Evaluations of consumption in modern thought

Alison Comish Thorne

Iowa State College

Follow this and additional works at: https://lib.dr.iastate.edu/rtd

Part of the Economic Theory Commons

Recommended Citation

Thorne, Alison Comish, "Evaluations of consumption in modern thought " (1938). Retrospective Theses and Dissertations. 12992.
https://lib.dr.iastate.edu/rtd/12992

This Dissertation is brought to you for free and open access by the Iowa State University Capstones, Theses and Dissertations at Iowa State University Digital Repository. It has been accepted for inclusion in Retrospective Theses and Dissertations by an authorized administrator of Iowa State University Digital Repository. For more information, please contact digirep@iastate.edu.
NOTE TO USERS

This reproduction is the best copy available.

UMI®
EVALUATIONS OF CONSUMPTION IN MODERN THOUGHT

By

Alison Comish Thorne

A Thesis Submitted to the Graduate Faculty for the Degree of
DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY
Major Subject Consumption Economics

IOWA STATE
AMES IA
COLLEGE LIBRAS

Approved:

Signature was redacted for privacy.
In charge of Major work

Signature was redacted for privacy.
Head of Major Department

Signature was redacted for privacy.
Dean of Graduate College

Iowa State College
1938
INFORMATION TO USERS

The quality of this reproduction is dependent upon the quality of the copy submitted. Broken or indistinct print, colored or poor quality illustrations and photographs, print bleed-through, substandard margins, and improper alignment can adversely affect reproduction.

In the unlikely event that the author did not send a complete manuscript and there are missing pages, these will be noted. Also, if unauthorized copyright material had to be removed, a note will indicate the deletion.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TABLE OF CONTENTS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>INTRODUCTION</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>PART I. THE TRANSITION TO MODERN ETHICAL THOUGHT.</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Section 1. Background and Analysis of Sumptuary Legislation, 1300-1700</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The background of European sumptuary legislation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>An analysis of European sumptuary legislation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sumptuary legislation and attitudes in colonial America</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary and conclusions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Section 2. Evidences of the Development of Modern Ethical Thought</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Early utopias</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Increased wealth and economic thought</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The idea of democracy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The authority of science</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary and conclusions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Section 3. An Illustration of the Triumph of Modern over Ideational Ethical Thought</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evaluations of consumption in American religious communitic societies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The relation between the simple, religious life and well-being</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Causes of dissolution of the communities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>PART II. EVALUATIONS OF CONSUMPTION IN QUANTITATIVE TERMS.</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Section 4. Economists' Opinions on the Measurable Relation Between Wealth and Welfare</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Section 5. Evaluations of Consumption in Studies of Family Scales of Living</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Introduction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Early studies of consumption</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Studies made by bureaus of labor in various states</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Farm family living studies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average value of farm living</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expenditures for &quot;advancement&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Food</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clothing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Housing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Section</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
INTRODUCTION

History contains many conscious formulations of ideas on what is wise living. The ultimate values of life and the ways of living to best secure those values have been variously defined. Wisdom, goodness, Nirvana, beauty, justice, happiness, maximum satisfaction, and welfare have been terms describing the ultimate goals, and there are many and varied instructions on how man should conduct himself to achieve these values. Such instructions are to be found in codes of law such as those of Manu and Moses, as well as in the less compulsory opinions of priests, philosophers, and statesmen, opinions in which theological, metaphysical, and utilitarian arguments are intermingled. In all of these approaches, however, there is an argument, tacit or outspoken, that what man eats and wears and how he occupies his time affect his opportunity of achieving the ultimate values of life. In other words, there is a relation between consumption and the ultimate values. This study treats of this relationship.

To clarify the relation of consumption to the ultimate values, a definition of consumption is necessary. A common definition of consumption is Ely’s: "The use of economic goods and services in the satisfaction of human wants."\(^1\) This definition was the outgrowth of the emphasis of economics on wealth. Economics has been variously defined as dealing with the causes of material well-being, or with the wealth-getting and wealth-using activities of mankind. According to this view the concept of wealth is primary; wealth

---

1. Ely. Outlines of economics. 5th rev. ed. p. 138, and 6th rev. ed. p. 135. The definitions of consumption to be found in earlier editions are similar.
is produced and then it is consumed. Robbins, however, has made familiar
another definition of economics, one which emphasizes the act of economizing.
He defines economics as "the science which studies human behaviour as a
relationship of ends and scarce means which have alternative uses."¹ Miss
Hoyt, using this conception of economics, has broadened the scope of con-
sumption to include time and energy as resources as well as economic goods
and services available on the market.² Consumption treats of choices of
what to buy, possess, or use, as well as of choices of how to use time and
energy. Consumption treats of choices of what to have and what to do in
so far as such choices involve scarce resources.

The problem of the present study is that of concepts of wise con-
sumption. Wise consumption may be defined as consumption conducive to the
ultimate values of life. These values, as has been pointed out, have been
variously named wisdom, goodness, Nirvana, beauty, justice, happiness,
maximum satisfaction, and welfare. For convenience the term welfare or well-
being, assumed to embrace any or all of the foregoing items, will be used.
Welfare is a condition not of having or doing but of being. The relation
between consumption and welfare may then be expressed in the following formu-
la: Choices of what to have and what to do affect what one is to be. This
statement of the problem is suggested by T. V. Smith when he says,³

Conscience at its most typical is the decision as to what one is to
be; the fact that every choice as to what one is to get or do involves
in lesser or greater fashion what kind of self is to be after and
through the process, but confirms the truth that conscience is an

¹. Robbins. An essay on the nature and significance of economic science.
². Hoyt. Consumption in our society. ch. 1.
aspect of consciousness and that we cannot erect a hard and fast line between moral and other choices.

As philosophical and scientific controversies have indicated in the past as well as today, there is no one complete answer to what is wise living or wise consumption. It is impossible to give an unequivocal answer to the problem by any method—laboratory, logical, or metaphysical. In spite of this handicap, however, it is possible to trace the history of ideas on what is wise consumption, that is, the history of opinions on what sorts of consumption are preferable to others in view of the goal of well-being. Such is the purpose of the present study, but before proceeding it is necessary to decide whose judgments of consumption shall be considered. Every consumer when he selects one commodity in preference to another, or when he chooses to use his leisure time in one way instead of another, is evaluating possible modes of consumption. His choice indicates that he believes some types of consumption are more conducive to his welfare than others. Since, however, such decisions are multitudinous and since consumers often do not actually think about their choices, these evaluations of consumption will not be considered. Rather, the attempt is to secure the judgments of those who have thought about the consumption of groups of people, for example, governments which pass sumptuary laws, churchmen who believe church attendance should be compulsory, reformers who think smoking should be condemned, and investigators of family scales of living who think sanitary conveniences in the home are necessary.

These specific judgments on what is desirable or undesirable consumption, made by persons considering the consumption of groups of people, will be called evaluations of consumption. It is assumed that if one could
find typical evaluations for a given historical period such evaluations would indicate the dominant ethical thought of that period. In the late Middle Ages, for example, a decree by sumptuary law that the lower classes should not wear fur is an evaluation indicating that medieval ethical thought emphasized social status quo and that the government had a right to dictate in personal matters. Today a judgment of a certain diet as inadequate in calories and vitamins is an evaluation of consumption which indicates the importance of health in achieving well-being and the importance of science as a reliable guide. Ethical thought may be defined as those general principles or rules for attaining well-being which lie in or behind evaluations. To use an analogy, ethical thought is like a luminous but intangible background defining well-being and giving general rules for its attainment, a background which gives its hue to the specific judgments or evaluations in the foreground.

To narrow the scope of the study, the period of "modern thought" dating from 1500 to the present has been chosen. Since there were remnants of medieval thought in the early part of the modern period, the present investigation will go as far back as 1300 to get a clearer picture of the nature of medieval thought. The present investigation is further confined

---

1. In consideration of the fact that science treats of means and ethics proper treats of ends, it may seem odd that ethical thought should be said to give high place to science as a reliable guide. Ethical thought, however, gives tasks to the discipline in which they belong, and modern ethical thought as shown in this study prefers science to superstition, for example.

2. Lee gives the following distinction: "Ethics is the attempt to formulate the theoretic principles lying in or behind the evaluation of conduct. It attempts to find a rational basis for such evaluation." See Internat. Jour. Ethics. 35:456. 1928.

3. It would be convenient to have a name for the period of transition from medieval ethical thought to what we know today as modern. See P. Smith. The life and letters of Martin Luther. Preface to second edition.
to western Europe and America, with particular emphasis on the nature of
evaluations of consumption in the United States today.

There can be little doubt but that there are essential differences
between the ethical thought of today and that of the period covering the
late Middle Ages and the two centuries following. Evaluations in these peri-
ods are different and reflect the difference in ethical thought. If the
results of the study may be anticipated, the following illustrations are to
the point. Sumptuary legislation in the late Middle Ages and early modern
period indicates that ethical thought of that time included such ideas as
the right of the government to dictate in matters of consumption, the belief
in a simple life to attain spiritual welfare, a belief in social status quo,
and fear of innovations just because they were new. Modern evaluations, for
which studies of consumption in quantitative terms are a good source, indi-
cate an ethical thought which gives science a high place as a reliable
guide, believes in individual freedom of choice, and encourages an abundant
life, materially and in terms of the satisfaction of a variety of interests.
That there is a difference between medieval and modern ethical thought is
not an a priori assumption. Histories of the culture of the two periods
indicate a difference. Sorokin has sought to prove that there is a differ-
ence in the mentality or system of thought at different times, and would
use "ideational" to express the medieval system of thought as well as the
character of the Reformation, and "sensate" to express the modern system of
thought.1 There is no attempt here to reinforce Sorokin's definition of
ideational and sensate cultures. Perhaps in medieval thought the fear of

1. Sorokin. Social and cultural dynamics. See the introduction to volume 1
for summary of his theory of sensate, ideational, and mixed cultures.
innovations is not a characteristic of ideational mentality as Sorokin defines it. Yet it was a motive behind sumptuary legislation. On the whole, however, the description of ethical thought as found in this study fits into Sorokin's analysis of the ideational and sensate cultures.¹

In summary, then, the purpose of this study is to show the transition from medieval to modern evaluations of consumption and ethical thought, with particular emphasis on the more recent era. In achieving this purpose it is believed that this study makes a contribution to methodology.

Nearly every book on consumption contains a note of inquiry into the problem of what is wise consumption. Miss Hoyt believes that the "great aim and end of the study of consumption is the problem of maximizing satisfactions. How shall we secure the greatest returns from the use of economic resources?"²

All our observations on consumption and all our study of it must naturally urge us along to the one great question of the ultimate significance of consumption and of the ways in which this ultimate significance may be measured.³

And Miss Kyrk states the problem in the following terms:

What is wanting is not wise discussion of the issues involved but a linking of the problem of "welfare" broadly conceived with the problem

---

1. In the present study the term "ideational" will be used to denote the dominance of the type of ethical thought prevalent during the medieval and early modern period, in contrast to the ethical thought of the more recent modern era. Ideational is perhaps preferable to the term "medieval thought" because the medieval period was closed in 1500. Ideational describes the dominant religious interest without chronological reference. It is obvious, however, that this dominance of religious thought after the Middle Ages was in continuity with the medieval. The term "modern ethical thought" is adopted in preference to "sensate" because the latter term has certain connotations which would only confuse the present study.


of consumption, and the desire to examine critically the values now intrenched in our standards.\footnote{Kyrk. Economic problems of the family. p. 392.}

The attempt of the present study is to develop an aspect of the study of consumption in which little has thus far been done.\footnote{The most complete discussion available is to be found in Hoyt, Consumption in our society. Part 4. The maximizing of satisfactions.} There are undoubtedly other and different approaches to the problem of wise consumption. It is believed, however, that the methodology suggested in this study will be of considerable use in the further development of the study of what is wise consumption.

Part I of the present study traces the transition from the ideational to modern evaluations of consumption, and the transition in the nature of the ethical thought behind these evaluations. Part II analyzes the evaluations of consumption to be found in quantitative terms in the more recent modern era; it includes a survey of statistical studies of family scales of living, and quantitative indexes used in measuring the relative welfare status of communities. Part III analyzes the nature of modern ethical thought, showing arguments for and against its various phases.
PART I
THE TRANSITION TO MODERN ETHICAL THOUGHT

Social, economic, and intellectual histories of the period from the fourteenth century to the present indicate the change in the temper of the times, the change, for example, from the dominance of religion and the simple life ideal to the dominance of science and the "material" life. Since consumption is an exceedingly large part of life these general histories can give a clue to contemporary opinions on what is wise living or wise consumption. It is believed, however, that a study of evaluations of consumption occurring in the modern and late medieval period reveals specific evidence of the change in the nature of ethical thought, and at the same time will bring together information usually treated in scattered places throughout history. Part I contains an approach to such a study of evaluations of consumption.

In section 1 is given an analysis of sumptuary legislation from 1300 to 1700, indicating the type of evaluations and the ethical thought they reflect. Before the period of sumptuary legislation was over, however, evidences of the rise of modern ethical thought were multiplying. Section 2 on evidences of the development of modern ethical thought describes some of the causes of the new era, such as increased productivity, the growth of political equality, etc. At the same time this section contains a mention of some of the evaluations of consumption to be found in early utopias, in the writings of mercantilists, and in the opinions of reformers. Section 3 gives an illustration of the triumph of modern over ideational thought. It
contains an analysis of the religious communistic societies in America in the nineteenth century, showing the ideational character of their consumption evaluations, and indicating the dissolution of the societies under the pressure of the modern ethical thought which dominates America.

Any attempt to secure an accurate picture of evaluations of consumption must meet four requisites:

1. Inclusion of a variety of sources of evaluations of consumption. Are sumptuary laws typical of the thought of the period on what is desirable consumption? Was it because churchmen were the dominant writers of the Middle Ages that it is usually stated that the religious attitude was dominant during that period? Perhaps there were classes of people with opinions on desirable consumption but they did not write them down.

2. Inclusion of a representative sample of evaluations from any one source of evaluations of consumption. For example, have all sumptuary laws been gathered together by historians, or are there still some to be discovered? To what extent are all such documents available to the student of consumption?

3. Valid interpretation of evaluations in terms of ethical thought. Do the early utopias really foreshadow democracy as it is known today? Is the simple life of American religious communistic societies to be explained by the ideational attitude, or were there other and more mundane causes?

4. Understanding of the nature of a culture which may be different from that in which the investigator lives. Can the student of today actually understand and describe the nature of medieval ethical thought?

Part I does not include an analysis of all documents available on any given subject, nor does it represent all types of opinion existing during the transition from medieval to modern ethical thought. But care has been used in the interpretation of the facts cited, and it is believed that Part I does reveal the general trend of thought during the transition and at the

---

1. This criticism would apply especially to any attempt to analyze evaluations of consumption in India or China.
same time illustrates a method which can be put to use in further study of evaluations of consumption.

It should be possible, in way of future research, to fill in this brief history of the transition to modern ethical thought. For example, evaluations of consumption could probably be found in church histories, and the history of hygienic rules of living might be more thoroughly traced. There was also considerable government action other than sumptuary legislation which indicates evaluations. Sanitary codes are an example. Utopias could bear more study and an analysis of representative literature of the different centuries would probably show the nature of evaluations and the ethical thought behind them. It would be interesting to compare the dominant philosophical theory of a given period with the concrete evaluations of that time. And it might be possible to find out with what rate evaluations of consumption change as compared with the rate of change in other phases of culture. Any efforts to picture evaluations, however, must take account of the four requisites enumerated above.
Section 1

Background and Analysis of Sumptuary Legislation, 1300-1700.

The background of European sumptuary legislation.

The Middle Ages was a period characterized by religious interest. The Church was the binding force which held loosely organized Europe together, and the thinkers of the age were predominantly churchmen. The preferable road to heaven was an ascetic life, in which temptations of all sorts were avoided. Monasteries, at their inception at least, followed a strict and simple regime of living.

The ideal of the church was monastic; all the pleasures of this world, all its pomp and learning and art were but snares to seduce men from salvation. Reason was called a barren tree but faith was held to blossom like the rose. Wealth was shunned as dangerous, marriage deprecated as a necessary evil. Fasting, scourging, celibacy, solitude, were cultivated as the surest roads to heaven.1

Both feudalism and theocracy upheld the doctrine of status quo, a doctrine reflected in economic and social thought of the time. Feudalism, which arose to give physical protection to the weak, was a chief cause of the hierarchy of social classes, but theocracy was not backward in giving support to the idea of hierarchy.2 God had decreed that all people conduct themselves according to their social class, and so strongly was the idea of social status quo inbred that, despite successful and unsuccessful revolts,

---

1. F. Smith. The age of the Reformation. p. 28. Cause-and-effect in this instance probably runs both directions. The Church encouraged the simple life, but on the other hand perhaps the poverty of the Dark Ages led the Church somewhat naturally to encourage spiritual satisfactions for which material things were unnecessary.

2. Exception must be made that within the Church it was possible for an individual to rise from a low to a high rank.
it was not until the nineteenth century that the majority of those in the lower classes dared question its inevitability.

The governments of the time were paternalistic in many sectors of life. Not only did they provide for military defense and set the weights, measures, and prices of wine and bread, but they guarded the morals of their subjects by limiting the number of guests at christenings, dictating the menu at weddings, advocating the kind of clothes the different classes might wear, prohibiting certain amusements, and punishing blasphemy. Extravagance was severely condemned, and innovations were believed especially corrupting to the morals.

In the thirteenth and fourteenth centuries there occurred a gradual increase in wealth. The Crusades brought new articles of consumption and new ideas. Not only did the noble classes lead colorful lives, but the clergy were tempted by the increasing wealth of the Church. Gluttony and luxury became prevalent in the upper classes. On the whole, however, the Church maintained its hold on social life. The new art of Italy was turned to the uses of the Church, and in northern Europe the Renaissance was more an intellectual than an artistic revolution.

Sumptuary laws became increasingly difficult to enforce, as indicated by the number of successive acts passed. New fashions were finally accepted by the government, at least to the extent of making statutes against extravagance enforceable. For example, in the Swiss city states the city fathers finally bowed to short clothes for men but insisted that they be decent.¹

¹ "It was but natural that the notions of propriety held by the city fathers should be liberalized, as, with extension of commercial intercourse life itself and its manners grew more complex, and the outlook upon the world widened. Means of gaining wealth were being multiplied; new tastes were awakened by new objects of imitation; and the most conservative were certain in time to find their standards of criticism revised." Greenfield. Sumptuary law in Nürnberg. p. 134.
Religious ideals did not disappear with the Renaissance. In the
tenth century Savanarola succeeded in setting up theocratic rule in
Florence. He swept obscenity from the streets, forced the citizens to lay
aside luxury and indecent attire, and to give themselves in humility to
the worship of God. His theocracy did not last long however.¹

In 1517 Luther led a revolt against the Church, a revolt which began
with repudiation of indulgences and ended with a complete repudiation of
the authority of the Pope. Luther was more lenient in the regulation of
personal life than some of his followers. He believed that after attending
religious services the Christian might devote the rest of the day to whatever
work or pleasures he chose. Detailed rules of conduct were needless for
the Christian had sufficient guide in the Bible and in his own conscience.
Calvin was more strict. He commanded attendance at sermons and forbade all
work on Sunday. On gaining control of Geneva he abolished all church
holidays excepting Sunday, and prohibited dancing and masquerading. Music
in religious services and all manner of artistic decoration were believed
sinful. The theater was attacked, especially when the new Italian habit of
giving women's part to actresses instead of to boys was introduced. Even
Luther, however, considered theaters to be "fools' work" and believed them
dangerous. Zwingli was in many ways more liberal than Luther, especially
in his interpretation of the Bible by reason. But even so he believed in
strict regulation of morals and favored laws against taverns and gambling.

¹. Hertzler attributes the fall of this theocracy to the increased strength
of the Medici, the anger of the corrupt Pope, and the hatred of the
people for the repressions of asceticism. See Hertzler. The history of
utopian thought, p. 96-97. The people's dislike for asceticism indicates
the existence of evaluations of consumption different from those of
ideational thought.
and would make church attendance compulsory. In Scotland, Knox was preaching openly against the excessive gaiety of the Queen's court.¹

The same forces that brought about the Protestant revolution caused the Catholic Reformation with opposition, among other things, to immoral clothing and immoral books. Sixtus V and other popes enforced laws against gambling, obscenity, gossip, Sabbath-breaking, and blasphemy. In 1583 the Council of Reims forbade the faithful to participate in dancing, public fairs, or stage plays on Sunday.²

The reign of Queen Elizabeth was characterized by ideals of both the Renaissance and Reformation. The shocking of Puritans became one of the delights of the sophisticated. Yet the abundance of sumptuary legislation passed during Elizabeth's reign indicates the assumption by the government of the right to protect the morals and manufactures of England.³ Theaters were not permitted within the city limits of London, partly for fear of fire, rioting, and contagious disease, and partly in deference to Puritan morality.

James I sought to counteract Puritanism with his Declaration of Sports in 1618 commanding the games and festivities of old England and declaring that dancing, archery, and various sports should be practiced after the Sunday services were finished. In the first year of his reign James I repealed the English sumptuary laws, mainly dealing with food and clothing. "This is one of the most remarkable, though one of the least noted, signs of the end of the Middle Ages and of the advent of modern times."⁴

---

¹ For a discussion of these reformers see Smith. The age of the Reformation. chs. 1-4.
³ The mercantilist arguments indicate the transition to modern ethical thought and will be discussed further in section 2 of this study.
⁴ Smith, op. cit. p. 509.
The triumph of the Puritans in the Civil War led to the closing of theaters by an ordinance of 1648. Clothes became less gay and perfumes and cosmetics were banned. All prohibitory laws on the statute books were to be enforced. Slight tendencies toward liberalism were evident, however, and Milton in his Areopagitica defended freedom in his attack on the censorship of the press. He declared it would be as absurd to censor the press as to refer "our garments....to the licensing of some more sober work-masters to see them cut into a less wanton garb," or to attempt to regulate dancing and mixed conversation.¹

An analysis of European sumptuary legislation.

With this brief history of the background of sumptuary legislation in the late medieval and early modern period, an analysis of sumptuary laws from 1300 to 1700 will be made. These laws contain evaluations of specific kinds of consumption as right and wrong. Rather than to list all the judgments of consumption occurring in sumptuary legislation, the evaluations are summarized under their purposes.² These purposes include the following: to reduce extravagance, to maintain social status quo, to protect health, to further religious well-being, to protect individuals from innovations, to encourage patriotism, to ensure local order and safety.

². It is frequently difficult to determine the exact purposes behind given pieces of sumptuary legislation. Occasionally the purpose was stated in the act, but even in such cases the true purpose might be different from the one stated. Where no purpose is given one can sometimes deduce the purpose from the nature of the act. Sometimes of course such circumstantial evidence may be inadequate. Further, it must be remembered that the cause-and-effect relation assumed by motives behind such legislation was not always rational from the modern point of view.
to increase military strength, and with the growth of mercantilist sentiment in the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries, to protect domestic producers' and hence the state's interests.

Most of the laws struck at so-called extravagance, especially extravagance occurring on important occasions such as funerals, weddings, dinners, and christenings. The number of guests and the menu were objects of regulation. Extravagance in dress was also a sore point and changes in fashion caused city fathers to shake their heads. One reason for the antagonism toward extravagance was the belief that those who could not afford such expense should not be made to go to such an outlay. Especially was this true in the case of funerals, weddings, and christenings, when the less well-to-do wanted to do their very best. In other words, the government implied that to go to great expense on such occasions was not a best use of resources. Something of the same attitude is seen today in the criticism of "keeping up with the Joneses," the chief difference being that the present age has ways other than funerals, weddings, and christenings for display of extravagance, and laws are not passed against "keeping up with the Joneses."

But there were other reasons for the medieval objection to extravagance. In dress, especially, it was wrong to go beyond one's class. An ordinance of Basel in 1637 gives detailed prohibitions of dress for the various classes.\(^1\) Regulations became more frequent as the lower classes secured more income or found other ways of securing clothes thought to be above their station. Philip Stubbs, the Puritan author of the Anatomie of Abuses, criticized fine clothes unmercifully but found it necessary to

---

explain that his remarks were not intended to reflect upon the "noble, honorable, and worshipful." People belonging to upper classes might adorn themselves as they chose.1

Furthermore, extravagance was bad for the morals in other ways. It was thought to bring about envy, covetousness, cunning, unfaithfulness, unbelief, pride, luxury, and contempt.2 Here is an assumption of a relation between consumption and the individual character.

"In Bern in 1464 the community was startled by the robbery of sacred vessels from the church, and this was taken as a sign of the displeasure of Providence. Consequently the authorities ordered, among other things, that extravagance in clothing should be curbed, and in particular decreed that the prevailing short coats and mantles were shameful exhibitions of the person and must be made to cover the middle of the body."3 Immorality caused by certain types of clothing4 and by certain diversions was a good cause for legislation in the Swiss city states. In one act, dancing at weddings was forbidden because it "is unseemly and awakens the wrath of God."5 In Nürnberg dancing in breeches and jacket, and immodest and novel dancing were prohibited, for according to the council it was displeasing to God and produced much dishonorable lightmindedness and scandal besides.6

In some of these latter cases, it was not so much extravagance which

2. Vincent, op. cit. p. 49.
3. Ibid. p. 45–46.
4. Greenfield states for example that certain types of clothing besides being regarded as indecent and hence morally wrong, were believed to lead to the moral disorder of pride. Op. cit. p. 114.
brought down the wrath of the law as it was fear of the new. Especially in regard to changes in fashion was opposition to be seen. If the soldiers brought home new ideas from the wars, such ideas were held to lead to immorality; new fads in clothing were usually among the innovations.

The general religious attitude meant that holy days must be observed. All had to attend church. The dress required was dignified. Expensive jewelry and even gold-mounted prayer books were forbidden. ¹ Certain games could not be played on Sundays and other holy days, and Protestantism, especially, transformed Sunday from a day of recreation to one of religious duties.

A very few of the sumptuary laws may have had protection of health as a possible motive. The headdresses of mothers at christenings were not to be too heavy, and the number of visitors to the bedside was restricted.² Covering walls with black cloth to represent mourning was considered not only extravagant but in times of epidemic a dangerous practice.³

A writer contemporary with Chaucer condemned the clothing worn by maids of the period, with fur dragging in filth.

It were better to take the fur from their heels in the winter, and place it about the stomach, which has then the most need of warmth; and in summer it were better away entirely, because it only serveth as a hiding-place for fleas.⁴

In regard to tobacco there were arguments for and against, on healthful as well as other grounds⁵; Bern prohibited its use in 1675 as a form of

---

¹ Vincent, op. cit. p. 19.
³ Ibid. p. 27. Basel 1677.
⁴ Quoted in Strutt, Dress and habits. See Baldwin, op. cit. p. 68.
⁵ See Corti. A history of smoking. King James’ personal aversion to smoking forms an interesting chapter.
suicide. Use of coffee and tea was prohibited for hygienic as well as economic reasons. It must be kept in mind, however, that regulations with a health motive were rare and when such a motive did occur it was mixed with other purposes. In contrast is the situation today in the United States where individual consumption is regulated perhaps more in the interest of public health and safety than in the interest of public morals. These latter regulations are not rare, however, when one considers laws against lotteries, bathing suits, and the importation of certain types of books.

Behind medieval and early modern sumptuary legislation there were also reasons other than prevention of extravagance and encouragement of morals and health. Sometimes the government had opinions on the matter of national dress. The English forced the Irish to abandon their usual dress because it was uncouth and because it led to undesirable nationalistic feelings.

Military strength of the nation was also an important motive. In 1363 Edward III of England felt obliged to issue a royal decree forbidding many rural sports and enjoining the use of archery. Henry VI abolished tennis and required shooting as a recreation. In 1511 there was a proclamation forbidding all Englishmen, except lords and knights, to wear silk. This was done in order that the gentry might save their money and purchase

1. Vincent, op. cit. p. 94.
3. Every regulation in the monographs of Vincent, Greenfield, and Baldwin which hints of the health motive has been included in the above discussion. There was, however, an occasional statute law relating to such matters as street cleaning and sewers. In the sixteenth century an elementary health code was developed. See Larkey. Public health in Tudor England. Am. Jour. Pub. Health. 24:1099-1102. 1934.
5. Ibid. p. 85.
6. Ibid. p. 94. Passed in 1156.
arms and horses in preparation for war with France.\(^1\) In the struggle for supremacy of the seas England required her people to eat fish "all through Lent and twice a week throughout the year; they might not like fish, but by buying it they helped to encourage fishermen and thus indirectly to keep up a school for seamanship."\(^2\)

Another reason for sumptuary legislation was the promotion of public order and safety. Tippling and gambling were limited on this account. No one in London should keep a tavern open to sell wine after curfew.\(^3\) In Nürnberg, a person found drinking after curfew was fined.\(^4\) In the fourteenth century the Nürnberg council ordered all gambling places closed.\(^5\) Sleigh-riding in Zurich was prohibited after hours in an attempt to preserve public order.\(^6\) Fear of fire caused tobacco to be regarded as an enemy of public safety.

The final and increasingly important motive, with the commercial development of countries, was the protection of home industry. Elizabeth insisted that her subjects wear English-made caps.\(^7\) In 1686 an act was passed providing for the burial of the dead in woollen only. This act was "intended to lessen the importation of linen from beyond the seas (and so to prevent

---

3. Baldwin, op. cit. p. 17. Passed during the reign of Edward III.
5. Ibid. p. 30. Tippling and gambling were also considered as extravagances. Games which involved betting tended to promote "idleness, theft, and debauchery among the lower classes, and sudden ruin, desolation and suicide among the upper classes." Baldwin, op. cit. p. 57. In the main, however, the chief objection to drinking and gambling seemed to be the disturbance of public order, or at least so Baldwin believes the Parliamentary history of England indicates. Op. cit. p. 180.
7. Cunningham. The growth of English industry and commerce in modern times. 1892 ed. p. 34.
money from going abroad), to encourage the woollen manufacture (by promoting consumption), and to prevent a reckless consumption of linen fibre (so as to assist the paper manufacturers.)"1

Sumptuary legislation and attitudes in colonial America.

Perhaps the chief difference between American sumptuary legislation and that of Europe lay in the fact that due to its relatively late settlement, America did not get as early a start at regulating consumption. But the analysis of motives in the foregoing pages holds equally well for the sumptuary laws occurring in the colonies. Only a brief discussion of the colonial attitude will be given here.

Theocratic government, especially in New England, led to laws as strict if not stricter than those of Europe. The notion of cause-and-effect was often similar to that of Bern where the church robbery in 1464 was an indication of God's wrath at disobedience to sumptuary law. For example, Increase Mather attributed the Boston fire of 1711 to baking and carrying burdens on Sunday, while Cotton Mather believed it to be a warning from God that the Thursday lecture should be better attended.

The Puritans lamented extravagance in dress. Governor Winthrop in 1630 declared he would no longer drink healths. Smoking2, gambling, and

1. Cunningham, op. cit. p. 177. Parentheses are Cunningham's.
2. "Severe and explicit were the orders with regard to the use of the 'Creature called Tobacco' on the Sabbath. In the very earliest days of the colony means had been taken to prevent the planting of the pernicious weed except in very small quantities 'for meer necessities, for phisick, for preservation of health, and that the same be taken privately by auencient men.'...The shrewd and thrifty New Haven people permitted the raising of it for purposes of trade, though not for use, thus supplying the 'devil's weed' to others, chiefly the godless Dutch, but piously spurning it themselves—in public." Earle. The Sabbath in Puritan New England. p. 251-252. Fear of fire was also a strong argument against the use of tobacco.
and dancing were fought. The observation of Christmas was for a time considered sinful. Instrumental music was frowned upon and theaters were abhorred.

The paternalistic attitude of the government was shown not only in the communities of New England, for the House of Burgesses of Virginia also felt obliged to regulate extravagant dress and excessive drinking.

It was moreover enacted that any person found drunk was for the first offense to be privately reproved by the minister; the second time this reproof was to be publicly administered; the third time the offender must be put in irons for twelve hours and pay a fine; for any subsequent offenses he must be severely punished at the discretion of the governor and council.

To guard the community against excessive vanity in dress, it was enacted that for all public contributions every unmarried man must be assessed in church "according to his own apparel"; and every married man must be assessed "according to his own and his wife's apparel." No one was allowed to wear gold lace except high officials. Such social misdemeanors as flirting received due legislative condemnation. Nobody traveled on Sunday, and a gun might be fired only in defense against Indians on that day.

As an illustration of the fear of the new, there is a Nantucket incident which Crèvecoeur tells:

...two single-horse chairs were imported from Boston, to the great offence of these prudent citizens. Nothing appeared to them more culpable than the use of such gaudy painted vehicles, in contempt of the more useful and more simple single-horse carts of their fathers. This piece of extravagant and unknown luxury, almost caused a schism, and set every tongue a-going; some predicted the approaching ruin of those families that had imported them; others feared the dangers of example; never since the foundation of the town had there happened anything which so much alarmed this primitive community.2

---

But the growth of wealth gradually led away from the simple life ideal. From 1740 to 1765 there was considerable extravagance in dress, house-building, and furnishing, which led to living beyond one's means. In the same period paint became cheaper and gay rivalry in church decoration sprang up. The wealthy Quakers apparently did not feel their religious tenets prohibited them from eating heartily and dressing in rich though drab materials, and just before the Revolution Philadelphia had the reputation of displaying much more luxury than Boston. During this time, however, there were numerous complaints that luxury was too prevalent, and the Continental Congress of 1774 out of moral and patriotic considerations discouraged horse racing, gaming, shows, and plays. Patriotism and the demand for military strength also led to non-importation agreements and the encouragement of home industries. American-made clothes, for a brief interval, were the fashion among the wealthy patriots. Sheep-raising for production of wool was systematically extended and mutton practically disappeared from patriotic tables. After the Revolution, with the heterogeneity of religious beliefs in the colonies and the impetus toward individual freedom, it was only natural that sumptuary legislation should decline.

3. It would be interesting to make a survey of sumptuary legislation in Europe and America after 1700, to see what changes there were in its nature, if there were changes. Today laws to discourage extravagance are not frequent, although taxation of luxury goods may be so interpreted. As for protection of morals, there are laws against nudity, obscene books, etc. Sunday laws are in evidence in a number of places. And it is possible to find laws with the purpose of health protection, maintaining local order and safety, as well as encouraging patriotism and increasing military strength.
Summary and conclusions.

I. The purposes of sumptuary legislation passed during the late medieval and early modern period may be classified as follows:

A. In terms of direct well-being of the individual:

1. To reduce extravagance.
   a. The poorer classes could not afford lavish outlays. Such laws implied that they should use their resources for other purposes.
   b. Extravagance was bad for the morals because it led to vice, vanity, and deceit.
   c. It was believed wrong to consume in a manner beyond the custom of one's social class.

2. To protect health. This motive was rare, however.

3. To further religious well-being. This motive was usually combined with consideration of morals.

4. To protect individuals from the new. Innovations were held to lead to extravagance, immorality, etc.

B. In terms of the well-being of society as a whole:

1. To encourage patriotism.

2. To maintain local order and safety.

3. To increase military strength.

4. To protect domestic producers' interests. In accordance with the mercantilist arguments this was believed advantageous to the state's interest.

II. The conclusions in regard to the ethical thought of this period are as follows:

1. The government had a right to regulate all kinds of matters, including personal consumption. "In the sumptuary ordinance we may see reflected at its clearest the paternal attitude of the legislators, and realize in its purest expression the sense of responsibility which they felt for the whole round of the activities of the citizen, from economic to moral."1

---

2. Status quo must be maintained. This meant that people must conduct themselves according to their respective social classes. Another aspect of status quo included condemnation of innovations.

3. The simple life without extravagance was held to be most conducive to good morals. This aspect of ethical thought was due to the influence of religion. God's ways meant a condemnation of extravagance as well as condemnation of more serious vices, for one must devote oneself to thoughts of heaven and not to the frivolities of the present life.

4. The government was obliged to take steps to maintain domestic order, military defense, and prosperity. This aspect of ethical thought exists today, the only difference being that in some cases present methods of attaining these ends are different from theirs. Domestic producers' interests were protected because the philosophy of the state required a prosperous nation. It was believed that such a philosophy would react to the benefit of the entire country.

Mercantilism was especially dominant during the seventeenth century but one finds similar arguments today.
Section 2

Evidences of the Development of Modern Ethical Thought

In contrast with the ethical thought indicated in sumptuary legislation, modern ethical thought sanctions a greater degree of individual freedom of choice, as evidenced by the rarer instances of government dictation in consumption today. The ideal of the simple life has been replaced by the ideal of a life abundant both materially and in terms of many interests. Social status quo has given way to democracy, in America at least. And the authority of science has largely displaced the authority of religion.

The transition to these ideas did not come all at once. Although the writers of the Renaissance, and humanists even earlier, had hinted at some of these ideas, sumptuary legislation continued to be relatively important for several centuries more, and remnants of it are to be seen today. The purpose of the present section is to give a brief history of evidences indicating the decline of ideational thought and the rise of the new order of thought.

Early utopias.

There are probably a number of ways of describing the first evidences

---

1. The totalitarian states of today curtail individual freedom of choice, but they employ more subtle means than sumptuary legislation.
2. It is difficult to trace the history of ideas. Such an attempt aims at interpretation and unification and runs the danger of degenerating into merely imaginative historical generalizations. See Lovejoy. The great chain of being. The introduction to this book contains excellent suggestions on the matter of tracing the history of ideas. The sketch attempted in the present section does not pretend to be thorough, but it does try to show some tendencies about which there seems to be general agreement among historians.
of modern ethical thought. Early utopias are used here by way of intro-
duction because they contain some detail of what is considered wise con-
sumption. Sir Thomas More in his Utopia advocated equal social rights for
all reasoning men. There was to be universal education and religious
tolerance, ideas postulated in an age which had scarcely heard of universal
education and religious tolerance. Men should be free to choose their trades.
More believed in the satisfaction of a variety of interests and outlined the
essential interests as those of the mind and body, and in a separate class,
those to be achieved through music. Freedom did not extend to indulgence
in gambling, jewelry, or clothes of varied colors. The natural color of
wool and white linen were the only two colors permitted. On the whole,
however, More hinted at the ideas of equality, education, and the satis-
faction of a variety of interests.

The next century saw several utopias. As further illustration of the
transition to the new order of thought, but with still a remnant of the
ideational philosophy, is Johann Valentin Andreas's Christianopolis (1619).
Scientific research was given an important place and so was education.
There was a health program, a great museum, and an emphasis on the fine arts.
The purpose of commerce was not to gain money but to increase the variety
of things at the disposal of the community. The families lived in simple,
ygianic apartments. In contrast to these innovations, attendance at

1. It must be noted that roots of the modern era are to be found farther
back than Sir Thomas More and the Renaissance. See Barnes. An intellectual
and cultural history of the western world. p. 546 ff. Barnes would
abandon the term Renaissance.
2. Morley’s edition of Ideal commonwealhes contains reprints of most of the
utopias. For an analysis of the utopias see Bertsler, The history of
utopian thought; Mumford. The story of utopias; Davis, Contemporary
social movements; and Wallis, Culture and progress.
prayers was compulsory and there was censorship of books.

Francis Bacon's *New Atlantis* (1627) is considered especially representative of the period of natural science. According to Bacon it was the progress of science which would bring greatest happiness, for scientific inventions would mean better health and greater comfort.¹ Bacon was emphasizing scientific inventions at a time when the government paid little attention to scientific research. The college of scientific investigators which he proposed was the first of a series of proposals which ultimately resulted in the establishment of the Royal Society of London.

Next came Tommaso Campanella's *City of the Sun* (1637). This was the first comprehensive scheme of social reform suggested in Italy since Savonarola. Ideals of health and cleanliness were set up, food was to be prepared under the direction of medical officers who saw to it that richness was tempered with acids and that neither ice cold drinks nor artificial hot drinks were served. Everyone worked four hours a day, and the remaining hours were spent in reading, reciting, writing, walking, and in other ways exercising the mind and body.

In summary, these utopias of the early seventeenth century, with More's of the sixteenth century, anticipate modern ethical thought by suggesting greater equality, education, a life abundant with many interests, and an emphasis on the contribution which science can make to human health.

¹ Critics sometimes object to the extent to which Bacon went into detailed description of the elaborate costumes of those living in *New Atlantis*. "When Bacon talks about science, he talks like a court costumer who is in the habit of describing the stage properties for a masque; and it is hard to tell whether he is more interested in the experiments performed by the scientists of the *New Atlantis* or the sort of clothes they wear while engaged in them." Humford, *op. cit.* p. 62.
and comfort. At the same time, however, they showed remnants of the ideational philosophy, and there was little place for spontaneity in individual choice.

Almost without exception life in utopia is drab, and is lived amid surroundings which are mean and monotonous, if not sordid. Almost uniformly, too, adventure and novelty are eliminated. The community runs as though by a time-piece, with all the cogs in place, everybody doing the expected. The dwellers in utopia do not write novels, they have no adventures, and the community makes no history.

Increased wealth and economic thought.

Commerce and industry were flourishing. The Crusades were an impetus to trade, as were the voyages of discovery, exploration, and piracy. The Commercial and Industrial Revolutions, by improving methods of production, tended to raise the scale of living. According to some theories, such as that of Max Weber, the ideals of religion were influential in this growth of industry. That the religious leaders themselves were sometimes aware of the paradox caused by urging frugality and hard work is indicated by John Wesley’s statement:

I fear, wherever riches have increased, the essence of religion has decreased in the same proportion. Therefore I do not see how it is possible, in the nature of things, for any revival of true religion to continue long. For religion must necessarily produce both industry and frugality, and these cannot but produce riches. But as riches increase, so will pride, anger, and love of the world in all its branches....So, although the form of religion remains, the spirit is swiftly vanishing away.

2. Quoted in Weber. The Protestant ethic and the spirit of capitalism. p. 175. Weber maintains that Calvinism and the sects stemming from it provided fertile ground for the growth of capitalism. Robertson, in Aspects of the rise of economic individualism, presents the thesis that the spirit of capitalism has arisen rather from the material conditions of civilization than from some religious impulse. Tawney strikes middle ground between the two arguments, in Religion and the rise of capitalism.
The thought of economists in this period of increasing wealth sometimes contains evaluations of consumption. When nations were seeking integration and greater prosperity, mercantilism was the dominant economic theory. According to this theory home industry should be encouraged and a favorable balance of trade maintained. It was mercantilism which justified the laws of the monarchs that their men subjects should wear woollen caps and their deceased subjects should wear woollen shrouds.

But mercantilism, with its emphasis on increasing the prosperity of the nation, led to a commendation of "pomp" and rich living. Thomas Mun represents the thought of this period, commending pomp and yet at the same time reflecting a little of the ideational attitude toward extravagance. In his chapter, "Of some excesses and evils in the Commonwealth, which notwithstanding decay not our Trade nor Treasure" he begins by saying,

"It is not my intent to extenuate or excuse any the least excess or evil in the Commonwealth, but rather highly to commend and approve that which by others hath been spoken and written against such abuses....."

Lastly, all kind of Bounty and Pomp is not to be avoided, for if we should become so frugal, that we would use few or no Forraign wares, how shall we then vent our own commodities?...Again, the pomp of Buildings, Apparel, and the like, in the Nobility, Gentry, and other able persons, cannot impoverish the Kingdome; if it be done with curious and costly works upon our Materials, and by our own people, it will maintain the poor with the purse of the rich, which is the best distribution of the Commonwealth."2

And Nicholas Barbon wrote, at the end of the seventeenth century,

"...Fashion or the alteration of Dress, is a great Promoter of Trade, because it occasions the Expanse of Cloaths, before the Old ones are worn out: It is the Spirit and Life of Trade....The Promoting of New

2. Ibid. p. 76, 61.
Fashions ought to be encouraged, because it provides a livelihood for a great part of mankind.¹

Mandeville created a great stir when he showed the paradox that luxurious living is considered a vice and yet increases trade.²

Adam Smith, building on the idea of laissez-faire, urged freedom of trade within and outside the nation as a method better than mercantilism for increasing the wealth of nations. Under the influence of classical economics regulations such as the woollen ordinance disappeared. Laissez-faire applied to producers, but as economic theory developed, freedom of choice on the part of the consumer was assumed.

The attitude of the classical economists toward luxurious living is not clear. One usually finds in their writing a distinction between productive and unproductive consumption. The former made for better workers or built up capital, while unproductive consumption was purely for personal gratification. Productive consumption was believed necessary to keep industry going, and the economists were not the only ones to believe this. In the eighteenth century the spread of drunkenness among workingmen was felt by the authorities to constitute a menace to the prosperity of England, and in 1736 a tax was laid on gin, rum, and brandy, a tax intended to be prohibitive for workingmen.³

Not all unproductive consumption, however, was of the nature of drunkenness, as John Stuart Mill realized when he said,

3. See p. 39 of the present study for mention of the part physicians played in encouraging such legislation.
It would be a great error to regret the large proportion of the annual produce, which in an opulent country goes to supply unproductive consumption. It would be to lament that the community has so much to spare from its necessities, for its pleasure and for all higher uses. This portion of the produce is the fund from which all the wants of the community, other than that of mere living, are provided for; the measure of its means of enjoyment, and of its power of accomplishing all purposes not productive.¹

Some economists continued to uphold frugality in order to assure the economic system of sufficient capital. Others believed luxury made the wheels of industry turn. And occasionally there were moral platitudes about avoiding ostentatious consumption and all artificial wants.² The present attitude of economic science, however, is one of neutrality with regard to judgments of the desirability or undesirability of various types of consumption.

The idea of democracy.

As has been pointed out, Sir Thomas More advocated equal social rights for all reasoning men. Other writers of the Renaissance occasionally hinted at the democratic form of government. Erasmus in 1515 interpreted the history of the ancients in such a way as to disparage monarchy, but after the Peasants' War he decided that "princes must be endured lest tyranny give place to anarchy, a still greater evil."

At the same time Luther was breaking from Catholicism and arguing that

2. According to Say the most judicious kinds of consumption seem to be "such as conduce to the satisfaction of positive wants; by which term I mean those, upon the satisfaction of which depends the existence, the health, and the contentment of the generality of mankind; being the very reverse of such as are generated by refined sensuality, pride, and caprice." Say, A treatise on political economy. 1850 translation from 4th French ed. p. 397.
man should be guided by the Bible and his own conscience. It is true that after him Calvin's regime was a theocratic dictatorship, but Congregationalism and Presbyterianism, for example, were democratic in nature, and the Reformation as a whole resulted in greater tolerance because the multiplication of sects led to doubt of the infallibility of any one authority.

The next great movement to influence freedom of thought was the Enlightenment, 1687-1776. Descartes in the early part of the seventeenth century had upset theology when he affirmed the immutability of the laws of nature and the supremacy of reason. With scientific notions of cause-and-effect and the resultant attempt to understand and control nature, men came to believe that potentialities of leadership lay within themselves, not in the authority of religion. Voltaire, who was the embodiment of the Enlightenment, declared war on irrationality, and to him irrationality included religion. Reason was God and Newton's *Principia* the Bible of the Enlightenment. The writers of this period did not, on the whole, encourage freedom for the masses; theirs was a freedom for the intellectually elite. But like Luther and Erasmus they unconsciously threw fuel on the conflagration which led to the American and French Revolutions.

The decline of sumptuary legislation was notable. Myers observes that after the American Revolution there was a decided lull in the activities of

1. Luther, like Erasmus, had no intention of encouraging an uprising of the masses against government. See Smith, *The life and letters of Martin Luther*; and McGiffert, *Martin Luther, the man and his work*.
2. "In the struggle between liberty and authority, Calvinism sacrificed liberty, not with reluctance but with enthusiasm." Tawney, op. cit. p. 151.
3. It has been pointed out that in America the vestry had great influence in the evolution of the town meeting.
blue law advocates. Jefferson was influential in the final release of the
grip of religion on national life in America, and Jackson's administration
brought greater political rights for all.

Nineteenth century philosophy upheld equalitarianism. The very oppo-
site philosophies of Kant and Bentham had given support to the idea. Kant
taught the dignity of the human being, that each person should be treated
as an end in himself. "Use every man as an end, and never as a means."
Utilitarianism, the greatest happiness of the greatest number, implied that
the happiness of all should be considered.

In the long run, the movement for democracy brought about the following
changes in ideas on evaluations of consumption: The idea of brotherhood and
equality, along with the higher scales of living, led to concern over the
living standards of the masses. The old social status quo was weakened.
And increased freedom meant less government and theocratic dictation in
matters of consumption. America, especially, fostered democracy on the fron-
tier and this implied democracy in consumption.

The authority of science.

Although sumptuary legislation, especially that dealing with food,
clothing, and amusements, largely ceased by the eighteenth century, there
were many people who sought to tell others how to live. Conservative

2. Smith. Beyond conscience. p. 517. "Their systems both eventuate as
stark equalitarianism: Kant's in a kingdom of equal ends, Bentham's in
a democracy of equal citizens."
3. See the discussion of Sir Frederick Eden's and Charles Booth's poverty
studies in section 5-B. Growing literature and increased travel also
made the wealthy more aware of the conditions of the poor.
4. Turner. The frontier in American history. See also McMahon. Social and
economic standards of living.
reformers, many of them religious, were plentiful. They had definite ideas on the matter of theaters, smoking, cards, dancing, the reading of novels, and Sunday amusements. They fought dress reforms, nude statues, feminism, and free love.

Society for a time in the nineteenth century assumed a moralistic tinge. The prudishness of the Victorian age in England is well known. Queen Victoria took a strong stand against artificial aids to beauty, a stand which received the whole-hearted support of the ministers of various churches. Perfumes and ointments were largely abandoned. The Queen also prohibited the playing of dice, cards, or any other games on Sunday, and alcoholic beverages were not to be sold on Sunday during sermon. In matters of smoking even military officers were restricted in their use of tobacco, and it was not until after the Crimean War that smoking was permitted in barracks.

America was not free from the moralistic atmosphere. Religious revivals were frequent during the nineteenth century. When a panic came people began to wonder how they had offended God, and the depression of 1857 led many Bostonians to give up hard liquor, cards, and frivolous novels. The temperance movement gained much headway in this century.

Particularly striking during the nineteenth century, and indicative of the growing respect for science, was the abundance of health reforms suggested. These were often taken over by the conservative reformers with much

1. "Moralistic" is difficult to define. It is used here to denote the biased proposals for reforms, usually conservative and in the eyes of present day culture essentially narrow-minded and repressive. The very characterization of the Victorian age as "prudish" indicates the difference in attitude existing today.

2. For a popularly written account of morals during Queen Victoria's reign see Markum, Mrs. Grundy. ch. 9.
Early attempts at health reforms can be found before the fifteenth century when there was considerable European literature on the rules of daily living. After this century the number of books on hygiene, usually written by physicians or those who claimed that status, increased by a sort of geometrical progression. Such hygienic rules were a phase of the Enlightenment.¹ There came to be special concern over children’s health. Dr. William Cadogan of London wrote a book on this subject which went through ten editions between 1747 and 1772. He extolled the value of fresh air and clean linen, and even went so far as to maintain that fresh fruits and vegetables were not unhealthy for children.² In Germany interesting little health catechisms for children were popular, and in 1782 there was an attempt to give the German people instruction in "first aid" procedures. From the seventeenth century on some instruction in hygiene was given in the German schools, although such a program was not tried in the English-speaking countries until 1850. In England and America, however, outdoor sports had been introduced and were widely practiced.³

The temperance movement in England and America originated primarily with physicians. In the first half of the eighteenth century Parliament passed a number of "gin acts." These were in a way a response to the suggestion of the London College of Physicians that the sale of strong drink should be restricted. In America Dr. Benjamin Rush inaugurated the temperance movement. But by the middle of the nineteenth century the clergy had

¹ Shryock. The development of modern medicine. p. 95.
² Ibid. p. 92-93.
³ Ibid. p. 94-95.
assumed leadership in the temperance movement, a leadership which caused
the movement to take on a moralistic character. Shryock argues that although
sanitarians were conscious of the physical evils of intemperance, they had
so many other things to worry about that they left the liquor question to
the temperance enthusiasts.\(^1\) The prohibition movement in the United States
gained enough strength that in the fifties half the states either forbade or
restricted the sale of alcoholic beverages. In the nineties and for some
time thereafter the physiology school children learned gave a prominent
place to illustrations of how alcohol and tobacco were destructive to the
human body.\(^2\)

Among the earlier arguments against tobacco was the claim that it
ruined the optic, auditory, and olfactory senses, and subverted the taste
for natural, unseasoned food. It drained the nation of intellectual power.\(^3\)
Coffee, which between 1821 and 1836 had become widely used, was believed to
be an amorous excitant and forced into early maturity the sexual capacities.\(^4\)

Some thought eating fruit after dinner was bad, while others extolled
the qualities of fruit. Gluttony was widely attacked. One reformer esti-
mated that alcoholism killed 50,000 American annually, "folly in dress" ac-
counted for 80,000, while "downright gluttony" destroyed a round 100,000.\(^5\)

---

2. For a report of recent scientific investigation on alcohol see Emerson,
ed. Alcohol and man; the effects of alcohol on man in health and in
disease. In the preface the authors state that they found themselves
"at one on the matter of a much needed re-writing of those books, texts,
and courses in physiology, hygiene and health offered to the children
of the intermediate and high schools of this country...."
4. Ibid. p. 280.
An evidence of the state of affairs can be seen in an old cookbook which solemnly warned young husbands not to expect more than three sorts of meat in case they brought the boys home to dinner unannounced.1

Sylvester Graham was a diligent reformer of the time who advocated vegetarianism, wholeshee products, the virtues of bathing, fresh air, sunlight, dress reform, sex hygiene, and exercise. There were Graham boarding houses in the larger cities and Brook Farm had a special table for the Grahamites. Another current notion, sometimes combined with Grahamism, was the hydrophy or water cure, which consisted of applying much water inside or outside the body, or both at once, in order to rid the body of its ailments. Most of the communist societies formed during the last century incorporated such reforms as prohibition of alcoholic drinks, tobacco, and even pork, and they emphasized the importance of fruits and vegetables.2 Shryock concludes that although some arguments of these health reformers were absurd they did pave the way for modern hygiene by teaching the danger of drugs, the importance of hygiene, and the ounce-of-prevention argument.3

Then there were the reformers in matters of dress. Union suits for women were once believed a daring but healthful innovation. Mrs. Bloomer thought her ideas on women's clothing made for greater utility as well as health.4 Frequently radical ideas in consumption were tied up with radical ideas of other sorts. Feminists have sometimes worn masculine attire.

1. Ibid.
2. The religious communist societies are analyzed in some detail in section 3. The Owenite and Fourieristic communities also usually favored health reforms.
It is difficult to distinguish the health from the moralistic reforms in some of the above examples. Often they were combined, as in the temperance movement. Nevertheless science became an increasingly popular authority to cite, until today it seems to be the one authority most acceptable to everyone. There have been many mistakes made in the name of science. Besides intentional mistakes like quackery, there are unintentional ones such as emphasis on certain aspects of diet, an emphasis revealed to be over-emphasis by later research. The importance of orange juice and milk may have been overrated, for example.

Such alterations in scientific thought do not lessen respect for it, and the days of the old-time "moralist" seem to be numbered. Where science can disprove his reforms it has done so; where it cannot, the knowledge of how other cultures live has led to doubt that any one pattern of living is the one and only correct way of life. As Summer said,

The mores can make things seem right and good to one group or one age which to another seem antagonistic to every instinct of human nature.¹

The attitude today is positive rather than negative. Modern society seeks the maximum health and comfort and looks to science as a guide, an attitude foreshadowed in the utopias of Bacon, Andreae, and Campanella.²

In specific cases man is urged to adopt scientific standards if they exist, and in all cases he is expected to adopt the advice of experts. There are

¹. Summer. Folkways. p. 231.
². Herein lies the contrast between Plato's ideal commonwealth and that of the utopias created at the opening of the scientific age. "The heads of Plato's city are metaphysicians, who regulate the welfare of the people by abstract doctrines established once for all; while the most important feature in the New Atlantis is the college of scientific investigators, who are always discovering new truths which may later alter the conditions of life." Bury. The idea of progress. p. 60.
specific nutritional standards and medical standards, and the family is to
go to experts in matters of child training, interior decorating, and meal
planning. Religion today does less dictation in matters of consumption, but
rather concerns itself with social orientation and spiritual welfare. It
also is positive in its outlook, being more concerned with present day
problems than with those of the life hereafter.

Another contribution of science is the change in notions of cause-and-
effect. The robbery of a church in Bern would not now be attributed to
God's wrath at disobedience to sumptuary laws, and the stock market crash of
1929 was not generally blamed on indulgence in hard liquor and reading bad
novels, as was the crisis of 1857.

No longer is there the fear of innovations which sumptuary legislation
indicated so strongly. Modern advertising has urged the new on the public
until it hesitates to keep anything old; science has taught that the world
is dynamic and that man should not hesitate to make his way of living a
changing one; and pragmatism is especially popular because more than any
other type of philosophy it embodies this urge for adaptation.

Summary and conclusions.

The transition from medieval to modern ethical thought was gradual. The
Reformation renewed the ascetic ideal in some respects, but increasing wealth
led to its final abandonment. Mercantilists and classical economists with
their emphasis on increasing the wealth of nations encouraged the ideal of

---
1. Some types of religion still regulate certain details of living. For
example, the Mormon church forbids the use of tea, coffee, tobacco, and
alcohol. In small communities of Lutheran faith teachers are not given
jobs if they dance or smoke.
a materially abundant life. Higher scales of living resulting from the Industrial Revolution, and the rise of democracy, led to concern over the living standards of the masses; these two forces also helped to weaken social status quo and to encourage individual freedom of choice in matters of consumption. Moralistic and health reformers abounded in the nineteenth century but the health aspect gained the upper hand. Science became the leading authority of the modern era. It changed the notion of cause-and-effect, abolished the prejudice against innovations, and urged objective standards.

In conclusion, ethical thought for the modern period contains the following ideas which are significant for the problem of wise consumption:

1. Democracy, especially the phase of individual freedom of choice.
2. The abundant life, especially materially.
3. Choice with knowledge, especially scientific knowledge.

This hasty sketch of history is not, of course, proof that these are the most important phases of modern ethical thought. In Part II, however, a survey of evaluations of consumption in quantitative terms is undertaken to find more tangible indication of what is the dominant ethical thought.

---

1. See the introductory statement to Part I.
Section 3

An Illustration of the Triumph of Modern over Ideational Ethical Thought

With the increasing strength of the new order of thought, ideational ethical thought suffered a decline. The decrease in sumptuary legislation which sought to prevent extravagance and enforce the simple life was one specific evidence of the new era. Although governments discontinued, to a great extent, the regulation of personal habits of consumption, there were groups of people who practiced the simple life among themselves and strictly regulated their own modes of living. Their movement was a continuation of the spirit of the Reformation, and a continuation in their eyes of the philosophy of the primitive Christian church. Their organizations were one of the last outposts in modern times of ideational evaluations of consumption.

With the rise of Protestantism dissenting sects, believing that theology had not yet been sufficiently reformed, withdrew to lead as strictly ascetic lives as possible. These groups were to be found throughout Europe. The Moravian brotherhood and the Anabaptists of the sixteenth century had many members, and the Hutterites, who now live in South Dakota and Canada, trace their history back to this sixteenth century movement.¹

Evaluations of consumption in American religious communistic societies.

Although there were many religious communities with strict habits of

consumption in other countries, the purpose here is to describe only those in the United States, and only the strongest of these. The communities studied are the Hutterites, Shakers, Rappists, Zoarites, and the Amana colony, Oneida community, and Bethel-Aurora communities.¹

The Shakers lived in the eastern states, the Rappists in Pennsylvania, the Zoarites in Ohio, the Amana Inspirationists in Iowa, the Oneida Perfectionists in New York, and Bethel was in Missouri while Aurora was in Oregon. The Shakers were predominantly American as were the Perfectionists at Oneida, but the other colonists were mainly German.

All of the communities were religious, and divine inspiration played an important part in the early history of several of the colonies. For example, Mother Ann Lee of the Shakers received inspiration and ruled the community in accordance with these divine messages. The Amana colonists had a similar belief in inspiration and usually referred to themselves as Inspirationists on this account.

The Rappists practiced celibacy but lived in small homes. The Shakers practiced celibacy and lived in large dormitories. The other communities permitted marriage but it was believed less desirable than the state of celibacy, and in Amana, for example, a couple suffered a temporary fall in grace at marriage and at the birth of each child. The Oneida community, founded by J. H. Noyes, was different from all the other communities in that it had little outward manifestation of religion, and complex marriage was required.

The members of these communities led simple and healthful lives. In most cases there were restrictions on diet. Some ate no pork and ate but little of other kinds of meat. Some prohibited alcoholic drinks while others permitted them only in moderation. The predominance of Germans in several cases meant indulgence, though moderate, in beer and wine. There does not seem to have been much condemnation of tea and coffee. Tobacco was usually prohibited. It must be remembered that the nineteenth century was characterized by diet reformers and the Grahamites undoubtedly influenced the communities. Health was emphasized in all colonies.

As for clothing and hair dress, most communities at some time adopted "unworldly" uniforms. The Shaker men wore light blue coats and broad hats, and the women wore dark dresses and caps which nearly hid their faces. The Rappist men wore blue suits; the women wore Normandy caps. The Muterites shunned buttons and used hooks and eyes instead. In other communities where men dressed like most men of the world, their dress was notable for its plainness. Vanity in dress was abhorred. The women in the Oneida community to show their freedom adopted short skirts, pantalettes, and bobbed hair, but vanity was suppressed even here and each woman was restricted to one breast pin for adornment. The Shaker men wore their hair long behind, but other communities did not particularly require long hair. For all communities it appears that the religious pattern of life required simplicity and abhorred vanity, but the details depended on the opinions of the leaders.

Housing was simple. Sometimes there were common dining halls but private homes. Some dispensed with the common dining hall. The houses in most cases were plain and often unpainted. Attempts to avoid ostentation were evidenced by the lack of fences, pavements, and ornamental trees in
some communities. Poverty, however, was perhaps the real cause of the plain exteriors of Bethel and Aurora. Some but not all communities expressed the aesthetic sense by cultivation of flowers, but the interiors of homes were usually void of aesthetic refinements. Biblical exhortation kept most communities from hanging pictures. The interiors were inevitably clean and arranged to secure the greatest efficiency in performance of household tasks.

Recreation and education also reflected simplicity of life. Children learned trades and simple recreations. In many cases there was little reading in the community. It was held that the Bible gave sufficient information, and quotations were cited from the scriptures to show the danger of worldly knowledge.¹ The Shakers prohibited instrumental music and the Amana colonies frowned on it for many years. In some of the German communities, however, there was band music. Dancing in some cases was considered wrong. Cards were universally condemned. The Oneida community was the exception and encouraged all forms of recreation, and believed education would not weaken religious faith. In most communities there were usually set hours for work and religious observance, and routine was very important.

The relation between the simple, religious life and well-being.

From these examples it is possible to analyze the relation of the

---

¹ In the Amana colony it was believed that reading for pastime was "soul dissipation" and "diverting the mind from heaven and the things which are of the Lord." Reading to acquire knowledge was also denounced since it is written in the Bible that "knowledge puffeth up" and that "in much wisdom is much grief; and he that increaseth knowledge increaseth sorrow." See Shambaugh, op. cit. p. 148.
simple life to spiritual well-being, as seen in the eyes of these colonists. The avoidance of emulation, ostentation, and individual wealth means a better ability to serve God. There are two possible reasons for this. In the first place, the religious spirit is actually different from the acquisitive spirit and the two cannot exist side by side. Secondly, a simple life means more resources, in way of thought, time, and energy, will be given to God. The collective use of material resources leads to greater security for all, which is in keeping with God's desires.

There may be still another religious reason for the peculiar habits of consumption found in these communities. Being different from the rest of the world bound them together and made them more aware of their religious ideals. It will be observed that their religions demanded no one specific pattern of consumption for the pattern varied with communities, but the general spirit of simplicity was the same in all communities.

There were, however, influences on their consumption other than the religious. Poverty may have caused some to live simpler lives than otherwise they might have done; it was poverty which caused some of the societies to take the communistic form. But the Amana, Shaker, and Rappist colonies were relatively wealthy, and yet they adhered to the simple life. Nature of the racial stock was another factor in the pattern of consumption. Most German communities had their bands, and communities where peasant groups predominated had little intellectual interest. Interest in health was probably due to the health reforms prevalent during that period. On the whole, however, it can be concluded that there was such a thing as the ideational or religious spirit which required a simple and unworldly life for its attainment.
Causes of dissolution of the communities.

Most of the communities were dissolved before the close of the nineteenth century, with the outstanding exceptions of the Amana colony and Hutterian settlements which endured into the present century. When dissolution of the communities occurred one of the most outstanding causes was contact with the world. The younger members of the community wanted a less monotonous life, wider interests, freedom to live as they chose, and a chance to climb up in the world. In the Rappist and Shaker communities celibacy decreased the population and the doctrines of these religions were not attractive enough to bring in young members. There were, however, other and sometimes more immediate causes of dissolution such as the death of the leader, disputes over ritual, financial difficulties, and outside opposition.

Contact with the world can be seen in the kind of changes which occurred in the communities prior to dissolution. Some communities took to clothing themselves like other people. The Shakers adopted the aesthetic spirit to the extent of cultivating flowers and permitting instrumental music. The Amana colony found it necessary to permit more reading, and little vanities were sometimes overlooked. Portraits were finally permitted and the Inspirationists went to the city and had their pictures taken in "world clothes."

2. "Sometimes in the privacy of her own room the little Amana maid decorates herself with ribbons and cheap jewelry or dons a pair of red and gold slippers with high heels. 'Well, maybe she does,' says the elder, 'but it is not allowed.'" Shambaugh, op. cit. p. 142.
In her book, *Amana that was and Amana that is*, Mrs. Shambaugh discusses the implications of the dissolution of the Amana colony:1

The railroad, the automobile, the airplane, the telegraph, the telephone, the radio, the daily newspaper and the magazine, and the insistent gossip and "prattle" of hoards of "worldly-minded" visitors were the forces that broke the circle of seclusion. A machine civilization drew Amana into its inextricable circle and taught it all it knows.

For the individual, the Great Change meant a decrease in discipline from without and an increase in discipline from within. It meant greater freedom of initiative in meeting life's problems, and greater freedom of conscience in matters of religion and worship. It meant the possibility of realizing many a dream and of satisfying many a suppressed longing. It meant, too, the possibility of a freer participation in the world of petty pleasures and passing vanities. For the ambitious, it meant the opportunity of higher education.... It meant the ownership of homes and automobiles, and of other things which could be purchased with wages and shares of stock.

Conclusions

This brief case study of the religious communistic societies shows that these ideational evaluations of consumption are in many ways different from those of the present era, and that the two kinds of thought, in the western world at least, have difficulty in existing side by side.

---

PART II

EVALUATIONS OF CONSUMPTION IN QUANTITATIVE TERMS

The transition from medieval to modern ethical thought as it affects ideas of wise consumption has been briefly traced. As further indication of the nature of modern ethical thought an analysis of evaluations in quantitative terms has been made. Long before the technique for making statistical studies was perfected, there had been concern over the relation of consumption to welfare and speculation on whether the relation were a measurable one. Early students postulated the problem in terms of wealth in general and welfare in general, and speculated on whether the two were arithmetically related. Certain economists have carried the discussion into our present day. Section 4 will treat of this attempt to measure the relationship of wealth to welfare.

A different approach is that of family scale of living studies which are discussed in section 5. In so far as these studies contain judgments of consumption, the assumption is that a certain amount of expenditure, or a certain type of consumption good, or a particular use of time, makes for greater well-being, but no measurable relation is sought between types of consumption and the well-being they generate.

Besides these studies of particular groups of families, there have been attempts to estimate the advance of civilization, and the relative status of nations, states, and cities. Have we made more progress than our predecessors? Is the United States a better place to live than the Argentine? Has Duluth a more desirable environment than Pittsburgh? In answer
to these questions quantitative indexes have been built for purpose of comparison. Usually measures of consumption form a large part of such indexes. For example, that civilization is most advanced which has a small proportion of its income going for food. One city is a better place to live than another because it has more parks and playgrounds per 10,000 inhabitants. Such comparisons naturally give a clue to what types of consumption are considered most desirable. Section 6 will discuss these indexes of the welfare status of communities.

These three sources of evaluations of consumption discussed in sections 4, 5, and 6 are not, of course, the only sources in present day culture. For a more complete picture of contemporary opinion there should be a detailed study of government regulations of consumption. Further, the voice of the reformer is not stilled, and a complete picture of contemporary opinion should include an analysis of current reform movements for evaluations in consumption. Current fiction may also prove a fertile field for evaluations. Further, it is likely that the social sciences such as political science and sociology contain assumptions implying the relation of certain types of consumption to welfare. If possible, it would be highly desirable to find some means of determining what is the most representative thought of today. It will be observed that sections 5 and 6 are concerned primarily with the United States. Evaluations being made in other countries should also be considered.

Although Part II is far from exhaustive in its choice of sources of evaluations of consumption, it is believed that with the current emphasis on quantitative studies, any evaluations to be found in quantitative terms will be fairly representative of contemporary thought.
Section 4

Economists' Opinions on the Measurable Relation

Between Wealth and Welfare

Economists who have tackled this problem have usually assumed that wealth is an undifferentiated heap of economic goods and services, while welfare is a state of happiness or other conscious feeling of well-being.

With increasing wealth during the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries, interest in the materially abundant life increased. Adam Smith and Ricardo believed that increasing the wealth of nations would bring about increased well-being. Smith observed that "no society can surely be flourishing and happy, of which the far greater part of the members are poor and miserable,"¹ and Ricardo began his chapter on foreign trade with this introductory sentence:

No extension of foreign trade will immediately increase the amount of value in a country, although it will very powerfully contribute to increase the mass of commodities, and therefore the sum of enjoyments.²

Commons puts the following interpretation on the attitude of Smith and Ricardo:

An increase in the quantity of product, according to Smith and Ricardo, is an increase in the quantity of use-value and this is paralleled by an increase in the happiness of mankind. The assumption back of it is that human wants in general are unlimited....Functional psychology was not known to Smith or Ricardo, and therefore no meaning of use-value could be given except the meaning of happiness in general.³

3. Commons. Institutional economics. p. 176,177. Smith and Ricardo did realize that these final use values, whose abundance brings happiness, will be psychological when they arrive and as divergent as the tastes of consumers. Hence Smith's exclusion of use-value from economics. Ibid. p. 189.
There is a history to this point of view, for wealth is etymologically but a longer form of the word "well," and wealth in the older sense signified the kind of welfare that is "so dependent on the possession or periodical receipt of certain external objects, such as bread, meat, clothes, or money, that the word came to be applied to those objects themselves as well as to the state of body and mind produced by access to them." The classical economists were interested primarily in the mechanism of the social organization of production, assuming that if wealth as a whole were increased, society would be better off.

The law of economics that wants in general are insatiable, except in particular situations where a given want might be satiated according to the law of diminishing utility, continued to appear in economics texts until very recently. According to many writers not only were wants insatiable, but it was desirable that people have many and varied wants.

To civilize a savage, he must be inspired with new wants and desires, even if not of a very elevated kind, provided that their gratification can be a motive to steady and regular bodily and mental exertion.

The importance of wealth in the eyes of most seventeenth and eighteenth century writers is also shown in the attempts at "moral arithmetic." Bernoulli maintained, for example, that it could be assumed that "moral fortune," or happiness, is inversely proportional to "physical fortune," or wealth. In other words, a minimum of subsistence being granted happiness increases continuously with an increase in wealth, but in inverse ratio. To a man with 100 ducats an increase of 50 would yield the same increment of

happiness as an increase of 500 to a man with 1000 ducats.\footnote{Daniel Bernoulli's argument, "Specimen theoriae novae de mensura sortis," appeared in the Transactions of the Petersburg Academy. v. 5. 1730-1731, and was separately published in 1738. The above interpretation is taken from Laird. The idea of value. p. 325. A similar attempt is to be seen in Karapetoff's diagram showing that civilizations and individuals attain maximum happiness when wealth, or quantity of goods, is increasing at maximum rate. See Karapetoff. On life-satisfaction. Am. Jour. Soc. 5:681-686. 1903.}

Regarding large fortunes, Bentham believed the problem was quite indeterminate, but regarding small sums he believed it fair to assume that increase of wealth and increase of happiness are directly proportional.\footnote{See Laird's discussion of Bentham, op. cit. p. 326-330.}

And from Jevons we have the statement:

I hesitate to say that men will ever have the means of measuring directly the feelings of the human heart. A unit of pleasure or pain is difficult even to conceive; but it is the amount of these feelings which is continually prompting us to buying and selling...and it is from the quantitative effects of the feelings that we must estimate their comparative amounts.\footnote{Jevons. The theory of political economy. 4th ed. p. 11. Italics are Jevons'.}

Marshall has been accused of assuming a direct relation between wealth and well-being, as indicated in the following passages:\footnote{Marshall. Principles of economics. 8th ed. p. 134, 717. Italics are Marshall's. Robson uses these passages in an accusation of Marshall. See Robson. Relation of wealth to welfare. p. 12-15.}

When we speak of the dependence of wellbeing on material wealth, we refer to the flow or stream of wellbeing as measured by the flow or stream of incoming wealth and the consequent power of using and consuming it.

It has been assumed that the happiness of life, in so far as it depends on material conditions, may be said to begin when the income is sufficient to yield the barest necessities of life; and that after that has been attained, an increase by a given percentage of the income will increase that happiness by about the same amount, whatever the income be.

Marshall, however, probably had no intention that such an impression should be drawn from his book. Much more outstanding in his book is his theory of
human activity. Marshall was sincerely interested in welfare and was a deep enough thinker to see that wealth is not all there is to life.\footnote{1}

Knight, like most thinkers on the subject of welfare, is also skeptic of wealth as being the whole of life. He writes,

\ldots life is at bottom an exploration in the field of values, an attempt to discover values, rather than on the basis of knowledge of them to produce and enjoy them to the greatest possible extent. We strive to "know ourselves," to find out our real wants, more than to get what we want.\footnote{2}

Pigou in his \textit{Economics of welfare} sought to treat welfare mathematically. This type of analysis confined him to the national dividend, or real income in terms of goods and services, and to the distribution of this dividend. Pigou admits that economic welfare will not serve as a barometer or index of total welfare,\footnote{3} but he does believe that when "we have ascertained the effect of any cause on economic welfare, we may, unless, of course, there is specific evidence to the contrary, regard this effect as probably equivalent in direction, though not in magnitude, to the effect on total welfare.\ldots"\footnote{4} In other words if for some reason real income is increased or more equally divided, then total welfare has probably been bettered rather than worsened. In his chapter on the quality of the people Pigou treats of the more intangible aspects of welfare.

There are other arguments that the relation between well-being and

\begin{itemize}
\item \textit{Parsons. Wants and activities in Marshall. Quart. Jour. Econ. 46:101-140. 1931.}
\item \textit{Knight. Ethics of competition. p. 106.}
\item \textit{Pigou. The economics of welfare. p. 12. According to Pigou, economic welfare consists of the national dividend. A better phrasing of the idea of economic welfare would be "material causes of welfare."}
\item \textit{Ibid. p. 20. Italics are Pigou's. Pigou would put the burden of proof on those who hold the contrary belief. It might be argued by some, however, that the burden of proof rests on Pigou.}
\end{itemize}
quantity of economic goods and services is not likely to be an overly close one. First, some goods and services created are desirable while others are to be condemned. Ruskin took the "dismal science" to task for neglecting to see that some wealth is really "illth" and should not be consumed, and until lately it was not uncommon to find the term "illth" defined in texts on economics. Some of the nineteenth century economists, in writing on consumption in their treatises on political economy presented ideas on what was desirable and what was undesirable consumption. For example, consumption should be consistent with moral rectitude; it should conduce to the satisfaction of positive wants, and not to sensuality, pride, and caprice.

Secondly, there must be consideration of how income is earned. Working conditions may be bad. Commons believes economists have usually held that work is distasteful. The "disutility" attitude he traces to Locke.


3. "With Locke and his Puritan contemporaries, all individuals were under a duty to work and accumulate—a duty imposed originally as punishment for the sin of Adam and Eve, and it was only those who actually worked and accumulated, and thus served the commonwealth, who fulfilled their duty to God." Commons, op. cit. p. 31. Writers of the present century have pointed out that workers may receive much satisfaction from their work. It is questionable whether the national dividend, as defined by Pigou, takes care of this type of satisfaction.

4. Pigou, op. cit. p. 10. "It will be sufficient to lay down more or less dogmatically two propositions; first, that welfare includes states of consciousness only, and not material things; secondly, that welfare can be brought under the category of greater and less." The present study is in substantial agreement with these two propositions.

Just how to measure general welfare and then to measure that part of welfare due to economic goods and services is a problem with which moral arithmeticians and economists have had little success. With the growth of a rigorous economic theory, confined largely to an analysis of the price system, there has been little concern on the part of economists over the relation of wealth to welfare. The productive system produces whatever goods and services are demanded. Economics does not pass judgment on the relation of these goods and services to the well-being of those who demand them.

On the whole, these writers seeking to measure the relation of wealth to welfare proceeded deductively. They had neither actual data on amount of wealth available nor a means of measuring the intangible substance of well-being. Other minds in the meantime took up the task of relating wealth to welfare, but they made the problem perhaps more subject to solution by studying actual consumption in terms of expenditures, inventories, and more recently, uses of time. The assumption of those interpreting these scale of living studies is that certain kinds of consumption have a tendency to make for more or less well-being, but this tendency is not put in terms of precise measurement.
Section 5

Evaluations of Consumption in Studies of Family Scales of Living

A.

Introduction

Studies of scales of living are a relatively new invention. These studies are the product of the scientific spirit of inquiry and especially of the growth of statistical methods. Therefore the attitude of makers of expenditure studies is different from that of moralists and sumptuary legislators. The modern investigator in securing the facts about expenditures refrains from bias. If he attempts interpretation of the data in terms of well-being, however, the investigator usually finds that he must pass judgment on the consumption of the families studied. It is these judgments or evaluations which the present study will analyze.

By way of introduction the present section takes up briefly the most important of the early studies of actual consumption. These are followed by a discussion of studies made by the bureaus of labor in various states in this country, from 1870 to 1912; these studies sometimes contain evaluations of consumption. Since 1918 there have been many farm family living studies made; these are analyzed for evaluations. Beginning shortly after 1900 there were attempts to set up minimum budgets for urban wage-earning families and families on relief; some of these budgets are discussed, as well as recommended budgets for farm families which were set up in the past decade. Finally, there are a few studies of uses of time which contain an occasional opinion on what is the best use of time.

At the beginning of Part I four requisites were set up for an accurate picture of evaluations of consumption and the ethical thought they
represent. At that time these requisites were applied to the attempt to trace the history of evaluations of consumption. These four points, however, are equally applicable to any attempt to describe present day evaluations and ethical thought. The extent to which section 5 fulfills these requisites may be summarized as follows:

(1) Inclusion of a variety of sources of evaluations of consumption. The introduction to Part II indicated that there is not a consideration in the present study of government legislation, of current reformers, or of evaluations to be found in modern fiction or social science. It is believed, however, that studies of scales of living because they are frequent, because they treat of consumption, and because they seek to refrain from bias, tend to show commonly accepted evaluations.

(2) Inclusion of a representative sample of evaluations from any one given source of evaluations of consumption. Section 5 includes the most frequently cited early studies of consumption, but it does not include a discussion of all of the early studies. For example, the LePlay monographs are not analyzed. While it is believed that the number of studies of state bureaus of labor and the number of farm family living studies analyzed is more than adequate for a representative sample, studies made since 1933 are not included. As for minimum urban budgets, only the earlier ones are included, with three examples of the more recent. The sample of recommended budgets for farm families is believed representative, however. The Consumer Purchases Study and the urban studies for other than minimum budget purposes are not included. Leob and Chapin have made suggestions

1. See p. 12 of the present study.
2. For example, Feixotto. Getting and spending at the professional standard of living; a study of the costs of living an academic life.
which might be of use in studying evaluations in scale of living studies.

These are not included in the scope of the present analysis, however.

(3) Valid interpretation of evaluations in terms of ethical thought. The scale of living studies involve peculiar difficulty in this respect. In all cases of evaluations, whether the purpose of the study was to make evaluations or not, the investigator may have included certain evaluations because they were easy to make quantitatively; whereas other evaluations, not made because of difficulty of securing the necessary facts, might have been more indicative of contemporary ethical thought. Since the purpose of many studies containing evaluations was not to interpret but to give facts, the evaluations in these cases were a side issue and perhaps should not carry too much weight in illustrating modern ethical thought. On the other hand, such evaluations may be so commonly accepted that they were included as a matter of course; if this is so they are very valuable in indicating the nature of modern ethical thought. Improvements considered possible under the circumstances may affect the investigator's opinion of what is desirable. For example, Rowntree's minimum budget set up at the beginning of this century may not have been as generous as the Chicago standard budget because the likelihood of raising the scale of living in Rowntree's time was less than it is today. Yet Rowntree might have believed a more abundant life for the poor to be as important as do relief

2. Sometimes categories were used for purposes of convenient classification of expenditures, but such categories had great influence in determining the type of evaluations of consumption which were made.
authorities today.

(4) Understanding of the nature of a culture which may be different from that in which the investigator lives. While this requisite is not of concern in section 5 which treats primarily of studies in the United States, it would be of concern in interpretation of present day evaluations of consumption in totalitarian states.

For convenience in analyzing the evaluations of consumption to be found in these scale of living studies, the terms "objective" and "subjective" standards will be used. An objective standard is one which can be written down and which, when used by various investigators in judging the consumption of a given family, will result in nearly identical evaluations. Objective standards are of several types:

a. Scientific standards such as for nutritional content of food. The term "scientific" is usually applied to agreed-on means of attaining health and efficiency, e.g., the product of research.

b. Quasi-scientific standards such as for housing. There is agreement that light and air are necessary for health and certain arrangements are necessary for efficiency, but there is not complete enough agreement on the standards so that housing standards can be called scientific in the strict sense of the word.

c. Other standards based on the advice of experts, but not called scientific. Such for example are standards for children's reading, landscaping, etc.

d. Relative standards. For example, the expenditures of one group may be compared with that of another group. Relative standards are sometimes used for clothing.

Recommended budgets, taking into account all categories of consumption, usually combine all four of these objective standards.¹

¹. Two further observations should be made. Noting the presence or absence of conveniences in the home, for example, is a form of objective standard, and all objective standards are not the result of the opinion of expert
Subjective evaluations, on the other hand, consist of standards which cannot be written down in clear enough form to produce identical results when used by different investigators. An example is where an investigator visiting a home judges, by glancing about, that the family is in poverty, or its members have cheerful faces. It must be noted, however, that such subjective standards are based on common opinion as to what constitutes poverty and cheerful facial expressions, and to some extent such subjective judgments have possibilities of becoming objective.

Another instance of a subjective standard is where the family itself decides its income is not enough for "comfortable support." In other words, the family compares its standard of living with its scale, but the standard of living is so intangible it cannot be written down in clear enough form for an outsider to use.

It is believed that such evaluations as occur in these scale of living studies are usually made in the light of contemporary ethical thought which the investigator has absorbed, largely unconsciously. The early studies show an occasional tendency toward moralism. The later studies are void of moralism but proceed to uphold such values as education, recreation, and healthful diet. The development of several species of objective standards when compared with the type of evaluations occurring in sumptuary legislation shows the emphasis of modern ethical thought on the opinion of experts, especially scientific experts.
Early Studies of Consumption

One of the earliest attempts at an evaluation of consumption in a statistical study is that of Sir William Petty, who, in his *Political Survey of Ireland* made at the end of the seventeenth century, sought to ascertain Ireland's capacity for trade. He was interested in obtaining statistically a unit of value constituting the sustenance necessary for a day. Gregory King, also interested in statistics, made a rough comparative analysis of living among different classes in England, France, and Holland. Richard Dunning's *Bread for the Poor*, another seventeenth-century study, contained a minimum standard of living. Such minimum levels were based partly on how the people were actually consuming and partly on the author's opinions of what constituted the minimum subsistence for maintaining working efficiency.¹

One of the most important early studies of expenditures was Sir Frederick Norton Eden's study on *The State of the Poor*, written in 1797. Eden thought that the miseries of the laboring poor "arose, less from the scantiness of their income (however much the philanthropist might wish it to be increased) than from their own improvidence and unthriftiness."² He gave recipes for the better utilization of food, lamented the amount of

1. Petty, A political survey of Ireland, 2d ed. 1719; King, Natural and political observations and conclusions upon the state and condition of England, 1698; Dunning, Bread for the poor, 1698. For a brief discussion of these and other early studies see C. C. Zimmerman in U. S. Dept. Agr. Misc. Pub. 223; 15-17. 1935.
2. Eden, The state of the poor; a history of the labouring classes in England, London, 1797. 3 v. The above quotation was taken from the abridged 1929 ed. p. 100. Parentheses are Eden's.
beer and tea drunk, and suggested that the people wear clogs, heavy
shoes which kept the feet dry and comfortable. In comparison, when
one comes to the minimum budget movement of the twentieth century there
is a parallel interest in increasing the real income of the very poor,
but the method of increased monetary resources is emphasized rather than
recipes; beer and tea are not so much lamented; but there is a parallel
interest in securing better food and clothing.

One of the earliest and most systematic classifications of expendi-
tures was that of Duquétiaux made for the International Statistical Con-
gress of 1853. This classification included a list called "Expenses of
a luxurious and improvidential type" with the following items: (1) beer
and wine, cafes, saloons, liquors with high alcoholic content; (2) tobacco;
(3) gambling; (4) toilet articles; (5) theaters; (6) fetes and public
recreation; and (7) loans and expenses at the pawn shops. This classi-

cification reflects the opinion of the time in regard to extravagance. As
will be seen later, the more recent studies attempt no such classification.

In 1886-1888 Charles Booth made a survey of poverty in London, the
first thorough study of poverty ever made. Booth classified the families
into eight classes according to extent of poverty or degree above it. These
classifications were primarily a matter of the opinion of the investigator
who observed the way the family lived, how crowded the household was, the

---

1. The improbability of increased monetary income for the poor in Eden's
time may have been one cause for his rejecting this source of melioration.
2. See Zimmerman. Consumption and standards of living. p. 28. He took the
list from Duquétiaux. Budgets économiques des classes ouvrières en
Belgique. Brussels. p. 6-8. 1855. It is possible that Duquétiaux used
this classification for purposes of convenience in description rather than
for evaluative purposes.
occupation and regularity of work, whether or not there were outdoor relief, and the general appearance of home and people.

The next important poverty study was Rowntree's investigation of York.1 His unique contribution was an objective minimum standard; families falling below this were considered in poverty. This standard was not, however, one on which anyone had ever been known to live a physically efficient life. It was an eclectic affair. The food standard was based on Atwater's nutritional standard, with the foodstuffs taken from the workhouse menu from which butcher's meat was subtracted. Local prices of food were used. Housing was taken as found. Rowntree explained that this minimum did not include the development of the mental, moral, or spiritual sides of human nature, and it left nothing for insurance or sick clubs.

Families in primary poverty were those whose total earnings were insufficient to obtain the minimum necessaries of this objective standard. There were some families earning more than enough to maintain the minimum level, but the investigator might decide that they were living in poverty anyway, a purely subjective decision based on his opinion of evidences of want and squalor. In other words, there was much poverty which was a matter of judgment of the investigator. These families were said to be in "secondary poverty", a poverty which they themselves could alter if they changed their ways of living, for supposedly their income was adequate. Drinking was believed a frequent cause of secondary poverty.

Also outstanding in the field of consumption was Ernst Engel who contributed much to the technique of statistical studies. He is especially noted for the formulation of the following "laws of consumption:"

---

The poorer the family, the greater the proportion of the total expenditures which must be devoted to the provision of food.

With greater well-being there is joined not merely a better material existence, but also an improved intellectual and moral life.¹

In summary, these earliest studies of consumption contained evaluations in terms of minimum standards; most of these were minimum of subsistence levels and were arbitrary lump sums. To a considerable extent poverty was a judgment based on subjective opinion. Rowntree set up the first objective minimum standard. Dupaëtiaux exhibited remnants of the old notion of luxury and extravagance in his classification of expenditures. Engel in his laws of consumption suggested as an index of adequacy of income the percentage of expenditures going for food, and implied that well-being includes intellectual and moral life as well as "material" existence.²

² See p.177 of the present study for a comparison of the various definitions of "material."
Studies Made by Bureaus of Labor in Various States

From 1870 to 1912 there were some 120 studies made by state bureaus of labor in this country, studies which contain information on scales of living. These studies form a homogenous group but thus far little attention has been paid them. Yet they contain a few indications of evaluations and these should be studied. The present analysis proposes to show contributions as well as shortcomings of these state labor bureau studies in regard to evaluations of consumption. These early studies can be readily criticized from the viewpoint of technique in collection, tabulation, and presentation of data. Accuracy of the data and representativeness of sample are open to question. The attempt here, however, is to find out what concepts there were of desirable consumption and the methods for determining extent of well-being. It is not the accuracy of the findings which is of concern but the ideas on what was believed to be wise consumption.1

When state bureaus of labor were created they usually copied in whole or in part their statement of purpose from that of Massachusetts. Among other tasks, statistical details were to be collected relating to the "commercial, industrial, social, educational, and sanitary conditions of the laboring classes."2

---

1. The bibliography for expenditure studies used in the present analysis is Williams and Zimmerman. Studies of family living in the United States and other countries. U. S. Dept. Agr. Misc. Pub. 225. 1935. In referring to expenditure studies, the citation number in this bibliography will be given. For a full statement of author and title of these studies see p. 209-211 of the present study. All state bureau of labor studies in the Iowa State College library were used; they comprised approximately 65 per cent of the state bureaus of labor studies listed in the Williams and Zimmerman bibliography.

2. See, for example, the acts passed in Maine, Kansas, and the State of Washington.
statistics are presented with no hint of an analysis or discussion. Yet more than one such study was preceded with the pious hope that the pages would contain "many valuable statistics," valuable for what and with what interpretation was seldom stated.

Even though analysis might be missing the questions asked about living conditions, in the earlier studies, indicate something of the bureau's idea of what was important. Most frequent were the questions on home ownership, children in school, extent of insurance, membership in beneficiary organizations, and existence of savings or debt.

That home ownership was considered desirable was borne out by an occasional statement of the agent visiting the homes, or by the person writing up the study for publication. The chief purpose of the information on home ownership, however, was to determine the size of the mortgage and interest payments as these were a drain on the family income. Young children were supposed to be in school instead of at work; very occasionally there were questions on ability to read and write, but these soon disappeared as it was found that cases of illiteracy were rare. Insurance and membership in beneficiary societies implied that security thus provided was desirable. A family with savings was better off than one in

2. One study thought that the wage earner in answering questionnaires was coming to realize that "upon the correctness of his statistical data and the manner in which he keeps his accounts largely depends his welfare in the matter of a better understanding of his social and economic life." It was claimed that such data led to an intelligent comprehension of relations between capital and labor, and provided a guide to legislation. Kansas (276) p. 1.
3. When studies began to list expenditures in detail, one can no longer judge the importance of particular items simply because they were included in the list of questions. The Massachusetts studies early listed expenditures in detail, but they were the exception rather than the rule.
4. N. Carolina (209) p. 4. The commissioner believed there was need for a livelier interest in education. See Michigan (233) p. xxiii for a statement in regard to the question on literacy.
debt, but the interpretation of saving and debt varied. A New Hampshire study implied that when families were in debt they were living extravagantly and such families were believed the cause of discontentment and strikes. A Maine study seemed to imply that savings need not increase with increased income, but that a higher scale of living should be adopted. Earning should be increased to meet the demand for a higher scale of living.

Very occasionally there would be a question on whether there were books or magazines in the home, or whether library facilities were used. In these cases data might also be secured on ownership of sewing machines and musical instruments. In one or two cases the questionnaire asked whether religious facilities were available, whether family members belonged to a church, and how many attended religious services.

Sometimes in an effort to get at the financial condition of the family the outright question was asked, "Can you earn more than enough to comfortably support your family?" "As compared with 1898, has the cost of your living increased or decreased?" Although such questions were not successful in securing concrete indications of comfortable support or cost of living, they did indicate the family's opinion on whether it was comfortably well-off, and a family's opinion on this matter is a part of its well-being.

3. N. Carolina (237) p. 158.
6. Kansas (271) p. 3.
7. See the Yale study in which faculty families were asked to state their opinions on how well off or poorly off they considered themselves. Such an approach indicates whether a family's scale of living reaches its standard of living. Henderson and Davie, Incomes and living costs of a university faculty.
Turning now from the questions asked in the questionnaire and schedule, one finds the statements in which the agent indicated his judgment of each family or of the community. One family is described by the agent as follows:


The agent apparently was so pleased with the condition of this family that he went into more detail than in his descriptions of other families. Most agents seemed to consider that home heat which was plastered and ceiled, and contained carpets, organ, sewing machine, clothes wringer, ornaments, and other furniture. Occasionally the agent noted the community church attendance, number of barrooms, and brandy and whiskey distilleries.

Besides noting the presence or absence of certain features, whether carpeting or church attendance, the agent might use certain evaluative words of comparison in regard to housing, surroundings, sanitary conditions, furnishings, food, clothing, and general appearance of the family. The agent used such evaluative words as excellent, good, fair, scanty, dilapidated, nutritious, comfortable. There were the terms, nice, aged with dust, homelike. The family was healthy looking, noble looking, or had pinched faces. Character traits of intemperateness, industriousness, cheerfulness, seem happy, were sometimes included. Obviously such judgments

1. Missouri (245) p. 342.
2. As a rule state bureaus of labor did not seek to determine extent of drinking, but agents visiting homes sometimes made comments on drinking. The U. S. Bureau of Labor studies of living abroad to compare with living here did not hesitate to make remarks on extent of intemperance. In the state studies workmen and employers often commented on the prohibition question.

of consumption are not strictly objective. True, the existence of plastered homes furnished with conveniences could be determined. These were considered desirable because those with higher incomes had them and they were fast becoming part of the general American standard of living, just as the automobile, refrigerator, and radio are today. But when the agent judged homes as nice, and judged the family by its character traits, a subjective judgment entered in. It is certain that character traits are important; they are an example of well-being, and if some definite, measurable relation could be found between them and consumption the chief problem of evaluations of consumption would be solved.

After the data were gathered, someone put them into tables and put the statements of agents and remarks of workmen and employers into publication form. The person thus compiling the study, perhaps it was the commissioner of labor, might comment on the presence of certain furnishings, or the extent of home ownership, savings, debt, and education. As for other objective standards of consumption, there were very few used. Although some information was obtained from the questionnaire on number of persons in the family and number of rooms in the house no attempt was made to determine overcrowding. Very rarely was a remark

1. Subjective as such judgments are, they reflect common opinion to a considerable extent.
2. A Maryland study (283) made an observation indicating an opinion that income and contentment are in inverse relation. It was observed that the two poorest paid workers were most contented, while the two highest paid believed in socialism. p. 8.
3. The question on number of rooms was usually asked when the family rented; it was an attempt to find out the range of rents. A few times one finds a question on number of families living in one house, but no interpretation is made of this question. See Kansas (208) p. 160. The failure to evaluate adequacy of room space may have been due to its being considered unimportant. More plausible an explanation, however, is the lack of system in analysis.
made on sanitary condition of the home. As for food, the agent visiting
the home might comment on the food as nutritious, or more variety necessary,
etc., but the person writing up the study obviously did not have much
information for evaluating food other than, in a few cases, information on
expenditures for food. An occasional Massachusetts study took advantage
of Atwater's work.¹

When there was an attempt to get at the relative well-being of
families, the easiest way was to make comparison with the expenditures of
others. Such comparisons were very rare, however. Family expenditures
were compared with that of former times, workers in other states, state
convicts, and workers in other countries.² After 1800 an occasional
study made use of the sum determined as a minimum living standard in
various states.³ Occasionally there was a remark that the family should
not find it necessary to call on poor relief authorities. Sometimes
the amount of money spent or the percentage for various items to be
found in Engel's studies was used for comparative purposes. It is not
clear whether the investigator thought Engel had found the most desirable
distribution of expenditures.⁴

In conclusion, the authors of these early studies seemed to believe
home ownership, savings and insurance, and education were important.
There was slight attention paid to religion. They knew that the relatively
well-to-do families had carpeted and plastered homes and owned equipment
such as sewing machines, wringers, pianos, and organs, and hence judged

1. See Atwater. Methods and results of investigations on the chemistry and
2. For a comparison with workers in other countries see Iowa (229) p. 6-8.
3. Maryland (296) p. 135. In Iowa study (251) p. 135, one workman in his
comments said that a man with a family needs at least $2 a day to keep
his family properly.
4. Kansas (207) p. 133. This study also used the work of Atwater and infor-
mation on state convicts. p. 132, 175-176.
the level of living of workers in that fashion. The modern ideal of a comfortable home was being anticipated. Scientific standards were practically non-existent, the closest approach being the use of Atwater's investigations on nutrition. But comparisons could be made with the expenditures of workers elsewhere, with the idea that the greater the expenditure the better off the family. Such comparisons were rare, however. The subjective evaluations occurring besides reinforcing the above conclusions also indicated the importance of personality traits.

How typical are these evaluations in representing the ethical thought of the period from 1870 to 1912? Since the investigators undertaking these studies did not have a personal axe to grind in the sense that the reformers did, it is probable that the evaluations occurring are fairly representative of common thought. However, circumstances under which the bureau of labor studies were made probably result in their being a less fertile source of evaluations than the ethical thought of the period might demand. For example, the primary interest of the state bureaus of labor lay in wages, strikes, working conditions, and the cost of living. They did not seek to evaluate how the people were actually living so much as to make it possible for the worker to achieve his existing standard. Even so, in the consumption studies if more use had been made of the statistical technique available at that time perhaps more possibilities of evaluation might have presented themselves.
D.

Farm Family Living Studies

The next large group of expenditure studies to be considered is that of the farm family living studies, most of which have been made since 1918. Those made between 1918 and 1934 will be considered here. These studies reflect to some degree the change in evaluations of consumption occurring since the studies of the state bureaus of labor which were made earlier. The present discussion is based on the state agricultural experiment station bulletins and United States Department of Agriculture bulletins. There are approximately seventy of these studies.

These studies differ considerably from the state bureau of labor studies which preceded them by 10 to 50 years. The farm studies were made as a unit in themselves, not as a side issue to any problems such as wages, strikes, and the effects of immigration on the status of labor. Where the farm studies are part of farm management studies, the living studies retain their own character.

On the whole these living studies were undertaken with experiment station funds with the purpose of giving a picture, with quantitative measures, of farm living. Instead of sending out questionnaires through

1. It is estimated that only eighteen such studies were made before the World War.
2. As listed in the Williams and Zimmerman bibliography. There are a considerable number of studies which are mimeographed, but these have not been included in the present survey. It must not be thought that the period of farm family living studies is over, for such studies are still being made. The studies referred to in the present discussion will be identified by the name of the author and the citation number in the Williams and Zimmerman bibliography. For the complete title of the studies cited in the present analysis see p. 211-213 of this thesis.
the mail and receiving back a small number of replies to questions many of which were not well-stated in the first place, as was the case with most state labor bureau studies, the farm studies used the schedule or account method, or both. Data for all families were summarized and presented. The bureau of labor studies had usually given lists of answers to questions with very little in way of summary. A further difference between the early bureau of labor studies and the farm studies is in statement of purpose. To discover the purpose of the former studies it was necessary to go to the statement of the law creating each labor bureau, but nearly every farm study includes, directly or indirectly, a statement of purpose. These purposes may be classified into two categories. First are those intending to give only a description of living with no attempt at evaluation.\(^1\) Secondly, there are attempts to give, besides description, something in the way of evaluation to indicate how descriptions might be used for evaluative purposes.\(^2\) Many studies do not state purposes directly but a perusal of their findings and an analysis of them indicates that what was accomplished was purely description, with perhaps one or two statements about the living as compared with that of others.\(^3\)

Among statements indicating the possibility of an evaluation of consumption are the following:

---

1. See Canon (94). Richardson (128) p. 5. states: "It is not intended that the information assembled here should be regarded as an attempt to set up a standard or fixed pattern for rural living, but rather that it shall present a picture of rural life as it actually exists in Montana today."  
2. Sometimes such a purpose was stated, but far from accomplished. See Hayball and Thomas (135). 
3. See p. 61 for a discussion of the relation between purposes of studies and the validity of the evaluations they contain, validity so far as representing modern ethical thought is concerned.
Household accounts give us the financial history of the family in question for a period of time, and in the details of that history is written the record of the family's life. The skilled interpreter can translate this financial history into terms of health, of education, of social life, of community spirit, of self denial and of thrift.  

The final objective of all study of agriculture is the improvement of rural living....This (series of rural life studies) is only a beginning. Next must come definite and concrete suggestions as to how rural living can be improved through detailed studies of the homes in which farm people live, of household comforts and conveniences, food budgets....

The results (of these studies) are expected to provide a scientific and practical basis for comparing household expenditures of country families in one state with those in other states and also for comparing the farm family's cost of living with that of town and city families. The information so secured should serve as a suggestive budget guide by which families can regulate their expenditures.

Black and Zimmerman selected 65 successful farm families and studied their living in order to show young farm people the advantages of farm living as compared with town living. Obviously the selection of 65 families as successful required some sort of a standard for successful living.

The following paragraphs treat of the types of evaluations made by various studies, along with a brief discussion of their shortcomings. It should be understood that no one study contained all of the evaluations listed, or that every time some sort of a standard for desirable consumption was set up its shortcomings were realized and listed, because such is not the case. The four most frequent evaluations occurring were those of average value of farm living, expenditures for "advance", the presence of modern conveniences in homes, and evaluations of food. These evaluations occurred in about a fourth of the seventy studies analyzed. A

2. Zimmerman and Black (66) p. 3.
3. Vonkampfihn et. al. (42) p. 9.
4. Black and Zimmerman (72).
fifth of the studies contained evaluations in matters of education, reading, and amount of room space in housing. About six per cent of the seventy studies had evaluations of surroundings of the home, social activities and recreation, medical care, and clothing.

As was noted in the introduction to this section, section 5 does not include an analysis of urban studies other than those of minimum levels. It is believed, however, that the urban studies omitted would present pictures of evaluations similar to those of the farm family living studies.

In detailed studies of consumption whether farm or urban it will be observed that for a complete picture of consumption, information is secured on expenditures, types and quantities of goods and services currently received, inventory such as books and furniture, and occasionally the use of leisure time.

**Average value of farm living.**

The average value of farm living has been frequently used as an index to well-being.¹ Behind it is the assumption that the greater the money value of farm living the greater the well-being. Zimmerman's 65 successful farm families were those with a high value of farm living. In comparing various states investigators have commented, for example, the fact that the particular families in their studies had higher value of farm living than others.² The owners were better off than tenants because they

---

1. Average value of farm living includes not only expenditures, but also the value of home-produced and home-used commodities, such as vegetables, wood, etc. A similar index is that of net money income.
2. "An average value of farm living amounting to $1,095 suggests a quality of living that compares very favorably with that prevailing in mountain communities elsewhere." Clayton and Peet (104), p. 120.
had greater total amount of living "cost".¹

It is true that the greater the value of farm living the more monetary resources² the family has for consumption, but there are drawbacks to this index, the same drawbacks which net income in the case of city families would have as an index:

1. The real income or actual goods and services received from expenditures may not be as large as supposed. Efficiency of purchaser and price level must be considered.

2. A lump sum representing value of farm living does not show:

   a. Expenditures for various categories of goods such as food, clothing, housing.
   b. Types and quantities of food, clothing, housing, etc.
   c. Inventory, such as furniture, books.
   d. Leisure time available and the use to which it is put.

In studies of low-income groups, however, amount of income is an important index, for a very low income has deleterious effects on health and attitude toward life.

Expenditures for "advancement."

An almost equally popular way of evaluating consumption is to consider the category "advancement,"³ which includes the goods and services over and above such items as food, clothing, housing, and perhaps savings. It is believed that the greater the proportion spent on advancement the greater the well-being. Engel probably started this idea in the interpretation of expenditure studies when he formulated the law, "With greater

2. With the addition of home-produced and home-used commodities.
3. The very term "advancement" is itself an evaluation. Other terms for the same category of expenditures, but occurring less frequently among these studies, are "sundries" and "miscellaneous." These latter terms do not carry the connotation of an evaluation.
well-being there is joined not merely a better material existence, but
also an improved intellectual and moral life." Engel believed the laborer's
greatest well-being is promoted under conditions in which not more than
30 per cent of his income is needed for the material satisfactions of life,
thus leaving 20 per cent or more for cultural items. 1 It was probably
Carroll D. Wright who re-stated Engel's law to read, "The higher the income,
the greater the proportion spent for advancement, or sundries" and implied
that it was a desirable state of affairs. 2

The index of expenditures for advancement may be taken to have two
meanings. In the first place, in so far as its increase is associated
with an increase in income, or expenditures, it is the same sort of index
as the average value of farm living. 3 The second and usual significance
attached to expenditures for advancement is that of a very desirable set
of expenditures. Some of the later farm family living studies used the
percentage spent on advancement without comment on its significance, implying indirectly however that the greater this category the better off the
family. 4 Other studies state definitely that the size or the relative
size of the advancement category is an index of desirable consumption.

Variations in expenditures for advancement goods are one of the best
indications of the prevailing standards of living and increases in
the proportion of the expenditures used for advancement would be

2. See Mass. (172).
3. Oyler (96) p. 75. "The amount spent for advancement goods is a signifi-
cant measure of the financial progress of the family." Kirkpatrick (23)
p. 7. believes that the per cent for advancement responds with greater
total expenditures, and so is as good as the total expenditures for an
index. Other studies have not found this to be true, however.
4. A discussion of mobility among Oklahoma farmers has the statement that
to a certain extent, somewhat larger amounts are spent for advancement
by those who move less frequently. Sanders (63) p. 81.
indicative of a rising standard of living.\textsuperscript{1}

It seems that the most satisfactory, universally applicable, single measure of a desirable standard of living is the proportion of family expenditures devoted to items of advancement, embodying formal education, reading matter, organization dues, contributions to church and Sunday school, expenditures for vacations, special trips and similar items.\textsuperscript{2}

One cannot help asking why advancement goods are to be commended. One hypothesis is that the standards of what is desirable in consumption are adopted from the way higher income groups consume and these higher groups usually spend more for advancement purposes. There is also the hypothesis that investigators had in mind the ideal of developing potentialities over and above mere subsistence, in other words, the ideal of the abundant life in terms of a variety of interests.

Is it true, however, that the category of advancement expenditures contains goods which really lead to advancement or improved well-being? Kirkpatrick believes that with all advancement goods, expenditures may carry little indication of the social or the spiritual satisfactions which these expenditures make available to the family.\textsuperscript{3} Zimmerman voices a different objection when he states that a greater percentage of expenditures for sundries usually indicates an increased complexity of life, and it is questionable whether a complex life is more to be desired than a simple life.\textsuperscript{4} A close scrutiny of the actual commodities and services included under advancement leads to further doubt. Kyrk

\textsuperscript{1} Anderson (79) p. 48. Compare this statement with Chapin's comment on expenditures for sundries. See p. 103 of the present study.
\textsuperscript{2} Thaden (47) p. 95.
\textsuperscript{3} Kirkpatrick (43) p. 26.
\textsuperscript{4} Zimmerman. Consumption and standards of living. ch. 12.
made no attempt to gather various items of household expense together under any such heading as advancement or development:

It is believed that no single word adequately describes such miscellaneous expenditures as those for tobacco and cigars, books and newspapers, Christmas presents, Red Cross contributions, music lessons, Farm Bureau dues, tickets to the movies, and expenses at the county fair.1

Zimmerman expresses somewhat the same idea when he describes this group of expenditures as including "expenditures of widely differing social meaning, such as for funeral wreaths, school pencils, lipsticks, whiskey, and engagement rings. However, they are all alike in that they serve to embellish life."2

Some of the recent expenditure studies have abandoned the category of advancement expenditures, breaking it up into items such as education, travel, recreation, etc. A number of the farm studies give a figure for advancement but also give separate figures for formal education, reading, and other items included under advancement.

Food.

a. Percentage of income going to food. A more useful category as an index is that of percentage of income going to food. Engel implied this when he said, "The proportion of the outgo used for food, other things being equal, is the best measure of the material standard of living of a population." Poverty studies of urban families, especially, can make use

1. Eyre (44) p. 68.
2. Zimmerman, op. cit. p. 277. It should be observed, however, that many expenditures for food, clothing, and housing serve to embellish life.
of the category of percentage for food.¹ If the proportion for food is above 50 per cent, in American eyes it is an indication of poverty for them too few resources are left to devote to the other interests in life.²

The index of percentage for food is of obvious importance when one considers that it can be used to compare different cultures and different periods of time, since neither changes in habits of consumption nor changes in value of money affect it. Unfortunately, sufficient expenditure data to make comparison among countries or different periods of time on the basis of food expenditures are not always available.

The distinction between levels of living is sometimes based on the percentage spent for food. Nystrom gives a long list, including the following: On the bare subsistence level 45 to 50 per cent of the income is spent for food; the minimum for health and efficiency standard includes from 40 to 45 per cent for food; the minimum comfort level, 36 to 40 per cent; and so on.³

b. Objective food standards. Science has set up food standards which have been used in some expenditure studies, but to use these standards data on quantity and kinds of food are necessary, and then these data must be analyzed by some one familiar with food analysis and the standards. The time, money, and skill involved often make such an extensive study of food consumption impossible. Sometimes such a study is undertaken and published.

¹ See also studies of consumption in the Orient, where the percentage of expenditures going for food is very high.
³ Nystrom. Economic principles of consumption. ch. 12. Nystrom also gives the percentage of expenditures for items other than food.
separately from the expenditure study which collected the data.

Usually an investigator has little difficulty in securing data on food expenditures. If it were possible to say that a certain sum of money were the minimum for an adequate diet, then this investigator’s problem would be solved providing he supplemented it with data on home-produced and consumed food. But housewives vary in knowledge of nutrition and in buying ability, thus making the monetary sum spent on food inadequate as a standard of nutrition. One investigator, however, assumed that inasmuch as most homemakers in the study were enrolled in home economics extension service they were able to prepare adequate meals. Where data were secured on kinds and quantities of food, the crudest type of a standard was to compare per capita consumption of cereals, for example, with that of the nation. One study compared average consumption of meat, lard, eggs, and milk with that of the United States. There was also a comparison, with other rural areas and workmen’s families, of tons of food consumed per capita.

Some studies gave a statement to the effect that more variety in food was necessary, more fruits, vegetables, milk, less fatty meats, or more calories per day. One or two studies used home production of foods as an index of the extent of the consumption. If vegetables, fruits,

---

1. "In general, money values are poor bases for comparison. Milk varies as much as 25% in price from place to place. Fruits vary widely in price from place to place and time to time. Meat has wide variations in price. Low expenditures should not imply low food values. Adequate diets can be obtained at low cost, but most housewives have too inadequate knowledge of food values to make every penny count." Dickens (80) p.47. "Although these data indicate that a large proportion of the poor quality diets were in the lowest cost group, they also show that cost was not the determinant of the quality of the diets as a whole." Hill et. al. (96) p. 47.

2. Freeman and Souder (121) p.345.

dairy, and poultry products were produced on the farm they were more likely to be included in the diet.

Where a more extensive investigation of dietary content was made, standards such as those set up by Sherman and Rose were employed.¹

Clothing.

Although science can indicate what food values are essential for health, scientific standards for clothing are practically non-existent, except perhaps for small children's clothing.² The profuse underclothing and crinoline skirts have been abolished and most people buy shoes that fit their feet. A few scattered instances like these indicate that the science of physiology has accomplished something. In most cases, however, excepting for vague statements that clothing should be warm or cool according to the season and that it should keep the rain off in rainy weather, science has done little to set up clothing standards for health and convenience.

More important than the standard of health in clothes is the standard of social approval. In fact, usually people expect convention and fashion to rule in the matter of clothing, not science. Carlyle noted that clothing is often based on emulation,³ and Veblen, in The theory of the leisure class, emphasized conspicuous consumption. But how is one to set up a standard of social approval? And to what extent is social approval a

---

³ Carlyle. Sartor resartus. ch. 10.
Studies of farm family living clearly indicate the state of affairs in the field of objective consumption standards for clothing. The majority of studies present clothing expenditures but make no comments upon them whatever. Occasionally a study would say that certain families spend more for clothing than others but there is no suggestion that the greater the expenditure for clothing the better. Once in a great while there is a statement of the purpose which clothing is to perform, but whether the clothing of the families studied achieved this purpose is not a question that could be answered.

Clothing is an important item of the cost of living. It must protect against heat and cold in such a way as to maintain health. It must be appropriate and attractive and reasonably pleasing to the wearer and those with whom he is associated. Farm people feel the pressure of keeping up appearances less than city people, but this difference has gradually lessened as communication has brought more frequent contact with other people.¹

When there is an attempt at some sort of a standard, such a standard is based on the actual clothing expenditures of individuals. In other words the standard is relative to what others have, not absolute in its being related to body functions. One study classified all families as better dressed than average, as average, or not as well dressed as the average.²

Once or twice the clothing expenditures of farm families were compared with minimum budgets for urban families.³ It must be remembered, however, that theoretical minimum budgets are based on current clothing habits and not on anything resembling a scientific standard.

---

1. Rankin. (62) p. 3.
As further illustration of an evaluation in terms of convention, this time in the matter of table linen, one investigator made the following observation:

How can one explain the fact that several families used oilcloth table-cloths who could have afforded cotton damask? How can one explain the fact that one family with a total value of family living of $600-1199 used napkins at every meal, while a neighbor with a value of farm living of $2400-2999 used them when there was company. Rearing and education of the housewife and what is done in the neighborhood are doubtless factors.1

This investigator noted that the educated housewife uses napkins at every meal. That there should be such a correlation is obvious for the American educational system sets up the standard of napkins for every meal. In other categories of expenditures, extent of social life for example, there is also a correlation between desirable ways of living and the education of the homemaker and her husband. Such a correlation obviously exists because the educational system gave both the investigator and the investigated the same standards of what is desirable living.

Housing.

Comments on the status of housing among farm families are numerous, but standards for judging housing are anything but extensive. There were three bases for evaluation:

1. Extent of modern conveniences. This is the index occurring most frequently among the total number of studies.
2. Amount of room space per individual.
3. General condition of house and surroundings. This might include remarks on state of repair and conditions of surroundings. This index occurred least frequently.

Modern conveniences increase productive efficiency of the homemaker, particularly, and greater efficiency may result in greater real income. At the same time, many conveniences provide greater comfort as well as other consumer satisfactions. Modern conveniences include running water and central heating and lighting systems. There should be bathing facilities and a kitchen sink, also a septic tank or some other acceptable means for sewage disposal. Washing machines and laundry tubs are considered important.\(^1\) Sewing machines and refrigerators were mentioned. Most of these items may be classed as labor-saving equipment.

The prevalence of labor-saving equipment is sometimes considered a gauge of the standard of living because it is believed to represent the importance placed on lessening the physical labor of the women of the family. Power-washing machines were chosen in the present study as perhaps the most significant article of this kind.\(^2\)

Other conveniences are sometimes listed, such as telephone, radio, piano, and phonograph.\(^3\) While the automobile is not a part of housing, it is usually included along with the list of conveniences believed desirable.

It is interesting to speculate on the extent to which conveniences and labor-saving devices are a part of the American standard of living. One influence bringing about such an emphasis is the pressure of manufacturing concerns who keep their products before the eyes of the public; refrigerators and vacuum cleaners are well-known examples. Miss Hoyt

---

1. One or two instances of hiring the laundry done were mentioned. Muse (102) p. 34.
2. Kirkpatrick et. al. (27) p. 15.
3. Von Tungeln et. al. (42) p. 23. classifies conveniences in the following manner: The completely modern house has a central heating and lighting system, running water, bathtub, indoor toilet and kitchen sink. Partly modern houses have at least three of the six above mentioned modern conveniences. Conveniences of comfort and pleasure include labor-saving devices, such as iron, vacuum cleaner, pressure cooker, and include automobile, telephone, piano, phonograph, camera, and laundry sent out.
observes that the farm homes studied were superior in telephones and patented equipment rather than in running water and bathrooms.¹

Convenience of arrangement of house should also be considered. Only two of the seventy studies mentioned this. One commented on the size of houses as being so large as to demand too much time and energy of the housewife.² Another study considered the distances which the housewife had to walk in her kitchen and concluded that the kitchens were not the right size and lacked the right arrangements for efficiency.³ This standard was one evolved by scientific investigation.

Almost all studies treating of housing mentioned the number of persons in relation to amount of room available, and quoted a standard set up in urban studies, usually Chapin's or that mentioned in the study by the Bureau of Applied Economics.⁴ According to Chapin's standard there should be not more than 1.5 persons per room.⁵ The bulletin of the Bureau of Applied Economics has a standard of one room per person. It must be noted however that these standards are somewhat arbitrary being based on observation of actual practice plus a general feeling that a certain amount of air space and privacy is desirable. On the whole, however, light, space, and air are available in large quantities

¹ Hoyt (86) p. 215.
² Hase (102) p. 15.
³ Hoyt (86) p. 215.
⁵ "...in all probability overcrowding is not the cause of much of the sickness found among these people, for the open construction of the houses would, in practically all cases where crowded conditions exist, provide for plenty of fresh air." Sanders (20) p. 53.
to the farm family outside the house.\(^1\)

These studies found that usually the farm house was too large rather than too small, and under such circumstances not health but efficiency of operation becomes the basis of judgment. Many farm homes were built when families were larger, in days when a large house was considered a good way of displaying wealth. Today, however, prosperity is shown more in equipment of home, especially labor saving devices, than in possession of a vast amount of housing space.

Besides conveniences of the home and the extent of room space, there is consideration of the general state of repair of the house and the nature of the surroundings. These statements are rare however. Gabbard graded the conditions and surroundings of the farm home.\(^2\) Another study reported the state of repair as good, medium, poor.\(^3\) Then there were general statements such as "fine house, commodious lawn."\(^4\) Many houses were "pleasing in their proportions and possessed other charms of colonial architecture. Unfortunately paint was often needed and some houses were in poor repair."\(^5\)

The most thorough study was Miss Hoyt's which considered neatness of grounds, trees, shrubs, cultivated flowers, exterior architecture, need of paint and repairs, need of trees and shrubs, and a suggestion that they not be planted in stiff rows. Improvement of grounds and garden was ad-

---

1. It was observed that there is nothing that could be considered overcrowding as commonly understood in housing legislation. See Scarborough (30) p. 22 and Kirkpatrick et al. (27) p. 14.
2. Gabbard (54) p. 148-149.
3. Sanders (20) p. 53.
vocated. Miss Hoyt compared Iowa farm homes with those of selected English farms and found the latter to have the greatest exterior beauty. Such a standard is not absolute, but is relative, being based on "what others have found desirable."

Why were the standards most frequently employed those of (1) extent of conveniences, not, however, including convenience of arrangement, and (2) amount of room space per person? Probably because they are easy standards to apply. It was a relatively simple matter to make note of the presence of labor saving devices and to count the number of rooms and the number of family members. General state of repair and surroundings of the home were more difficult because of lack of objective standards. Another reason might be the importance which the American standard of living attaches to the efficient rather than the aesthetic.

As indication of the importance in which modern ethical thought holds objective standards is the suggestion made by several studies that more detailed housing standards be set up.

**Education.**

Formal education is one of the important values in the American standard of living. These farm studies indicate its importance when they speak of the advancement category as a desirable set of expenditures and invariably include education as a part of this category. And where the

---

3. A fallacy in this sequence of thought is indicated when a family without children and hence without expenditures for formal education is said to have a low standard of living.
advancement category is not given, the desirability of education is still stressed. But in the case of expenditures for formal education the criticism can be made that amount of expense does not always indicate quality of education. Instead, the usual way of treating education is to consider the number of school years finished by various members of the family; note may also be made of the speed of promotion of the children who are in school. Occasionally there is consideration of the kinds of schools and the amount of training which teachers have had.

Why should a greater degree of education, which includes reading, be taken to indicate a higher scale and standard of living? The impressions one gathers from these studies are the following:

1. Education may result in greater farm income because the farm operator gains a greater knowledge of scientific farming.

2. Education may result in a greater expenditure because there is more knowledge of how others live and acquaintance with more ways of spending money.

3. Education may result in a greater amount or percentage being spent for advancement, a category in which education and reading are usually important parts. Education may lead to more recreation and social activity, for example.

4. Education may result in more efficient household production. Especially will it result in more labor saving devices.

5. Education may lead to better health because of better diet and a greater attention to necessary medical care.

Reading.

Farm family living studies treat more of periodicals than of books.

1. Reading is a form of education but is usually treated separately in living studies.

2. There may be considerable income available for spending purposes, but many a farm family will turn much of it back into investment in the farm. With more education, less of it may be turned to investment and more to living purposes. The relation between investment and amount spent for living purposes has been treated by Zimmerman in his Minnesota studies.
probably because families have more periodicals than books, and newspapers and magazines are most frequently an item of expense. But how much and what kind of reading matter is desirable? One study found an average of seven periodicals per family and concluded that was a generous amount. ¹

Another study implied the more books the greater the well-being.² It must be observed, however, that the presence of reading material in the home does not always result in its being read.

There are several kinds of periodicals found in farm homes: daily papers, farm journals, general magazines, local newspapers. If any judgment of them occurred it was in way of suggestion that there was a lack of general reading, especially of literary magazines.³ It was sometimes suggested that reading materials should not be confined to local and neighborhood events but that there should be contact with national and international news. Such reading would tend to bring about a greater unity between country and city and would broaden the interests of the rural family. All of this is in keeping with the modern idea that knowledge of how others live and of events that occur is desirable.

In judging books there were two references to a standard, one a standard of the adequacy of libraries⁴ and the other a reference to a California study on children's reading.⁵ One family living study commended the presence

¹ Hill, et. al. (96) p. 54.
² Thaden (47) p. 114.
³ Hill et al. (96) p. 54.
⁴ Muse (102) refers to the report of the Committee on Educational Facilities for Rural People made and published by the Vermont Commission on Country Life, Burlington, 1931.
⁵ Rankin (62) refers to Terman and Lina. Children's reading; a guide for parents and teachers.
of books in the home such as Knut Hansen's *Growth of the Soil* and Sinclair Lewis' *Arrowsmith*, and magazines like the *New Republic* and *Christian Century*.¹

This same study observed that in one fairly prosperous community the proprietor of the bookstore said that cheap novels of the most trashy kind were the only ones that could be sold. The only copy of a modern realistic novel which he possessed had been on the shelf for three years—many of the books in the family libraries were of that generally useless sort sold by book agents.²

There is another approach to the problem of reading and education of farm families, that used by Miss Hoyt, when, through a special schedule, she sought opinions on such subjects as plans for children's education, contacts with the state college, agricultural bulletins, periodicals, books, use of public libraries, travel, and interest in and knowledge of public affairs.³

Social activities and recreation.

The significance of expenditures for formal education, reading, social activities, and other forms of recreation was indicated in the discussion of advancement goods, for these expenditures are invariably included in such a category, where used. However, the purpose of the following brief analysis is to find out if there is anything resembling a specific standard for social activity and recreation.

"Can a social hermit have a high standard of living?"⁴ That he cannot is apparently the assumption of all studies of farm living which devote

---

1. Zimmerman and Black (66) p. 23.
2. Ibid. p. 28. The judgments of the bookstore proprietor and of the investigators are open to more question than a standard drawn up by experts in the field of literature.
3. Hoyt (66).
4. Thaden (47) p. 117.
considerable attention to extent of membership in organizations and expenditures for social purposes. As for standards of recreation, the nearest approach is a statement by Freeman and Souder that six per cent of the general expenditures of the farm family went for recreation, while the families in small towns spent fifteen per cent for that purpose. There was a question in the minds of these two investigators in regard to proper interpretation of the facts. Did the facts mean that farm families did not get their share of pleasure, or that they enjoyed many things which did not have a money cost?¹ The only other statement hinting of an evaluation of recreation was an index of quality, but just one statement: "In some cases the families had patronized burlesque and other cheap types of shows."²

Church.

In the time of medieval sumptuary legislation religion was an authoritative judge of ways of living. It is interesting to contrast the attitude of scale of living studies toward religion with the medieval and Reformation ideas that church attendance should be compulsory and that the church could effectively condemn certain activities.

The earlier bureau of labor studies very occasionally had a question in regard to spiritual welfare, asking whether the community had religious facilities, whether the laborers were members of a church, and whether or not they attended. While most farm family living studies contain church and charity expenditures, comments on these expenditures and on church attendance are few and far between. The chief advantage of church atten-

¹. Freeman and Souder (121) p. 348.
². Zimmerman and Black (66) p. 29.
dance is believed to be the social experience it gives. Some writers would indicate that the church is on a par with the Farm Bureau.

**Tobacco.**

The items of church attendance and contributions, and the expenditures for tobacco were deliberately studied in the present analysis in order to see to what extent attitudes toward them have changed in comparison with the attitudes of previous centuries. There are only three remarks on tobacco which could be interpreted to imply condemnation of excessive smoking. The most obvious of these was the comment that the average expenditure for tobacco among tenant families was greater than the average spent for formal education, reading, church and charity, or recreation.¹

**Medical aid.**

This category has been variously named sickness, death, medicine, health, etc. Ostensibly it includes items such as doctors', dentists', and oculists' fees, hospitalization, expenses for drugs, and in the case of a death category, funeral and monument expenses. Investigators encountered considerable difficulty in evaluating such a category, and what statements do occur are not in the nature of a criticism of amount spent on treatments. Rather there are general statements to the effect that probably the physician was not visited as often as necessary.² The

1. Anderson (79) p. 76.
rarity of annual trips to the physician and to the dentist received very occasional comment.¹ The nearest approach to objectivity, not however based on the particular farm study, is Miss Hoyt's use of available data on the defects of Dubuque rural school children, and a comparison of Iowa per capita expenditure for conservation of health and sanitation with the average for the United States.²

It is possible that modern ethical thought places greater emphasis on health, and hence adequacy of medical care, than these scale of living studies indicate. The investigators may have been unaware of available objective standards. There is the further difficulty that to judge whether medical care for a given family is adequate it is necessary to know the condition of the health of the various members.

**Insurance and security.**

What is adequate insurance? Sometimes studies noted cases where there was a complete lack of insurance. One farm study paid particular attention to insurance and made use of several rather specific standards,³ but it was the only study doing so. Perhaps one reason for the lack of application of standards of insurance in most studies was the fact that farm owners, for example, have farm investment as a guaranty of security thus making personal insurance less important. And in any case, variations in the situations of families makes a different amount of insurance

1. Anderson, op. cit., observed that the living standard was low because not an average of one person per family had a dental examination during the year.
necessary in each case. For these reasons the application of objective standards of personal insurance may be difficult. The lack of evaluations of insurance in these studies should not be interpreted to mean that ethical thought gives scant place to security.

Conclusions.

On the surface it might appear, from the general rarity of evaluations in the farm family living studies, that modern ethical thought does not believe in dictating on what is desirable or undesirable consumption, but would leave choices primarily to the families involved. While there is undoubtedly truth in this interpretation, perhaps these studies do not give a complete picture of ethical thought, for two reasons:

1. The purpose of many studies was to present a description of consumption, not to evaluate it. As has been observed, however, if evaluations do creep in, they probably reflect commonly accepted thought and are a good indication of modern ethical thought.

2. Where the intention of the study was to evaluate consumption, evaluations may have been few and far between because:

   (a) Although it is possible to say that clothing should be warm, clean, comfortable, and with style enough to permit the family to move in public with a fair degree of mental satisfaction; and while it is possible to say that education of the children should be not only for a trade or profession but for life as well; when it comes to making out objective standards difficulties arise. And objective standards were apparently preferable to subjective ones in the eyes of the investigator.

   (b) Objective standards available were not put to use because the investigator was not familiar with them. Frequently in the study of family scales of living there was blind following of precedent without looking about for available standards which have not been used by previous investigators.
Despite these considerations of the possibility that scale of living studies do not give an accurate picture of modern ethical thought, it is believed that these studies do indicate the importance of some aspects of ethical thought. The desirability of an abundant life is implied in the importance attributed to a large average value of farm living in preference to a small average value. Comforts and conveniences in the home were emphasized. The advancement category, containing the things over and above the necessaries of food, clothing, and shelter, was believed by many to contain those values which make life worth living.

One can see also in these studies the importance attributed to choice with knowledge. Especially is formal education a value in the American standard of living. In the eyes of the investigators broad reading was to be preferred to that of a limited range. Further proof of the importance of choice with knowledge, and particularly knowledge of the opinion of experts, is to be seen in the use of objective standards in preference to subjective judgments. A particular preference is noted for scientific standards where available, for example, in the case of food, medical care, and to some extent, housing.

Finally, the third aspect of modern ethical thought indicated in these studies, although indicated indirectly, is the importance of individual freedom of choice. As has been observed, perhaps the general scarcity of evaluations was due to the application of the ideal of individual freedom of choice. Certainly the creation and application of many

---

1. Frequently objective standards are based on the actual consumption habits of the group in question. There is an assumption of a relation between "what is" and "what ought to be."
objective standards is difficult in consideration of differences in age, composition, and consumption habits of various families. And the dominance of the ideal of freedom of choice would prevent any investigator from suggesting that families be forced to live according to certain standards.
Recommended Budgets

Minimum budgets for urban families.

Rowntree's investigation was a landmark in the history of minimum budgets. The minimum of subsistence standard he set up contained an effort at a scientific food standard, although housing was taken as found and there was no provision for the "mental, moral, or spiritual sides" of human nature. Rowntree concluded that a certain income was necessary to attain this minimum standard.

The first important studies in the United States to set up minimum budgets were More's Wage-earners' budgets and Chapin's The standard of living in New York City. On the basis of the average expenditures of two hundred low-income families, Mrs. More concluded that a fair living wage would be at least $728 a year, and perhaps as high as $900. This minimum standard was based on how families were actually living. She assumed that overcrowding existed when the average number of persons per room was more than two. A change since the time of Rowntree in the idea of what constituted a minimum level of living is indicated in the following observation:

A "fair living wage" should be large enough not only to cover expenses which Mr. Rowntree calls "necessary for maintaining merely physical efficiency," but it should allow for some recreation and a few pleasures, for sickness, short periods of unemployment, and some provision for the future in the form of savings, insurance, or membership in benefit societies.

1. See p. 66.
3. Ibid. p. 269.
Chapin in his study of New York families used a standard of 22 cents per man per day for food, a standard based partly on nutritional study and partly on the actual expenditures of the families in his study. On the basis of the average of expenditures on clothing, a clothing budget was set up. One and one-half persons to a room was the standard set for housing, a standard somewhat different from More's. Chapin concluded that at least $800 income was necessary to permit the maintenance of a minimum standard, and that "an income of $900 or over probably permits the maintenance of a normal standard, at least so far as the physical man is concerned." It is interesting to observe Chapin's arguments against excessive indulgence in tobacco and drink; he argued that it lowers earning power and diverts expenditure from more fundamental needs.

The moralistic tone is not completely lacking. On the other hand there is evidence of the importance of the abundant life, for in regard to the category of "sundry items" Chapin says,

They represent expenditures for the satisfaction of what the economist calls "culture-wants"; that is, wants arising out of the desire for intellectual, social and aesthetic gratifications, as distinguished from wants connected with the mere prolongation of physical existence. They include also some physical satisfactions, like tobacco and soda water, which are not indispensable to life. Largely these headings include the cost of that which makes life worth living.

Similar attempts to set up minimum levels of living followed. These minimum levels were based primarily on actual expenditures of the families

2. Ibid. p. 246.
3. Ibid. p. 249.
4. Ibid. p. 198. This category of "sundry items", sometimes called "advance-ments," was analyzed in detail in the sub-section on farm family living studies.
studied. The investigations of Kennedy, Streightoff, Little and Cotton, and the Bureau of Standards of New York City are examples. In 1912 Florence Nesbitt published the first complete family budget to cover all items considered necessary for a dependent family, a budget based as far as possible on what scientific knowledge was available as to needs of individual families.

Minimum budgets came to be used for two different purposes. One was for helping dependent families. Relief agencies have usually found it advisable to use some sort of a minimum standard although in most cases relief allowances have not been large enough to attain the standard. The other use of minimum budgets was for purposes of wage adjustment. Both workers and employers sometimes presented estimates of what minimum was necessary for a living wage. In 1917 was begun the precedent whereby a disinterested party set up an impartial budget. Budgets for wage arbitration tended to become minimum comfort budgets and showed the trend of opinion that levels of living of industrial workers should be raised as rapidly as possible.

2. The Charity Visitor, 1913. Appendix. This budget has since been enlarged and revised; it is known today as the Chicago standard budget for dependent families.
In the application of both kinds of budgets, those for dependent families and those for wage arbitration purposes, the family has usually been granted freedom of choice in its actual consumption. Workers, after settlement of a wage dispute on the basis of a minimum budget, would resist any efforts to force them to follow that budget in their choices. In the case of dependent families, some authorities advocate cash relief so the families can make their own choices. There are a number of advocates of relief in kind, however, especially for food consumption where standards are scientific.

Attempts to force adherence to minimum standards are practically non-existent because (1) the ideal of freedom of choice is prevalent, (2) most items in minimum budgets are not subject to scientific standards, and hence there is lack of agreement, and (3) the size, composition, and present consumption habits of the family may not be compatible with the sort of minimum budgets set up.¹

Every minimum budget set up has been different. Miss Kyrk compared the content of three minimum budgets showing the variations in apportionment of income to different purposes. This comparison is given in Table 1.

One cannot help asking why estimates of minimum budgets vary. Miss Kyrk gives the following analysis of the way in which minimum budgets are built, an analysis which explains the differences occurring in these budgets:²

First the statement of experts in regard to basic requirements for children of different ages and adults of different employments may be secured. The food items in a properly constructed budget represent the best scientific authority in regard to a well-balanced diet. But, unfortunately, for few items other than food is there scientific authority upon which to base the inclusion of this item or that. Under those circumstances as always in lieu of the expert's distum

¹. All three of these arguments are interlinked.
# TABLE 1
Allowances for food, clothing, shelter and other purposes in three standard budgets

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Items</th>
<th>Chicago (1929)</th>
<th>Boston (1931)</th>
<th>Cincinnati (1928)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Food</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Husband</td>
<td>$148</td>
<td>$135</td>
<td>$190</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wife</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>104</td>
<td>160</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Girl seven</td>
<td>96</td>
<td>83</td>
<td>100 (child three)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Girl ten</td>
<td>112</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Boy thirteen</td>
<td>143</td>
<td>127</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Extra allowance for waste</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>**</td>
<td>**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clothing</td>
<td></td>
<td>215</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Husband</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wife</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Girl seven</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>17 (child three)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Girl ten</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Boy thirteen</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Upkeep</td>
<td>**</td>
<td>**</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rent</td>
<td>360</td>
<td>300</td>
<td>360</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Operating expenses</td>
<td>280</td>
<td>224</td>
<td>211</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coal</td>
<td>98</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gas</td>
<td>19</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Electricity</td>
<td>23</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Household furniture and</td>
<td>84</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>supplies</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Car fare</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>(55)</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sundries</td>
<td>252</td>
<td>114</td>
<td>103</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recreation</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organizations and incidentals</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Insurance and savings</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>$1946</td>
<td>$1491</td>
<td>$1674</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


b. More liberal allowances of milk, vegetables and meat than other budgets.

c. Estimated cost of four tons of coal and necessary wood for kindling.

d. Includes only household medicinal supplies; family uses free clinics.
we fall back upon experience. The second guide used in making the
standard budget is the consumption habits of the group in question.
Through the collection of data concerning the consumption of many
households the goods and services bought by the majority of families
and the quantities in which they are bought can be discovered. The
average practice of a large group may be regarded as constituting a
norm below which it would be undesirable to go. The third influence
affecting the budget is the investigators' own standard of essentials.
It is difficult to deny to others what you feel strongly to be
essential.

Recommened budgets for farm families.

In 1929-1931 there seems to have been a movement on the part of ex-
tension workers in certain counties of several states to set up recommended
budgets for farm families. For the present study, seven of these recom-
mended budgets have been analyzed, including one from Mississippi, four
from Colorado, and two from South Dakota. General recommendations were
given in these studies in way of landscaping and housing suggestions,
nutrition, clothing, health, child development, recreation, and organiza-
tions. Frequently these suggestions were very general, for example the
finishes of the home should be simple and restful, and clothing should be
simple, well-fitted, and correctly constructed. There was, however, some
attempt to be more specific in several instances. Then came a report of
actual findings in regard to the expenditures, state of health, housing,
etc. of the families in the county. These actual findings seldom gave the

1. All but two or three of these recommended budgets are incorporated in
mimeographed reports of county farm and home economic conferences and
are not readily available. The following states have one or more reports
in which budgets are recommended: Wyoming, South Dakota, Utah, North
Carolina, Arizona, Mississippi, Colorado, and Washington. See the
Williams and Zimmerman bibliography.
2. Williams and Lindsey (142); Holt et. al. (145), (146), (147), (148);
Sayre and Henkers (117); and Mann and Swanson (138). For complete
titles see p. 213 of the present study.
necessary information for evaluations in terms of the general recommendations. For example, actual data were not gathered on the simplicity, fit, and construction of clothing. This inability to find specific measures for recommendations stated in general terms again indicates the handicap faced by those who would evaluate consumption in quantitative terms.

Finally a complete budget was drawn up in terms of items and amount to be spent for them. As in the case of minimum budgets for urban families, the budgets recommended in these various counties were far from identical.

In summary of the general recommendations, data actually gathered, and final budget drawn up, the following phases should be noted:

1. Objective standards, some of which attempt to be scientific, were implied in
   a. Nutritional standards.
   b. Standards for medical care. Data were gathered on such items as average distance from doctor and hospital, average days lost because of illness, number of cases of colds and defective teeth.
   c. Clothing standards. The fit of shoes was the only instance of a specific standard in the case of clothing.
   d. Sanitary conveniences in the home.
   e. Lighting. One study suggested a standard of 20 square feet or more of window space to 100 square feet of floor space. Only the nutritional standards were adopted in the final budget drawn up.

2. Contemporary opinion on the importance of the abundant life is reflected in the importance attached to education, reading and music, recreation and organizations, and labor saving equipment in the home. Especially striking, because rare, was the statement that "more attention should be given to types of recreation that do not cost much money such as enjoying of nature, fishing, swimming, etc."

3. Recommended budgets to a large extent reflect consumption habits of the group in question. Investigators secured information on actual consumption habits before building the recommended budget.

1. Mann and Swanson (138).
4. The personal opinion of the investigator entered into the compilation of a recommended budget.

Recommended budgets for farm families are fewer in number and importance than the recommended budgets for urban workers because the plight of the lower income groups in urban areas appears greater. The farmer usually has housing and food, but some urban families lack these. Wage arbitration among workmen made minimum budgets necessary but the farmer is usually an entrepreneur. And finally, farm family living studies because of recent developments of technique and the interest of rural sociologists have treated of evaluations to some extent. These recommended budgets have added little to the evaluations made in the farm family living studies per se.

Uses for recommended budgets.

The use of minimum budgets for relief and wage arbitration purposes has been discussed. The recommended budgets for farm families were used by extension workers in planning ways of improving farm living. There are still other uses for recommended budgets. A newly married couple wonder what percentage of their income ought to go to savings and what percentage to rent. A family suddenly finding itself in possession of a $2000 yearly income when accustomed to $5000 wonders whether a recommended budget might not help in its problems of income apportionment. A family moves into a new community and wonders what is the customary expenditure pattern of that community. Sometimes banks and finance companies make out model budgets to help their patrons in problems of income apportionment. Sometimes the family in question has other means of securing information on the customary habits of expenditure in their community or
income class.  

There may be advantages to these model budgets. The newly married couple and the family moving to a new community may find helpful suggestions, as may also the families rising or falling to a different income bracket. A model budget may help a family to save money. Miss Kyrk has the unique suggestion that the family of higher income level may make use of minimum budgets for low income groups, because a perusal of such budgets gives rise to a feeling on the part of the more well-to-do family that after all it does have choice over and above the necessities of life. The family realizes that many of its expenditures which it had considered essential do not really constitute essentials at all.  

But there are disadvantages to model budgets. In the first place such a budget fits a certain type of family in a given situation, while in actuality families differ in size, composition, and in the situations which they face. The second disadvantage of a model budget is that it may prevent the family from thinking about its standard of living; the members of the family may merely copy blindly, or if they have access to the budget for the next higher income group, they may try to "keep up with the Joneses."

One great danger of giving precise advice as to the spending of money is that it may encourage undesirable standardization. There is no fixed amount or percentage which can be named as "best," and the consumption economist is more interested in recommending intelligent divergence from custom on the basis of the needs of particular

---

1. The present analysis has not gathered together a representative sample of these model budgets, other than the minimum budgets for urban families and the recommended budgets for farm families.
3. Agnes Donham has written a case book showing the different problems which arise in income apportionment. See Donham. A case book in family budgeting.
individuals and families than he is in bringing about a standardized world. 1

Conclusions

Indications of contemporary ethical thought are to be seen in these recommended budgets. The desire to include some attempt at an abundant life, even in the minimum standards, is to be seen in comparing the standards set up by Rowntree, More, and the Chicago standard budget. Rowntree advocated a minimum standard which took care only of the most elemental wants of food and housing. More would expand this minimum to include recreation, a few pleasures, medical care, and security. But More's minimum level is lower than that of the Chicago standard budget which makes definite provision, though the allowance is small, for education, recreation, medical care, and insurance. The tendency to raise minimum budgets used for wage arbitration to minimum comfort budgets shows the interest felt in raising the scale of living of industrial classes. It must be remembered, however, that likelihood of securing a more abundant life for those for whom minimum budgets are designed may be a reason for their not being more generous than they are. This may be a possible explanation of the difference in generosity of Rowntree's budget and the Chicago standard budget.

The importance of choice with knowledge is implied in the recommended budgets. These budgets combine the opinion of experts, scientific and otherwise, as well as standards based primarily on actual consumption habits. Scientific knowledge is available for food consumption especially.

choose „rather than atrophy through „keep up with the Joneses."

Later, note that the members of the family seek "security" and the situation
situation and proceed to analyze the couple of circumstances
with the sort of minimum budget set up and (2) students of economics
and hence to establish a comprehensive

The steps

which, or arrangement on what to deconstruct the comprehensive
minimum budgets are not subject to societal standards and hence there is

ence to strike a compromise to a recommended budget. (1) must there in

of freedom, there are supplementary reasons for freedom of choice in

follow a recommended budget in every detail. Besides the General Theory

when minimum standards would consider the parameter that the

budget itself once the wage is secured they are free to spend it in any choice
would object to any attempts to force them to force economic to the minimum

the case of budgets for purposes of wage explanation, certainly the workers

part of social workers to give money rather than money rather in kind. In

rather in recommended budgets. For example, there is frequently a preference on the

The trend of individual freedom of choice that in the Joneses shown in these

as rapidly as societal standards are developed they tend to be ignored.
Studies of Use of Time

Money is not the only resource which the consumer has at hand. Time also should be considered. But time studies are rare compared with the hundreds of expenditure studies which have been made. There are efficiency studies of uses of time in industry, a rare study or two on uses of leisure time among workmen, and a few studies of homemakers' uses of time and farm family uses of leisure.¹

The rarity of time studies as compared with expenditure studies is partly due to the fact that our economic system of production turns out quantities of goods and services to be bought. Industrialization has made people income and expenditure conscious. Especially among lower income groups, among whom the majority of urban expenditure studies have been made, is more income necessary if life and health are to be sustained.

A second possible reason for the scarcity of time studies is the belief that expenditure studies will indicate indirectly, to some degree, the extent of leisure time and the uses to which it is put; examples are expenditures for travel, books, and movies. But there are activities which use little in the way of economic goods and services. Contributions to social organizations are scant indication of extent of participation, while informal meetings are not shown by expenditures at all, at least not with customary classifications of expenditures. Hikes, bird study, and

¹. In Russia there have been collections of data on use of time by typical city workers and peasants. Stralin and Larin distributed the yearly 8,640 hours into production, transportation to work, state duties, household duties, marketing, education, eating, recreation, religion, and sleeping and resting. See Zimmerman. Consumption and standards of living. p. 459. Zimmerman, however, does not give any detail concerning these studies.
outdoor swimming are not likely to be indicated to any great extent by an expenditure study.

Finally, there has not been until recently much development of technique for measuring and evaluating time uses. Examples of recent inventions applying, however, to social relations are the "contact" and the "participation index." H. J. Burt created the idea of a "contact," a concept which facilitated the measurement of activities. There are religious, social, educational, recreational, and economic or trading contacts. A contact is defined as the "exposure of one person to group, except family, influences for one hour."1 Kirkpatrick in a later study made use of the "participation index" in which affiliation, attendance, contributions, committee work, and leadership were weighted.2 Perhaps further technique will need to be developed for evaluations of time uses other than for social activities.

Among the possible types of time studies are the following:

First there are studies of the use of time while at work. Such studies are an aspect of efficiency. Industrial leaders have naturally been interested in the uses of time which will result in maximum product.

There are studies of the effect of working in groups and singly, the effect of rest periods at different intervals, etc.3 The problem is primarily one of technology, namely, what is the best way of doing some given task. It

---

1. Burt. Contacts in a rural community. Mo. Agr. Exp. Sta. Bul. 125:7-8 1929. A primary contact is any contact produced by physical presence in "face-to-face" relationship. A secondary contact is of a more impersonal and indirect nature, such as that experienced through the medium of the printed page, the radio, etc.
3. See Taylor. The principles of scientific management. Also Mogensen. Common sense applied to motion and time study.
is not a problem of consumption.

Then there is the problem of distribution of time between working hours and leisure time. The demand of labor unions for shorter hours shows in part the desire for more leisure time. Technological efficiency is not the goal of man, but rather a more satisfactory life, to be gained by a distribution of time between work and other activities. Only the individual concerned can decide what is the proper distribution for achieving wise living. There is also the problem of wise use of leisure time by the workers, a problem which has been little studied.¹

There have been more time studies made on farms than in urban areas, but even here they are few and far between. In some of the general farm family living studies, which treat mainly of expenditures and inventories, there was an occasional mention of leisure time. A few studies have been devoted primarily to the use of time by most members of the family², but none of these contain an outright evaluation of use of time. There are statements implying that an overly long working day is undesirable. There is concern over the amount of time for sleeping and eating, with hints that in many cases insufficient time is allotted for these purposes. The interest manifested by investigators in the activities of social organizations indicates an evaluation.

It might be well at this juncture to mention the contrast between the idealistic attitude toward leisure time and that of today. Man must

---

¹ See Pangburn, The worker's leisure and his individuality. Am. Jour. Soc. 27:431-441. 1922. The International Labor Office has also made a number of inquiries.
work, according to the old view, because he had sinned. Idleness was con-
demned by churchmen and employers. As for leisure time activities, dancing,
drinking, gambling, cards, and bowling were frowned on. The emphasis was
a negative one. But today the emphasis is positive with a belief in a life
abundant with a variety of interests, as reflected in suggestions for uses
of leisure.

Two farm studies were introduced with statements that time should not
be wasted in mere idleness or harmful practices,¹ but they contained no
evaluations of the use of time in these terms. And that idleness may not
be the demon it was regarded by medievalists and Reformationists, is im-
plied in Frayser's statement:

Most of those interviewed seemed to think that "just sitting" was not
a creditable use of time, and that taking a nap was a confession of
laziness. Doubtless "just sitting" is usually only for relaxation
after work, but it may also give opportunity for conversation within
the family group. At times it may indicate an apathetic state of mind.
On the other hand, it may afford time for the highest type of re-
lective thinking.²

Studies of homemakers’ uses of time imply an interest in the length
of the working day and amount of leisure time, as well as in efficiency.
Several state agricultural experiment stations, using schedules issued by
the Bureau of Home Economics, instituted studies of farm homemakers’ use
of time in the period 1927 to 1930. Data were gathered on time spent in

¹. "Time may be spent in (1) the business of getting the necessities of
life, (2) accumulating a surplus, (3) recreation, (4) self-improvement,
(5) mere idleness, or (6) harmful practices...Just what is the best use
of time depends on circumstances and must be a matter of opinion. The
purpose here is to show how time is actually used rather than how it
ought to be used." Rankin, op. cit. p. 3.
"Since it is conceded that leisure should not be wasted in idleness or
dissipation, but that it should be wisely invested if civilization is to
progress, a study of the present and possible uses of 'spare time' by
adult farm residents should prove of value in a state where agriculture
and home-making are major pursuits." Frayser, op. cit. p. 5.
². Frayser, op. cit. p. 38.
homemaking activities, farm work, other work, personal activities (time spent in sleep and rest, eating, care of person), and leisure.¹ There were two ways of evaluating the time spent in work: (1) by comparison with town homemakers where such data were available, and (2) by comparison with legal regulations of the working week of women in industry. Sixty hours was believed to be a fair standard for the occupation of homemaking due to advantages the homemaker has over the woman in industry.² There are no suggestions on how leisure time might be used to greater satisfaction, but one study asked the homemakers what they would do if they had more leisure time.³

The gainfully employed mother in urban areas presents an especially grave problem, for she usually has very little leisure and even when she is off work she lacks time and energy to engage in leisure time activities.⁴ Then there is the case of the middle class wife who is accused of having an undue amount of leisure time to spend on reading novels and playing bridge. Time studies, perhaps with evaluations, might prove worthwhile in this case.

Are there any scientific guides to the best use of time? As far as health is concerned, science may point out that a certain amount of sleep and relaxation is necessary, a certain amount of outdoor activity may be desirable, and a certain minimum of time should be spent in eating. But

² Wesson, op. cit. p. 8.
³ Wilson, op. cit. p. 47.
how much time should be spent in work and how much in recreation? This is obviously a consumption choice, for one's standard of living leads one to place a certain emphasis on economic goods and services. These are to be earned by labor either in the business world or in household production. But just as strong as the pull of economic goods and services is the pull of leisure time in which to engage in activities other than work.

There is the further question of what sorts of leisure time activities are to be preferred. Many books have appeared on leisure uses, urging, for example, more folks songs, folk dances, less commercialization, less "on-lookerism", more music and art, etc. On the whole, however, the general admonition seems to be that there should be variety and one should seek individuality and creativeness.

Time studies are too scarce to draw any conclusions in regard to evaluations contained in them, but to show what place such evaluations might have in measuring the extent of desirable consumption the following scoring system, compiled by Kirkpatrick, is presented.¹ At the same time this scoring system shows the interlocking importance of expenditures, inventory, uses of time, and attitudes in rating consumption.

---

¹ Kirkpatrick. The standard of life in a typical section of diversified farming. Cornell Agr. Exp. Sta. Bul. 425:49-65. 1923. The scoring system as presented here is a condensation of Kirkpatrick's system. Kirkpatrick secured for this score card the approval of one hundred individuals, including specialists in rural sociology, farm management, home economics, rural education; editors of farm journals; farmers; and others. But the values in this scale are far from fixed for all time. A different investigator undoubtedly would attribute somewhat different values to the various items.
I. Expenditures for necessities, comforts, and luxuries  
   Based partly on average expenditure per cost consumption unit and partly on percentage spent for advancement  
   Points: 200

II. Education of children  
   Points: 300

III. Social values manifested thru disposition to improve environment, use of time, and participation in community activities  
   Points: 500

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>A. Home surroundings and home</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>B. Use of time</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Vacation from farm work</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Recreation at home</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Social entertainment at home</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Household and farm labor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Deductions for</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Work in excess of time stated daily</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Excessive help with farm work</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

C. Participation in community activities and organizations  
   Points: 125

D. General outlook  
   Desire for improvements of farm home; suggestions for community betterment; appreciation of surroundings, that is, realization of certain advantages of farm life.  
   Points: 60

---

Total Points: 1000
Studies of Family Scales of Living, Summary and Conclusions

The evaluations of consumption to be found in these statistical studies of scales of living reflect modern ethical thought. Although the earlier studies displayed a remnant of the moralistic attitude later studies sedulously avoided the accusation of moralism. The trend of modern thought is positive rather than negative, that is, there is emphasis on what people ought to do rather than on what they ought not to do. Tobacco, for example, was severely condemned after its introduction. Although Chapin in 1909 found reason to urge less indulgence in smoking, it is interesting to observe that the more recent consumption studies are neutral in regard to tobacco. Another case is that of attendance at church and other manifestations of religion. These were believed an essential aspect of life by the medievalist, Reformationist, and nineteenth century conservatives. Although an occasional state bureau of labor study might ask about religious facilities and attendance the commissioners of labor did not usually inquire about religion. By the time of the farm family living studies, most of which have been made since 1918, the church had become to the investigators primarily a means for social activity and there is no indication in these studies that church attendance was held to be particularly more desirable than attendance at other organizations for social participation.

Another instance of the negative approach to consumption is to be

---

1. This conclusion is subject to the qualification that an insufficient number of the earliest studies of consumption was analyzed.
seen in the attitude toward idleness. Idleness was frowned on by the
ideational view and employers during and after the Industrial Revolution
greatly emphasized the importance of work. Idleness was also condemned
because of the uses to which it was put.\(^1\) The workmen of the last century,
for example, were believed by many churchmen, employers, and philanthropists
to spend their free time in drinking and gambling. This condemnation of
idleness is not found in the scale of living studies. Perhaps the workman
today has ways of using his free time, other than drinking and gambling.
At any rate, one gathers the impression from analyzing scale of living
studies and from reading current writers on leisure time uses that the
emphasis is not on what people ought not to do but on how many varied and
interesting pursuits they can undertake.\(^2\)

And finally there is Ducépétiaux's classification of expenses of a
"luxurious and improvidential type." This classification was not used in
later studies as it smacked too obviously of bias. Oddly enough, many
of the items Ducépétiaux listed as luxuries and condemned came to be jumbled
together into the category of advancement and commended.

Those then are the evidences of the change from the negative to the
positive attitude in evaluations of consumption. Next to be considered are
the general values which the scale of living studies indicate to compose
the nature of modern ethical thought. In the first place, there is a belief

\(1\). Idleness might be defined as doing nothing, or as engaging in harmful
practices.

\(2\). A third instance of the negative approach is the attitude toward drinking.
Eden lamented beer drinking among the laboring poor. Chapin objected to
alcoholic drinking among the wage earning groups in New York. The early
studies of state bureaus of labor very occasionally had remarks on the
prohibition question. Since prohibition was in effect when most of the
farm family living studies included in the present analysis were made,
the attitude of these studies on the matter of drinking cannot be determined.
in the importance of the abundant life, both materially and in terms of
many interests. Eden did not believe in increasing the wages of the poor
but later students of consumption did not hesitate to emphasize the im-
portance of adequate material means. The generosity of the minimum
standard increased with time as can be seen by comparing Rowntree's
standard with the Chicago standard budget. The tendency to raise the
minimum standard in wage arbitration cases is also evidence of the im-
portance which the present age places on the abundant life. The state
bureau of labor studies advocated greater security and were concerned
over the cost of living. The farm family studies implied that the
greater the average value of farm living the better.

Comforts and conveniences in the home are also desirable from the
modern point of view. This can be seen by observing the parallelism
between the opinions of agents of the bureaus of labor who waxed enthusi-
astic over plastered, ceiled, and carpeted front rooms with nice pictures
on the walls, a marble-top bureau and an organ, and the present day con-
cept of a completely modern home which is one containing a central heating
and lighting system, running water, bathtub, indoor toilet, kitchen sink,
and with the conveniences of comfort and pleasure which include telephone,
radio, camera, automobile, and laundry sent out. If sufficient evaluations
for centuries preceding the nineteenth and twentieth were compiled, per-
haps they would also indicate an interest in the comfortable and con-
venient life. It is fairly evident, however, that in the Middle Ages and
for a time thereafter the comfortable life was not exalted for two reasons:

1. This conclusion must be qualified by the observation that these budgets
were often limited by possibilities of achievement.
the attitude of the Church and the scarcity of comforts and conveniences.

The advancement category is another evidence of the importance of the abundant life. It contains the things over and above the necessaries of food, clothing, and shelter, and supposedly contains those values which make life worth living. For the same reason leisure time is desirable.

Secondly, one sees in these studies the importance of choice with knowledge. Education had an important place in state bureau of labor studies as well as in the more recent studies, although it must be admitted that much of this emphasis on education was to increase productive efficiency. Formal education for children is considered particularly important. In the eyes of the investigators broad reading by children and adults is to be preferred to that of a limited range.

Objective standards of consumption are considered important by these studies. This objectivity perhaps differentiates the modern idea of choice with knowledge from the idea of choice with knowledge held in earlier centuries. The increasing importance of objective standards is to be seen in the elimination from farm family living studies of subjective standards such as were found in the state bureau of labor studies. There are scientific standards for food consumption, and there are indications of a desire to be scientific in matters of sanitation, lighting, and medical care, although specific standards are not used. In uses of time it might be possible to find scientific standards for health in regard to sleep, relaxation, and outdoor activity, but time studies are so rare that evaluations of any sort are hard to locate.

Finally, the third important aspect of modern ethical thought to be found in these studies, although indirectly shown, is the desirability of
individual freedom of choice. The scarcity of scientific standards and
the differences in family size, composition, and habits caused investigators
making out recommended budgets to hesitate in advocating complete adherence
to a model budget. Certainly the dominance of the idea of freedom of
choice would cause a family to object strongly to attempts to force it to
live according to any given budget. Even in the case of budgets for
families on relief, there is debate over the relative desirability of cash
allowances and relief in kind. The suggestion by students of consumption
that families should not copy the Jones' budget indicates the importance
which some thinkers would attach to original thought in matters of con-
sumption.

In conclusion, the evaluations of consumption to be found in these
studies of scales of living reflect the following ethical thought:

1. The abundant life is desirable materially and in terms of a variety
   of interests.
2. Knowledge makes for better living. Especially is knowledge of
   the advice of experts, particularly scientific experts, desirable.
3. Individual freedom of choice is desirable.

None of these ideas are new. Evidences of them can be found in
earlier periods of history and in various cultures. It is believed, how-
ever, that these ideas are emphasized more strongly today than in the
Middle Ages, for example.¹

¹. Compare the conclusions of section 1 with the conclusions of section 5
   just presented.
Section 6
Evaluations of Consumption in Indexes of the Welfare
Status of Communities

Many statistical data on all manner of subjects have been collected
in the past fifty years, and more than one statistician has expressed hope
that from the use of quantitative data the well-being of mankind might be
improved. ¹ From these statistical data a few enterprising social scientists
have sought to select facts with which to build a quantitative index to
compare the status of cities, states, and nations. While this urge to
evaluate aspects of life could probably be explained in a variety of ways,
Havelock Ellis explains it thus:

Life...may be regarded as an art. But we cannot help seeking to
measure, quantitatively if not qualitatively, our mode of life. We
do so, for the most part, instinctively rather than scientifically.²

The assumptions of the present study in regard to quantitative indexes
of well-being are (1) that it is practically impossible to measure welfare,
no matter how defined, whether as a state of consciousness, a matter of
actual satisfactions, happiness, character, personality, justice, or spirit-
ual welfare,³ but (2) since what people have and what they do affects what

¹ "The science of statistics is the chief instrumentality through which
the progress of civilization is to be measured, and by which its
development will hereafter be largely controlled." North, in Korean.
History of statistics. p. 15. More recently one finds the statement
that statistics are used to "check up on most of our philosophies and
theories of general social welfare." Dittmer. Introduction to social
statistics. p. 9.
² Ellis. The dance of life. p. 286.
³ "We have no score which is surely a symptom of intelligence per se...
Nor have we scores which can reasonably be assumed to be valid symptoms
of definite traits of character such as temperance, justice, industry,
they are, and since having and doing in terms of consumption, at any rate, are measurable, then perhaps it is wise to grasp at this relationship and go ahead in making quantitative indexes of welfare. In other words, it is possible to say that a country with a large proportion of its younger generation in school is likely to have a higher welfare status than a country which sends a small percentage of its children to school. But the degree to which the welfare status is improved is not measured.

Most of the indexes used in these scales of evaluation are measures of consumption, partly because these data are available on a wide scale, and partly because there are so few direct measures of the aspects of life believed to be an integral part of welfare. In the indexes that follow it will be observed that some are not of consumption, such for example are birth and death rates, and number of famous men. These may be more direct indexes than the consumption indexes. It is possible that there is some relation between consumption and the more direct measure, but the direct index if available is to be preferred. This section discusses consumption indexes primarily, but a brief list of more direct indexes is included at the end of the section.

Most of the indexes discussed have been suggested by thinkers on the problem of what makes for greater well-being. Since this section is not exhaustive in its search for such opinions, the writer has taken the liberty, where the logic of the situation demands, of suggesting further indexes which might be used.

1. Expenditure and time studies are not available for large groups of people, but there are production statistics on food, clothing, automobiles, etc. For procedure in gathering such statistics see Lough. High level consumption.
2. A direct measure of values would be health and length of life. In other words, there seems to be a consensus of opinion that these are an integral part of welfare.
Attempts at composite indexes.

One of the early attempts to determine the extent of well-being in quantitative terms, expressed in this case as the desirable and undesirable aspects of civilization, is that of Alfred Niceforo who attempted to picture the French civilization in statistical terms.\(^1\) Niceforo considered as possible indexes, among other things, urbanism, consumption of coal (to indicate industrial activities), increase of wealth, proportion of illiteracy, newspapers, luxuries (sugar, coffee, alcohol), food (cheese and potatoes), suicide rate, illegitimate births, birth and death rate, convictions of crime, divorce ratio, seats at theaters, and cooperatives. He also included declarations of atheism and refusals to declare religion.

A recent index is that compiled by Bennett, in which he attempts to compare the United States with a number of other Western countries.\(^2\) Bennett, unlike Niceforo, is not evaluating the various aspects of civilization by whatever quantitative measure is available, but confines his index primarily to the per capita quantum of goods and services utilized annually by the inhabitants of a country.

They (these indexes) are not designed to show whether or not the average person in the British Isles is happier or enjoys life more than the average person in Portugal, but merely to show whether and to what extent the one exceeded the other with reference to use of a limited the not a narrow aggregation of goods and services.\(^3\)

He gives a measure of the scale of living.\(^4\) The index includes the following:

3. Ibid. P. 318. Miss Hoyt has discussed the significance of Bennett's and other indexes. See Consumption in our society. ch. 20.
4. Bennett uses the term "standard of living" in the sense in which the present study uses the term "scale of living".
Professional services.
Deaths per 1000 inhabitants, inverted.
Births per 1000 inhabitants, inverted.
Percentage of total occupied population engaged in professional service.
Percentage of population aged 5-20 attending elementary and secondary schools.
Pieces of mail per capita handled by postal services.

Transport and communication.
Telephone instruments per 1000 inhabitants.
Mileage of telephone and telegraph wire per 100,000 inhabitants.
Teleg raph messages sent per 1000 inhabitants.
Railway locomotives per 100,000 inhabitants.
Motor vehicles per 1000 inhabitants.

Food consumption
Raw sugar per capita domestically retained.
Tobacco per capita domestically retained.
Tea, coffee, and cacao per capita domestically retained.
Citrus fruits and bananas domestically retained.

Bennett also suggests certain other indexes. The validity of these along with the above indexes he actually uses will be considered later. While Bennett did not intend his indexes to indicate effects on welfare, the present study has taken the liberty of analyzing his indexes for their advantages and disadvantages in representing well-being.

Another recent instance of a composite quantitative index is Thorndike's and Woodyard's rating of cities in the United States on the basis of one hundred or more items of fact.¹ Of this total list of items he gives a brief list of the most important points used to compile a weighted "goodness" score, called the GG score. The items are as follows:²

- Infant death-rate reversed.
- General death-rate reversed.
- Per capita expenditures for teachers' salaries.
- Per capita expenditures for textbooks and supplies.
- Per capita expenditures for libraries and museums
- Per capita expenditures for recreation.

---

² Ibid. p. 204-205.
Per capita expenditures for provision of play equipment.
Per capita value of asylums, schools, libraries, museums, and parks
owned by the public.
Public property minus public debt.
Rarity of extreme poverty.
Rarity of less extreme poverty.
Per capita number of homes owned.
Crime reports.
Percentage of persons eighteen to twenty attending schools.
Percentage of persons sixteen to seventeen attending schools.
Average salary, high-school teachers.
Average salary, elementary-school teachers.
Per capita circulation of Better Homes and Gardens, Good Housekeeping
and The National Geographic Magazine.
Per capita circulation of the Literary Digest.
Per capita installations of electricity.
Per capita installations of gas.
Per capita support of Y.M.C.A.
Ratio of value of schools, etc., to value of jails, etc.
Excess of physicians, nurses, and teachers over male domestic servants.
Per capita park acreage.

Thorndike believes that these items "may be called 'good' traits of a com-
munity in the sense that a community with a large amount of the variable
would be considered 'better', other things being equal, than one with a
smaller amount of it, by almost any competent group of judges."¹ As to
the other items not included in the GG list there is less unanimity of
opinion. Examples are large proportions of clergymen, of physicians, and
large families. The chief purpose of his study is to obtain evidence of
the "goodness" of these other items by estimating their correlations with
the GG list.

There have been several other attempts to use a composite standard of
quantitative indexes to indicate well-being. Folsom gives a list to be in-
cluded which suggest the sort of data necessary but he gives no statistics.²
Folsom's classification includes biological welfare to be judged by longevity.

¹. Ibid, p. 198.
². Folsom, Culture and social progress, p. 228-229.
and health; and mental welfare to be judged by (1) an index of mental adjustment (crimes, suicides, insanity, pauperism, unemployment, social insurance, etc.), (2) leisure time, (3) per capita consumption of true luxuries,\(^1\) (4) recreational variety, and (5) an index of individual liberty, to be obtained by a study of the law and customs of the people with a special view to discovering needless coercions. Folsom does not give any specific examples of what constitutes needless coercions. It is easier to speak in general terms than to find statistics for illustration.

Another ranking is that of Visher who compares the status of various states on grounds of number of eminent men and women, mental tests, frequency of telephones, extent of education, per capita income, percentage (among the gainfully employed) of professional people and persons engaged in manufacturing, effectiveness of transportation facilities of several sorts, and health as reported by insurance companies. He also includes per capita circulation of certain magazines, homicides, prisoners, venereal disease, and ratio of income to savings.\(^2\)

As can be surmised from these examples of composite indexes, any attempt to set up quantitative indexes of well-being meets with certain difficulties:

1. In regard to the relation between well-being and a given kind of consumption or resource for consumption.

a. For example, consider the amount spent per capita for school

---

1. True luxuries are goods whose presence gives enjoyment but whose absence introduces no suffering. Psychological necessities, made necessities by social pressure, for example, are not included as true luxuries. Ibid. p. 239. It would be difficult to classify goods on this basis, however.

systems. Are statistics available on amount spent, and are they comparable on an international scale?

b. What do expenditures for schools represent or picture? The extent and quality of education? But perhaps percentage of children of certain ages attending school would be a better item of fact to picture extent of education. Perhaps neither expenditures on schools nor school attendance pictures quality of education.

c. How desirable is education for achieving well-being? In other words, how is it evaluated? Perhaps education means familiarity with many interests and therefore leads to wiser consumption choices. Perhaps education increases productive efficiency and hence the number of goods and services available, and there is assumed a relation between real income and well-being.

d. What is the nature of ethical thought implied in the evaluation? In the above case, ethical thought may be said to emphasize the importance of choice with knowledge and the materially abundant life.1

2. In regard to setting up a composite score containing a number of items of fact. In other words, what items are to be given more importance than others?

Bennett raises the following questions with regard to his composite index: Is luxury food consumption as important as professional service? Is birth rate as important as death rate?

Thorndike states with reference to his GG list for cities. "We make no claim that a certain degree of 'goodness' in a city means equal 'goodness' for all sorts and conditions of men. The values of the facts used in our composite will vary for the bright and dull, parents and celibates, artists and business men, bookworms and nature lovers."2

Analysis of single indexes.

The purpose of the following discussion is not to set up another com-

1. Generalizations in regard to the nature of modern ethical thought should be based on a survey of a large number of quantitative indexes. The number analyzed in the present section is probably too small for valid generalizations.

posite index. Rather, the purpose is to dissect the composite indexes which have been made as well as to study single indexes used by historians and other students of social life.

For convenience the following terminology will be used: The item of fact is the particular kind of consumption or resource in regard to which statistics are supposedly available. The picture is the activity or phase of life which the item of fact represents. For example, expenditures for schools picture education. Iron and coal resources picture industrial activity. Evaluation is the relation of the picture to well-being. Education leads to welfare because education increases productivity and brings about wiser consumption choices. Industrial activity implies greater well-being because of the real income it creates, and many goods and services are believed conducive to welfare.

These indexes may be classified into two general groups: (1) those indicating general resources available, and (2) those indicating ways in which resources may be employed by consumers. There is some overlapping between the two. The indexes in the first group as discussed below include industrial and commercial activity, real income, and leisure time. These are followed by an analysis of the second group which includes household labor saving devices, travel and communication, reading, education, recre-

1. Occasionally a historian judges extent of intellectual interest by importation of books into the American colonies, for example. Historians, however, are seeking to show how people live rather than to give greater importance to some phases of their lives than others. But in so far as importation of books is believed to picture reading, an item of fact has been found. Sometimes, too, a historian goes to the extent of making an evaluation.

2. Availability of statistics on a national or international scale for the item of fact is not discussed here because such a discussion would make the present section unwieldy. That others have usually suggested the items of fact indicates that usually some sort of statistical data are available.
atat, religion, food, clothing, housing, and medical care.

**Industrial and commercial activity.** Historians have sometimes used cities or lack of cities as an item of fact picturing the extent of commercial activity, and sometimes to picture promotion of higher arts and literature. The evaluation is that the increased real income resulting from commercial activity, and the varied pursuits represented by higher arts and literature are indicative of the state of civilization, and civilization in this respect is believed synonymous with well-being. It was the lack of cities in the first part of the Middle Ages which gave that period the name of the Dark Ages. Using this argument, there have been occasional objections to the way in which westward expansion was carried on in this country, resulting as it did in dispersed settlements. Wakefield lamented:

> In the history of the world, there is no example of a society at once dispersed and highly civilized; while there are instances without end, in the history of colonization, of societies which, being civilized, became barbarous as soon as they were dispersed over an extensive territory.

That cities in themselves are not an adequate item of fact to be used in judging well-being is shown in Niceforo’s compilation of data proving that there are disadvantages to urbanism as well as advantages.

---

1. See Firenze’s theory of the place which commerce played in the growth of medieval cities. Medieval cities, ch. 4. Thompson observes, "Not only were they (cities) the focal points of commerce and industry, but as their wealth increased they also became of importance in the promotion of the higher arts and of literature." Economic and social history of the Middle Ages, p. 515, in speaking of the free cities of the Hohenstaufen epoch in Germany.

The use of cities as an item of fact rarely occurs in evaluating present
day culture.

An item of fact used by some writers to picture industrial and com-
mercial activity in different countries is extent of iron and coal resources.
Wythe believes, however, that petroleum and hydro-electric resources offset
any deficiencies in iron and coal. According to him, shortage of iron is
not necessarily more serious than a shortage of foodstuffs or industrial
raw materials, such as fibers. The foreign trade of countries has been
used to picture industrial and commercial activity, but since some countries
produce primarily for export and still do not have more goods and services
for domestic consumption than self-sufficing countries, foreign trade is
not an adequate item of fact.

Thorndike suggests as possible items of fact to picture business
activity the per capita wage earners in factories, values added to manu-
factured products, and bank deposits. These items of fact may not actually
picture industrial and commercial activity because there are workers other
than wage earners in factories; agricultural as well as manufactured
values must be considered; and bank deposits may be large in a country
guaranteeing security, although the country may not have great commercial
activity. For example, Liechtenstein’s primary purpose is to attract
deposits, but there is no manufacturing carried on in this little country.

Other items of fact which have been suggested are number of patents
registered. All patents do not find their way into business channels, how-
ever. Visher would suggest as an item of fact the percentage, among the

1938.
gainfully employed, of professional people and persons engaged in manu-
facturing. His index implies that professional employment occurs only
when real income is high.

Next there is the problem of the extent to which industrial and com-
mercial activity is related to well-being. Apparently a relation is
assumed between an abundance of goods and services and well-being. Some
writers have pointed out that business activity is desirable because it
leads to influence in world politics. But it has been shown that all
implications of commercial and industrial activity are not toward welfare.
More than an abundance of goods and services may be necessary for well-
being; there must be consideration of types of goods and services; the
goods and services may not be well distributed among the population;
working conditions and living conditions among the wage-earning classes
may be undesirable from the point of view of well-being. Business activity
has led to cycles of unemployment which cause suffering, and the political
power resulting from industrial and commercial activity may be a cause of
war. All of these arguments show that quantitative indexes based on
measurements of industrial and commercial activity may not be adequate
to represent well-being.

Real income and its distribution. Some of the items of fact used to
picture industrial and commercial activity have been used to picture real
income. More frequently used to picture extent of real income, however,
are per capita income and per capita value of private property, insurance,
savings and investments. These items of fact may not actually picture real
income, however, because (1) there are sources of real income other than
monetary income, and (2) even in the case of monetary income it is necessary
to know the price level before conclusions can be drawn about the goods and services money income will buy. Further, an increase in scarcity often raises monetary values while the actual goods and services represented are fewer. (3) Per capita figures do not show distribution among members of the population.

(As an item of fact, per capita monetary income might be reduced to terms of real income, but for comparisons of per capita real income in different countries the following information would be necessary: (1) rate of exchange in order to make monetary units comparable and (2) a representative list of goods to price in different countries for representing the collection of goods and services the monetary income will buy. This second step involves peculiar difficulty because of variations in consumption habits of people in different countries and of various classes of people in any one country. 1

There are a number of items of fact proposed to represent distribution of real income among the inhabitants of a country. Thorndike suggests extent of extreme and less extreme poverty, based on rent data. His method of securing a picture of poverty might be questioned. He further proposes number of income tax returns to picture extent of higher income; but there are evasions of income taxes in many cases. He also suggests per capita ownership of Ford automobiles and of cars other than Fords, but there are low cost cars other than Fords today. With all three of Thorndike's proposals there is the objection that they are not items of fact which can be used for international comparisons.

Perhaps the most satisfactory way of picturing extent of real income is the average percentage of income spent on food. This percentage shows

1. Further difficulty is involved when one considers that real income also includes home produced and consumed goods and services as well as so-called community "free services."
what part of the income is left for purposes other than food, and as an item of fact might adequately picture the real income of various countries. Such an item of fact does not face the difficulties involved in money exchange rates, price levels, and differences in food habits.

In way of evaluations there is an assumption that real income is essential to well-being. As has been shown in previous sections of this study more than real income in general is necessary for achieving welfare. There must be consideration of specific kinds of goods and services which make up real income; working conditions may be undesirable from the point of view of well-being. According to many thinkers on the subject, greater equality in distribution of real income is necessary for welfare. The idea of the greatest happiness of the greatest number can be taken to imply the desirability of a more equal distribution of real income. It is argued, especially in democracies and communist societies, that everyone should have an opportunity to lead a life of varied and interesting activities, and real income is necessary to such a life. There is the further belief that taking from the rich to give to the poor will not decrease the satisfactions of the rich as much as it increases the satisfactions of the poor.¹

Leisure time. Folsom suggests per capita hours of true leisure as one of the most direct and unequivocal evidences of a community's welfare, true leisure not including that caused by unemployment, for example. Folsom suggests no items of fact, however, to represent true leisure. Average length of working day might be a possible item of fact. Extent

¹. Cf. section 4.
of facilities for leisure time, such as those suggested by Thorndike, might be used as an indirect item of fact picturing leisure time available.

The evaluation behind leisure time is the assumption that leisure time means opportunity to engage in activities other than "work". It makes possible the pursuit of varied activities. Following this line of argument, the uses to which leisure is put would probably be better indexes of welfare than amount of leisure time available.

We do not know a nation until we know its pleasures of life, just as we do not know a man until we know how he spends his leisure. It is when a man ceases to do the things he has to do, and does the things he likes to do, that his character is revealed. It is when the repressions of society and business are gone and when the goals of money and fame and ambition are lifted, and a man's spirit wanders where it listeth, that we see the inner man, his real self.  

The indexes just discussed were a description of general resources available. Those below are based on uses to which general resources are put, especially by consumers.

**Household labor saving devices.** Items of fact sometimes used to picture extent of household labor saving devices are per capita installa-
tions of electricity and gas, ownership of washing machines, and growth of commercial substitutes for household production.

The evaluation of these devices in terms of well-being was implied in the farm family living studies, which showed the importance attached to household conveniences for saving energy of the homemaker. While such

---

2. By general resources are meant time and goods and services as a whole. There are more specific resources such as hospitals, parks, etc. if one chose to employ the term *resources* in that manner. Household conveniences sometimes increase the availability of the resource of time and so perhaps belong in the classification of resources.
devices tend in some cases to lighten the work of the homemaker, thus
giving her more leisure, labor saving devices have sometimes led homemakers
to undertake still more household tasks. Where the family adopts many
commercial substitutes for household production, causing decline in the
tasks performed at home, there may be repercussions on the family structure.
There is less family cooperation in doing tasks about the home, for example.  

**Travel and communication.** Items of fact to represent extent of
communications are numerous. For this purpose Bennett collected
data on railway locomotives, miles of telephone and telegraph wire, tele-
phone instruments, motor vehicles, telephone messages, and pieces of mail.
The growth of airplanes and radio have also been used as an item of fact.  

The evaluation implied, when these items of fact are used to indicate
well-being, is that travel and communication further business activity,
thus making for increased real income. The relation of real income to
welfare has been discussed. But in using these facilities for travel and
communication, business men are sometimes taken away from home and home
life may be reduced. Some thinkers believe there is a relation between
extent of home life and well-being. On the other hand, perhaps these
facilities bring some men home to their families more often than otherwise
would be possible.

Another evaluation implied is that the spread of ideas on how others
live, and on events that happen, is desirable for well-being. The investi-

1. This is only one of many possibilities. On the whole, however, there
are usually factors other than decline of household production involved
in family disintegration. See Reid. Economics of household production.
ch. 20.
2. Burgess has constructed an illuminating chart showing the rate of
increase since 1900 in different agencies of communication as compared
with the rate of population growth. Am. Jour. Soc. 35:1000. 1930.
gators of family scales of living urged wider knowledge of world events in preference to local gossip, for example. But these facilities for travel and communication may have implications detracting from well-being. Accidents are frequent; harmful and mediocre information is often disseminated. One writer believes that in spite of volumes of mail these facilities have brought a decline in the art of letter-writing.

"Art is useless," said Oscar Wilde, quite truthfully. Yes, and love is equally useless. And romance is useless. Indeed, nearly all the things which make life livable are useless. Letter-writing, one of the pleasures of a bygone age, is fast becoming a dying art. What with the telephone, the telegraph, and picture post-cards, and that "speeding-up"process one hears so much about, and which curiously enough has deprived us of all leisure, our minds have fallen into laziness and disuse; it has reacted, too, on our courtesy and manners.¹

Reading. Students of American history, in the attempt to secure a picture of the extent of reading in colonial life, sometimes make note of the number of books imported into the colonies.² Since there were at first no facilities for printing in the colonies, information on imports and inventory of libraries gives a complete picture of the reading material of the colonists. Note is made of the first printing press and the rapidity of circulation of reading material. Literacy as an item of fact has also been used by historians.³

². See Adams, Provincial society. 1690-1763; Priestley, The coming of the white man 1492-1848; Wertenbaker, The first Americans, 1607-1890.
³. There are a number of curious ways of getting at literacy. Adams, in referring to the town of New York, says that in a petition "to the king in 1701, of the six hundred and eighty-seven who were of sufficient importance to sign such a document, sixty-one or nearly one in ten had to sign by a mark." Op. cit. p. 131-132. Wertenbaker states that extent of literacy could be judged by the signing of names when on juries and the signing of deeds and depositions. Op. cit. p. 254.
For the nineteenth century an estimate of the total value of books manufactured and sold in the United States has been used by one writer in picturing extent of intellectual interest. Today, in comparing countries the extent of literacy is occasionally used as an item of fact to picture extent of reading. The number of books in libraries is a more customary item of fact, however. Information is given on library collections of universities, and colleges, for example. Average per capita expenditure for public library services has also been used by some writers to picture extent of reading. Use of library facilities is another possible item of fact. Occasionally there is an attempt to picture the type of reading matter. One author considered, as picturing a good type of reading, the circulation of Wells' Outline of history and Durant's Story of philosophy, and the circulation of leading magazines published in New York, including such "solid periodicals" as the Literary Digest and New York Times.

This same author also used as an item of fact sensational publications, as indicating an undesirable state of affairs. Thorndike used as an item of fact the circulation of Better Homes and Gardens, Good Housekeeping, The National Geographic, and Literary Digest, implying that these were desirable types of reading. To further picture the quality of intel-

2. E. W. Knight in discussing education in the southern states says, "According to the latest published statistics of a prosperity year, the people of at least four southern states had in their garages more automobiles than books in their public libraries." In Couch. Culture in the south. p. 215-216.
lectual interest one or two writers have suggested number of outstanding writers to be found in Who's Who.

The evaluations implied by historians who noted the first printing press in America were that independent thought and public opinion resulting from the use of those presses meant greater well-being. In the evaluations of reading today there is an implication that people should be aware of world events and have opinions on them; that knowledge of how others live gives one ability to live a better life. There is a belief that quality of reading matter affects well-being. Hayes uses an argument about quality of reading in the following way:

More literacy, however, does not make humans humane or critical or even intelligent; and in literate nationalities, the majority of boys and girls, who do not pass beyond the earlier grades of elementary schooling, acquire only sufficient mastery of the art of reading to render them the gullible victims of penny dreadfuls, graphics, newspaper headlines, advertising posters, movie captions, and in general the cheaper sort of journalism which is apt to reek with nationalism.

Reading is also considered conducive to welfare because it may increase productive efficiency and so raise real income. The relation of real income to well-being has already been discussed.

Education. The use by historians of literacy as an item of fact has been mentioned. Literacy has been taken to picture reading and to picture education. Considerably better as an item of fact in information on formal education, perhaps because this type of education is most

1. "...French America was especially laggard in independent thought and public opinion. No newspaper or book was printed in it until the middle of the eighteenth century." Priestley, op. cit. p. 248. In his book on the social and economic history of the Middle Ages, Thompson judged that decadence was manifested by the deterioration of educational and intellectual pursuits of monasteries. He used as an index the decrease in number of manuscripts produced. Op. cit. p. 648.
amenable to measurement. Compulsory school attendance and amount spent on education per capita have been used as possible items of fact. Expenditure for textbooks, classroom supplies, teachers' salaries, etc. might be considered. Other items of fact are the percentage of the population in colleges and universities, or percentage of the population aged five to twenty attending elementary and secondary schools. Sometimes writers use as items of fact to picture quality of education the value of school property, number of buildings, facilities for training teachers, etc.

It is assumed that there is a relation between education and well-being. Some attribute the relation on the basis that education increases productivity and hence real income. Others emphasize the fact that education makes for choice with a variety of knowledge and hence leads to better living.

Recreation. Reading has already been considered as a possible item of fact; it can be taken to picture some aspects of recreation. Other phases of recreation are the theater, sports, and social organizations. Items of fact used to picture these include expenditures per capita for these purposes. Thorndike suggests the provision of certain kinds of recreational equipment. Some writers would separate recreations which require participation from those which are of a spectator nature.¹

Expenditures may not picture extent and kinds of recreation. Folk songs and dances, as well as spontaneous informal gatherings cannot be

¹ "Does the American actually love out-of-door sports, the pleasure of the pathless woods, the 'breezy call of insect-breathing morn,' or does he love numerical records of out-of-door sports? Certainly the crowd in front of the newspaper's tabular bulletin-board seems not less intent than the crowd on the 'grand-stand.' Certainly there is a deep and widespread interest in the framing of 'all-America' nines and elevens, one of the most disinterestedly ideal of all mathematical employments." Jameson. Am. Hist. Rev. 15:297. 1908.
well pictured by expenditure data. Items of fact built on time uses rather than on expenditures might be better for this purpose.

Some writers have sought items of fact to represent recreations of an aesthetic nature. The number of professional and amateur artists might be a possible item of fact. Other suggestions include number of theaters, concerts, music festivals, orchestras, bands, art galleries, and parks. Some would suggest attendance as an item of fact. Aronovici states: "I was told by an artist that the aquarium in New York is attended yearly by three times as many people as the Metropolitan Museum of that city."¹ This artist implied that it might be better to have an interest in pictures than in fish, although the size of these two institutions may have had something to do with the attendance.

The evaluation implied in these items of fact representing recreation is that recreational activities are desirable for well-being because they lead to a variety of experiences. Some types of recreation are treated as more desirable than others from the point of view of well-being. Participation is preferable to on-lookerism in the minds of some thinkers. Some believe recreations of an aesthetic nature are highly desirable.

Religion. The items of fact used to picture extent of the religious interest are not numerous. Nieskoro considered as a possible item of fact the declarations of atheism and refusals to declare religion. Thwing believes that one of the tests of a nation's civilization is its attitude toward God, and he gives number of Protestant and Roman Catholic members.² Nieskoro and Thwing imply that church membership is related to

well-being. The difficulty of finding more examples of items of fact on
religion may indicate that in America church membership is not believed
essential to welfare.

Food consumption. Bennett suggests as a possible item of fact to
picture adequacy of diet the per capita food consumption in calories
represented by foods derived from sources other than cereal and tubers.
Such an item of fact would imply the presence of variety in the diet
and the presence of foods containing minerals and vitamins. The League
of Nations and the United States Bureau of Home Economics as well as other
United States government agencies have made studies on the adequacy of
diet, some of which might be used for purposes of international comparison.

Particular foods used as items of fact by Bennett include citrus
fruits, bananas, and raw sugar. It is probable that they are used to pic-
ture extent of real income, on the assumption that they are consumed
only when real income is fairly high. The consumption of tea, coffee,
and cocoa is used by Bennett, probably for the same reason.¹ Occasionally
one finds a historian who judges the material progress of a people
by the size of the demand for sugar and tea.² On the whole, it can be

1. Sir Frederick Eden apparently would not agree with the above statement
for he remarked in regard to the poorest labourers of South England
that if their "finances do not allow them the indulgence of malt liquor,
2. Dewey, in Financial history of the United States. 11th ed. observes that
in 1860 the consuming powers of the American people "had never been so high, as was proved in particular by the unprecedented demand for sugar
and tea; there was but little pauperism, and wealth on the whole was
evenly distributed." p. 273.
concluded that the items of fact of citrus fruits and bananas, raw sugar, tea, coffee, and cocoa seem to imply that there is a high real income, rather than adequacy of diet.

It might be possible to find an item of fact to picture extent of the aesthetic in food, for example, mentions of food in poetry, or varieties of recipes. Note must be made that in the poorer countries the good cook is the one who camouflages the same types of dish, as rice or spaghetti, and in America varieties of types of food give the variety to recipes.

The evaluations implied in the above items of fact might be summarized as follows: An adequate diet means health, and health is essential to well-being. A high real income is desirable for well-being. As for the arguments in regard to the place which the aesthetic in food has in the United States, at least, one rarely sees items of fact implying this evaluation. Lin Yutang notes this absence of interest in the aesthetic in food as follows:

The truth is, the English do not admit that they have a stomach. No stomach is fit for conversation unless it happens to be "sick" or "aching." .... Many Americans while abroad sigh for ham and sweet potatoes at home, but they never admit that this makes them think of home, nor will they put it in their poetry.

Clothing. There are items of fact based on clothing which have been used to picture extent of real income. For example, Bennett proposes yardage of domestic sales of silken cloth per 100 inhabitants. It is questionable in these days, in the United States at any rate, whether the consumption of silk cloth indicates high real income. Even the well-to-do have gone in for rayon and for cotton. Bennett probably had in mind the

sort of picture which Hubbart gives:

The dress of the masses of the people, as higher standards arose, changed from buckskin, the jeans...and linsey-woolsey of the first period to the calico, gingham, and delaines of the middle period of a family's social history. The silk and lace period did not dawn in the smaller towns of the West until the Civil War suddenly scattered bank notes....

A possible item of fact to portray comfort in clothing is extent of leather or rubber-soled shoes. For international comparisons, however, perhaps there are other types of shoes which are just as comfortable.

In summary of the evaluations implied in these indexes, one notes again the assumption of a relation between real income and well-being, and a belief in the relation of comfortable clothing to well-being.

Housing. Thorndike includes in his GG list per capita homes owned. Supposedly the item of fact of home ownership pictures good housing, or large real income, or good citizenship. Thorndike does not make clear what he is intending to portray with this item of fact. In criticism it can be pointed out that owned homes are not always better housing than rented homes. It is true that the lower income groups in this country cannot afford to own homes, and so perhaps there is some picturing of extent of real income. It must be remembered, however, that even for those in the upper income brackets, and especially the middle income brackets, home ownership may so reduce mobility that the wage earner or salary earner loses

opportunities for jobs which might give greater real income. As for

citizenship, there has never been proof that home ownership makes better
citizens.

There are also items of fact suggested to picture housing in its
health and comfort aspects. Bennett for example suggests square feet of
floor space per capita in dwellings, and square feet of window glass per
capita in dwellings. Apparently the relation of window and floor space
is suggested by certain housing legislation. In order to picture con-
gestion of housing one might consider as an item of fact the number of
persons per acre of soil. Items used to picture comfort in housing
include number of stuffed and padded chairs and number of steel bed
springs. Other suggestions are number of bathtubs and lavatories shipped.
It is possible that the item of fact of soap consumption is another means
of picturing health and cleanliness. On the other hand, these items of
fact may be used merely to picture extent of real income.

In the evaluations relating housing to well-being, it is again seen
that there is an assumption of a relation between real income and welfare.
Good citizenship is desirable for well-being, but home ownership does not
particularly picture good citizenship. Comfortable, uncongested housing
with facilities for cleanliness is believed by many writers to further
well-being. That such a relation between welfare and cleanliness and
comfort may not actually exist is suggested by Lin Yutang in the following
statement:

Degeneration is a highly misleading term, for it can only be relative
in meaning. Since the invention of the flush toilet and the vacuum
carpet cleaner, the modern man seems to judge a man's moral standards
by his cleanliness...Yet it is not dirt but the fear of dirt which is
the sign of man's degeneration, and it is dangerous to judge a man's
physical and moral sanity by outside standards. Actually, the European
man living in overheated apartments and luxurious cars is less fitted to survive than the Chinese farmer living in his lowly and undisinfected hut. ¹

**Medical care.** Facilities for medical care, in way of hospitals, doctors, dentists, and nurses have been used as indexes. One might consider the number of hospital beds per 1000 inhabitants, for instance. There are also the more direct indexes of health, such as longevity and frequency of certain diseases. These are mentioned below.

**The more direct indexes of well-being.**

These indexes, more direct in some respects than the consumption indexes which relate to the use of goods and of leisure time, measure the aspects of life which are believed to be an integral part of welfare. Every writer on the subject has a different way of expressing what aspects of life go into the composition of welfare. There are general statements that welfare means the real perfection of man’s intellectual, moral, and physical faculties; the destruction of inequality between nations; increasing social differentiation and integration; greater individuality of action and enlarged freedom; the development of social faculties; etc.²

Sometimes there is difficulty in reaching common ground in these vague terms. For example, freedom and individuality of action are questionable values in totalitarian states. When it comes to items of fact to picture these aspects of life there is usually further difficulty. Health and longevity are fairly easy to measure, but other items of fact involve

---

¹ Lin Yutang, *op. cit.* p. 23.
² These examples were taken from the ideas of prominent men on what is progress. See Todd, *Theories of social progress,* ch. 7.
problems. Assuming liberty and preservation of the family as an institution to be two vital aspects of welfare, what is the relation of the item of fact of increasing divorce to well-being? Increasing divorce may illustrate greater liberty, but it is also detrimental to the family as an institution. It is probable that a questionable index such as divorce is probably not as direct a measure of value as are some consumption indexes.

It is not the purpose of the present study to analyze the difficulties involved in these quantitative indexes which are not strictly consumption indexes, but a purely arbitrary list is given to illustrate the kinds of aspects of life included by those compiling quantitative indexes of well-being. These indexes usually occur along with consumption indexes.

Physical health and longevity
- Average life expectancy
- Death rate
- Infant mortality rate
- Deaths from preventable diseases
- Remediablo physical defects
- Accidents

Optimum population
- Birth and death rate

Mental ability
- Feeble mindedness
- Insanity
- Neurosis
- I. Q.
- Measures of character and personality traits
- Number of eminent persons in various fields

Relation between individual and society
- Divorce
- Liberty
Crime\(^1\)

Adaptation of state to state
Wars

Summary and conclusions.

Welfare as an intangible quality is not subject to measurement. But if assumptions are made in regard to what aspects of life are important for well-being, then quantitative indexes of well-being can be compiled. Many of the items of fact used to build such indexes are based on consumption statistics. This is to be expected if one assumes that what people have and what they do affect their well-being. And since certain kinds of consumption data are available on a rather large scale, the use of items of fact based on these data is further facilitated.

As this section has shown, the difficulties of building quantitative indexes are many. For example, comparative statistics are not available on certain subjects; once having selected the item of fact there is the problem of what aspect of life it pictures; then there is the problem of determining the relation of that aspect of life to welfare; and finally, if one attempts a composite score as did Niceforo, Bennett, and Thorndike, there is no infallible basis for weighting the component items of fact.

The consumption indexes were classed as follows: (1) general resources available, such as industrial and commercial activity, amount of wealth and income, and leisure time; and (2) specific ways in which resources are used such as household labor saving devices, travel and

\(^1\) In so far as consumption treats of uses of time as a scarce resource, it should perhaps be concerned with criminal activities. But the non-criminal choices of use of time are so numerous that students of consumption have studied only these.
communication, reading, education, recreation, religion, food, clothing, housing, and medical care.

Besides the consumption indexes there are the more direct measures of aspects of life considered an integral part of welfare. For example, mental and physical health and long life are believed by many to be important constituents of well-being. While long life and certain aspects of physical and mental health are easily measured, other items of fact are difficult to find.

In conclusion: (1) If this section had selected quantitative indexes from a greater variety of sources, the conclusions in regard to nature of ethical thought they reveal might be more valid. A cursory survey of composite quantitative indexes and an analysis of single indexes including both consumption measures and the more direct aspects of life relating to well-being would indicate the following aspects of life to be important for well-being: abundant resources in money and leisure time, a variety of interest, comforts and conveniences, education, and an emphasis on the worth of the individual, especially physical and mental health and long life; there is some though not a great deal of apparent interest in religions. These conclusions are in harmony with the phases of modern ethical thought as found in earlier sections of the present study.

(2). The findings of this section will be of further use in Part III, which analyzes in greater detail the nature of modern ethical thought. In this section were shown many of the arguments for and against the abundant life, and the difficulty of knowing what values or interests are most important in life was illustrated. That the ideas on what is
The nature of such a discussion was the purpose of this section. The public is more likely to realize the problem of where it lies in these concrete pictures of well-being as judged from various viewpoints, and the concrete pictures of well-being will lead to thought on the matter of what consumption and set up indexes will lead to thought of what is and what is not desirable in time. Perhaps the greatest value of a study of various indexes and the correlation of new ones lies in the thought of what use are such attempts? Perhaps the greatest value of the discussion of the indexes of pulling quantity indexes of
PART III

ANALYSIS OF ASPECTS OF MODERN ETHICAL THOUGHT

Modern ethical thought as it affects ideas on wise consumption has been shown to include three central ideas: (1) freedom of choice, (2) choice with knowledge, particularly knowledge of the opinion of experts, and (3) the abundant life, materially and in terms of many interests. Although unanimity of opinion on these aspects of modern ethical thought does not exist, the preponderance of opinion, in English-speaking countries at least, would probably uphold these three principles. It is the purpose of this section to discuss these three aspects of modern ethical thought in more detail than was possible in previous sections.

Freedom of choice has been curtailed in the past by religion and in many instances religion still dictates in matters of consumption, but its influence has been declining. The idea of the right of aristocracy to restrict the consumption of the lower classes in order to maintain social status quo is a right which is fast losing adherents. Custom, in the past and today, has played a role in thwarting freedom of choice. In addition to these handicaps to liberty the totalitarian state of today has tendencies to limit freedom of choice. Section 7 will indicate the nature of these issues as well as arguments in favor of freedom of choice.

But just as in politics it is urged that there should be no rights

1. It would be interesting to attempt quantitative measures of the extent to which these three ideas are held. Besides approaches suggested in the present study, there are Sorokin's methods used in his volumes, Social and cultural dynamics. Thurstone has made suggestions for attitude measurement which may some day be turned to this account.
without duties, so in consumption, freedom of choice implies the responsibility of making wise choices. And a wise choice according to present day concepts is a choice made with knowledge of how others live, and knowledge of the opinions of experts, especially scientific experts. To bring into relief the implications of choice with knowledge, section 8 gives a brief review of the history of the idea, culminating in the thought of pragmatism. The relation of science to philosophical value will also be analyzed.

Finally, there is the third aspect of modern ethical thought, the idea of the abundant life. The materially abundant life has met with much past and present day criticism. Section 9 discusses the nature of this criticism. As for the idea of a life abundant with many interests, it is far from a universal idea. It is different from the asceticism of the early Christian church and it is different from the Nirvana of the Orient.

Each of these topics, freedom of choice, choice with knowledge, and the abundant life leads into various branches of science, art, and philosophy. The purpose here is not to achieve anything resembling completeness in discussion of these ideas, but if, from the standpoint especially of consumption problems, some of the pertinent issues involved can be pointed out that will be sufficient for the purposes of the present study. The discussion here is too brief to be thorough, but it is included in order to bring to logical completion the study of evaluations of consumption in modern thought. Part I and Part II were more of a description of what sorts of evaluations and ethical thought occur. Part III analyzes the significance of the ethical thought behind these evaluations.
Section 7
Freedom of Choice

Freedom of choice is difficult to define. To begin with, everyone from primitive times to the present has had occasion to make choices which are relatively freely made. The primitive man may decide whether to walk on one trail or another, but taboos may prohibit him entirely from taking certain trails. It is the relative number of alternatives which may be freely chosen which determines the extent to which there is freedom of choice. With application to consumption choices, freedom is implied when the individual (1) is free to choose what values or what ends in life he shall pursue and (2) when he has access to opportunities for securing means with which to fulfill those opportunities. Freedom of choice may be roughly defined as the right to make most of one's choices, rather than having them made for one. To exercise freedom of choice implies something of individual deliberation in choice-making.

The history of the idea of freedom of choice was briefly traced in Section 2. There it was shown that freedom from the dictation of religion received unintentional impetus from the Reformation which so multiplied sects that many men began to doubt the validity of theological authority. The growth of science further dimmed the prestige of religion. Democratic institutions and the Industrial Revolution spelled the doom of attempts to make people live according to a set standard for their particular social class. Liberalism, of which the laissez-faire of economics was an integral part, had as its platform freedom to express opinion and to
live as one chooses without dictation.\(^1\) Mill's essay on liberty well expresses the view of the liberalists. In this essay he argued (1) for freedom of opinion on all subjects, (2) "liberty of tastes and pursuits; of framing the plan of our life to suit our own character...." and (3) liberty of combination among individuals.\(^2\)

**Arguments in favor of freedom of choice.**

There have been a number of arguments presented in the past and today in favor of freedom of choice. It is difficult to list these in a clear-cut manner because the arguments are interlocked together. Most of the arguments center about the idea of individualism, and individualism may be defined as

> the conviction that personality is the center of value....all social organizations get their significance from their promise to enhance the individual; to guarantee the sacredness of his person, to safeguard his rights, to extend his opportunities.\(^3\)

Kant's philosophy had great influence in elevating man as an end in and of himself. He taught that men as moral beings tower above the phenomenal world of measurement and are consequently infinite.\(^4\) The importance of man as an end in and of himself can be variously demonstrated in modern life. The section on quantitative indexes mentioned the apparent agreement on the importance of life and health. That poverty is usually considered an

---

1. "Liberalism" might be a term synonymous with "modern ethical thought" as used in this study. The author does not know of any definition of liberalism, however, which specifically refers to choice with knowledge and the abundant life. Liberty, of course, is an essential aspect of the definition of liberalism.


4. This was in contrast to the view of Christianity that natural men are equal because they are infinitely insignificant. Smith. The American philosophy of equality. p. 155.
undesirable state shows further the value attached to the development of human personality. So great is the value of the individual to T. V. Smith that he defines ethics as "the theory of man's hope for individuality."\(^1\)

It is commonly held that individualism arises through choice-making. Common sense shows that herein lies the difference between the mature and immature person. Despite disagreement on what are the human capacities and how definite they are there is agreement that only by practice in choice-making can these capacities be developed. Mill held this view.\(^2\)

The human faculties of perception, judgement, discriminative feeling, mental activity, and even moral preference, are exercised only in making a choice. He who does anything because it is the custom, makes no choice. He gains no practice either in discerning or in desiring what is best. Whoever thinks that individuality of desires and impulses should not be encouraged to unfold itself, must maintain that society has no need of strong natures--is not the better for containing many persons who have much character--and that a high general average of energy is not desirable.

With George Herbert Mead's theory that man gets his self or his personality from contact with society, comes reinforcement to the idea that these contacts must be wide.\(^3\) It is on this theory that T. V. Smith believes,

Those who would censor speech, then, whether they mean it or not, set themselves the task of impeding, if not of stopping, mental growth. And, I repeat, the right to be a man cannot be divorced from the right to become a man.\(^4\)

The next phase of the argument is that individuality or originality of choice made possible through freedom of choice is desirable in that it

\(^{1}\) Smith, Promise of American politics, p. 2. For an almost unqualified eulogy of individualism see Lindsay, Ethical value of personality, Internat. Jour. Ethics. 30:423-449. 1920.


\(^{3}\) Mead, Mind, self, and society.

\(^{4}\) Smith, op. cit. p. 66.
benefits both society and the individual. Why should man put a premium on individuality? In art, the unique and original has always held high place. Probably the scientific age with its inventions has also taught the worth of doing something new. Geniuses have usually inspired mankind with admiration and occasionally with ambition. Carlyle paid homage to the great man, but Emerson expressed very clearly the idea that every man can have an element of greatness within himself.

Against creed and system, convention and institution, Emerson stands for restoring to the common man that which in the name of religion, of philosophy, of art and of morality, has been embezzled from the common store and appropriated to sectarian and class use.

It is urged that society benefits from the diversity which results from individuality. There are discoveries, arts, goodwill among the members of society, etc. Mill believed diversity of character and culture made European nations an improving rather than a stationary portion of mankind. Milton used an analogy to a beautiful building.

And when every stone is laid artfully together, it cannot be united into a continuity, it can but be contiguous in this world; neither can every piece of the building be of one form; may rather the perfection consists in this, that out of many moderate varieties and brotherly dissimilarities that are not vastly disproportional arises the goodly and graceful symmetry that commends the whole pile and structure.

1. What is an original or unique choice? Is it a choice which the individual has never made before though he may know someone else who has made a similar choice? Or is it a choice which he has never known anyone to make? Or is it a choice, which so far as anyone knows, has never been made before? The concept is too vague to be precisely defined. Warner Fite defines an original choice thus: "If you could make the present choice from the standpoint of a clear vision of the whole of your personal life, you would express yourself in an act so individuated that from all eternity it could be the act of none other but yourself..." Individualism. p. 86.


Another argument for liberty is that only in this way can truth be found. Such was Milton's and Mill's argument. While the modern pragmatist believes truth to be more of a relative matter than did Milton and Mill, relative to the situation in which it occurs, he still holds with his predecessors that liberty is necessary to achieve this relative truth. The modern era, especially with its emphasis on change, shows the necessity of finding new ways of meeting new situations. The pragmatic argument is that since there are differences among individuals and among situation, the individual is more likely to reach a satisfactory solution to his problems if he is given freedom of choice. Bound by custom or dominant church or state decisions there can be little flexibility in adjustment to various situations.

Some limitations of freedom of choice.

But there have been and there are today limitations of freedom of choice. The Catholic church requires that its members make choices in accordance with the framework of religion. It is believed that wise living is more likely to be achieved by following the decisions of the Church and there are undoubtedly arguments for this position.¹

A reaction in philosophy is to be seen in Hegel, who held the state to be superior to the individual. He taught that the citizen is only a stage toward the realization of the objective mind in the state; he emphasized the need for security and for a unitary sovereign, and believed war was not only a necessary but a spiritual good. These aspects of

¹ See Ryan. Individualism. Catholic Encyc. 7:761-762. There is considerable freedom of choice within the framework.
Hegelian thought are reflected in the modern totalitarian state, and as one writer observed, Gentile has given it something of an official status in fascist Italy.1

Besides church and government dictations which decrease freedom of choice, there are custom and convention.2 Custom and convention tend to put taboos on certain types of choices which people might like to make and in this way they resemble church and government restrictions. In part custom and convention restrict the vision of man so he cannot see certain possibilities of choice at all. While conceding that custom, convention, and habit save time and energy because all actions need not be preceded by weighing alternatives, pragmatism points out that frequently better ways of doing things can be found if man breaks from the habitual.3

Certain schools of psychology, such as behaviorism, have challenged whether there is really such a thing as freedom of choice, and have implied that all talk about the desirability or undesirability of freedom of choice is wasted breath. A discussion of behaviorism and determinism, however, would take the present discussion too far afield to be profitable. So, just as Mill explained at the beginning of his essay on liberty that he was not writing about the problem of liberty of the will, the present study will dispense with the problem of behaviorism and proceed on the

1. Cohen. Hegel Encyc. Soc. Sci. 7:311-315. It has been observed by many commentators that Hegel's pronouncements of world reason bear great resemblance to the Prussian state of his day, a state with distinctly totalitarian tendencies.
2. "Keeping up with the Joneses" is included in this argument. For an excellent statement against this habit see Mill, op. cit. p. 109-110.
3. Dewey's discussion of this matter in his book, Human nature and conduct, is classic. For specific application to consumption see Miss Hoyt's discussion of the checks and limitations to interests. Consumption in our society, ch. 5.
assumption that choice is possible. Both economics and ethics, for example, assume that choice is possible. It is because there are not enough resources to go around that economics must study the best way of allocating, or choosing the use of, resources. It is because human beings can conduct themselves in a number of different ways with differing consequences for themselves and society, that ethics arises.

Finally there is the problem of how far the government should go in curtailing the actions of individuals. Liberals after arguing against a variety of government interference hasten to list the types of laws which are desirable, pointing out that they are permissible because they further welfare. Government action is urged where individuals injure each other, for example, in drunken driving. Where there is almost complete agreement on what is desirable for people the government may choose for the people, as in the instance of compulsory education and public health regulations. Furthermore, the government uses the taxpayer's money to provide parks, museums, armaments, and other facilities. The consumer may or may not be in favor of these uses of his money. Whether he makes use of the parks and museums or not, part of his income is used to pay for them, thus restricting him to the use of a smaller income than would have been necessary if he did not pay taxes. It may be argued that from liberalism with some state regulation to totalitarianism with a greater amount of state regulation is only a matter of degree, but the degrees become so multiplied that it is customary to treat them as two separate concepts.

1. For a detailed description of government services to consumers in the United States see Hoyt. Consumption in our society. ch. 18.
Totalitarian states are of two general kinds. First there is communism, with its ultimate goals of brotherhood and the abundant life for all. In the Soviet Union, which professes to be a communist nation, all people are not held in equal esteem, and frequently individual choices are restricted by demands of the state which override the demands of individuals. In other words, as T. V. Smith points out, the ends of communism are consistent with the ideals of liberalism, but the means being used to achieve the ends are the same as those in fascism. In fascism the goal is not so much brotherhood and the abundant life for all as it is power of the state, a power which requires sacrifices on the part of the individuals.

In the totalitarian states as they exist at present some classes of people receive better treatment than others, and the worth of the individual in the rejected classes falls very low. Examples are the enemies of the government in power in Russia, and the Jews in Nazi Germany and Italy. But even in those classes of people not considered enemies of the state the worth of the individual is not, in democratic eyes at least, very high. The individual should not hesitate to lay down his life for the state; in fact, he should glory in doing so. The satisfaction that his nation is a superior nation is supposed to overbalance the loss in freedom of thought and action and in purchasing power. Perhaps it does. As long as satisfactions are immeasurable there is no way of judging the value of patriotism for maximizing satisfactions. It is undoubtedly

2. It can be argued, of course, that some people in democracies receive better treatment than others, but such rigorous means as purges and ghettos are not used against those in the unfortunate classes.
possible for a person to gain satisfaction by identifying himself with something greater than himself. Empathy is a type of satisfaction. It is common in religion. But it is a question whether the totalitarian states may not stretch this type of satisfaction until it disintegrates.

The totalitarian state does not, of course, completely block off freedom of choice in consumption, but it does hedge it about to weaken individuality in choice. Art is limited in its scope. For example, the art of Russia centers on patriotic themes, the glory of the present as compared with the Czarist regime. The most obvious cases, however, are loss of academic freedom, the truth which Milton and Mill believed so important has difficulty in thriving in such propagandized atmosphere. Knowledge of how others live and knowledge of the advice of experts is restricted. These restrictions affect consumption as well as other phases of life. It is sometimes argued that even though propaganda has molded the choices of the person in the totalitarian state, since those are the choices of the individual others have no right to pass judgment on them. But if there is any validity in the ideal of choice with knowledge, then it is desirable that the citizen have more than one attitude to choose from. If the people of the totalitarian state, other than those in power, knew of other attitudes would they choose the ways of totali-

1. T. V. Smith observes that the very name "church" has come to be the name of a "mystical body" more important than the individual believers. This idea of the mystical body is the younger brother of the Platonic notion of the organic body of the social organism and the older brother of Mussolini's corporate body of the state. Smith, op. cit. p. 105.

2. There is yet another argument with regard to the value of the individual. If the chief ethical goal is the well-being of all humanity, then totalitarianism fails to achieve this goal, for it looks only to itself and cares little for the welfare of other nations. But the same criticism is applicable to the democracies to a great extent.

3. See the discussion below on choice with knowledge.
tarianism? It is a moot question.

In matters of consumption in the totalitarian state there is not sumptuary legislation of the nature of the late Middle Ages, but by subtle means consumption has been greatly affected. In order to arm the state, funds are diverted in such a way as to lessen purchasing power of the people. The supply of articles for consumption is cut. This is not the place to go into the economics of the totalitarian state, but it is obvious that the resources of any country are limited, and if too many of these resources are used for self-sufficiency and rearmament there is less for food and clothing for civilians. It can be argued, however, that a considerable proportion of the resources of democratic countries goes to armaments; but economic self-sufficiency in peace time is not sought at the price which the fascist states pay. In war time, as evidenced by World War experiences, democratic states use methods of rationing consumption which are similar to those of present day totalitarianism.

It is possible that in the long run the totalitarian state will be able to furnish its people with a more abundant life, that terrorism will cease, and that the sacrifices made today will be more than recompensed in the future. Even today these states dare not go too far in curtailing consumption for fear of rioting. One's opinion on the virtues of the

1. In Japan on the anniversary of the war with China special "self-denying three-cent meals, consisting of a ball of rice the size of a grapefruit with a sour pickle imbedded in the centre, were eaten throughout the nation." Last year Mussolini, as a war measure, stored part of the wheat crop and sold part of it for foreign exchange. "Bakers, unable to purchase sufficient wheat flour, eked out their dough with substitutes like corn flour, bean flour, ground lentils... The Government legalized this adulteration up to 20%." This year adulteration is permitted only up to 10 per cent. Time. July 18, 1937. p. 15, 17.
In summary, the argument is that freedom of choice is not the same as freedomler of choice. The suggestion is that freedom should be considered a benefit from these advanced systems, not just an end in itself. The presentation of the discovery of "truth" is well as the interaction environment for the discovery of "truth." Encourages and provides a source for the development of human capabilities, encouraging or inhibiting choice, and leads to the development of new ideas of interactionism. The idea of interactionism has been pointed out by freedom of choice leads to the development of new ideas of interactionism. Interactionism is that most widely in the subject of comparison with the evaluation.
future

By a recognition of security and by greater acquaintance of living in the

proposition of totalitarianism these disadvantages may be counterbalanced

outnumber the resources available for living purposes. In the minds of the

of a large proportion of economic resources go into private enterprises

the indigenous. The indigenous of industry are handpicked, and the devotion

induced, and requires all indigenous to assume the same superior to

By totalitarianism needs ob the concentration of the development of certain

degree, but the degree may be very great. The restoration of liberty

of freedom of choice. The difference between the two is a matter of

apologized for the totalitarian state and the same government imposition

custom and convention, and government action. Both intellectual and the

-167-
Section 8
Choice with Knowledge

Just as in political freedom it is argued that there should be no
rights without duties, so freedom of choice in consumption should carry
with it the responsibility of making wise choices. Statement after state-
ment in the foregoing discussion of freedom of choice implied that such
freedom, if used, would lead to deliberation resulting in choices which
would fit the given situation, and choices which would be original. But
deliberation in choice-making will not be successful, in fact, cannot
proceed, without the employment of knowledge, both knowledge of ends and
knowledge of means to achieve given ends.

The meaning of knowledge in the past.

To Plato and Aristotle knowledge of the best way of living, or "reason"
as they termed it, consisted of a given set of values or ends which humans
should seek to realize. The immutability and immortality of this set of
values is seen in Plato's analogy of the cave and of the chair.¹ Aristotle
gave more consideration to choices in particular instances, where the
immediate choice should be left to the individual, but he also believed
in the existence of a set of values to be realized.

The Catholic church as well as other religions coordinated the idea
of a given set of values with the idea of God. It was His will that the
people follow the ways of religious truth and that sort of truth was be-

Bk. 2, Sec. 2.
lieved pretty firmly fixed for all time. With the discoveries of natural science, from Bacon and Newton to the nineteenth century, it was believed that there were immutable laws of nature. The scientist had only to discover them. Whereupon other disciplines took up the search for natural law. Political economy had distinct tendencies in that direction. And philosophers more than ever believed that there was a network of given values which had only to be discovered. But unfortunately, different thinkers found different principles and had no way of proving or disproving their validity.

The position of philosophy of value.

The late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries saw the decline of rationalism. The concept of immutable laws changed; even the scientist studying the physical world could only discover tendencies and admit that later discoveries might suggest new hypotheses. It had been suggested, even before the decline of rationalism, that there is a distinct difference between "what is" and "what ought to be." Physical, biological, and social sciences could give no support to the idea that man ought to pursue some values or ends in preference to others. Philosophy of value was placed in a precarious position. It sought to find a basis for values, but the sciences questioned the bases it proposed.

In the main, however, modern ethical theory has maintained a dialectical existence as the ghost of the natural law theory. The framework of the ghost has been the assumption that ethical theory, while not knowledge of the physical universe or of the actual nature of man or society, is nevertheless in some sense knowledge; and this framework has been thinly covered with demonstrations of the
objectivity of values.\(^1\)

The problem facing the philosophers in the past two or three centuries may be stated thus:

Are all, or any, values, matters of taste, or liking, or our pleasure? If any are, can moral and aesthetic values really be of this order? Is there no excellence in things which rationally determines our approval? Can our approval never claim authentic validity? If it cannot, what becomes of duty? And if it can, how can the claim be reconciled with bonum jucundum, or with the prevalent view that values are matters of taste, and that tastes rest on feeling or emotion? Is there any other road from pleasure or sentiment to dignity and worth? Can we justify our values by rational reflection, or have we to say, in the end, that we feel them strongly, and act upon them, but must renounce even the idea of finding any rational justification for them? These are questions essential to the issue.\(^2\)

Most current studies in philosophy of value are methodological, that is, they are attempts to find a valid basis for values. Occasionally there is an attempt to list actual values.\(^3\) One speaker at a recent international congress of philosophy observed that there is probably agreement that values exist, but less agreement on what they are.\(^4\)

The significance of science.

Today, in America at least, more attention is given to science than to philosophy. Certainly the common man is more concerned with popularized science, especially applied science, than with popularized philosophy.\(^5\)

---

2. Laird. The idea of value. p. 184, in showing the problems that faced the British philosophers, Shaftesbury, Hutcheson, and Hume.
3. For studies of a methodological type see R. B. Perry, H. Osborne, and M. B. Clarke. D. H. Parker lists and discusses actual values.
5. Durant's Story of philosophy has had a wide sale, but it is questionable how many of those who own the book have read it through. The Popular Mechanics Magazine and similar magazines are read until the covers fall off.
Furthermore, science has seemed to demonstrate that it can lead to wiser living. From the foregoing study it has been seen that modern thought places importance on efficiency, health, and longevity, and insofar as science can aid in securing these, scientific standards of behavior are accepted by most people.\(^1\) But science does not judge between ends. If man wants health, it will lay down a regimen. If man wants speed, it will give him technology. But what interests to pursue and how to combine them in living, these questions science cannot answer.

Neither science nor art is completely self-justifying in the sense that it has unlimited authority. Each, however, has complete authority within its own sphere...It (morality, or planning a sound way of life) would have to go to science to learn what scientific values are and to art to learn what artistic values are. And it would govern these other values, not in the sense that it could intermingle with them directly, but chiefly in the sense that it might have to declare that any such value, however great it were, should nevertheless be foregone.\(^2\)

The province of morality or ethical thought is to weigh the values of life and accept and advocate those which are most worthwhile, but social scientists have not hesitated to make studies of mores and concluded that since mores vary with time and place there is no one given pattern of life essential for well-being. Some social scientists would imply that ethical rules are man-made rules, varying with cultures.

Despite the discouragement which a study of mores may give one for

---

1. "Scientism is in truth the most prominent and most important mark of our mentality...Just as in the age of the truth of faith God's name was everywhere, so in our time Science is on everyone's mind and lips, from quacks and salesmen to scientists and scholars themselves. If something is qualified 'scientific,' even soap, face powder, car grease, or dog biscuits, it sounds to us great as the word 'orthodox' in an age of faith. 'Unscientific,' on the contrary, sounds as bad as the words 'heretic,' 'sacrilegious,' and 'blasphemous' in the period of the early Middle Ages." Sorokin. Social and cultural dynamics. v. 2, p. 113-114.

2. Laird, op. cit. p. 46-47.
finding a given desirable pattern for consumption, it is possible to
find fairly universal interests. Especially is this true if interests
or values are conceived in general terms. Miss Hoyt, proceeding on this
assumption, discovered that the important cultures of the world reveal
six basic interests: the sensory, social, intellectual, technological,
aesthetic, and empathetic interests.¹ If men on the whole have found
these six types of satisfactions worthwhile, Miss Hoyt reasons that
they are essential to wise consumption. Ethics is coming more and more
to rely on the findings of social and biological science, and the above
method of Miss Hoyt would receive the indirect sanction of A. K. Rogers
when he says:²

If any chance remains of justifying an ideal goal of human nature,
it can only be along the empirical path—by finding that as a
matter of fact, men as they proceed, do tend to converge toward
some common agreement, not as a result of logic, but because
experience shows them that in this way they are more likely to
satisfy their essential needs.

One chief reason why some feelings are considered to outweigh
others in significance is, plainly, the fact that they wear better,
are less subject to attrition and revaluation in the vicissitudes
of man's life history....

The significance of pragmatism.

Certain it is that whether one accepts as aspects of life essential
for well-being the venerable triumvirate of truth, goodness, and beauty,

¹ Hoyt, op. cit. ch. 2.
² Rogers. Instrumentalism and ideals. In T. V. Smith, ed. Essays in
philosophy by seventeen doctors of philosophy of the University of
Chicago, p. 24, 22. That the belief in an immutable set of values
above the world of what is may be complementary and not antithetical
to the belief that values originate in the physical and psychological
tendencies of the human being is suggested by Walker. Perry and Hartmann:
or accepts Miss Hoyt's list of six basic cultural interests based on an
empirical study of cultures, the aspects of life essential to well-being
show themselves in concrete situations; and it is the pragmatist who has
concerned himself primarily with the concrete situation. Pragmatism is
the philosophical system which particularly embodies the ideal of making
choices with knowledge of as many alternatives as possible. Dewey’s
explanation of the process of deliberation implies pragmatism. Dewey's
book, Human nature and conduct, describes every individual as having habits
of action, but sometimes situations arise so that there is a conflict, for
example, a conflict between two habits. Then there follows a process of
deliberation in which, in imagination, one visualizes the effect of various
courses of action open. Reasoning results in acceptance of the best
course of action. The greater one's knowledge of the various possible
alternatives, the wiser the decision reached. Brogan states the pragmatic
method in a discussion of the means of solving ethical and moral problems. 1

1. Explanation of problem; conflict of rules? clashing interests?
2. Survey of alternatives; must be practicable.
3. Analysis of alternatives.
4. Consideration of moral influence; consider more than just immediate
   obvious results of action.
5. Choice of better alternative; which alternative is better than
   the others for all the interests involved and in the light of
   available knowledge?

In order to survey and analyze the influence of alternatives, knowledge
is necessary. The more alternatives one has and the greater the knowledge
of the consequences of the various paths, the more satisfactory will be the

   Brogan states that this method is upheld in parts by Cumberland, Moore,
   Dewey, Mead, and Tufts. This method is melioristic, whereas Plato's
   is perfectionistic or utopian, a matter of discovering the perfect and
determining in how far it is practicable.
solution. Pragmatism undoubtedly takes its method from the example of
science, which collects information before drawing conclusions. There
are, however, a number of difficulties involved in the pragmatic method
of choice with knowledge. These difficulties center primarily about the
problem of whether pragmatism insures the attainment of the most important
values. Rogers, for example, asks: 3

To be explicit, I want to raise a query about the disposition shown
by instrumentalists to blur the distinction between means and moral
end and to make it the sole business of the moral philosopher to deal
with the facts relevant to some situation which, as given, is not
itself describable in value terms....I cannot avoid an impression
that in practice, instrumentalism does encourage a readiness to take
experience rather too much as a hand to mouth affair.

Rogers goes on to state that as a matter of fact the pragmatist in addition
to his method always does have more general aims. His tendencies are
usually those of liberalism.

There are other difficulties with the pragmatic method. In setting
up the ideal of choice with knowledge, one will find in concrete situations
that there is never complete knowledge of alternatives. There are too many
choices to permit waiting for all evidence, and even if there were very
few choices to be made, complete knowledge on all issues is not desirable.

1. "Attitude psychology," a fairly recent brand of psychology, teaches that
individuals possess attitudes, some active, some passive, some general,
and some particular. Propagandists by manipulation of attitudes may
make certain choices on the part of the people inevitable. But the
people who are propagandized still have an opportunity for freedom.
If they have knowledge of the methods of the propagandist they may
realize that there are other points of view. If they can keep before
themselves other attitudes, they will have several attitudes from which
to choose. Doob has pictured these defenses of freedom of choice in
his book, Propaganda. For a brief synopsis of attitude psychology in
general see Allport. On attitudes, In Huchison's Handbook of social
psychology.
2. Charles Peirce first postulated pragmatism as a scientific method.
William James had definite leanings toward science.
3. Rogers, op. cit. p. 15, 16.
for one would have to figure out the complete consequences of every possible alternative and then there would never be action. Still, it is undoubtedly better according to most thought, past and present, to have some knowledge before making a choice than to proceed without any information.

The pragmatic method is of especial importance in consumption, for the limitation of resources makes choice after choice a daily necessity. On the one hand a family has its standard of living, composed of the values, usually translated into terms of goods and services, which it desires. On the other hand there are the scarce resources of time, energy, and money. The purpose of the family is to achieve as much of the standard of living as possible, to maximize the returns from its resources. This is a pragmatic problem, in that the family is acutely aware of the problem of deciding which goods and services to select, and how to use its time. But the process of allocating resources to achieve the standard of living leads the family to haul into the light its standard of living, and frequently there are revisions in it, a change in emphasis on certain aspects of life. What help can be given the family in deciding which aspects of life ought to be emphasized more than others, from the point of view of well-being? This is not so much a pragmatic problem as a question for philosophy of value.

Summary

It is obvious that the idea of choice with knowledge leads into various phases of thought. Only a few of these have been sketched; the

---

deepest problems have not been touched. First there is the nature of knowledge as it was known in the past. A given set of values essential for well-being was believed to exist, the only task being to discover and list them. This idea was to be found in Greek philosophy, the theology of the Catholic church, and in philosophic rationalism. Today, however, the development of science has led to aspersions on the validity of a given set of values to be discovered by intuition, metaphysics, or other means. The tendencies of today may be summarized as three: (1) Ethics should look for values in those general aspects of life which the experience of man has shown to be quantitatively important. (2) Science is believed important to attain given ends, but not valid to judge what ends or values are most important. (3) Concrete situations where choices are to be made are more important than a debate over what are the ultimate values of life; this is the pragmatic view of life.
Section 9
The Abundant Life

As implied in modern ethical thought, the nature of which was shown in previous sections, two meanings have been attached to the abundant life: (1) the materially abundant life in terms of many economic goods and services and (2) the abundant life in terms of many interests. These two concepts are not distinct, for a relation exists between them. It usually requires economic goods and services to carry out a variety of interests. Leisure time uses, for example, frequently involve some monetary expenditures. It may be hiking boots or a ticket to the movies. In regarding culture as a whole it will be observed that great aesthetic and intellectual advance usually requires a material basis. The age of Pericles in Athens occurred when Athens possessed considerable wealth; the Italian Renaissance was contemporary with commercial activity in the Italian cities; and Elizabethan literature occurred when the English were expanding their empire.

The materially abundant life.

There have been several criticisms of the materially abundant life.

1. The "material aspect" of consumption has several connotations. It sometimes refers to the things money will buy, that is, economic goods and services. Such is the meaning here employed. In this sense, the non-material services such as those rendered by professions are included in the materially abundant life. Another connotation, but less useful, would include as material wants those for food, clothing, and housing, while the "higher or spiritual wants" are for such items as education and religion; the books for these purposes, however, are just as material as the milk and bread included under the category of food. Another idea, least tenable of all, includes as the material aspect of consumption those goods and services satisfying "egoistic" demands rather than "altruistic", and immediate rather than deferred wants.
criticisms usually, though not always, directed at America. These criticisms center about the fact that high standard of living as the term is used in this country has come to be one with many economic goods and services.

The need for new things is imperative. What is a high standard of living? Nothing but new things for more people.  

Most of the new things are to add to comfort and convenience. It is the great increase in comforts and conveniences resulting from inventions that has led some to believe the industrial age has brought about progress.  

One need not look far for the criticisms of the materially abundant life. Magazines such as Harper's, Scribner's, and Forum have carried articles of this nature.  

There are numerous books containing suggestions on the desirability or undesirability of the materially abundant life. They vary from the Bible to Sorokin's Social and cultural dynamics.  

One argument used against the materially abundant life is its effect on the ideational spirit. The religious spirit, as it was conceived in the past at any rate, is the antithesis of the materially abundant life.  

This can be seen in the admonitions of Jesus:

Lay not up for yourselves treasures upon earth, where moth and rust doth corrupt, and where thieves break through and steal:....For where your treasure is, there will your heart be also....  

No man can serve two masters: for either he will hate the one, and love the other; or else he will hold to the one, and despise the other.

---

2. See some of the arguments in Bury. The idea of progress.  
3. In the case of many criticisms of the materially abundant life, there may be no clear-cut basis for the criticism. For example, the European who rails at American "material ways" and lack of "culture" may be doing so from motives of jealousy. He may not be able to define "culture." But in so far as there appears to be an understandable argument, it should be analyzed.
Ye cannot serve God and mammon. Therefore I say unto you, Take no thought for your life, what ye shall eat, or what ye shall drink; nor yet for your body, what ye shall put on. Is not the life more than meat, and the body than raiment?

The extent to which the late Middle Ages and the early modern period were characterized by a condemnation of the material life has been indicated. The analysis of the religious communistic communities in America in the nineteenth century also showed the extent to which, in ideational eyes, one must eschew the world in order to be truly spiritual. The avoidance of emulation, ostentation, and individual wealth according to this belief means a better ability to serve God because (1) the religious spirit is actually different from the acquisitive spirit, and the two cannot exist side by side; (2) a simple life means that more resources, such as thought, time, and energy will be given to God; and (3) the fact of being different from the rest of the world binds the members of the religious sect together and makes them aware of their religious ideals. The dissolution of these societies indicates that the ideational spirit in these communities has failed to survive under modern conditions.  

Another criticism, directed, however, at the relative amount of attention given the materially abundant life, is that if too much attention is paid to the conveniences and comforts of life one may neglect other aspects of life. Miss Hoyt has developed this trend of thought, contending that Western culture lacks balance because it places undue emphasis on technology. The machine age, besides robbing man of resources for enjoying other types of satisfactions, may also rob him of the inclination. As Van

1. Matthew 6:19,21,24-25.
2. See section 3 of the present study.
3. Hoyt. Consumption in our society. ch. 29.
Loon lightly puts it

The bathroom with running water became the grand and glorious purpose of a life which no longer demanded that the austere chamber of the soul and the intellect should also be provided with the running water of criticism and the fresh air of intellectual independence and courage. ¹

American consumption is especially abundant with technology in forms of automobiles, radios, refrigerators, typewriters, etc. This is the result of frontier conditions which taught the idea of control of nature; at the same time science was also teaching control; add to this the many natural resources of the country, and it is clear why technology plays such an important role in American consumption. Historians as well as others have recognized that perhaps too much emphasis has been placed on material means. Frederick Jackson Turner wrote:

If the task of reducing the Province of the Lake and Prairie Plains to the uses of civilization should for a time overweight art and literature, and even high political and social ideals, it would not be surprising. But if the ideals of the pioneer shall survive the inundation of material success, we may expect to see in the Middle West the rise of a highly intelligent society where culture shall be reconciled with democracy in the large. ²

The task of integrating into our culture something besides technology is also seen by Bogart, a student of Turner's, who in his presidential address before the American Economic Association concluded:

We must also effect a synthesis of usefulness and beauty, of learning and life, of material achievement and art, of economics and ethics. Life is after all one organic whole, and technology and culture are not and should not be distinct. More material achievement is not a final goal. We must provide a juster social organization, a civilization more appreciative of and better able to use leisure, art, literature, the finer things of the spirit, and higher ethical ideals. ³

The people of the Orient, with a philosophy very different from ours, do

1. Van Loon. To have or to be. School and Society. 35:7-8. 1932.
2. Turner. The frontier in American history. Conclusion of ch. 4.
not believe in greatly emphasizing the technological.

The difference between China and the West seems to be that the Westerners have a greater capacity for getting and making more things and a lesser ability to enjoy them, while the Chinese have a greater determination and capacity to enjoy the few things they have.

On the other hand, the modern world, with its over-development of machinery, has not taken time to ensure that man enjoys what he makes. The glorification of the plumber in America has made man forget that one can live a very happy life without hot and cold running water, and that in France and Germany many men have lived to comfortable old age and made important scientific discoveries and written masterpieces with their water jug and old fashioned basin.1

Usually those who criticize the one-sidedness of American culture would not advocate the abandonment of the technological interest, but would urge the adoption of other interests.

In short, our culture must be consonant with realistic science and with machine industry, instead of a refuge from them. And while there is no guaranty that an education which uses science and employs the controlled processes of industry as a regular part of its equipment will succeed, there is every assurance that an educational practice which sets science and industry in opposition to its ideal of culture will fail.2

The final set of criticisms of the materially abundant life may be grouped under the general heading of misuse of goods and services created.

Radios can bring symphony music or horror-thrillers. Newspapers can give a picture of world events, with and without sensationalism. Automobiles mean communication, but they also mean automobile accidents, frayed nerves and spoilage of landscape. Chemicals may save lives in the hands of a doctor and take lives in the hands of a warring nation. When a critic says that the machine age has put tools into the hands of man, but he has not learned to use them, the above arguments are the usual ones given.

There is another way of misusing goods and services, a way which can

---

be seen in the tirade against the newly rich, against vanity, prestige, and keeping up with the Joneses, possession for possession's sake. A family with a large amount of wealth may not use it in the "right way," may not receive the appropriate satisfactions from it. Is there a proper use for commodities? For example, is a copy of Shakespeare to be used to start a fire in the fireplace? Or to be bought only because the color of the binding harmonizes with the color scheme of the room? Or to be set in a conspicuous place where visitors will assume that the family has a literary turn of mind? Books are meant to be read, and that is their appropriate use.

The criticisms of the "nouveaux riches" belong here. It is believed by many people that those who buy elegant homes and furnishings, start picture galleries with no knowledge of how to appreciate them are not making the appropriate use of their wealth. There is social criticism when their homes are too gaudy and their clothes too obviously representative of much income. The arguments against "keeping up with the Joneses" belong here also. Consumption economists as well as others have thought "keeping up with the Joneses" undesirable in many respects.

It might be questioned whether the arguments against motives of vanity and prestige are strictly scientific arguments. Probably not. The judge here is the experience of man. Below is a description by a historian of life in Italy during the crusades, showing that criticism of the "nouveaux riches" traits is so commonly accepted today that it is used in historical description without explanation or apology.

The rise of a capitalistic system created a peculiarly obnoxious class of nouveaus riches, fond of ostentation and display, given to vulgar luxury, loud in manners, unscrupulous, and uncharitable.¹

¹ Thompson, Economic and social history of the Middle Ages. p. 471-472.
In summary, the criticisms against the materially abundant life may be listed as follows: (1) the materially abundant life is contrary to the ideational spirit; (2) the technological conveniences for comfort and convenience may lead to neglect of other aspects of life; and finally (3) the goods and services which characterize that abundance may be misused. Modern ethical thought apparently gives little attention to the ideational spirit. The second and third arguments imply that interests should be broad, not confined only to the technological, and that there are certain desirable standards in regard to the proper use of goods and services, standards of what is good reading and good art. The value attached to human life is shown in the criticism of the use of certain technological devices which take and injure life. The rather common belief in the undesirability of prestige interests has been pointed out in both this section and that on individual freedom of choice.

In justice to the materially abundant life, defined as many goods and services, it has been pointed out by numerous writers that certain uses of material abundance have led to greater health, longer life, and opportunities for the enjoyment of a wide variety of interests, although some interests such as the ideational have little place. The life abundant with a variety of interests.

The Middle Ages did not know a variety of interests, for it was an age of poverty and lack of communication. Even those at the top of feudal society did not have a variety of diversion. Church theology condemned the extravagant life when attempts in that direction were made. But with the growth of wealth, the knowledge of how others lived resulting from the
Crusades and voyages of discovery, and with the rise of democracy and the coming of the Industrial Revolution, there were more things to enjoy, and after a time more free time to enjoy them.¹

As indicated in the statistical studies of consumption, the abundant life in terms of many interests is an essential aspect of modern ethical thought. Minimum budgets for families in the poverty class came more and more to include the items of education and recreation, even though the allotment might be only a daily newspaper. And in studies of more fortunate people, such as the farm family living studies, considerable attention is given to advancement items. These include education, reading, travel, recreation, and especially social organizations. Leisure time is believed a necessity, and there is concern that it not be spent in monotonous ways.

In reading, broad knowledge is preferable to local gossip. In the quantitative indexes of the welfare status of communities, parks, schools, museums, concerts, and sale of sporting goods are often included.

It is difficult to attribute this interest in a variety of interests to particular causes. Increased wealth, communication, and the decline of religious duties have been mentioned. Undoubtedly a further influence is social science, particularly sociology and psychology, which seem to hold that personality development is furthered if one has wide knowledge and experiences with different sorts of activities. Man should develop his capacity to appreciate many phases of life.

Exactly what interests should go to make up variety of interests in the abundant life and how they should be organized in the standard of

¹ Still, it must be remembered that there were numerous holidays and festivals in the Middle Ages and for some time thereafter.
living is a debatable point. The principle of freedom of choice would
discourage any hard-and-fast answer. And the present state of ethics and
philosophy of value shows no hard-and-fast answer is forthcoming, as
observed in the discussion of choice with knowledge. There have been,
however, general answers to the question. Miss Hoyt would list the six
basic cultural interests: the sensory, social, intellectual, technological,
aesthetic, and empathetic. The expenditure studies listed interests more
specifically in terms of categories of goods and services. Perry in his
book, Moral economy, states the problem in very general terms:

Morality is only life where life is organized and confident, the
struggle for mere existence being replaced with the prospect of a
progressive and limitless attainment. The good is fulfilled desire;
the moral good the fulfillment of a universal economy, embracing all
desires, actual and possible, and providing for them as liberally
as their mutual relations permit. The moral good is simply the
greatest possible good, where good in the broad generic sense means
any object of interest whatsoever, anything proved worth the seeking
from the fact that some unit of life actually seeks it.1

Other names have been used to denote the "universal economy" which Perry
mentions. "Harmony" and "organic whole" are commonly used. Miss Hoyt
discusses the standard of living as an organic whole and states:

Satisfactions received from successive units of time, energy, or
money given to the development of appreciation may for a long time
increase, and they increase the longer the more nearly the apprecia-
tion approximates one of the main generalized types of interest. For
the greatest possibilities of increase over a whole life, however,
the man's potential appreciations must have a more or less harmonious
development.2

The Golden Mean was an earlier way of stating the principle of harmony.
According to Aristotle, to feel feelings "when we ought, on what occasions,
towards whom, why, and as, we should do, is the mean, or in other words the

best state, and this is the property of virtue." Virtue then is "a state apt to exercise deliberate choice, being in the relative mean, determined by reason, and as the man of practical wisdom would determine."¹ To Plato riches and poverty were both bad, and a compromise should be struck between them. The excessive weeping and laughing of Homeric stories was to be prohibited in his Republic. Temperance was applied particularly to the youth of the Republic, but it was also present in the organization of all the classes.² T. V. Smith interprets Plato's concept of the Golden Mean as follows:

......we see interwoven in Plato's practice three prescriptions for the health of the soul; (1) no basic desire is to be summarily suppressed; for this leads to bad dreams by night and sore troubles by day; (2) no desire is to be pampered; for this would be for other desires to neutralize the first prescription; (3) contemplative or aesthetic susceptibilities are to be specifically stimulated as others are quieted.³

It will be observed that in all of these concepts of harmony in choice of interests to be developed in life, there is some implication of which are the values especially important in that harmony. To Perry such values are the interests proved worth seeking from the fact that some unit of life actually seeks them; to Miss Hoyt, the six basic cultural interests are the ones among which a balance is to be sought; to Aristotle, the values which reason finds important are emphasized in the mean; and for Plato, the contemplative life is above all the most desirable. It is questionable whether all writers advocating the principle of harmony make clear what

interests or values are most important in that harmony.¹

But on the principle of the abundant life, in terms of the satisfaction of a variety of interests, there is not complete agreement. More than one brilliant scientist has devoted himself chiefly to research oblivious of other activities. The life of the Curie is an example. More long-standing examples are the medieval ideal of asceticism and the Oriental Nirvana. Monasticism teaches that man should flee from the world. The Hindu philosophy, on the contrary, believes in experiencing the abundant life but in realizing that the true aim of man does not lie in the variety of experiences, but in a realization that they are insignificant in comparison with the great spiritual heights which can be attained. From some Hindu literature it appears that a man has to pass through these experiences in sympathy if not in actuality, before he can attain Nirvana. For a complete study of evaluations of consumption, the ideals of asceticism and Nirvana should be further investigated; such a study is outside the scope of the present thesis, however.

It is likely that there may be some curtailment of the ideal of the abundant life in the totalitarian state, for two reasons. First, censorship

¹ Laird's criticism of the concept of harmony is forestalled by the above provisions of these writers, but since his criticism is well-stated and all writers on harmony and the organic whole are not invulnerable, it is given. "A word should be added concerning the harmony of appetences. The ideal of harmony is seductive, partly because disharmony is discouraging and exhausting, but principally because we assume a certain kind of harmony as our ideal. We assume in effect, that the best or most excellent appetences are conserved in the harmony, and united with as many appetences as possible, which, although not very good, are good enough. A harmony of appetences, none of which are nobler or more excellent than any others, tells an entirely different story. If one man's interests revolved harmoniously round leeks, and another man's interests revolved harmoniously round cabbages, we really need not be expected to be greatly impressed." The idea of value, p. 131.
may limit extent of knowledge, and second, resources may be so inefficiently used, or may be so directed to militarism, that there is little left for the everyday living of the people. In the long run, however, both fascism and communism probably seek an abundant life for their people.

In summary of the life abundant in terms of many interests, it should be pointed out (1) that one still must know which values or interests are more important than others; even the "harmony" or "Golden Mean" principle requires this knowledge. And (2) the life abundant in terms of many interests is not a universal ideal. It is contrary to asceticism. The Hindu Nirvana, while there is evidence it accepts the life abundant with many interests as a stage, sees beyond such a life.
of consumption in terms of 

representation and 

(3) The concept of consumption must be more 

(1) To secure an accurate picture of what is the 

of that period 

Examples are possible if referred to the development of the 

representative sources are utilized for a given period of history. 

Rules like in or before the era of industrialization from 

consumption of groups of people. 

by those who have lived the 

development of material life from the point of view of real-behavior. 

are of use. 

(2) In studying these one must look at 

people have and do acquire what they are 

a state of both and consumption affects well-being because what 

precedes development of welfare is possible, but it is assumed that welfare 

may be derived as consumption in addition to welfare or well-being. 

which the concept of resources for their consumption. 

people have or buy and what they do in so far as these actions are related 

energy in the satisfaction of human interests. 

and 

SUMMARY
ethical thought, and (4) understanding of the nature of a culture which
may be different from that in which the investigator lives.

The present study, in picturing ideas of wise consumption in the
historical period from 1300 to the present, in Europe and America, used
such sources of evaluations as sumptuary legislation, early utopias,
reformers, opinions of early economists, and religious communistic
societies in nineteenth century America. For a picture of present day
ideas on what is wise consumption, particularly in the United States,
evaluations of consumption were secured from studies of family scales
of living and quantitative indexes of the welfare status of communities.

The present study, while not exhausting the various possible sources
of evaluations of consumption for any given period, did select sources
likely to contain typical evaluations. The greatest omission was an
analysis of present day government regulations. Given sources are not
exhausted, but it is believed that the number of studies used in analyzing
sumptuary legislation, the religious communistic societies in nineteenth
century America, and family scales of living in the United States are
sufficiently extensive. Examples of quantitative indexes of the welfare
status of communities which were collected are probably not sufficient
to show the general trend of ideas on what is wise consumption, but the
evaluations contained in them are consistent with the evaluations in the
scale of living studies.

4. Evaluations of consumption in the late medieval and early modern
period show that the dominant ethical thought of that time emphasized the
following ideas: (1) the government to a great extent had a right to
regulate personal consumption; (2) social status quo must be maintained;
(3) the simple life without extravagance was held to be most conducive to good morals; (4) fear of the new was expressed at the introduction of innovations; (5) domestic order and military protection must be maintained. It is believed that the first four aspects of ethical thought were emphasized more than they are today; these four aspects have been called "ideational ethical thought." The fifth point is probably common to most nations in various historical periods as well as today. The ideational ethical thought was the product of feudalism, poverty, lack of contacts between communities, and the influence of the Catholic Church. The Reformation had the immediate influence of enforcing the simple life.

5. With the decline of the authority of religion, rise of the authority of science, growth of democracy, increased wealth, and wider contacts among societies, as well as other causes, modern ethical thought arose. Histories of the transition period contain suggestions on influences leading to the modern era.

6. An approach to the problem of wise consumption is seen in the attempt of moral arithmeticians and certain economists to determine whether a given increase in wealth does or does not cause a proportional increase in welfare. The difficulties involved show that little is to be gained by trying to measure degrees of well-being.

7. The approach to the problem of wise consumption used in studies of family scales of living is that some uses of time and some types of goods have a tendency to increase well-being. While it is possible to measure quantities of goods and uses of time, no attempt is made to measure the extent of their tendency to improve well-being.

8. Quantitative indexes of the welfare status of communities contain
evaluations of consumption. The methodology used in such indexes involves the following procedure: The item of fact upon which data are secured pictures or portrays a certain aspect of life; that particular aspect of life is necessary to well-being; but there is no attempt to measure how essential it is to well-being. For example, expenditures for education are an item of fact picturing extent of education; there is a relation between extent of education and well-being; but no measurement is made of this relation.

9. An analysis of the evaluations of consumption to be found in studies of family scales of living and in quantitative indexes of the welfare status of communities would seem to indicate that modern ethical thought emphasizes what people ought to do rather than what they ought not to do. These evaluations imply the following to be important phases of modern ethical thought: (1) freedom of choice; (2) choice with knowledge, especially knowledge of how others live and of the opinion of experts, particularly scientific experts; (3) the abundant life, materially and in terms of many interests. Studies of family scales of living and quantitative indexes of the welfare status of communities are inadequate in picturing modern ethical thought for they do not show to any great extent the government regulations, or lack of regulations, which imply evaluations of consumption.

10. A survey of writing on the problem of what are the important values of life, couched in less objective terms than was the case of sources of specific evaluations, shows the following arguments with regard to the various phases of modern ethical thought:

(1) The arguments in favor of freedom of choice center about the idea
of individualism, or importance of human personality. Freedom of choice has been limited by such forces as the religious framework, dominance of custom and convention, and government action, which if carried to a certain extreme becomes totalitarianism.

(2) The tendencies of today with regard to the idea of choice with knowledge indicate that people should go to experts for advice. Science is believed important to attain given ends, but science cannot judge what ends or values are most important for well-being. It is believed that ethics should look for values in those aspects of life which the experience of man has shown to be important. The pragmatist believes concrete situations where choices are to be made are more important than a debate over what are the ultimate values of life. All of these ideas are significant for consumption.

(3) Criticisms of the materially abundant life include the argument that it is contrary to the ideational spirit, the belief that technological inventions for comfort and convenience may lead to neglect of other aspects of life, and the belief that there is waste when goods and services are misused. Certain aspects of the materially abundant life may lead to greater health, longer life, and opportunities for the enjoyment of a variety of interests. At the same time, certain interests, such as the religious, are little emphasized. The idea of the life abundant in terms of many interests must contain stipulations of which values or interests are more important than others; even the "harmony" or "Golden Mean" principle requires this knowledge. The life abundant in terms of many interests is not a universal ideal. It is contrary to asceticism. And the Hindu Nirvana teaches that there are satisfactions beyond the life abundant in terms of many interests.
CONCLUSIONS

1. A study of ideas on what is wise consumption is an approach to the problem of welfare. It is assumed that what people do with their scarce resources affects their well-being. These ideas on what is wise consumption can be found in opinions of those who have evaluated the consumption of groups of people. Such opinions can be found in history as well as in certain present day writing and legislation.

2. A study of evaluations of consumption from the fourteenth century to the present, in Europe and America, shows a change in the nature of dominant ethical thought. There was a change from an emphasis on social status quo, the simple life, fear of the new, and dominance of religion, to the modern emphasis on the idea of freedom of choice; choice with knowledge, especially knowledge of how others live and the opinion of experts; and the abundant life, materially and in terms of many interests. Further study of evaluations of consumption to be found in the transition period as well as today is necessary to fully substantiate these findings.

3. The underlying assumption of the present study, that it is desirable to know the opinions of others on what is wise consumption, is part and parcel of the ethical ideal of choice with knowledge.

4. The methodology used in the present study can be used for further investigation of what is wise consumption. This methodology includes (1) the concepts of evaluations and the ethical thought such evaluations represent, (2) the setting up of requisites which must be met in securing an accurate picture of evaluations of consumption for a given period, and
(3) the interpretation of quantitative indexes of the welfare status of communities in terms of items of fact, the picture which the item of fact portrays, and the evaluation implied.
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The writer is particularly indebted to Professor Elizabeth E. Hoyt who helped formulate the problem and who patiently read preliminary copies of the manuscript, giving suggestions on organization and interpretation which were invaluable. The writer is also deeply indebted to Professor Margaret G. Reid who helped in putting the study into final form by giving suggestions which made for clearer analysis and greater precision of statement. The writer also expresses appreciation to Professor E. D. Ross of the history department for suggesting a bibliography of books on history bearing on the subject of the thesis and for reading and criticizing Part I.

Dr. Jean Bowman of Iowa State College and Miss Virginia Britton, graduate student at the University of Chicago, read the entire study and made pertinent suggestions. Dr. Ida Greaves gave assistance at several points in the writing of the study. Professor F. B. Clark of the A and M College of Texas read and criticized portions of the study in its first draft. To these individuals the writer expresses sincere appreciation,
This bibliography is classified according to the following headings: economics, ethics, history, general, and studies of family scales of living. Although this classification makes necessary the arbitrary placement of several references, on the whole it facilitates use of the bibliography.

**Economics**


Bonar, J. Philosophy and political economy in some of their historical relations. 5d ed. G. Allen and Unwin, London. 1922.


----------

A history of the theories of production and distribution in English political economy from 1776 to 1848. 3d ed. P. S. King and Son, London. 1924.


----------


---


---


---


Say, J. B. A treatise on political economy; or the production, distribution, and consumption of wealth. From 4th French ed. Grigg and Elliot, Philadelphia. 1836.


Wicksteed, P. H. Commonsense of political economy and selected papers and reviews on economic theory. George Routledge and Sons, London. 1933. 2 v.


Ethics


Perry, R. B. A general theory of value; its meaning and basic principles construed in terms of interest. Longmans, Green and Co., New York. 1926.


History


Greenfield, K. R. Sumptuary law in Nürnberg. John Hopkins University
Studies in Historical and Political Science. v. 36. no. 2. John
Hopkins Press, Baltimore. 1918.

1923.

Hind, W. A. American communities and cooperative colonies. 2d rev. ed.

Holliday, R. C. Unmentionables; from figleaves to scanties. R. Long and

Hubbard, H. C. The older middle west, 1840-1880; its social, economic and
political life and sectional tendencies before, during and after the

1908.

24:1095-1102. 1934.

Lovejoy, A. O. The great chain of being; a study of the history of an idea.

McGiffert, A. C. Martin Luther, the man and his work. Century Co., New
York. 1911.

1922.

McMahon, T. S. Social and economic standards of living. D. C. Heath and
Co., Boston. 1925.

Markham, L. Mrs. Grundy; a history of four centuries of morals intended
to illuminate present problems in Great Britain and the United States.

Mers, J. T. A history of European thought in the nineteenth century. 2d
ed. W. Blackwood and Sons, London. 1904. 4 v.


York. 1930-1935.

Nordhoff, C. The communistic societies of the United States; from personal
visit and observation. Harper and Brothers, New York. 1875.


Shambaugh, B. M. K. Amana; the community of true inspiration. State Historical Society of Iowa, Iowa City. 1906.

——— Amana that was and Amana that is. State Historical Society of Iowa, Iowa City. 1932.


General


Fite, W. Individualism; four lectures on the significance of consciousness for social relations. Longmans, Green and Co., New York. 1911.


Thurstone, L. L. and Chave, E. J. The measurement of attitude: a psychophysical method and some experiments with a scale for measuring attitude toward the church. University of Chicago Press, Chicago. 1929.

Thwing, D. F. What are the tests of a nation's civilization? Can America meet them? Hibbert Jour. 27:335-347. 1929.

Todd, A. J. Theories of social progress; a critical study of the attempts to formulate the conditions of human advance. Macmillan Co., New York. 1918.

Van Loon, H. W. To have or to be. Sch. and Soc. 36:6-8. 1932.


Studies of Family Scales of Living

Early studies and minimum budgets for urban families.


Kennedy, J. C. et al. Wages and family budgets in the Chicago stockyards district, with wage statistics from other industries employing unskilled labor. An investigation carried on under the direction of the Board of the University of Chicago Settlement. University of Chicago Press, Chicago. 1914.


Studies made by state bureaus of labor.

These studies are listed in numerical order according to their citation number used in referring to them in section 5. These are the citation numbers contained in the Williams and Zimmerman bibliography, U. S. Dept. Agr. Misc. Pub. 223. 1935. Only the studies cited in section 5 are listed below.


Farm family living studies.

These studies are listed in numerical order according to their citation number used in referring to them in section 5. These are the citation numbers contained in the Williams and Zimmerman bibliography. U. S. Dept. Agr. Misc. Pub. 223. 1935. Only the studies cited in section 5 are listed below.


Recommended farm family budgets.

These studies are listed in numerical order according to their citation number used in referring to them in section 5. These are the citation numbers contained in the Williams and Zimmerman bibliography. U. S. Dept. Agr. Miss. Pub. 223. 1935. Only the studies cited in section 5 are listed below.


Studies of use of time.


Miscellaneous.


Henderson, Y. and Davie, M. R. Incomes and living costs of a university faculty; a report made by a committee on the academic standard of living appointed by the Yale University chapter of the Am. Assoc. of Univ. Professors. Yale University Press, New Haven. 1923.


