Comparison bone plating, Richard vs. A.S.I.F.

William D. Hoefle
Iowa State University

Follow this and additional works at: https://lib.dr.iastate.edu/rtd

Recommended Citation
https://lib.dr.iastate.edu/rtd/18241

This Thesis is brought to you for free and open access by the Iowa State University Capstones, Theses and Dissertations at Iowa State University Digital Repository. It has been accepted for inclusion in Retrospective Theses and Dissertations by an authorized administrator of Iowa State University Digital Repository. For more information, please contact digirep@iastate.edu.
Comparison bone plating - Richards vs. A.S.I.F.

by

William D. Hoefle

A Thesis Submitted to the Graduate Faculty in Partial Fulfillment of The Requirements for the Degree of MASTER OF SCIENCE

Department: Veterinary Clinical Sciences
Subject: Veterinary Surgery

Signatures have been redacted for privacy

Iowa State University
Ames, Iowa
1974
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>INTRODUCTION</strong></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>LITERATURE REVIEW</strong></td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>MATERIALS AND METHODS</strong></td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Experimental Animals</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anesthesia and Presurgical Preparation</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Surgical Technique</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>RESULTS</strong></td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Group 1: 8-Week Observation Period</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Group 2: 16-Week Observation Period</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Group 3: 40-Week Observation Period</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>DISCUSSION</strong></td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS</strong></td>
<td>102</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>BIBLIOGRAPHY</strong></td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>ACKNOWLEDGMENTS</strong></td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
INTRODUCTION

In recent years compression bone plating has gained popularity as a method for internal fixation of long bone fractures in small animals. Compression plating of fractures has several advantages over other methods of fracture fixation.

Anderson (1965) felt that compression was beneficial because it increased the rigidity of fixation by impacting the bone ends and narrowing the space between the fragments which had to be bridged by new bone.

Jacobs and Guten (1967) observed the same characteristics with compression plating. Additionally, they felt that compression plating permitted early ambulation, reduced muscle atrophy, and shortened the period of disability. Burwell (1971) agreed on these points and further felt that plating led to less deformity.

Wolff (1972) stated that compression plating permitted primary bone union which was accomplished when two vascular bone fragments were rigidly fixed under compression. Direct bony union occurred without radiologically visible callus.

Two major orthopedic companies, Richards¹ and A.S.I.F. (Association for the Study of Internal Fixation)² have devel-

¹ Richards Manufacturing Co., Memphis, Tennessee.

² Association for the Study of Internal Fixation equipment distributed by Smith Kline Surgical Specialties, Philadelphia, Pennsylvania.
oped equipment to accomplish compression bone plating. Although the basic concept and principles of compression fixation are the same, each company utilizes different types of equipment and techniques.

Many veterinary surgeons have utilized one type of equipment or the other without a more valid reason for choosing other than which company was the better salesman. Granted, there may be differences in costs of equipment, but this may not be the best criterion for selection.

There are two basic differences between the systems. The Richards system utilizes screws which are self-tapping while the A.S.I.F. system does not. In the A.S.I.F. system the threads are cut into the bone with a tap before the screw is inserted. The Richards system uses a compression device which is applied over the bone plate utilizing an existing screw through the plate. The A.S.I.F. compression device is applied at the end of the plate and requires that an additional hole be drilled beyond the plate.

The purpose of this investigation was to compare healing of femur fractures repaired with Richards and A.S.I.F. equipment and to compare the holding effectiveness of the self-tapping with that of the non-self-tapping bone screw. The short and long term effects of the respective plates and screws on the bone and surrounding tissues were evaluated to help determine if there were adverse effects from leaving bone plates in place indefinitely. Evaluations and comparisons
were made by the use of clinical, radiological, gross, and histopathological studies.
LITERATURE REVIEW

In 1943 Urist and Johnson presented some classic observations of fracture healing in man. They stated that there was complete similarity in the general pattern of bone repair in man and animals. The gross structure of this pattern included three types of tissue - granulation tissue, fibrocartilage, and bone.

Procallus was a term applied to the organizing hematoma and highly vascular granulation tissue which developed in the first weeks of healing. The undifferentiated connective tissue cells exhibited the ability to differentiate into fibrocartilage callus - a translucent mass of dense fibrous connective tissue, fibrocartilage, and cartilage which was seen from the second to the third week of healing until the time of union.

The bony callus originated in some fractures as early as the first week, through the proliferation of spindle shaped cells in the inner layer of the periosteum and the endosteum of the fracture ends. These cells then became recognizable as osteoblasts and deposited new bone on the medullary and periosteal surfaces of the injured cortex. At about three to four weeks, the new bone grew from the endosteal and subperiosteal bony callus into the fracture gap by replacing the fibrocartilage callus in the wake of invasion by blood vessels, primordial marrow, spindle-shaped connective tissue cells, and osteoblasts.
The time sequence of these various processes was obscured by the overlap in the appearance of new structural changes. The hematoma was so large that organization of the core was incomplete at the time the periphery of granulation tissue was developing into fibrocartilaginous callus. Collars of new bone of considerable volume were already constructed around the main fragments. In a healing fracture between twenty and forty days, every phase of bone repair was visible. Differentiation and growth of new connective tissue was directed by diverse means to the development of bone across the fracture ends.

Eggers et al. (1949) used pressure to hold fracture ends together. They concluded that pressure in optimal amounts stimulated osteogenesis, while excessive pressure produced necrosis and non-union.

Ford et al. (1951) did some experiments with grafts and felt that pressure made little difference in the manner or rate of union.

Eggers et al. (1951) used slotted plates without the screws being drawn tightly to repair fractures clinically in man. This allowed the fractured ends to be under the same physical forces of contact and compression as are present in a closed reduction. Shaft fractures healed promptly with this plate. They felt that absorption and osteogenesis occurred concurrently, thus achieving a balance. They further stated that any method of fracture fixation which deprived the area
of the contact-compression factor (as they termed it) denied
the parts of a useful and necessary physiological function.

Venable (1951) acknowledged the principle of attaining
close approximation of the fracture ends to obtain uninter-
rupted bone union at the fracture site. Venable developed
the first compression device which he termed an impactor. He
further summarized that continuity of like cells with a blood
supply uninterrupted by necrotic changes during healing
facilitated tissue repair. Early engagement of like tissues
was essential for prompt healing of all wounds. Closely main-
tained coaptation of fresh fracture ends was necessary for
early healing of the injured bone without excess callus. He
felt that callus was excessive bone scar formation due to
instability and insufficient blood supply at the injured bone
site during healing. Impacted coaptation secured total
immobilization at the fracture site.

Friedenburg and French (1952) found that experimental
fractures of the ulna of dogs healed faster when a compressing
force of 12 to 18 pounds was used. Pressures of 30 pounds or
greater caused necrosis of the cortex and poor healing.

They felt that enhanced healing under pressure was related
more to secure fixation and impaction of the fracture. They
were undecided whether pressure induced a specific osteogenic
response in healing bone tissue. Key and Reynolds (1953)
concurred with this idea. Their experiments showed that the
most rapid and perfect fracture healing occurred when the
fragments were fused by appositional bone. They felt that clinicians should strive to create conditions under which the fusing by appositional bone could occur.

Ford and Key (1954) stated that pressure caused bone fragments to be immobilized and compressed together. They disagreed with Eggers in that they did not find that excessive pressure caused non-union.

Reynolds and Key (1954) compared standard bone plates, slotted plates, and intramedullary nails. They concluded that fixation and apposition of the fractured fragments were more important in obtaining union than the pressure created by weight bearing.

Bagby and Janes in 1958 devised their own compression plate. They used a plate in which the screws were placed off center in the hole. As the screws were tightened, this would create compression at the fracture site. In experimental studies using these plates on dog femurs, they concluded that compression reduced the fracture gap to a minimum and therefore less time was needed to span the gap with callus. They felt that good immobilization favored early repair of a fracture. They believed that these factors allowed a fracture to heal by first intention. Little external callus was found in the fractures which united early.

Based on experiments done on the tibia of rabbits, Laurin et al. (1963) felt that compression did not speed callus formation.
Muller (1963) stated that three months after the insertion of ordinary self-tapping screws in dogs, only connective tissue could be distinguished between the threads of the screws. He designed a screw with a thread which gave excellent holding power, but which had threads pre-cut in the bone with a tapping device. These screws were as well anchored in the bone after three months as on the first day. Only bone or newly formed bone could be detected between the threads.

Boyd et al. (1965) studied healing in the treatment of non-union fractures. They felt that the most important factors in successfully treating non-unions were firm fixation, apposition of the fragments, and osteogenesis. They believed that the best stimulus for osteogenesis was autogenous cancellous bone packed about the non-union.

Based on experimental work with fractures of dog femurs, Anderson (1965) agreed with preceding authors that reduction of space by compression reduced the healing time and increased the rigidity of fixation. He believed that plate and screw fixation did less damage to the medullary and cortical blood supply than other methods of internal fixation. He agreed with Muller in that he felt that using a sharp tap generated less heat which might cause necrosis of bone and loosening of the screw. He observed that the amount of callus decreased as the rigidity of fixation increased. Jacobs and Guten (1967) made similar observations when using compression plating in man.
In a paper on fracture healing in dogs and cats, Vaughn (1966) emphasized the role of callus in fracture healing. He observed that osteocytes are killed at the fracture site when a fracture occurs and that this death is due to an interruption of circulation in the Haversian vessels.

Wickstrom et al. (1967) evaluated the AO (which later became A.S.I.F.) compression apparatus. They agreed with several of the previous authors that compression promoted healing by enhancing immobility and producing close contact of bony surfaces. They did not observe bone necrosis at the compressed interface.

Putnam and Pennock (1969) used the A.S.I.F. compression equipment in both large and small animals. They observed that it was helpful to have immediate weight bearing after surgery. They reiterated that if fracture lines in the cortical bone are placed in close apposition, osteogenesis can occur directly from each fragment of cortex across the fracture line.

Naiman et al. (1970) used A.S.I.F. plates on upper extremity fractures in man. The improved rigidity allowed earlier union limiting the period of external immobility and permitted earlier rehabilitative therapy. They reported a high incidence of excellent functional results.

Hickcox (1970) used a Richards plate in dogs, that was slotted, which allowed compression from the center (Hirschhorn modification) and decreased the required area of exposure.
He was impressed with the rapid ambulation and near absence of post-operative pain.

Herron and Doonan (1971) reported excellent results in using A.S.I.F. compression plating in non-union fractures in dogs.

Horne (1971) reiterated the advantages of plating as stated by previous authors. He also found that the Hirschhorn plate required less exposure than other methods of compression. He observed that the Richards screw had a fluted end which removed chips and this prevented clogging of the threads and binding of the screw. It also had buttress threads, which increased holding power and eliminated back pressure.

Burwell (1971) used plating for tibial fractures in man. He observed that these patients had less joint stiffness, absence of deformity, and more certain union of the fracture without need for prolonged immobilization.

Wolff (1972) and Muller et al. (1970) stated that in fracture repair it was necessary to get as accurate an anatomic reduction as possible and rigid internal fixation of fragments during the entire period of fracture healing. This permitted primary bone union - union without any radiologically visible periosteal callus.

Uhthoff and Dubuc (1971) observed some disadvantages in the healing of fractures repaired with plates. In a study on dog femurs, they showed that reduction in shaft caliber and cancellization of the cortices occurred from the bypassing
effect of the plate. In their work, the cortical bone was transformed into cancellous bone and replaced by an incom-
pletely mineralized woven bone. They also noted some subperi-
osteal bone resorption.

In 1971 Zaslow and Lenhard reported success in using compression plates for immobilization of foreleg fractures in the dog. They noted quick restoration of weight bearing and good anatomical reduction in this use of compression plates.

Bone plates have been used in areas other than limb fractures. Sumner-Smith and Dingwall (1971) used plates in repairing fractures of the mandible in dogs. In six cases, they noted that the dogs could eat immediately after surgery, had less pain, and had rapid healing with less callus form-
ation.
MATERIALS AND METHODS

Experimental Animals

Twelve dogs were used in this study. The dogs were of mixed breeding and were selected without regard to age or sex. All dogs weighed 10 Kg or more. Each dog was given a physical examination to insure that it was in good health and that no lameness existed. All dogs were vaccinated for canine distemper, hepatitis, and leptospirosis and were treated for internal and external parasites when found.

The dogs were kenneled in steel cages and were allowed to exercise for about 20 minutes twice daily. Cages were cleaned at least twice daily and disinfected once each day. Water and commercial dry dog food were given free choice. The twelve dogs were divided into 3 groups of four dogs each. Following surgical implantation of the bone plates, each dog was observed and evaluated for a variable length of time. Group 1 was observed for 8 weeks, Group 2 for 16 weeks, and Group 3 was observed for 40 weeks postoperatively. Clinically, the dogs were observed for return of weight bearing and freedom from limping.

At the end of the observation period the dogs were euthanized with a concentrated pentobarbital sodium solution.¹ Necropsies were performed and both femurs were removed in their

¹Toxital, Jensen-Salsbury Laboratories, Kansas City, Missouri.
entirety. Each femur was manipulated to evaluate gross sta-
bility with the plate in place. The muscle tissue was then
stripped from the bone, the screws removed and the plate taken
off. The bone, screws and plate were observed for discolor-
ation, and the tissue observed for reactivity to the plate or
screws. Stability of the fracture site (without plate) was
evaluated by applying moderate manual pressure (Figs. 1A, B, C).

The femoral head, neck, and greater trochanter were removed
from each femur by making a cut with a band saw at a 90 degree
angle to the long axis of the femur. The condylar area of the
femur was removed by making a cut at a 45 degree angle to the
long axis of the femur. Cutting at different angles helped
to identify the proximal and distal ends of the segment. All
of the screw holes were included in the portion of femur which
was saved (Fig. 1D). The bones were split longitudinally in
an anterio-posterior plane with a band saw (Fig. 1E).

The femurs were radiographed by laying the split portions
of each femur side by side with both femurs from one dog on
the same cassette. The right femur was marked with an R and
the left femur with an L. Each dog's identification number
was included on the radiograph. All femurs were radiographed
at 50 KVP, 100 MA, 1/20 second, and at a 30 inch distance
(Fig. 2).

The femurs were placed in 10% buffered formalin for at
least 72 hours. The bone specimens were then cut (Fig. 3)
and decalcified in a 10% solution of ethylene dinitrilo
Fig. 1A. A femur with a transverse mid-shaft fracture

Fig. 1B. The fracture has been reduced and a compression plate applied.

Fig. 1C. Healing has taken place and the plate has been removed.
Fig. 1D. The femoral head and greater trochanter were removed with a transverse cut (— — #1). The condyles were removed with an oblique cut (— — #2).

Fig. 1E. The femurs were split longitudinally (cut #3).
Fig. 2. Radiograph of split portions of both femurs of dog 133
Fig. 3. Cut #4 was made through the proximal screwhole. A microscopic section was taken from that face.
Cuts #5 and #6 were made through the holes adjacent to the fracture site.
Cut #7 divided that section longitudinally through the screw holes. A microscopic section was taken from that face.
tetraacetic acid disodium salt\textsuperscript{1} for at least 21 days. Fresh EDTA solution was added after the 10\textsuperscript{th} day. The decalcified bone tissues were embedded in paraffin and the cut sections stained with hematoxylin and eosin.

Anesthesia and Presurgical Preparation

Each dog was administered intravenously .07 mg/Kg body weight of atropine sulfate in combination with 5\% thiamylal sodium\textsuperscript{2}. The thiamylal sodium was given to effect for the purpose of endotracheal intubation. General anesthesia was maintained with methoxyflurane\textsuperscript{3} in a semi-closed circle system.

For all practical purposes, the hair from the rear half of each dog was clipped. Hair was clipped from the last rib caudally, down each rear leg to the hock joint on all aspects, and hair was clipped a short way down the tail. The surgical field was scrubbed at least three times with povidone-iodine\textsuperscript{4} surgical soap and rinsed each time with alcohol. Just prior to surgery, a final application of povidone-iodine solution was applied with a hand sprayer.

In the surgery room the patient was positioned in lateral

\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{1}EDTA disodium salt, Matheson, Coleman, and Bell Manufacturing Chemists, Norwood, Ohio.
\item \textsuperscript{2}Surital, Parke-Davis and Company, Detroit, Michigan.
\item \textsuperscript{3}Metofane, Pitman-Moore, Indianapolis, Indiana.
\item \textsuperscript{4}Betadine, The Purdue Frederick Company, Norwalk, Connecticut.
\end{itemize}
recumbency with the rear limb to be operated on suspended from an IV stand with gauze (Fig. 4). The surgeon scrubbed with povidone-iodine surgical soap and then donned a sterile surgical gown and surgical gloves. Four towels were draped at right angles surrounding the thigh (Fig. 5). The limb was freed from the IV stand by an assistant and held while a sterile 4" orthopedic stockinette was started onto the foot by the surgeon (Fig. 6). The surgeon would then grasp the foot through the stockinette and roll the stockinette up the leg and secure it with towel clamps. An aperture was cut in a sterile disposable drape and the limb placed through the opening (Fig. 7). The remainder of the patient and the surgical table were covered with sterile drapes.

Surgical Technique

The Richards equipment was used on the right leg and the A.S.I.F. equipment on the left. The leg to be operated on first was selected at random.

A lateral approach was used to expose the femur. A skin incision was made from the greater trochanter to the patella (Fig. 8). The incision was continued down through the subcutaneous fascia. The junction of the biceps femoris muscle and the fascia lata was incised along the entire length of the skin incision (Fig. 9). The biceps muscle was retracted caudally and the vastus lateralis muscle cranially to expose the shaft of the femur (Fig. 10).
Fig. 4. Rear limb to be operated on was suspended from an IV stand with gauze
Fig. 5. Four towels were draped at right angles surrounding the thigh
Fig. 6. Limb was held by an assistant while a stockinette was started on the foot.
Fig. 7. Draping has been completed with disposable drapes
Fig. 8. Skin incision has been made from the greater trochanter to the patella
Fig. 9. Junction of the biceps femoris muscle and the fascia lata was incised along the length of the skin incision.
Fig. 10. Biceps muscle was retracted caudally and the vastus lateralis muscle cranially to expose the shaft of the femur
A transverse mid-shaft fracture of the femur was created with the use of a guillotine-type bone breaker designed by the author (Fig. 11). The breaker was positioned on the femur so that the fork of the breaker was on the anterior-medial surface of the femur and the movable blade was on the posterior-lateral aspect of the femur (Fig. 12). The handle was turned clockwise until the bone broke. Pressure was then released, the breaker was removed, and any periosteum which had remained intact was broken down manually. Invariably, a single transverse fracture resulted (Fig. 13).

**Right femur (Richards equipment)**

A Richards bone plate of the proper length was selected (Fig. 14). The length of the femur and the amount of exposure influenced the choice of plate length. A rule of thumb was to use a plate five times as long as the diameter of the bone. The decision as to whether the slotted portion of the plate should be placed on the proximal or distal fragment was determined by the exposure. Generally, the slotted portion was placed on the fragment where exposure was the greatest. The non-slotted end of the plate was held to the bone fragment with a Richards bone holding forcep (Fig. 15). The second hole from the non-slotted end was drilled with a hand drill using a 7/64" drill bit. Centering the drill bit in the hole in the plate was facilitated by using a drill guide (Fig. 16).

A depth gauge was used to determine the proper length
Fig. 11. Guillotine-type bone breaker
Fig. 12. Bone breaker has been placed on the femur
Fig. 13. Transverse mid-shaft fracture has been created
Fig. 14. A proper length Richards plate has been selected
Fig. 15. The non-slotted end of the plate was held to the proximal fragment with a Richards bone holding forcep.
Fig. 16. A drill guide was used to center the drill bit for drilling the bone at the second hole from the end.
screw to use (Fig. 17). The ideal length of screw penetrated the opposite cortex by about one full thread. The appropriate length self-tapping screw was placed in the hole and tightened until snug, but not tight (Fig. 18). The fracture ends were brought into alignment and held in position by placing a baby Kern bone holding forceps over the plate and around the medial side of the fracture segment at the slotted end of the plate. The compression device was set in position and used as a guide for drilling the hole for the screw used to anchor the compression device (Fig. 19). The screw placed through the compression device was longer than the other bone screws since it had to go through the compression device and both cortices (Fig. 20). A compression wrench was used to tighten the compression device until some resistance was felt (Fig. 21). At this point, the plate was snug and well aligned along the long axis of the bone. The bone was then drilled at the end hole at the non-slotted end of the plate and a screw of appropriate length was placed (Figs. 22 and 23).

The compression device was then further tightened until it turned with difficulty. Visually the fracture was well compressed (Fig. 24). Another hole was drilled, this time at the end hole of the slotted end of the plate (Fig. 25). A screw of proper length was placed (Fig. 26). The compression device was loosened with the compression wrench and the compression device removed by removing the extra long bone
Fig. 17. Depth gauge was used to determine the proper length screw to use.
Fig. 18. A screw was placed in that hole
Fig. 19. Compression device was set in position and used as a guide for drilling the hole for the screw to anchor the compression device
Fig. 20. A screw was placed to anchor the compression device
Fig. 21. A compression wrench was used to tighten the compression device until some resistance was felt.
Fig. 22. A hole was then drilled at the non-slotted end of the plate
Fig. 23. A screw of the appropriate length was placed in the end hole
Fig. 24. The compression device was further tightened until the fracture was well compressed
Fig. 25. A hole was drilled at the slotted end of the plate
Fig. 26. A screw was placed in the end hole.
screw. A shorter length bone screw was placed in this hole (Fig. 27). Holes were drilled in the bone at the remaining holes in the plate and appropriate screws were inserted except where the hole and screw would pass through the fracture line (Fig. 28). In all cases there were at least two screws on each side of the fracture line.

The biceps muscle was reattached to the fascia lata with simple interrupted sutures of 0 chromic surgical gut (Fig. 29). The subcutaneous tissue was closed with simple interrupted sutures of 00 chromic surgical gut. The sutures were placed in an inverted manner so as to bury the knots in the deeper tissues (Fig. 30). Simple interrupted sutures of 32 gauge monofilament stainless steel wire were used to close the skin incision (Fig. 31).

An assistant then positioned the dog in right lateral recumbency. The left leg was suspended with gauze from an IV stand and prepped as the right leg had been. The surgeon changed gloves and instruments. Sterile draping was performed for the left leg as previously described for the right leg.

**Left femur (A.S.I.F.)**

Exposure of the left femur was similar to that of the right, and the fracture was produced in the same manner (Fig. 32). An A.S.I.F. plate of the proper length was selected (Fig. 33). After the fracture had been reduced the plate was positioned on the lateral aspect of the femur. The
Fig. 27. The compression device was removed and a proper length screw placed in the slotted hole.
Fig. 28. The completed plating
Fig. 29. The biceps muscle was reattached to the fascia lata with simple interrupted sutures of 0 chromic surgical gut
Fig. 30. The subcutaneous tissues were closed with simple interrupted sutures of 00 chromic surgical gut in an inverted manner.
Fig. 31. The skin was closed with simple interrupted suture of 32 gauge monofilament stainless steel wire
Fig. 32. A transverse mid-shaft fracture of the left femur was created
Fig. 33. An A.S.I.F. plate of the proper length was selected
to be positioned to allow the compression device to be placed at one end of the plate. This required additional exposure since the compression device projected about 3 cm beyond the end of the plate. The end of the plate opposite that to be used for compression was held to the bone with Verbrugge bone holding forceps (Fig. 34). The second to the end hole at the end of the plate held by the bone forceps was drilled with a 3.2 mm drill bit. A drill guide was again used to center the hole in the plate with the hole being drilled in the bone (Fig. 35). Similarly a depth gauge was inserted and used to find the correct length of screw required (Figs. 36 and 37). Contrary to the Richards system, a bone tap was used to cut threads in both cortices of the bone. This procedure was necessary since an A.S.I.F. screw has no cutting edge (Fig. 38). A screw scale was used to find a screw of the proper length (Fig. 39). A screw of the proper length was inserted and tightened until it was snug (Fig. 40). The fracture ends were aligned and held in position with Verbrugge forceps placed over the end of the plate and the bone fragment not yet attached to the plate.

The guide for establishing the distance from the end of the plate for the hole for the screw to anchor the compression device was positioned (Fig. 41). The anchor hole was drilled and the threads tapped (Figs. 42 and 43). The compression device was set into position and the anchor screw was placed (Fig. 44). The compression wrench was used to tighten the
Fig. 34. The plate was held to the proximal fragment with Verbrugge bone holding forceps
Fig. 35. A drill guide was used to center the drill bit for drilling the second hole from the end of the plate.
Fig. 36. A depth gauge was used to determine the length of screw required.
Fig. 37. The screw length required was read off the depth gauge
Fig. 38. A tap was used to cut threads in the bone.
Fig. 39. A screw scale was used to measure the screw
Fig. 40. The screw was inserted and tightened until snug
Fig. 41. A guide for establishing the distance from the end of the plate for the hole for the anchor screw for the compression device was positioned.
Fig. 42. Using the guide the anchor hole was drilled
Fig. 43. The threads were tapped for the anchor hole
Fig. 44. The compression device was positioned and anchor screw placed.
compression device until some resistance was felt (Fig. 45). At this point, the plate was fairly well aligned along the long axis of the bone. A hole was then drilled at the end hole of the plate opposite the end with the compression device (Fig. 46). The depth of the hole was measured, the threads tapped, and the proper length screw inserted and tightened (Fig. 47). The compression device was turned until much resistance was experienced. Visually the fracture was well compressed (Fig. 48).

A hole was drilled in the bone at the hole in the plate adjacent to the compression device (Fig. 49). Length was measured, threads tapped, and the appropriate screw placed in the hole (Fig. 50). Holes were then drilled, tapped, and screws placed under any remaining holes in the plate. Holes were not drilled where the screw might pass through the fracture line.

The compression device was then removed. A hole was drilled in bone at the hole in the plate where the compression device had been. The threads were tapped and a screw of the appropriate length was used to complete the plating (Fig. 51).

The biceps muscle was reattached to the fascia lata with simple interrupted sutures of 0 chromic surgical gut. The subcutaneous tissues were closed with simple interrupted inverted sutures of 00 chromic surgical gut. The skin was closed with simple interrupted sutures of 32 gauge stainless steel wire.
Fig. 45. The compression wrench was used to tighten the compression device until some resistance was felt.
Fig. 46. A hole was drilled at the opposite end of the plate
Fig. 47. A screw was placed in that hole
Fig. 48. The compression device was tightened until the fracture was well compressed
Fig. 49. A hole was drilled in the bone at the hole adjacent to the compression device
Fig. 50. An appropriate screw was placed in this hole
Fig. 51. The completed plating
No bandages were used postoperatively. The dogs were maintained on penicillin-streptomycin for at least 5 days following surgery. The skin sutures were removed at 10-14 days postoperatively.
RESULTS

Group 1: 8-Week Observation Period

In group 1 the femurs were transversely fractured bilaterally in 4 dogs. The femoral fractures were repaired using an A.S.I.F. compression plate on the left and a Richards compression plate on the right.

Lameness in each case was classified into the following categories: normal ambulation, moderate limping, and carrying the limb.

All dogs in this group had no lameness and were bearing full weight at the time of euthanasia.

Gross evaluation

Wound healing of the surgical incisions was complete and free of drainage in all dogs in this group.

No irritation or discoloration was observed in the tissues adjacent to the plates.

Following removal of the femurs the soft tissues were stripped from the bones. Bending and rotational forces were manually applied to each femur with the plates in situ. All were stable.

In most instances there were varying amounts of fibrous tissue which had grown over the plates. This was cut through to expose the screws. The screws and bone plates were removed. The femurs were subjected to moderate manual bending and rotational forces. All were stable.
Radiographic evaluation

After the femurs had been grossly examined, they were split longitudinally with a band saw in an anterior-posterior direction. The medial and lateral halves were placed (cut surface down) side by side on a radiograph cassette along with the cut halves from the opposite femur. Radiographs were taken and evaluated. The femurs were evaluated to determine if the cortex had regained continuity and if the fracture line had disappeared.

Radiographically, there was continuity of the cortex of the femur under the plate on two femurs plated with Richards and two plated with A.S.I.F. On the contra-plate side two femurs plated with Richards and three plated with A.S.I.F. had regained continuity.

The fracture line was no longer visible under the plate on two femurs repaired with Richards and two repaired with A.S.I.F. On the contra-plate side, the fracture line was no longer visible on two femurs repaired with Richards and three plated with A.S.I.F.

In all cases the bone was more dense in a small circumscribed area surrounding the screw holes.

Microscopic evaluation

Longitudinal sections were taken of the plated side of each femur which included the fracture site and through the adjacent screw holes proximally and distally (Fig. 3). An
additional section was taken transversely through the most proximal screw hole of each femur, again on the plated side (Fig. 3). These sections were evaluated with both non-polarized and polarized transillumination.

The screw holes were classified as to whether there was fibrous tissue, fiber bone, or lamellar bone adjacent to where the screws had been and whether there was good or poor definition of the grooves created by the screw threads in the osseous tissue.

There was lamellar bone adjacent to where the screws had been except in the cases of two A.S.I.F. screw holes, which had fibrous tissue. There was good definition of the grooves in all cases (Figs. 52 and 53).

At the fracture site, evaluation was based on bony bridging of the fracture site and whether fiber bone, lamellar bone, or fibrous tissue was present.

Examination of the section of one femur repaired with a Richards plate showed that there was not bony bridging at the fracture site. One femur plated with A.S.I.F. did not have osseous bridging at the fracture site. One Richards and one A.S.I.F.-plated femur had fibrous tissue at the fracture site (Fig. 54). One A.S.I.F. and two Richards-plated femurs had fiber bone and lamellar bone at the fracture site. The rest had only lamellar bone at the fracture site.
Fig. 52. Grooves made in bone by Richards screw in dog 104. Hematoxylin and eosin stain. X35
Fig. 53. Grooves made by Richards screw in dog 104. Polarized light. Hematoxylin and eosin stain. X35
Fig. 54. Fibrous tissue at the fracture site of the left femur in dog 187. Hematoxylin and eosin stain. X35
Group 2: 16-Week Observation Period

In group 2 the femurs were transversely fractured bilaterally in 4 dogs. The femoral fractures were repaired using an A.S.I.F. compression plate on the left and a Richards compression plate on the right.

All dogs in this group had no lameness except dog 279, which carried its left leg.

**Gross evaluation**

Wound healing of the surgical incisions was complete and free of drainage in all dogs in this group. No signs of irritation or discoloration were seen in the tissues adjacent to the plates.

All of the femurs were stable to bending and rotational forces except the left femur of dog 279, which had fractured at the end of the plate.

There were varying amounts of fibrous tissue growth over the plates. After plate removal, the femurs were subjected to moderate manual bending and rotational forces. All were stable except for the above mentioned left femur of dog 279.

**Radiographic evaluation**

The femurs were split and radiographed as the ones in group 1 had been. The cortex was continuous in the contraplate sections of all femurs except in both femurs of dog 281. The cortex was continuous on the plated side of all femurs in this group.
There was disappearance of the fracture line in all dogs except dog 281. The fracture line was still evident on the contra-plate side of this femur.

The new fracture at the distal end of the plate on the left femur in dog 279 was readily apparent (Fig. 55).

There were areas of increased density around the screw-holes in all cases, except the distal two holes in the left femur of dog 278. There was considerable lysis around these holes.

Microscopic evaluation

There was lamellar bone adjacent to where the screws had been except in the left femur of three dogs which had fibrous tissue around the threads (Fig. 56). There was good definition of the grooves made by the threads except for the left femur of dog 279.

Examination of sections of all femurs showed some bridging at the fracture site. All of the A.S.I.F.-plated femurs had lamellar bone at the fracture site, except one which was a combination of lamellar and fiber bone. Two of the Richards-plated femurs had lamellar bone (Figs. 57 and 58), one had a combination of lamellar and fiber bone (Figs. 59 and 60) and one had a combination of cartilage, fiber bone, and lamellar bone at the fracture site (Fig. 61).
Fig. 55. Radiograph of split femurs of dog 279. Note fracture of the left femur at the end of the plate.
Fig. 56. Fibrous tissue in the space between bone and where the A.S.I.F. screw had been in dog 40. The fibrous tissue has separated from the bone during the processing. Hematoxylin and eosin stain. X35
Fig. 57. Fracture site of the right femur of dog 279. Note lamellar bone, but different orientation at the fracture site. Hematoxylin and eosin stain. X35
Fig. 58. Same as Fig. 57, but with polarized light
Fig. 59. Fracture site of the right femur of dog 281. Note areas of lamellar bone (darker) and fiber bone (lighter). Hematoxylin and eosin stain. X35
Fig. 60. Same as Fig. 59, but with polarized light. Areas of lamellar and fiber bone are more readily apparent.
Fig. 61. Fracture site of right femur of dog 278. There are areas of lamellar bone, fiber bone, and cartilage present. The dark blue areas are cartilage. Toluidine blue stain. X35
Group 3: 40-Week Observation Period

In group 3 the femurs were transversely fractured bilaterally in 4 dogs. The femoral fractures were repaired using an A.S.I.F. compression plate on the left and a Richards compression plate on the right.

All dogs in this group had no lameness except dog 44, which carried its left leg.

**Gross evaluation**

Wound healing of the surgical incisions was complete and free of drainage in all dogs in this group. No signs of irritation or discoloration were seen in the tissues adjacent to the plates.

All of the femurs were stable to bending and rotational forces except the left femur of dog 44. There was motion at the fracture site when this femur was manipulated.

There were varying amounts of fibrous tissue growth over the plates. After plate removal, the femurs were subjected to moderate manual bending and rotational forces. All were stable except the left femur of dog 44. There was motion at the fracture site when only slight force was applied.

**Radiographic evaluation**

The femurs were split and radiographed as the ones from the previous groups had been.

The cortex had regained its continuity on both the plated
and contra-plated side in all femurs except the left femur of dog 44 (Fig. 62).

The fracture line had disappeared in both the plated and contra-plated side of all femurs except the left femur of dog 44.

There were areas of increased density around the screw-holes in all femurs except the holes in the left femur of dog 44. There were lytic areas around all of the screw holes of this femur.

**Microscopic evaluation**

There was lamellar bone right up to where the screws had been except the screw holes from dog 44, which had fibrous tissue between the bone and where the thread had been (Figs. 63 and 64). There was good definition of the grooves made by the threads (Figs. 65 and 66) except in the left femur of dog 44, where the grooves were poor. In several femurs there was a shell of bone surrounding the screw extending down into the medullary cavity (Figs. 67 and 68).

There was bony bridging at the fracture site, except in the left femur of dog 44. This femur had fibrous tissue at the fracture site. The right femur from dog 44 had a combination of lamellar and fiber bone at the fracture site. The rest had lamellar bone at the fracture site.
Fig. 62. Radiograph of split femurs of dog 44. Non-union has occurred in the left femur. Note lysis around screw holes in left femur.
Fig. 63. Grooves made by Richards screw in right femur of dog 44. There is fibrous tissue in the space between the bone and where the screw had been. The fibrous tissue has separated from the bone during the processing. Hematoxylin and eosin stain. X35
Fig. 64. Same as Fig. 63, but with polarized light
Fig. 65. Groove made by A.S.I.F. screw in dog 133. Hematoxylin and eosin stain. X35
Fig. 66. Grooves made by Richards screw in dog 133. Polarized light. Hematoxylin and eosin stain. X35
Fig. 67. Shell of bone surrounding the threads in the marrow cavity of the right femur of dog 133. Hematoxylin and eosin stain. X35
Fig. 68. Same as Fig. 67, but with polarized light
DISCUSSION

This investigation, in which 12 dogs were used, was carried out to compare the results of femur fracture repair using Richards and A.S.I.F. compression plates. A review of the literature revealed that plating had been used for fracture repair since 1951. Plating with and without compression had been compared by Reynolds and Key in 1954. Many investigators used various types of compression plating equipment for repair of fresh fractures and delayed unions. No one had compared different types of compression equipment under similar conditions in a single investigation. This investigation attempted to do that.

Muller (1963) and Anderson (1965) stated that it was necessary to use a bone tap to cut threads in the bone for the screw in order to avoid necrosis and formation of fibrous connective tissue between the screw threads and the bone. This investigation compared the pre-tapped screws of the A.S.I.F. system with the self-tapping Richards screws.

A bone breaker, which was designed by the author, consistently produced simple transverse fractures. All previous investigators had used various types of saws to produce the fractures for their experiments.

The only dogs which showed lameness were those with non-union or refracture. In the 8-week group the dogs were walking
normally even if union had not occurred by gross, radiographic, and microscopic observations.

It was significant that, radiographically, in some cases the cortex had regained continuity and the fracture line had disappeared on one half of the femur, but not on the other. This may have been due to the stage of healing.

Grossly and microscopically, there was little reactivity to the bone plates. Plates and screws are made from type 316 stainless steel in both systems. Most of the fibrous tissue growth around the plates was likely due to periosteal stripping at the time of surgery.

The microscopic section taken of each fracture site represented only a minute segment of the $360^\circ$ radius of the cortex. This fact helped explain some of the discrepancies in the gross, radiological, and microscopic results. When discrepancies occurred the radiological and gross evaluations were relied on more heavily.

In the cutting technique, it was not always possible to cut the sections of the fracture site such that both adjacent screwholes and the fracture site would appear on the same microscopic section. It was hoped that it would be possible to do that in order to have more screwholes for evaluation.

It was noted in the microscopic sections that if there was any indication that the screws had not held well, then there was more fiber bone and fibrous tissue at the fracture site.
The use of polarizing lenses was very helpful to help determine what was lamellar bone and what was fiber bone.

In one section toluidine blue was used to help demonstrate cartilage which was present and involved in the healing process.

In most microscopic sections of screw holes, it was noted that a shell of bone surrounding the threads of the screw extended down into the medullary cavity. This explained the increased density around the screw hole which had been noted radiographically.

In this study only three fractures on two dogs had not healed at the time of euthanasia. Two of these fractures were in one dog in the 8-week group. These could possibly have eventually healed with time. The other femur which did not heal was an A.S.I.F.-plated femur in the 40-week group. Some of the screws had pulled out within the first two weeks after the repair of this fracture. One of the femurs which had been repaired with A.S.I.F. later fractured at the end of the plate. The original fracture site on this femur had healed. The new fracture was not significant in this study. Based on these results, there appeared to be no significant advantage of one compression system over the other as a method of fixation for fracture healing. The results did substantiate that compression plating is a good method of fracture repair.

The extra exposure required for the A.S.I.F. compression device was a disadvantage in the surgical procedure.
These results indicated more fibrous tissue between the screw threads and the bone with the A.S.I.F. than with the Richards screws. This was contrary to the opinions expressed earlier by Muller and Anderson. In this study, the extra time required to tap the threads for the A.S.I.F. screws was a disadvantage.
SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS

1. The purpose of this study was to compare healing of femur fractures repaired with Richards and A.S.I.F. compression plates. The holding effectiveness of the self-tapping Richards screws and non-self-tapping A.S.I.F. bone screws was compared. The effect of the plates and screws on the bone and surrounding tissues was evaluated.

2. The evaluation was made by comparing the results of fracture healing clinically, grossly, radiographically, and microscopically. The holding effectiveness of the screws was evaluated clinically and grossly. The screwholes were evaluated radiographically and microscopically. The effects of the screws and plates were observed grossly and microscopically.

3. Twelve dogs of mixed breeding were divided into 3 groups and observed for 8 weeks, 16 weeks, and 40 weeks postoperatively. Each animal had transverse femur fractures created bilaterally. The right femur fracture was repaired using Richards compression equipment and the left using A.S.I.F. compression equipment.

4. Lameness in each case was classified into the following categories: normal ambulation, moderate limping, and carrying the limb. Lameness was noted in two dogs. Both dogs were carrying their left legs. Their femurs had been repaired with A.S.I.F. plates. One was a non-union and the other femur
had fractured at the distal end of the plate. All of the other dogs had no lameness and were full weight bearing on both rear legs at the time of euthanasia.

5. Each surgical incision was evaluated for wound healing and freedom of drainage. Healing was complete and drainage was absent in all dogs. On gross observation there was no irritation or discoloration of tissues adjacent to the plates.

6. Bending and rotational forces were manually applied to each femur with the plate still in place. Two femurs showed instability. Both were left femurs repaired with A.S.I.F. plates. One was a non-union and the other was a femur which had fractured at the distal end of the plate.

7. The plates were removed and the femurs were subjected to moderate bending and rotational forces. The same two femurs showed instability.

8. The femurs were split longitudinally in an anterior-posterior direction into plated and contra-plated halves. The halves were radiographed lying side by side on a cassette. The radiographs were evaluated to determine if the cortices had regained continuity and the fracture line had disappeared. There were 3 femurs where the cortex failed to regain continuity on both the plated and contra-plated side. Two of these were A.S.I.F.-plated femurs and one was Richards-plated. There were 2 femurs where the cortex did not regain continuity
on only the plate side. One had been repaired with a Richards plate and the other with an A.S.I.F. plate. There were three femurs with a lack of cortical continuity on only the contra-plate side. Two had been repaired with Richards and the other with A.S.I.F.

There were three femurs in which the fracture line did not disappear radiographically on both halves. Two were left femurs (A.S.I.F.) and one was a right femur (Richards).

There were two femurs in which the fracture line had not disappeared on the plated half. One of these was A.S.I.F.-plated and the other was Richards-plated. There were two right femurs (Richards) in which the fracture line had not disappeared on the contra-plate side.

9. Histopathological sections were taken through the proximal screwhole on each femur. These sections were evaluated and classified according to the type tissue adjacent to where the threads of the screw had been. The tissue types were either fibrous tissue, fiber bone, or lamellar bone. The sections were also evaluated for good or poor definition of the grooves in the bone created by the screw threads.

In seven screw holes there was some fibrous tissue present. Six of these were A.S.I.F. screwholes and one was a Richards screwhole. The remaining sections had mostly lamellar bone adjacent to where the screw had been.

Definition of grooves made by the threads was good in all
screwholes, except two A.S.I.F. holes. Fibrous tissue was present around these two screws.

10. Histopathological sections were made through the fracture site and extending proximally and distally to the screw holes adjacent to it. The sections were evaluated as to whether or not there was bony bridging of the fracture and if fiber bone, lamellar bone, or fibrous tissue was present.

There were three femurs in which bony bridging was not present. Two of these were left femurs (A.S.I.F.) and one was a right femur (Richards).

There were 14 femurs that had lamellar bone at the fracture site. Six of these were Richards-plated femurs and eight were A.S.I.F.-plated. Three femurs had fibrous tissue at the fracture site. Two were A.S.I.F. and one was a Richards. Six femurs had a combination of fiber and lamellar bone. Four of these were Richards femurs and two were A.S.I.F. One Richards-plated femur had a combination of cartilage, fiber bone, and lamellar bone at the fracture site.

11. The results of this study showed that the holding effectiveness of the A.S.I.F. screw, which required the threads to be cut in the bone with a tap, was not superior to the holding power of the Richards self-tapping screw. There was more fibrous tissue interposition between the bone and the screw with the A.S.I.F. screw.
There appeared to be no negative effects from leaving the plates and screws in place for as long as ten months.

Healing of fractures repaired with the two systems appeared to be similar. There was non-union with one A.S.I.F.-plated fracture. There was one dog in the 8-week group where neither femur had bony union at the time of euthanasia, although the dog was walking normally on both legs.
BIBLIOGRAPHY


ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The author wishes to thank the following people for their assistance and encouragement on this project:

Dr. Phillip T. Pearson for his advice, guidance, and encouragement.

Dr. Wallace M. Wass for his interest and suggestions and for making time and funds available.

Dr. Ronald L. Grier for his suggestions and help in preparation of the manuscript.

Dr. David Graham for helping evaluate the histopathological tissue sections.

Mr. Wallace C. Schloerke for his suggestions and for serving on the graduate advisory committee.

Dr. David Twedt and Dr. Jonathan Chambers for their surgical assistance and many hours of postsurgical care, while they were senior veterinary students in the veterinary clinics.

Mr. Melvin Helphrey and Mr. Marvin Helphrey for their photography.

Mr. Dean Biechler for his illustrations.

Mrs. Karen Durbin for hours spent in the typing of the manuscript.

Finally, the author wishes to thank his wife, Judy, and children, Billy and Paige, for the encouragement and sacrifices they made.