1984

The effect of instructional media on the composition skills of eleventh graders

Lynn M. McGreevey

Iowa State University

Follow this and additional works at: https://lib.dr.iastate.edu/rtd

Part of the Bilingual, Multilingual, and Multicultural Education Commons, English Language and Literature Commons, First and Second Language Acquisition Commons, and the Instructional Media Design Commons

Recommended Citation


This Thesis is brought to you for free and open access by the Iowa State University Capstones, Theses and Dissertations at Iowa State University Digital Repository. It has been accepted for inclusion in Retrospective Theses and Dissertations by an authorized administrator of Iowa State University Digital Repository. For more information, please contact digirep@iastate.edu.
The effect of instructional media on the composition skills of eleventh graders

by

Lynn M. McGreevey

A Thesis Submitted to the
Graduate Faculty in Partial Fulfillment of the
Requirements for the Degree of
MASTER OF SCIENCE

Department: Professional Studies in Education
Major: Education (Curriculum and Instructional Media)

Approved:

Signatures have been redacted for privacy

Iowa State University
Ames, Iowa
1984
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>DEDICATION</td>
<td>iii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACKNOWLEDGMENTS</td>
<td>iv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Statement of the problem</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Purpose of the study</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assumptions</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hypothesis</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Procedure</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REVIEW OF THE LITERATURE</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research--the composing process</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research--the use of media in teaching composition</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>METHODOLOGY</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Procedure</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ANALYSIS OF THE RESULTS</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SUMMARY, CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusions</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recommendations</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REFERENCES</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APPENDIX A. HUMAN SUBJECTS APPROVAL FORM</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APPENDIX B. LESSON PLAN OUTLINES</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APPENDIX C. LESSON PLAN SCRIPTS</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
DEDICATION

To my mother, Gertrude McGreevey, who taught me life's most important processes: living, loving, and dying.
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

With sincere appreciation, I thank my major professor Dr. Elaine McNally Jarchow. Her contribution to my graduate studies is invaluable, and her example of scholarly discipline I will aspire to emulate.

I extend my appreciation to Dr. Richard Zbaracki and Dr. Will C. Jumper for their scholarly guidance and their affable natures.

The support of family and friends nurtured the idea; the contributions of the following people made the idea a reality.

Liz Schabel
Cindy Rossman
Sue Beers
South Hamilton High School Class of 1985
Mary Badami
Doris Soorholtz
Andrea Carter

Susan Danks
Marylou Eggena
Eunice Meredith
Lori Nielsen
Klint Patterson
Pete Nett
Sheryl Moore

Jack Mully

who saw me through the process
INTRODUCTION

Writing involves clarifying values, assessing knowledge, organizing experience, questioning, defining, and finally finding words and arrangements that will make the thoughts and expressions of one person clear to another. If we are simply overwhelmed by the demands of teaching these things, we will do as so many others have done before: we will simply ask students to write. And they will hesitate, flounder, question, and struggle as so many others have done before (Irmscher, 1979, p. 185).

Students learn to write by writing, scholars say. Yet students cannot write aimlessly without a purpose or a specific audience in mind. Traditionally, writing has been viewed as a mechanical skill taught by language "mechanics" to students expected to assimilate rules and to transfer them to a page (Hairston, 1981). English teachers often give writing assignments specifying little besides a general topic and the number of words. Students have concentrated only on the finished product to be corrected by the teacher.

In the past, composition teachers have viewed the writing process as a mystery, something that could not be described or analyzed and, therefore, could not be taught (Hairston, 1981). Their job was to criticize the finished product rather than to give students direction through the writing process. During the past decade, more emphasis has been placed on writing as a process including three broad areas: prewriting, writing, and rewriting (Cooper & O'Dell, 1978; Emig, 1971; Murray, 1968). Educators are concerned with the kinds of writing required of students and with the evaluation of the final writing product (Britton, 1975;
Kinneavy, 1969). Analyses of the thought process and studies of the psychology of learning lend insight into what happens internally as a writer composes and into how that experience is transformed into writing (Barritt & Kroll, 1978; Emig, 1977). As researchers learn more about the process of writing, new suggestions that place the teacher and the student in a more constructive, cooperating role bridge the gap between learning theory and learning activities.

Composition textbooks, handbooks of writing, and style manuals are commonly found in the English classroom. Yet assessments of students' writing abilities at the national level and by college admissions personnel, professors, employers, legislative task forces, teachers, and students indicate that students are not learning to write well by studying these resources alone. Moffett (1968) stated that students learn language and literature better through reading, writing, and discussing whole authentic discourses rather than by using textbooks that support a substantive and particle approach to composition. Still, English teachers rely on textbooks and traditional paradigms to teach composition (Gebhardt, 1977; Stewart, 1978).

The composition teacher must be aware of the skills a learning task requires and provide students with opportunities to exercise the skills before a final product is required. Pastva (1973) identified three processes fundamental to composition: 1) generation of content, 2) structural manipulation of material, and 3) practice in the use of varied
rhetorical patterns. Professional literature contains many articles concerning the stimulation of ideas for composition through the use of audio-visual media. If instructional media can help students generate content in their writing, might they also enhance the organizational and editing stages of composition? Recognizing the public and professional outcry for better composition instruction in the public schools, educators must look closely at the instructional methods and materials used to teach the writing process.

Instructional media provide diverse methods of teaching and learning. The more media the student is exposed to, the more the student is able to cope with a variety of learning situations and problem-solving situations. Media can lessen the burden of teaching many students with varying abilities. Differences between skilled and unskilled writers can be matched with strategies to help students compose better and to alleviate the frustrations of the former trial-and-error approach to writing. Nevertheless, English teachers have been reluctant to use media hardware and software in their courses. Barry (1979) replicated but expanded the media component of the Squire-Applebee survey of high school English practices. One half of the 444 teachers responding never consistently used media. They cited personal inhibitions, poor quality materials, a lack of funds, time, media staff, equipment, and materials as reasons for the static use. Though English teachers are trained and oriented toward print, their students live in a society dependent on media--audio and visual as well as print. The composition teacher should consider beginning writing instruction where the students are. Students cannot always
analyze the written word, but they can usually follow traits such as flashback and montage in visual projections (Comprone, 1973). Close observation of detail is a prerequisite for much of the expository writing a student does in high school and college—description, definition, classification, reports, processes (McCrimmon, 1970). Observation is especially important in any writing which requires the writer to infer a conclusion from observations, as in contrasts, causal analysis, criticism, and arguments (p. 129). Film focuses attention. If what is seen is written down, concrete details for description are there. Students record what they see, make inferences, and evaluate responses. Statements are supported by evidence. The writing is personal but disciplined.

Writing requires oral, aural, visual, and kinesthetic skills (Sheeley, 1968). Students exposed to audio-visual presentations intuitively hear and see structures and through inductive reasoning can analyze the elements of a presentation to expand their understanding of it (Gray & Trillin, 1977). To teach sentence combining, for example, words are animated on a screen, an explanation of the process is vocalized, sentences are expanded or reduced. Students process the information and are asked to practice what they have observed.

Research has shown that no particular media attribute (e.g., motion vs. slow, color vs. black and white) bears an inherent advantage in facilitating learning. The value of the medium depends on the task to which it is assigned (Heidt, 1980). Why consider an audio-visual approach to teaching composition? Media and writing are representations of
experience (Heidt, 1980). Word media and image media reinforce each other. Visual media rely on words to communicate knowledge. Word media appeals to the visual dimension of the imagination. Visual media can help learners understand printed material. Multimedia are realistic context in which to approach printed media (Morrow & Suid, 1974).

Bell (1980) perceives film as visual language. She contends that writers and film makers share a common goal and work with common elements. The chart below illustrates the parallels.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sender</th>
<th>Message</th>
<th>Receiver</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Film: Narrator</td>
<td>Subject</td>
<td>Audience (viewer, listener)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Composition: Writer</td>
<td>Purpose</td>
<td>Audience (reader, listener)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

GOAL: To communicate by coordinating elements within a certain framework

Critical viewing of creative productions sharpens a student's analytical skills. Given a variety of images, the student can use words to discuss them. Point of view, sequence, transition, and editing are all components of film production transferable to the writing process (Wiener, 1974). When a teacher presents abstract or complex ideas, which for many students include the structure of words, phrases, sentences, paragraphs, and compositions, it is often necessary for students to visualize the concepts. Through effective media design and implementation, this can be done in the composition classroom. Instead of simply defining a concept and expecting students to demonstrate mastery of the procedure, Graves (1972) proposes a five-step approach to teaching
writing which works well with audio-visual materials: 1) the concept is identified, 2) the concept is presented to students through concrete and specific examples, 3) the class discusses what they see, and elements are emphasized or highlighted so students better understand how the elements function within a structure, 4) students engage in activities individually or in small groups to practice using the concept, and 5) their ability to recognize and to use the concept is evaluated. This CEHAE (concept, example, highlighting, activity, evaluation) paradigm identifies the feature to be studied and provides a form for students to follow. Once the framework for manipulating the concept is established, students' knowledge of the form gives them more choices for expressing ideas and may even assist in better understanding the subject of their compositions.

Audio-visual media, especially television, are blamed for students' shorter attention spans and lack of reading and writing skills. It might be possible to reverse these effects and use audio-visual media not only to stimulate thought but to teach other composition skills such as clarity, sentence structure, coherence, organization, and transition--areas of students' writing weaknesses as identified by the 1973 NAEP (Wagner, 1982).

Statement of the problem

The area of media design is a relatively new field of research. English teachers will remain apprehensive of audio-visual materials until they are better trained to use media hardware and to critique, develop,
and implement media software. They will require evidence that the use of instructional media in teaching composition does help students to write more effectively than does a conventional approach. The problem was to design a composition program that effectively integrated audio-visual media to facilitate the acquisition of writing skills and to evaluate that program to determine if it were more successful than the traditional textbook approach.

**Purpose of the study**

There is a need to create and test the effectiveness of multimedia instruction in the English classroom. It may be possible for students to learn to write as effectively through non-text means, involving film, audiotape, and other media as through textbook instruction or nondirective experience in writing. The purpose of this study was to determine if the performance level of students writing comparison-contrast essays would be improved by audio-visual instruction.

**Assumptions**

1. Students had no prior writing instruction that extensively covered the development of comparison-contrast.

2. Students were randomly assigned to the three sections of Language Arts 11.

**Hypothesis**

1. Students receiving instruction through audio-visual media would perform better than students receiving traditional instruction as
evaluated by pre-instruction writing samples, post-instruction writing samples, and student evaluations.

**Procedure**

A large number of variables operate in any teaching situation. Learners react in different ways and are affected by different stimuli. The influence of peers and teachers, the need for structure, and the difference in abilities for learning through oral, aural, visual, and verbal stimuli all have effects on how people learn. An audio-visual approach to composition instruction provided a varied means to explain the concept of comparison-contrast development in writing. A ten-day unit on comparison-contrast was presented to three junior English classes. Similar information about the elements of comparison-contrast writing was presented in one of three ways: 1) by traditional textbook instruction, 2) by lecture/discussion supplemented with print and film illustrations, and 3) by lecture/discussion with audiotape and film examples of comparison-contrast. Students were required to respond in discussion and in writing to what they read, viewed, and listened to in class. At the end of the ten-day unit, students wrote an in-class essay to demonstrate their understanding and command of comparison-contrast development.

**Summary**

College admission personnel, college professors, employers, parents, teachers, and students are not satisfied with secondary students' writing abilities. Composition teachers must deal with insufficient training, preparation time, classtime, and materials to teach composition. They
must also compete with increasing amounts of nonprint media for their students' attention. It is necessary to conduct research to determine how various forms of media can be incorporated into the composition classroom to stimulate student interest in writing and to effectively develop writing skills.

The succeeding chapter presents a further review of composition research during the past decade. Applications of audio-visual instruction are also presented. Chapter three describes the conditions of the research conducted, and chapter four details the results. In the final chapter, the implications of this project for the teaching of composition and the recommendations for further research are discussed.
REVIEW OF THE LITERATURE

Research—the composing process

Process is not an idea new to English instruction. At the turn of the century, educators were writing about the process of composing (Campagnac, 1912). The writing process, however, has been overshadowed by the emphasis on the finished result or product of composing. Although the first issue of the English Journal published in January 1912 contained articles concerned with insufficient funding for writing instruction, teacher class load, and inadequate apparatus for teaching writing (Dieterich, 1973), Campagnac heralded talk as the basis of written composition, self-expression in the English classroom, followed by emphasis on accuracy of expression, and the teacher's responsibility to develop and direct the child's expressive powers (p. 50). These four characteristics are part of the writing process studied today.

Some educators might argue that the status of writing has not altered much since the first English Journal publication. Writing instruction has advanced, and educators have tried to match theory like Campagnac's with actual classroom practices. Teachers give students more pertinent opportunities to write; mere imitation of the "masters" is disappearing, and less red ink is used to "correct" compositions since student writing is shared in class discussion and subjected more often to peer evaluation (Dieterich, 1973).

Moffett (1968) began his exploration into the teaching of writing by considering the elements of discourse (speaker, listener, and topic) and
the relations among the three elements. He contends that the student's language ability progresses from an existential, unabstracted (I-you) relationship to a referential (he-it) relationship that is symbolic of reality. The psychological development of the child becomes the backbone of the curriculum. The teacher provides learning activities to lead the students through the hierarchy of abstraction—from the selection and perception of experience (what is happening) to generalizations and theorizing of experience (what may happen). Moffett's "learning to write by writing" is the foundation for many composition courses. But, the student writer must be motivated to write, sometimes by stimulants and prompters provided by the teacher.

The development of student writing abilities has also been studied to determine the effect of process on product and of product on process. Britton et al. (1975) categorized writing tasks and differentiated among kinds of writing required in the school setting. The writer's involvement in the process of writing is influenced by several forces.

The strategies a writer uses must be the outcome of a series of interlocking choices that arise from the context within which he writes and the resources of experience, linguistic and non-linguistic, that he brings to the occasion. He is an individual with both unique and socially determined experience, attitudes and expectations; he may be writing voluntarily or, as is almost universally the case in the school situation, he may be writing within the constraints of a prescribed task. This he either accepts and makes his own in the process of writing, or he perfunctorily fulfills his notion of what is demanded; and his choices are likely to vary from occasion to occasion and from task to task (p. 9).
The writing process, for Britton and his colleagues, involves:

1) conception--the events leading to the decisions to write
2) incubation--the definition and redefinition of the writing task
3) production--the actual writing which includes beginning, concentrating, pausing, and scanning.

Teachers influence writing during the first two stages. They can steer pupils in a desired direction by employing a variety of instructional methods to explore, clarify and interpret experience.

Britton's theory suggests that students also develop a "sense of audience." Adjustments and choices in writing are made. Depending upon whether the audience is oneself, the teacher, a wider known audience, or an unknown audience and upon the purpose of the writing, the student writes in one of three modes:

1) transactional--to inform, to persuade, to instruct
2) expressive--to explore feelings and moods
3) poetic--to order and to pattern language as an art medium.

In the school environment, Britton found that most writing done by students is transactional and that the target audience is the teacher.

Writing has also been viewed as a process of discovery. Coles (1974) sees writing as a process of self-discovery. Class discussion about a subject students know provides the initial motivation for writing. But Coles wants students to be aware of language as more than words; it is also a concept. Writers must hear, see, and think as well as express. The teacher provides students with stimuli that compel them
to develop a language which enables them "to rename, reinterpret, recreate experience" (p. 92).

Murray (1980) also views writing as a process of discovery—discovery of meaning. The writer proceeds from the rehearsing stage when the writer mulls over the raw material that might be used in writing. Drafting the material allows students to read their translated thoughts and to discover what they mean to say. Revising permits students to say what they mean clearly. Murray identifies four processes that interact as the student composes:

1) collecting—experiences for writing are gathered
2) connecting—experiences are organized
3) writing—experiences are articulated
4) reading—articulation of experiences is critiqued, reorganized, expanded.

If a writer can discover meaning through the writing process, learning has probably taken place. Emig (1977) sees writing as a mode of learning. Writing is a learned behavior and an artificial process. But it is also a technological device resulting in a visible graphic product. Citing language theories of Vygotsky and Bruner, Emig contends that higher cognitive functions (analysis and synthesis) develop most fully only with the support system of verbal language which requires the establishment of systematic connections and relationships. The hand, eye, and brain work together to produce not only a linear written product but also a product that expresses the writer's intuition and emotion.
A major consideration in the teaching of writing is the learner's cognitive development. According to Piaget (Heidt, 1980), once a child reaches the stage of rational-formal operations, the child can reason through hypothetical situations. Therefore, adolescents should be able to read about writing or simply think about what they want to write and perform the act. In reality, many students are frustrated when they write. They are trained neither to observe the details of their experiences nor to structure their thoughts into effective language patterns. Yet students are bombarded with literary examples by professional writers whom they are expected to emulate.

Bruner (Emig, 1977; Heidt, 1980), on the other hand, contends that even the adult life is characterized by the interplay of observation of and participation in activity, the depiction of image, and finally symbolization of experience. A person never completely loses dependence on objects and concrete situations. The composition teacher, then, should consider methods of instruction that provide students with concrete representation of experiences, processes, and structures. If the internal processes involved in writing can be presented to the student by an external simulation, the student may more easily transform thought to writing.

Research--the use of media in teaching composition

Moreover, teaching is, like writing itself, an art that depends less on formulas than on a blend of knowledge, skill, and creativity. Indeed if anything, the new paradigm requires that teachers be flexible enough to respond to students as individuals and be ready to pursue any appropriate methodology (Donovan, 1980, p. xi).
Educators have tried to bridge the gap between language theory and teaching practices in the composition classroom (Gebhardt, 1977; O'Dell, 1981). Research in the area of instructional media has not led as successfully from theory to practice (Ruebling, 1983). Since students' writing abilities still are criticized by professionals and by laymen, it may be necessary to consider media-supplemented instruction as an "appropriate methodology" for teaching writing. Appropriate media can be coordinated with learning tasks to teach writing skills as is illustrated by a number of media articles in the literature.

Malcolm S. MacLean, in the foreword of Appel's *Write What You Mean*, defines composition as communicating "to other people--by writing or by prepared speech, or by both--what you think and what you feel." To facilitate that communication process Appel suggests:

> Life, the greatest stimulus to writing, flashes by us in a continuous series of pictures. Most of these are unrelated and last only a fraction of a second on the retina of our eyes. Hence real photographs and paintings, fixed and permanent so that we can study them, are found to be first-rate things to write about (Appel, 1938).

Almost fifty years later, media--fixed, motion, aural, and visual--continue to enhance writing instruction. Teachers look beyond the textbook for materials to encourage student writing. Proponents of popular culture view it as a natural starting place for composition instruction. They believe teachers should begin instruction where their students are. Consequently, novels, magazines, television shows, movies, records, and
radio shows are the resources to draw upon for classroom materials (Walker, 1968; Hise, 1972).

Composition students can look at pictures (still or motion) and through deduction apply characteristics observed in visuals to their writing. Students might first identify action in a picture. As a class, the students can produce sentences to describe the action. General observations lead to specific details which are noted on the board or overhead. The class decides from what perspective the action is viewed, what senses are aroused, what major and minor details illustrate the action, and what order those details take. Students then write cumulative sentences to convey this information (Comprone, 1973).

Donlan (1974) identifies the benefits of music for creating a stimulating environment, increasing language fluency, stream-of-consciousness, and free-association. Mood music can be compared to or contrasted with the emotional tone of writing (p. 86). Words are studied as conveyers of sound as well as sense. The sounds of instruments can represent the fricatives, vowels, or nasals. Donlan suggests further research into correlations between the quality of music and the quantity of writing a student produces while listening to types of music. The effect of familiar and unfamiliar music on the writer is another area to study, as is the relationship between the sound of music and the writer's choice of words while listening.

Television is a medium that Lucking (1974) believes remains a useful tool in teaching the writing process. Since television consists of words and visual images, the study of television's relationship to language
seems natural (p. 74). Students can examine program content and categorize types. Television stimulates the senses; therefore it involves the viewer. Through their own videotape productions, students gain a sense of audience and become more aware of the need to make writing credible when directed with a genuine purpose toward a particular audience (p. 75).

Hillocks (1979) noted the lack of specificity in student writing, the omission of detail, resulting possibly from students' belief that prose conveys their perceptions. Following a series of pilot studies, Hillocks generated several hypotheses regarding students' writing. First, he believed that students who engage in observational activities (recording visual, tactile, auditory, olfactory, and internal sensory perceptions) would show greater gains in the specificity of their writing than students involved in a more traditional mode of instruction. Secondly, the gains would be achieved in a relatively short sequence of instruction. Additionally, Hillocks hypothesized that students whose writing showed gains in specificity would also be judged to be more creative writers. Hillocks also predicted that the gains in measures of organization would be greater for students involved in observational activities than for those studying the traditional paragraph structure of topic sentence supported by details and examples.

Hillocks' experimental group spent over half their class time in actual observation with no study of paragraph structure. The control groups spent time in direct study of paragraph structure through text and slide presentation with no special observing activities. The gains for
the experimental group were greater than those of the control group. Hillocks referred to gestalt psychology to explain the results. During the observational activities, students examined parts of larger segregated shapes, finding new ones; then they reorganized parts to find new relationships. He concluded that

... the almost singular, traditional emphasis on the study of verbal models as a means of learning to write appears to be inappropriate. The close examination of experience from a variety of perspectives may yield far more important results in improving student writing (p. 35).

A medium is generally recognized as any one of many stimuli through which information is communicated--technical equipment, film, recordings, lectures, field trips, and teachers. The media of particular interest in this study was the software used during instruction--printed text, film, and audio tape. The media provided a means for visualizing and hearing a complex structure. Heidt (1980) recognizes that the "use of media in itself has not resulted in a more individualized instruction, nor in any other effective change." Consequently, he questioned what media could contribute to instruction. Because research studies so far have shown that no media attribute (motion vs. slow, color vs. black and white) bears an inherent general advantage to learning, Heidt speculated that the relative value of media depended on the learning task.

Media attributes enhance learning only when they are not just an additional embellishment of the presentation, but when they serve an instructional function with regard to the specific learning task (p. 377).
Considering media attributes, learner personality traits, and the learning task should help to determine the design of learning environments. The effects of learning result from interaction between particular features of instructional methods and learner characteristics. To disperse some educators' fears that learners would become unable to cope with a variety of learning situations and problem solving situations if instructed in only one preferred mode, four model treatments were suggested by Salomon (Heidt, 1980).

1) remedial model—treatment which develops the learner's deficient capabilities
2) preferential model—treatment adjusted to learner capabilities
3) compensatory model—treatment includes learner deficiencies
4) transferential model—treatment requires student to interpret situations into categories suiting his/her abilities.

Because media are representations of experience, their message, as in writing, is coded within a symbol system. Different learners have different ways of processing information or of transforming the message of one medium into the symbol system of another medium. It is worth considering media instruction in the composition classroom, not merely as a means of conveying knowledge but also as a means of reconstructing knowledge.

Clark (1983) also contends there are no learning benefits from employing any specific medium to deliver instruction. The uncontrolled effects of instructional method and the novelty of the media might be what account for gains in student achievement. It is not the medium that
affects change but the curriculum reform that comes from supplementing instruction with media. Citing research that spans fifty years, Clark concludes that there are no learning benefits from employing different media. He recommends that attributes of media and their influence on the way information is processed in learning be studied. The attributes would develop cognitive skills when students modeled media attributes.

Summary

Students learn to communicate in a world where once clearly defined categories of discourse are being replaced by mass media's explosion of information and by the crossing of rhetorical modes. In print media the subject is apprehended after the discrete parts. In visual media the whole is apprehended before the discrete parts. In our multimedia, electronic age, more people who can write are needed to order and to communicate information and experience (Murray, 1973). Teachers can no longer separate print media from other forms of expression.

Learning is not strictly a matter of reading and writing. But reading and writing are not strictly a matter of reading and writing either. In the media-oriented school, teachers and students find themselves moving through a variety of modes, at times banging directly away at print skills, at times connecting print with the other forms of communication, at times using reading and writing to improve expression in the non-print media to improve reading and writing (Morrow & Suid, 1974).
METHODOLOGY

Introduction

Designing and conducting an experiment can do much to sharpen the expertise of a teacher of writing regardless of measured results (Pierson, 1972, p. 80).

Criticism of students' writing skills and surveys of teaching practices in English prompted inquiry into instructional methods used to teach composition. Joseph Comprone's article "The Uses of Media In Teaching Composition" (Tate, 1976) provided a bibliography of articles and books dealing with media theory, media language, persuasive media, kinds of media, and classroom applications of media. Though more complicated studies involving analysis of film structure or oral composing and their effect on writing skills might be conducted, groundwork exploring aural and visual instruction and student reaction to them was required. This study sought to determine if student performance in writing could be improved through audio-visual instruction as compared with instruction using a traditional textbook approach. Student performance was evaluated by a pre-instruction writing sample, a post-instruction sample, and a student evaluation of instruction.

Procedure

Subjects Eleventh grade language arts students in a rural, midwestern community school participated in this study. The Iowa State University Committee on the Use of Human Subjects in Research reviewed this project and concluded that the rights and welfare of the human
subjects were adequately protected, that risks were outweighed by the potential benefits and expected value of the knowledge sought, that confidentiality of data was assured and that informed consent was obtained by appropriate procedures. (See Appendix A.) The students' teacher was a willing and cooperative participant in the study. She permitted three of her junior English classes to be used in the study. Students in the three sections were not grouped according to ability. Table 1 illustrates class distribution according to the three treatments administered. The writing samples of students who did not complete both the pre- and post-instruction assignments were eliminated. Forty-nine sets of usable data were included in the analyses. Each section of Language Arts 11 met in the same classroom, and students were seated at four round tables. The class period lasted forty minutes. The treatments were administered during the weeks of January 16 through January 30, 1984. Results of the study were somewhat affected by several uncontrollable circumstances (e.g., the death of a classmate, staff interruptions, inclement weather).

Table 1. Class distribution according to treatment

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Group</th>
<th>Treatment</th>
<th>Male</th>
<th>Female</th>
<th>Data</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Control n = 21</td>
<td>Traditional textbook with writing models</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exp1 n = 21</td>
<td>Writing models and film</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exp2 n = 15</td>
<td>Audio-cassette recordings</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Teacher    One teacher taught all three sections. She was a substitute English teacher for the regular teacher who was on maternity leave. Some students knew the substitute from other classes, but they had not been taught by her in English. The substitute teacher requested that the lesson plans for each unit be scripted, so she might administer the treatments as the researcher desired. Before teaching, she read and studied the plans and class material to ask for clarification of material she did not understand. Periodically, the teacher and researcher met to discuss the progress and alterations of the unit. On her copies of the lesson plans, she noted changes, recommendations, and student reactions to the lessons.

Content    A series of lessons dealing with the development of comparison or contrast in paragraphs and essays was presented to three sections of language arts students. Students were required to respond in class discussion and in writing. The units devised were presented during two school weeks, over a ten-day period. (See Appendices B and C.) Days 1 and 10 for the three classes included an introduction to the project and the writing of the final essay. (Note: Day 1, Group III, students listened to recorded excerpts instead of reading from the handouts.)

Before January 1984, research procedures began. The research design--pre-test-treatment-posttest--was selected. Audio-visual media readily available to the school and classroom were selected. A mode of writing often required in the school environment and challenging, yet not surpassing, students' general cognitive ability at the junior level was selected. Consequently, the content became comparison-contrast writing
presented via textbook instruction, print writing models, film, and au­dio-cassette recordings. Comparison-contrast was chosen because it has traditionally served as a method of developing exposition, and typifies the transactional writing (Britton et al., 1975) often required of older students. The development of comparisons or contrast required students to engage in abstract analogic classification of subjects (Moffett, 1968), yet provided an inherent structure for students to follow.

Textbooks from the school were consulted as were composition texts belonging to the researcher. Information concerning comparison-contrast writing included the definition, purpose, and development of comparison-contrast. Examples of comparison-contrast were taken from the writing texts. The basic lesson was sequenced. Control group 1 received instruction by reading and discussing photo-copied textbook explanations and illustrations of comparison-contrast. Experimental group 1 was instructed by teacher lecture and class discussion of printed writing models and of films. Experimental group 2 was instructed by teacher lecture and class discussion of recorded writing models and of films; print media was eliminated.

The films were provided by the local area education agency. Films were chosen initially by their titles and descriptors in the film cata­log. Portions of films were previewed to assure that each film illus­trated comparison-contrast.

In December 1983, the regular teacher collected a pre-instruction writing sample. Students knew of the impending study and at this time were told only the function of comparison-contrast as a method of
developing a composition. Students were given topics to compare or contrast or they could choose their own. They had approximately thirty minutes in class to develop a short essay. These writing samples initially served as a basis for developing the comparison-contrast unit.

Following the nine-day unit, students again wrote an in-class essay to demonstrate their ability to use comparison or contrast in writing. On day 6 of the unit, students were given a handout explaining the assignment requirements and listing possible topics to develop in their essays. On day 10 of the unit, students had at least thirty minutes to write. They wrote only one draft with no formal revision.

The writing products from the three classes were analyzed holistically in an effort to answer two questions: In what ways, if any, did the writers' performance improve? If performance did improve, did it result because of instructional method and materials used? The scores were tested statistically using a T-test and an ANOVA.

Guidelines were applied to create a holistic rating scale adapted from a model suggested by White (1982). This scale is included in Appendix E. Students' writing products were numbered and analyzed. Four experienced English teachers used the scale to evaluate 49 pre- and 49 post-instruction writing products by the control and experimental groups. Readers were not trained to use the rating scale and were free to ask questions to clarify criteria for evaluation. Each rater spent no more than five minutes holistically scoring each paper. If scores were adjacent, they were averaged, and if scores were nonadjacent, papers were reread by the raters to resolve any discrepancy. Only four instances of
nonadjacent scoring occurred. A third rater was asked to evaluate that paper which produced an adjacent score that was averaged with the previous ratings.

After the data were collected a T-test was run to determine if there was a significant difference between the pre-instruction and the post-instruction writing scores. A one-way analysis of variance in post-scores within groups and between groups was also conducted. The results of these tests are discussed in chapter four.

Two weeks after the unit was presented, students were asked to evaluate the unit. This written evaluation included questions that probed students' perception of their ability to write comparison-contrast. They were also asked to evaluate the effectiveness of the media used to present the lessons. The teacher's role was also evaluated. (See Appendix D.)

Summary

This study attempted to combine knowledge of how students write and knowledge of instructional methods used to teach composition. Three approaches were developed to teach the same unit on comparison-contrast writing to eleventh grade language arts students. One approach included the traditional textbook with writing models, and two included instruction supplemented with audio-visual materials. In experimental groups I and II, the textbook was eliminated, and in experimental group II, print media was entirely eliminated. Pre-instruction and post-instruction writing samples and a student evaluation questionnaire provided the basis
for the analysis of results presented in chapter four. The students' writing performance, student reactions to the units, and the lesson plans are discussed.
ANALYSIS OF RESULTS

Introduction

Analysis of the results of this study both reinforced and refuted some of the beliefs the researcher held about the teaching of composition. The review of the literature supported the contention that there had to be some way to teach writing other than by studying grammar, imitating professional models, and producing a finished product. These methods can be effectively incorporated with other materials to help students write better. The experimental units used in this study appealed to students, but the methods did not necessarily produce any better writing.

The hypothesis which directed this study was: Students receiving instruction through audio-visual media would perform better than students receiving traditional instruction as evaluated by pre-instruction writing samples, post-instruction writing samples, and student evaluations. Data for testing the hypothesis came from two sources: the pre- and the post-instruction writing samples. Pre- and post-test scores from a holistic evaluation of 98 sample writing products were included, and the 98 papers produced by the 49 students in the experimental and control groupings were examined. The purpose of the holistic evaluation of the writing products was to provide an opportunity for the researcher to draw tentative conclusions which would direct future study. Each of the 49 pairs were scored to permit a statistical analysis of the results. However, a
primary focus of this study was the unit plans and their effect on student writing and teacher performance. A total of 49 students were distributed within the two experimental groups and the control group. Students enrolled in the classes were included in the study only if both pre- and post-instruction writing samples were available.

Scoring of the pre-instruction writing products did establish some notion of the performance levels of students in terms of their ability to develop an expository essay by means of comparison or contrast. Scoring of the post-instruction writing products did permit a tentative comparison among the control and the experimental groups to determine differences between pre- and post-instruction writing performance and to determine differences among the experimental and control groups. Table 2 illustrates the scoring of these pre- and post-instruction writing products. (See Appendix E for holistic scoring scale and Appendix F for student writing samples.)

Table 2. Holistic evaluation of pre- and post-instruction writing samples

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Group</th>
<th>Product</th>
<th>Pre-instruction</th>
<th>Post-instruction</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Rater 1 R2 R3</td>
<td>Rater 1 R2 R3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C1 1</td>
<td>2 5 1 2.7</td>
<td>5 5 5.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>n = 19</td>
<td>2 2 2 2.0</td>
<td>3 3 3.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>text 3</td>
<td>4 4 4 4.0</td>
<td>4 4 4.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 4 4 4.0</td>
<td>4 4 4.0 4 4 4.0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 4 4 4.0</td>
<td>5 3 4 4.0 4.0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 4 4 4.0</td>
<td>3 4 3.5 4.0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 4 3 3.5</td>
<td>6 5 5.5 4.0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8 2 3 2.5</td>
<td>3 2 2.5 4.0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9 3 2 2.5</td>
<td>4 3 3.5 4.0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 2. Continued</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<p>| | | | | | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>E₁</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>n = 18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>print/film</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>E₂</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>n = 12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A-V</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<p>| | | | | | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
Comparison of these pre- and post-instruction samples tentatively supported the hypothesis that students' writing performance would improve due to instruction. However, if the instructional method with varied media supplements were important to students' success in developing comparison-contrast in expository writing, one would have expected that the mean scores obtained from the writing products would vary significantly among the control and experimental groups. This was not the case. Table 3 illustrates that there was no significant difference between pre- and post-writing samples.

Table 3. T-test comparison of pre- and post-instruction writing sample mean scores

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Instruction</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD*</th>
<th>T</th>
<th>2-tailed probability</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pre</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>3.0347</td>
<td>0.784</td>
<td>-4.83</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Post</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>3.5898</td>
<td>0.838</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*No significant difference between pre- and post-writing samples.

A descriptive analysis of the 49 student papers provided insight into the effect of instructional media on the composition skills of eleventh grade students. Three pre-instruction and three post-instruction student papers (two from each of the three groups) are included in Appendix F. These six represent the work of three students on both assignments. Generally, the pre-instruction writing samples from
the three sections reflected the students' need for instruction in how to choose and develop topics for comparison-contrast. The essays seldom had an introduction, many began only with a point of comparison. Students often listed the comparisons without developing details to support the significance of similarities or differences between subjects. Points of comparison followed no particular sequence and were presented as if the student wrote whatever came into mind. Some students digressed into another mode of writing, usually narration. Few students were able to write a conclusion drawn from the examples in the essay. There were, however, some students who presented a statement of purpose in the introduction of their essay and developed examples to support that purpose. Transitions between paragraphs were less frequent in the pre-instruction writing samples.

Table 4 illustrates that the students' post-instruction writing products showed a general improvement in student ability to construct an essay of comparison-contrast. Following instruction, more students attempted to develop a topic sentence or statement of purpose. Students' essays contained more points of comparison or contrast between their subjects; however, their choice of details to compare or contrast did not always support their statement of purpose. Most writers attempted to draw a conclusion at the end of their essays. The method of developing comparison-contrast more frequently used was point by point comparison as opposed to the presentation of one subject and then the other.

Students chose a variety of subjects to compare for both the pre- and post-instruction assignments. The personalities of two individuals
Table 4. Mean score of pre- and post-instruction writing products

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Value</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
<th>Value</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>14.3</td>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>16.3</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>14.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.7</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>10.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>22.4</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>22.4</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>24.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.0</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>14.3</td>
<td>4.0</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>20.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>12.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>5.0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>5.5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

were most frequently compared, followed by the characteristics of two
recreational activities. The post-instruction essays dealt with topics
that seemed more familiar to the students' or with less familiar topics
that they researched. Only a few students borrowed their topic ideas
from the writing models or films presented in class.

Table 5 illustrates that this study showed general improvement in
students' writing performance following instruction, but not significant-
ly greater gains for the experimental groups, one would conclude that for
this particular study, variation in instructional materials had little
influence on student performance. However, the method of instruction did
seem to influence students' attitudes toward the composition unit, as
Table 6 illustrates.
Table 5. Analysis of variance by group

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sources of variations</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Mean squares</th>
<th>F-value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Between groups</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>.5915</td>
<td>.8362</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Within groups</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>.7074</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*a No two groups are significantly different at the .05 level.

Table 6. Student evaluation of instructional method

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>+ Comments</th>
<th>Group</th>
<th>Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Control (textbook)</td>
<td>· examples too complex</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>· poor topics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>· too many handouts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>· already familiar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>· with comparison</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>· class discussion</td>
<td>Experimental1 (print and film)</td>
<td>· handouts too long</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>· experience writing</td>
<td></td>
<td>· film topics boring</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>· learned to summarize</td>
<td></td>
<td>· too much printed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>· topic in intro and</td>
<td></td>
<td>· material</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>· conclusion</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>· films</td>
<td>Experimental2 (audio-visual)</td>
<td>· tape recordings</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>· learned to introduce</td>
<td></td>
<td>· topics uninteresting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>· and conclude essay</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Students receiving traditional textbook instruction had the most negative responses to the unit. They criticized the examples of comparison-contrast for being too complex and for dealing with uninteresting topics. Students thought that there were too many handouts, and they
claimed to have already known how to develop a topic using comparison or contrast.

Experimental group 1 had a more favorable opinion of the instructional method. At the end of the unit, students felt that they better understood comparison-contrast. They cited class discussion and experience writing comparison-contrast as having helped them. The film topics did not seem to influence students' opinion of the unit, and the writing models were described as lengthy and difficult. Yet these provided the catalyst for class discussion. Students in experimental group 1 also cited writing skills that they thought were improved by instruction. These included summarizing a topic in a single sentence or introductory paragraph and drawing a conclusion. Students thought it was easier to identify points of comparison in the printed materials than in the films. Table 7 shows that papers from experimental group 1 received a higher post-score average than papers from the control group or experimental group 2.

Table 7. Means and standard deviations of post-scores for writing samples

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Group</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Standard Deviation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>C1</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>3.5263</td>
<td>.9200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E1</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>3.7833</td>
<td>.6767</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E2</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>3.4000</td>
<td>.9303</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Though some students thought there was too much information presented at one time and too much time spent on the unit, this group, in general, remarked that their writing improved as a result of instruction. One student commented that the value of the unit would increase if students had more opportunities to write following instruction.

Students in experimental group 2 had the most favorable opinion of the instructional method. They favored the films, indicating that their minds wandered when they listened to the tape recordings. Students were not impressed by the topics in the models presented, but they mentioned that they had a better understanding of the types of items that could be compared or contrasted. Though students found drawing conclusions from their comparisons most challenging, they did feel more comfortable introducing and concluding their essays following instruction. In general, students were more aware of the components of comparison-contrast writing.

Researchers have concluded that the greatest positive influence on students' writing is not the mode of instruction but an interested and enthusiastic teacher who encourages students to express their ideas and who responds to the content of writing more than to its mechanics (Hollifield, 1981). Moffett (1968) observed that without help, students may not think of all the trials possible to learn to write. The teacher should provide meaningful assignments in a meaningful sequence with feedback (p. 199). Irmscher (1979) echoes the belief that the personality and attitude of the teacher will be a stronger influence than any
materials (p. 49). Still, a good teacher needs a good plan of instruction.

Student evaluation of this study's unit revealed strengths and weaknesses of the lessons presented. (See Appendix D.) Students tended to comment favorably about the teacher's role in presenting the lessons. The teacher also evaluated the lesson plans while she taught the unit.

The teacher agreed with students in the control group that there were too many handouts of explanations and examples. She criticized some topics as being above eleventh grade interest level. The actual lesson plans for group I (traditional textbook) were the easiest to complete within a class period and to follow in their planned sequence.

The lesson plans for experimental group 1 sometimes contained too many activities for one class period. Within the ten-day period, however, the teacher was able to complete the activities and assignments. Class discussion time was relinquished occasionally. The teacher had to allow time to respond to students' inquiry that the researcher may not have anticipated when devising the unit. The number of handouts and writing assignments varied among classes (i.e., the control group did more writing during the time the experimental groups were discussing films). The teacher added a few activities to the existing assignments for the experimental groups to balance the point accumulations in the gradebook. In general, the teacher thought that there was too much time spent viewing films and reading. She preferred two or three more writing assignments to replace the longer essays. She noted that when discussing
films, students' interest level was most high for topics with which they were familiar.

The dominant criticism for experimental group 2 concerned the tape recordings' audibility. The teacher noted that the students listened attentively but could not always grasp the purpose of the excerpts. After the first day's lesson, the teacher used a cassette player of better quality. The tape recordings were clearer, but students still had difficulty discerning topics. Class time was managed better without the exchange of printed materials.

Summary

Though criticized for covering too much material in too little time, the units on comparison-contrast improved student writing performance as measured by pre- and post-instruction writing products. The method of instruction did not significantly affect student writing as determined by an analysis of products among post-instruction groups. Students performed better in experimental group 1. Students in experimental group 2 preferred the non-text method of instruction. The teacher favored a balance of audio-visual presentations with periodic writing assignments.

The implications of this analysis of students' writing and of the students' and teacher's evaluation of the unit are discussed in the final chapter as well as further recommendations for the teaching of composition.
SUMMARY, CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

There are two things necessary . . . a way of discovering those things which are to be understood, and a way of teaching what we have learned.  

St. Augustine

Summary

Writing is a way of discovering. Students, as writers, discover what they know and what they do not know about a subject. By observing children in the act of writing and by analyzing the products of their writing, researchers have gained understanding into the composing process. Knowing how one learns to write, teachers should be able to teach students the process of writing through a variety of methods. Further inquiry into the relationship between the thought processes and the composition processes will lead to further inquiry into effective methodology for teaching composition.

Many teachers have discovered that one of their most valuable resources for composition instruction is the popular culture around them. Reaching beyond the textbook, the classroom teacher can build an environment for writing that is familiar to and comfortable for the student. Because students are surrounded by nonprint media, multimedia's role in the classroom needs to be defined. If the skills that a writing task requires are known, the influence of media on the development of those skills is an area in which to conduct research.

For this study, the task was to sharpen expository writing skills by studying comparison-contrast development. The task was presented to three junior English classes through one of three media: print, film,
and audio-cassette. The media provided specific examples of comparison-contrast and stimulated class discussion. These discussions served as part of the pre-writing stage. Information was relayed and ideas were generated, yet the desired skill was also investigated. Through direct questioning, the teacher sought to help students not only to see or to hear the relationship between the subjects compared but also to understand the structure of comparison-contrast.

Following the pre-writing activities—reading, writing, viewing, listening, discussing, and thinking—students were asked to compose. The product of their writing was evaluated to determine what improvements, if any, had been made in the student's ability to write an essay using comparison-contrast. Although students' performance on the writing task seemed to improve between pre- and post-instruction, their performance did not seem to vary according to the medium through which the lesson was presented. Nevertheless, the students' and the teacher's reaction to the methods indicated that both were willing to explore media other than print to discover what is known about writing.

Conclusions

Because the writing process starts before symbols appear on the page, teachers of writing need to explore ways to stimulate students' thought processes. However, students need direction as well. Once thinking is aroused, ideas need to be channeled. Older students' cognitive abilities generally allow them to perform higher order functions: generalization, rationalization, analysis, classification, symbolization.
Teachers need to explore methods of teaching that motivate students, stimulate thought, and develop skill. In writing, students draw upon their awareness of language and how it works. With practice, this awareness increases, and students recognize conventions of language such as spelling, syntax, and paragraphing. Exposure to language models allows students to imitate structures as well as to explore topics. In this study, the researcher attempted to design a unit to teach students how to structure comparisons and contrasts in expository writing. The following conclusions were drawn from this study:

1. Writing performance can be improved by designing a unit that involves students in sequenced activities that are related to the learning task. Students receiving audio-visual instruction generally perform at the same level as students receiving traditional textbook instruction. Students prefer to discuss ideas from audio-visual media and then to write rather than to read examples by professional writers that they are expected to imitate.

2. The unit plans provide a sequenced progression of activities and models from which to learn to develop an essay using comparison-contrast, but the number of examples used in class could be decreased and be replaced by more opportunities to write. Students might feel less overwhelmed if they study examples of other students' writing. The original lesson plans cover too much material for one class period. The unit does emphasize the process of learning to write comparison-contrast. The students' final writing product is not subjected to severe correction.
3. Students write more following instruction. More details are used to
develop comparisons in the post-instruction samples. Before in-
struction, students are not familiar with the structure of
comparison-contrast. They do not introduce topics well or draw con-
cclusions, but a better attempt is made to do so following
instruction.

4. The control group is instructed by traditional methodology--writing
models and textbook explanations. There are more opportunities to
write in the control group. Experimental group 1 has too many
lengthy writing samples, making it difficult to see comparisons or
contrasts. The print medium is completely eliminated in experimen-
tal group 2. This did not seem to adversely affect the students' ability to write. Better quality media are needed.

5. Students receiving traditional textbook instruction dislike the
unit. Most of the students enjoy class discussion that stimulates
an exchange of ideas and helps to clarify the purpose in written,
recorded, and film examples. Students in experimental group 2 (non-
print) have the most positive attitude toward the unit. Student
reaction to the teacher indicates that she did not influence stu-
dents' preference of method.

**Recommendations**

Before children attend school, they attempt to write. They draw on
almost anything and seem to enjoy holding a crayon, a piece of chalk, or
a pencil in their hands. Writing may be a more natural act than some
researchers believe. Writing, unlike reading and speaking, is one skill that parents seldom encourage at home. The teacher is responsible for nurturing the student's urge to write. Much is written about the process of writing and about the stages—affective, cognitive, and psychomotor—through which the writer progresses. A survey of professional literature reveals innumerable suggestions for stimulating writing. Supplementing instruction with media is one of the most common recommendations. Through this approach, students' senses are aroused, ideas are formulated, and relationships are drawn. Still, English teachers rely more on textbooks than on instructional media to teach writing. As a result, students' writing skills are still assessed as being poor, and students still respond in writing surveys that they dislike writing.

Because ours is an age of technology, we need to study what technology has added to the learning process. Teachers should employ a multimedia system to provide a variety of ways to explain concepts, to clarify terms, and to meet individual learning needs. A variety of learners and a variety of teachers should be complemented by a variety of teaching materials. Studies including a range of media must be conducted to test the methods of transmitting messages. Media appeal to the learner's need for viewing and hearing as well as verbalizing. Several recommendations for future research on the effects of instructional media on composition skills resulted from this study:

1. Researchers should continue to study the effect of instructional methods on the writing skills of students. The role of media in the classroom can go beyond the stimulation of ideas, once researchers
understand the correlations between media structures and writing structures.

2. A balance between the types of media used in the classroom should be attained. The frequency of mediated instruction should be monitored to avoid saturating students with one medium. The fact that students learn from a variety of sensory experiences supports the use of audio-visual material in the classroom.

3. More than one pre- and post-instruction writing sample lends greater reliability to the evaluation of a student's writing ability. To establish what effect, if any, mediated instruction has on students' composition skills, a range of writing modes would have to be taught and evaluated. Allowing students to revise compositions should be considered.

4. Control and experimental groups should be observed performing more than one skill. Though units would span fewer days, students should be involved in the study for a longer time period than two weeks. Instead of recording written examples of the writing task, actual spoken examples of narration, comparison-contrast, analysis, cause-effect, etc. should be recorded and discussed.

5. Student evaluation of the unit should require both the students' perception of how they have mastered the task and the evidence in writing that the student can perform the task. Students should be questioned more closely, possibly interviewed, to discover what appeals and what does not appeal to them about the method of
instruction. A classroom observer might be asked to record students' reactions as the lesson is presented to evaluate peer and teacher-student interaction.

Currently, there is a discrepancy between the training of teachers and the demands of the writing classroom. English teachers are not always trained to teach composition, but instead their preparation includes the teaching of literature and grammar. Consequently, many students are taught to write by copying professional models and by completing language drills and exercises. Teachers need to learn to develop, critique, and implement audio-visual materials for classroom instruction. These are the stimulants and structures with which students are familiar, but teachers have little experience using them. This is one reason why teachers of English hesitate to use media. To encourage teachers to learn how to use media in the teaching of composition, further research is needed to support these assumptions:

1) students learn better through media than through traditional methods.
2) knowledge of material gained through media instruction lasts longer.
3) students enjoy learning through media.
4) certain skills are more effectively taught through mediated instruction than through nonmediated instruction.
5) time is saved by teaching through a multimedia approach.

There is no substitute for learning to write well other than to continue to improve one's writing through guided practice. Though textbooks may give teachers some direction for what to teach about composition,
they do little to motivate students' writing interest. The teacher of writing must become involved in planning, designing, and adapting instructional methods, not only to stimulate the writing process but also to develop the cognitive skills their students need to function in school and in life.

For the student, media, like writing, can be "a way of discovering those things which are to be understood." For the teacher, media, like writing, can be "a way of teaching what we have learned."
REFERENCES


Lucking, Robert A. Teaching the message and the massage. English Journal, October 1974, 63(7), 74-88.


APPENDIX A. HUMAN SUBJECTS APPROVAL FORM
Title of project (please type): The Effect of Instructional Media on the Composition Skills of Eleventh Graders

I agree to provide the proper surveillance of this project to insure that the rights and welfare of the human subjects are properly protected. Additions to or changes in procedures affecting the subjects after the project has been approved will be submitted to the committee for review.

Lynn Margaret McGreevey 12-5-83
Typed Name of Principal Investigator
N164 Quad 4-8907
Campus Address Campus Telephone

Signature of Principal Investigator

Signatures of others (if any) Date Relationship to Principal Investigator

ATTACH an additional page(s) (A) describing your proposed research and (B) the subjects to be used, (C) indicating any risks or discomforts to the subjects, and (D) covering any topics checked below. CHECK all boxes applicable.

☐ Medical clearance necessary before subjects can participate
☐ Samples (blood, tissue, etc.) from subjects
☐ Administration of substances (foods, drugs, etc.) to subjects
☐ Physical exercise or conditioning for subjects
☐ Deception of subjects
☐ Subjects under 14 years of age and/or ☒ Subjects 14-17 years of age
☐ Subjects in institutions
☐ Research must be approved by another institution or agency

ATTACH an example of the material to be used to obtain informed consent and CHECK which type will be used.

☐ Signed informed consent will be obtained.
☒ Modified informed consent will be obtained.

Anticipated date on which subjects will be first contacted: 1 16 84
Anticipated date for last contact with subjects: 1 27 84

If Applicable: Anticipated date on which audio or visual tapes will be erased and/or identifiers will be removed from completed survey instruments:

Month Day Year

Signature of Head or Chairperson Date Department or Administrative Unit

Decision of the University Committee on the Use of Human Subjects in Research:
☒ Project Approved ☐ Project not approved ☐ No action required

George G. Karas 11-13-84
Name of Committee Chairperson Date Signature of Committee Chairperson
APPENDIX B. LESSON PLAN OUTLINES
I. TOPIC: Modes of discourse

II. AIM: to understand the function of different modes of expression

III. OBJECTIVES: The student will identify the characteristics of descriptive, narrative, and expository writing. The student will identify the function of descriptive, narrative and expository writing. The student will contrast expository and imaginative writing.

IV. PROCEDURE: The teacher introduces herself and the project. Students respond with questions. The teacher introduces description, narration, and exposition. Students review the forms of writing. The class discusses creative and expository writing.

V. EVALUATION: Student response in class discussion.

VI. OUTCOME: Students will have a framework from which to understand types of writing and their functions.

VII. RESOURCES: Teacher Writing: Unit Lessons In Composition 3B pp. 143-150 Building English Skills Composition (yellow level) p. 212
I. TOPIC: Ways of developing the paragraph

II. AIM: to understand developmental structure of paragraphs

III. OBJECTIVES: The student will study examples of expository paragraph development.
The student will discuss the purposes of expository writing.
The student will practice writing a paragraph showing similarities between two subjects.

IV. PROCEDURE: The teacher reviews expository writing.
The class discusses the function of sample paragraphs.
Students respond to questions about paragraph details.
Students complete assignment 1.

V. EVALUATION: Student response to questions.
Completion of assignment 1.

VI. OUTCOME: Students will recognize types of expository writing.
Students will practice writing a paragraph comparing two people they know.

VII. RESOURCES: Building English Skills Composition (yellow level)
p. 137
Building English Skills Composition (orange level)
pp. 97-98
I. TOPIC: The paragraph of comparison or contrast

II. AIM: to understand the purpose of comparison-contrast writing

III. OBJECTIVES: The student will define the purpose of comparison.
The student will define the purpose of contrast.
The student will cite situations in which comparisons or contrasts are made.
The student will develop two subjects in a paragraph illustrating similarities, differences, or both.

IV. PROCEDURE: The class discusses comparisons, showing similarities between subjects.
The class discusses contrasts, showing differences between subjects.
Students complete assignment 2.

V. EVALUATION: Student response in class discussion.
Completion of assignment 2.

VI. OUTCOME: Students will choose appropriate topics to compare or to contrast.
Students will write a paragraph using comparison, contrast, or both.

VII. RESOURCES: Building English Skills Composition (yellow level) pp. 145-147.
I. TOPIC: Developing a paragraph by comparison or contrast

II. AIM: to develop paragraphs showing similarities or differences between two subjects

III. OBJECTIVES: The student will study examples of comparison and contrast writing. The student will identify points of similarity and points of difference between subjects. The student will recognize the choice of detail to support the writer's purpose.

IV. PROCEDURE: Students exchange assignment 2, discuss. Class discusses comparison and contrast in examples provided. Students complete assignment 3.

V. EVALUATION: Student response to questions. Completion of assignment 3.

VI. OUTCOME: Students study examples of subjects appropriate for comparison or contrast. Students develop a topic sentence by making comparisons or contrasts.

Warriner's English Grammar and Composition Third Course pp. 293-295
I. TOPIC: Using comparisons or contrasts

II. AIM: to use comparison, contrast, or both in writing

III. OBJECTIVES: The student will identify the writer's purpose in sample paragraphs.
   The student will discuss detail supporting the writer's purpose.
   The student will identify topics appropriate for comparison, contrast, or both.

IV. PROCEDURE: Students exchange assignment 2, discuss.
   Class discusses the writer's purpose in paragraphs showing comparison or contrast.
   Students complete assignment 4.

V. EVALUATION: Peer evaluation of assignment 2.
   Class discussion.
   Completion of assignment 4.

VI. OUTCOME: Students will identify the writer's purpose and the type of development used to support that purpose.
   Students will build their resource of topics appropriate for comparison or contrast.

VII. RESOURCES: Students
Building English Skills Composition (orange level)
pp. 82-84
I. TOPIC: Arranging supporting details

II. AIM: to develop comparisons or contrasts effectively

III. OBJECTIVES: The student will study presentation of details item by item.
The student will study presentation of details point by point.
The student will identify the method of comparison-contrast development in paragraphs studied.

IV. PROCEDURE: Teacher returns assignment 3.
Class discusses unit to date.
Teacher introduces final writing project.
Class discusses the arrangement of details to show similarities or differences between two subjects.

V. EVALUATION: Students' questions or comments regarding unit.
Student recognition of detail arrangement.

VI. OUTCOME: Students will recognize different arrangements of details in comparison-contrast writing.
Students will use different arrangements of details in comparison-contrast writing according to their purpose.

VII. RESOURCES: Modern Composition Book 3 pp. 66-67
I. TOPIC: Using comparison and contrast

II. AIM: to use comparison and contrast appropriately in paragraph development

III. OBJECTIVES: The student will identify supporting details, reasons, or examples in paragraphs of comparison or contrast. The student will identify the topic sentence. The student will identify the method of paragraph development. The student will develop a paragraph by comparison and by contrast. The student will study the use of a second paragraph to make a comparison. The student will discuss the use of transition between paragraphs.

IV. PROCEDURE: Class discusses using details to support comparisons or contrasts. Class discusses examples provided in class. Class completes assignment 5 in class. Class discusses using a second paragraph to make a comparison. Students complete assignment 6.

V. EVALUATION: Student response in class discussion. Completion of assignments 5 and 6.

VI. OUTCOME: Students will use details to support their purpose. Students will effectively arrange details to support their purpose.

I. TOPIC: Sharpening meaning by comparison

II. AIM: to use comparison or contrast effectively to communicate the writer's meaning

III. OBJECTIVES: The student will review subjects appropriate for comparison or contrast.
The student will review arrangements of details.
The student will develop contrast point by point.
The student will develop comparison or contrast item by item.

IV. PROCEDURE: Students exchange assignment, discussing topic, details, and the arrangement of details.
Students review the development of comparison-contrast.
Students discuss practices 1 and 2.
Students complete practices 3a and 4a in class.
Students complete assignment 7.

V. EVALUATION: Class discussion of concepts previously taught.
Completion of in-class assignments.
Completion of assignment 7.

VI. OUTCOME: Students will use appropriate topics and arrangement of detail to write comparisons or contrasts.
Students will develop contrast point by point.
Students will develop comparison or contrast by presenting one item and then the other.

VII. RESOURCES: Writing: Unit Lessons in Composition 3B pp. 51-56
I. TOPIC: The explanatory composition

II. AIM: to compose using comparison or contrast effectively

III. OBJECTIVES: The student will apply concepts used to develop a paragraph to develop a composition. The student will discuss an essay and identify contrasts made. The student will review the elements of comparison-contrast writing.

IV. PROCEDURE: Students discuss assignment 6. Students exchange assignment 7. Class discusses the use of metaphor to show similarities. Class discusses development of expository compositions using comparison and contrast. Students study additional examples of comparison-contrast writing.

V. EVALUATION: Class discussion of assignments 6 and 7. Students' response to expository composition.

VI. OUTCOME: Students will select appropriate items to compare or contrast. Students will organize comparison and contrast effectively. Students will transfer principles of paragraph development to composition development.

VII. RESOURCES: Writing: Unit Lessons in Composition 3B pp. 51-56 Building English Skills Composition (orange level) pp. 150-153
I. TOPIC: Expository Writing--The Comparison-Contrast Essay

II. AIM: to develop an essay using comparison, contrast, or both

III. OBJECTIVES: The student will write a 200-400 word essay using comparison or contrast.

IV. PROCEDURE: Teacher responds to students' questions about assignment. Students compose.

V. EVALUATION: Student composition

VI. OUTCOME: Students will learn another approach to expressing their knowledge and ideas in writing.

VII. RESOURCES: Student
I. TOPIC: Ways of developing the paragraph

II. AIM: to understand the development of paragraphs

III. OBJECTIVES: The student will study examples of expository paragraph development. The student will discuss the purposes of expository writing. The student will view a film that illustrates the development of a subject using comparisons. The student will read an essay contrasting two subjects.

IV. PROCEDURE: Teacher reviews expository writing. Class discusses paragraphs illustrating the functions of expository writing. Teacher introduces film. Class views and discusses film. Teacher distributes reading assignment 1 with questions for students to consider as they read.

V. EVALUATION: Student response to questions in class discussion. Student response to questions over film. Completion of reading assignment 1 and response to questions.

VI. OUTCOME: Students will recognize the purpose of expository writing. Students will view a situation in which comparisons and contrasts are made.

VII. RESOURCES: Teacher
Building English Skills Composition (orange level) pp. 97-98
"Into the Jet Age" (film)
"The Revolution in Small Plane Flying" (essay)
I. TOPIC: Using details to develop comparisons

II. AIM: to understand the use of detail to develop comparisons or contrasts

III. OBJECTIVES: The student will view an illustration of comparison between the personalities of two individuals.

IV. PROCEDURE: Teacher introduces film.
   Students view film.

V. EVALUATION: Student response in class discussion Day 4.

VI. OUTCOME: Students will see similarities and differences between individuals and between generations.

VII. RESOURCES: "Bernice Bobs Her Hair" (film)
I. TOPIC: Using comparison or contrast to develop an idea

II. AIM: to develop a subject by showing similarities or differences

III. OBJECTIVES: The student will cite similarities and differences between subjects presented. The student will compare the filmed presentation of subjects with the written exposition. The student will recognize the development of comparisons by the effective use of details. The student will write a short essay comparing or contrasting the personalities of two people.

IV. PROCEDURE: Class discusses "The Revolution in Small Play Flying" and "Into the Jet Age." Class discusses "Bernice Bobs Her Hair." Students read "A Separate Peace" in class, discuss. Students complete assignment 2.

V. EVALUATION: Student participation in class discussion.

VI. OUTCOME: Students will learn to develop details to strengthen comparisons or contrasts. Students will recognize a writer's purpose in developing comparisons.

VII. RESOURCES: "The Revolution in Small Plane Flying" (essay) "A Separate Peace" (student essay)
I. TOPIC: Using comparisons and contrasts

II. AIM: to use comparison or contrast effectively according to the writer's purpose

III. OBJECTIVES: The student will identify similarities and differences between subjects in paragraphs provided. The student will cite situation in which comparisons or contrasts are made in real life. The student will draw comparisons between two subjects.

IV. PROCEDURE: Teach presents examples of comparison-contrast writing for discussion. Class discusses the purpose of comparing and contrasting subjects. Teacher introduces film. Class views and discusses film.

V. EVALUATION: Student response to questions. Student discussion of film.

VI. OUTCOME: Students will understand how details are used to support a comparison or contrast of two subjects.

I. TOPIC: Developing comparisons and contrasts

II. AIM: to use supporting details to develop effective comparisons or contrasts

III. OBJECTIVES: The student will identify the statement of purpose in authors' writing.
    The student will identify details to support the purpose.
    The student will view and discuss an example of a topic developed by contrast.
    The student will read an essay and identify the contrasts presented by the author.

IV. PROCEDURE: Students exchange assignment 2, discussing their statement of purpose, appropriate use of comparison or contrast, use of supporting details, and appropriate conclusion.
    Teacher explains guidelines for the final writing project.
    Students ask questions over unit so far.
    Teacher introduces film.
    Class views and discusses film.
    Class completes assignment 3.

V. EVALUATION: Student response to peers' essays.
    Students' questions and responses in class discussion.
    Completion of assignment 3.

VI. OUTCOME: Students will develop comparisons using details to support their purpose.
    Students view and read presentations of similar subjects developed by contrasts.

VII. RESOURCES: "Hold the Ketchup" (film)
                   "Science Has Spoiled My Supper" (essay)
I. TOPIC: Arranging details to support comparison or contrast

II. AIM: to develop comparisons or contrast effectively to attain the writer's purpose

III. OBJECTIVES: The student will compare written and filmed presentations of similarities and differences between two subjects.
The student will give examples of products or processes that can be compared or contrasted.
The student will identify the writer's purpose in examples presented in class.
The student will view a film and draw comparisons between the lives of two people.

IV. PROCEDURE: Class discusses "Science Has Spoiled My Supper" and "Hold the Ketchup."
Teacher introduces the use of details and their organization to support the writer's purpose.
Class discusses print examples of comparison and contrast.
Teacher introduces film.
Students view and discuss film.

V. EVALUATION: Student response to questions over essay and film.
Student response to questions over writer's purpose.
Student participation in discussion of film.

VI. OUTCOME: The student will choose and arrange details to support the purpose of writing.

VII. RESOURCES: "Science Has Spoiled My Supper" (essay)
Building English Skills Composition (orange level) pp. 82-85.
"Parallels in History: Kennedy and Lincoln" (film)
I. TOPIC: Arranging supporting details

II. AIM: to use effective arrangement of details to show similarities and differences between subjects

III. OBJECTIVES: The student will develop comparisons by presenting one subject then the other. The student will develop comparisons point by point. The student will identify arrangement of details that support the writer's purpose. The student will study the use of a second paragraph to develop a comparison. The student will recognize the use of transition between paragraphs.

IV. PROCEDURE: Teacher introduces arrangement of details in comparison-contrast writing. Students read examples and discuss paragraph development. Teacher introduces film. Students view film. Teacher presents corresponding reading assignment 4.

V. EVALUATION: Student response to questions in class discussion. Completion of assignment 4.

VI. OUTCOME: Students will recognize two methods of arranging supporting details in comparison-contrast writing. The student will identify the purpose of succeeding paragraphs to develop details and draw conclusions.

VII. RESOURCES: The Macmillan English Series 9 pp. 345-347, 351-352 "Advertising" (film) "Outdoor Advertising: Two Points of View" (essays)
I. TOPIC: Developing comparisons and contrasts

II. AIM: to use details to support the purpose in writing comparison or contrast

III. OBJECTIVES: The student will compare authors' viewpoints on two subjects.
The student will discuss differences between two lifestyles.
The student will view and discuss a film illustrating differences between two lifestyles.

IV. PROCEDURE: Class discusses "Advertising" and "Outdoor Advertising: Two Points of View."
Teacher introduces film.
Students view and discuss film.
Students read additional examples of comparison-contrast writing.

V. EVALUATION: Student discussion of essay and films.
Student response to questions over film.

VI. OUTCOME: Students will recognize the use of comparison-contrast to develop ideas and to relay information.

VII. RESOURCES: "Outdoor Advertising: Two Points of View" (essay)
"Rural and Urban Viewpoints" (film)
I. TOPIC: Paragraph development

II. AIM: to understand the purpose of various methods of paragraph development

III. OBJECTIVES: The student will listen to and discuss paragraphs that explain.
The student will discuss paragraphs in which two subjects are compared.
The student will view and discuss a film comparing the lives of two individuals.
The student will write a paragraph in which the lives of two people are compared.

IV. PROCEDURE: Teacher introduces paragraph development.
Teacher reviews expository paragraph development.
Students listen to and discuss paragraphs developed by use of facts, examples, incidents, and comparisons.
Teacher introduces film.
Students view and discuss film.
Students complete assignment 1.

V. EVALUATION: Student response to questions about paragraph development.
Student discussion of film.
Completion of assignment 1.

VI. OUTCOME: The student will understand that purpose in writing determines the development of details.
The student will write a paragraph showing similarities between two subjects.

VII. RESOURCES: Building English Skills Composition (orange level) pp. 97-98
"Parallels in History: Kennedy and Lincoln" (film)
I. TOPIC: Supporting details

II. AIM: to choose details that strengthen the comparisons or contrasts being made

III. OBJECTIVES: The student will identify the purpose of using comparison-contrast development in writing. The student will listen to and discuss paragraphs that compare two subjects. The student will identify details that support a comparison or contrast. The students will view and discuss a film that compares two lifestyles.

IV. PROCEDURE: Students exchange and discuss assignment 1. Students listen to examples of comparison and contrast, discussing details that point out similarities or differences. Students view and discuss film.

V. EVALUATION: Student response to questions over recorded paragraphs. Student discussion of film.

VI. OUTCOME: Students will understand the use of detail to support one's purpose in developing a comparison or contrast.

VII. RESOURCES: Building English Skills Composition (orange level) pp. 82-83
Building English Skills Composition (yellow level) pp. 145-147
"Two Cities: London and New York" (film)
I. TOPIC: Subjects to compare or contrast

II. AIM: to recognize subjects that are appropriate for development by comparison or contrast

III. OBJECTIVES: The student will listen to and discuss paragraphs developed by comparison and contrast that support the writer's purpose. The student will view and discuss a film in which two lifestyles are compared. The student will write a short essay in which two places are compared.

IV. PROCEDURE: Teacher returns assignment 1 and answers students' questions. Students listen to recorded paragraphs and discuss comparisons or contrasts. Students view film. Students complete assignment 2.

V. EVALUATION: Student discussion of recorded paragraphs. Student response to questions over film. Completion of assignment 2.

VI. OUTCOME: Students will understand how choice of details can support the writer's purpose. Students will write an essay comparing two places.

VII. RESOURCES: Warriner's English Grammar and Composition Third Course pp. 293-294 "Urban and Rural Viewpoints" (film)
I. TOPIC: Arranging supporting details

II. AIM: to develop comparisons and contrasts by effectively arranging supporting details

III. OBJECTIVES: The student will study the arrangement of details supporting one subject and then the other.
The student will study the arrangement of details comparing or contrasting two subjects point by point.
The student will identify the author's purpose, supporting details, and the arrangement of details in recorded paragraphs.
The student will understand the use of additional paragraphs to develop a topic and to draw a conclusion.

IV. PROCEDURE: Students share assignment 2 in class and discuss.
Teacher introduces two methods of arranging details to develop comparison or contrast.
Students listen to recorded paragraphs.
Teacher lectures over use of succeeding paragraphs to develop an essay of comparison or contrast.
Class discusses recorded examples of paragraphs using comparison and contrast.

V. EVALUATION: Peer reaction to assignment 2.
Student discussion of paragraph topics, details, and arrangement.

VI. OUTCOME: The student will recognize two methods of developing comparisons and contrasts.
The student will transfer principles of developing comparison-contrast paragraphs to developing comparison-contrast essays.

VII. RESOURCES: Modern Composition Book 3 pp. 66-67
The Macmillan English Series 9 pp. 345-347, 351-352
I. TOPIC: The essay of comparison-contrast

II. AIM: to develop a comparison between more complex subjects

III. OBJECTIVES: The student will view and discuss a film contrasting two nations. The student will compare attitudes as well as lifestyles.

IV. PROCEDURE: Teacher returns assignment 2. Teacher responds to students' questions regarding the unit to date. Teacher introduces guidelines for final writing assignment. Teacher introduces film. Students view and discuss film.

V. EVALUATION: Student reaction to unit. Student response to questions over film.

VI. OUTCOME: Students will view and analyze a comparison of two lifestyles.

VII. RESOURCES: "Two Factories: Japanese and American" (film)
I. TOPIC: Using details to support comparisons and contrast

II. AIM: to choose details that illustrate similarities and differences

III. OBJECTIVES: The student will view and discuss comparisons and contrasts presented in a film about two individuals.

IV. PROCEDURE: Teacher introduces film.
Students view and discuss film.

V. EVALUATION: Student discussion of comparisons and contrasts presented in the film.

VI. OUTCOME: Students will recognize the use of detail to present similarities and differences between two subjects.

VII. RESOURCES: "FDR and Hitler: Their Rise to Power" (film)
I. TOPIC: Sharpening meaning by comparison

II. AIM: to use comparison or contrast to communicate the writer's meaning

III. OBJECTIVES: The student will listen to recorded examples of comparison, identifying points of similarity and difference, and method of arranging details.
   The student will list points of comparison or contrast for subjects given in class.
   The student will write a paragraph developing a suggested topic and arranging details point by point or item by item.

IV. PROCEDURE: Students listen to and discuss a paragraph showing contrasts.
   Teacher reviews elements of comparison and contrast.
   Students complete in-class activity.
   Students complete assignment 3.

V. EVALUATION: Student discussion of paragraph.
   Students' responses to activity.
   Completion of assignment 3.

VI. OUTCOME: Students will recognize subtle points of comparison and contrast.
   Students will identify similarities and differences between two subjects.
   Students will write a comparison-contrast paragraph in which they arrange details to present their purpose most effectively.

VII. RESOURCES: Writing: Unit Lessons in Composition 3B pp. 51-53
               Students
I. TOPIC: Subjects to compare or contrast

II. AIM: to develop comparisons or contrasts between more abstract ideas

III. OBJECTIVES: The student will view and discuss a film comparing two forms of government. The student will analyze points of comparison and contrast between two systems.

IV. PROCEDURE: Students share assignment 3, discussing arrangement of supporting details. Teacher introduces film. Students view and discuss film. If time remains, students read additional examples of comparison-contrast writing.

V. EVALUATION: Completion of assignment 3. Student response to questions over film.

VI. OUTCOME: Students explore complex subjects to compare or contrast.

VII. RESOURCES: Students "Capitalism and Communism" (film)
Film - "Winning is Everything?" (21 min.)

Compare the attitude (philosophy) toward sports participation and its purpose in schools?
- Which approach is more appealing? more realistic?
- What are the advantages/disadvantages of competitive sports? of non-discriminatory sports?
- Would team sports change by adopting open sports participation?

Film - "Two Farms: Hungary and Wisconsin" (22 min.)

Compare the concept of a "farm family" in each location.
- Are family ties the same?
- What geographic differences are obvious?
- What cultural differences can you identify?
- Are the growing cycles similar?

Consider the decisions that need to be made by the farmers from both places.
- What risks does each face?
- What attitude toward the land does each have?
LESSON PLANS

Bibliography


FILMS

"Advertising" 1971 BFA 22 min. color
propaganda vs. free enterprise

"Bernice Bobs Her Hair" n.d. Perspective 48 min. color
Bernice/Marjorie 1920s teen/modern teen

"Capitalism and Communism: A Comparison" 1976 BFA 22 min. color

"FDR and Hitler: Their Rise to Power" 1978 Films Inc. 26 min. color

"Hold the Ketchup" 1979 Churchill 20 min. color
processed foods/home-cooked foods

"The Human Machine" 1955 Moody Inst. Sci. 15 min. color
body systems/man-made machines

"Into the Jet Age" 1970 Time Life 20 min. B/W
early aircraft/warfare and travel crafts

"Parallels in History: Kennedy and Lincoln" 1974 Doubleday 11 min. color

"Two Cities: London and New York" 1973 LCA 23 min. color

"Two Factories: Japanese and American" 1974 LCA 22 min. color

"Two Farms: Hungary and Wisconsin" 1973 LCA 22 min. color

"Urban and Rural Viewpoints" 1974 BFA 18 min. color

"Winning Is Everything?" 1978 Lucerne 21 min. color
competitive sports/programs for all children
Teacher introduces self: Mrs. Mary Badami

Teacher introduces project:

Lynn McGreevey is a graduate student at Iowa State University, working on a Master's degree in Curriculum and Instructional Media. She is emphasizing English composition because her own background in writing and teaching writing is weak. After four years of teaching high school English and French, she decided to return to college to become a better teacher. Teaching composition is an area she needs to learn about so she has chosen to research the effect different methods of teaching composition have on students' ability to write. Group I will be taught by a traditional textbook approach to learn paragraph development through comparison-contrast. Group II will be taught with text and film; whereas group III will be taught with film and audio-cassette. Your work will be evaluated as part of your third quarter grade. When Lynn reports the results of this experiment, your names will not be used.

Questions from students.

Modified consent form

Remind students to keep classnotes.

Let's begin our unit on comparison-contrast writing with a brief introduction to three types of composition: DESCRIPTION, NARRATION, AND EXPOSITION.
DESCRIPTIVE WRITING tells how things appear; it appeals to all senses and leaves the reader with vivid impressions.

NARRATION answers the questions: What happened? and When? It is concerned with action and time. There generally is a beginning, a middle, and an end that unify events to make a story.

EXPOSITION is the type of writing we will focus on for the next seven days. Expository prose is concerned primarily with the why and how of things. It appeals to our understanding. Expository prose defines words, explains processes, reports, analyzes, argues, defends, and evaluates or judges experiences. Some examples of expository writing with which you might be familiar include dictionary definitions, encyclopedia entries, editorials, book reviews, and scientific articles.

GROUP I
TRADITIONAL TEXTBOOK INSTRUCTION
HANDOUT

Unit 22 Combine the Forms of Writing pp. 143-150
Review and discuss.

Keep in mind that the three common types of composition often appear in the same piece of writing. They are often studied in isolation to gain a better understanding of their content and function. You will read some examples of writing in which comparisons and contrasts are obvious. In other examples, similarities and differences between subjects may be less obvious. You are encouraged to combine expository writing and creativity as you complete assignments.
HANDOUT

Part 1 Expository Writing and Imaginative Writing p. 212
Defines two types of writing and provides an example of comparison-contrast

Always keep in mind your general purpose in each assignment: to show similarities and/or differences between two subjects.

You should keep notes of class lectures and discussion and of the examples you read. These will help you complete written assignments and provide ideas for topics.
Chapter 8 Ways of Developing the Paragraph  p. 137

Yesterday we discussed types of writing. Remember, too, that comparison and contrast is not the only way to develop a paragraph. To understand how this method differs from the others, we will look at a few examples.

Part 2 The Explanatory Paragraph  pp. 97-98

The purpose of exposition is to explain.

- What types of writing explain things?
  Read and briefly discuss the examples.
  Identify why each paragraph is an example of the technique identified.

- What facts support the topic sentence "Long distance bus travel (is) efficient as well as economical"?

- What example is given to show how some zoo's have gained public support to feed animals?

- What incident is retold in the third paragraph?

- What comparisons are drawn between Whittier and Emerson?

ASSIGNMENT 1

Think of two people you know or have read about. Write a short paragraph (5-6 sentences) in which you reveal their similarities. Exchange your paragraph with a classmate. Volunteers share their paragraphs with the class.
Day 3
Handout

Part 3 The Paragraph of Comparison or Contrast pp. 145-147
Read and discuss.

Comparison shows similarities.
- What similarities have art historians identified between the two paintings that lead them to conclude that Quarton is the probable painter of the Coronation?

Contrast shows differences.

p. 146 Answer "What two things are being contrasted?"

Discuss other situations in which people use comparison and contrast. (in daily life or in writing).

pp. 146-147 Can you cite other similarities or differences between English people and Americans?

Assignment 2

Complete Exercise B page 147. Due classtime Thursday.

Be prepared to exchange your paper with a classmate.
DAY 4

Questions, comments about assignment

Students exchange paragraphs. Partner identifies topic sentence, comments on appropriate use of comparison, contrast, or both.

Return papers, hand-in.

HANDOUT

83c. Develop A Paragraph By Comparison Or Contrast  p. 365

A writer may compare and contrast two subjects in the same paragraph.

- In the first paragraph, to what does the narrator compare the young woman?

  Briefly discuss the imagery.

- How are the bumblebee and the honey-bee compared in the second paragraph? (Students identify contrasts.)

HANDOUT

12h. A paragraph may be developed by making comparisons or contrasts. pp. 293-295

  Comparison emphasizes similarities.

  Paragraph 1

  - What similarities are drawn between the Pacific Ocean and a highway?

  Paragraph 2

  - What differences does the author cite between small town life and life in a big city? Which does he prefer? Notice how his choice of differences supports his preference.

ASSIGNMENT 3

Complete Exercise 8 (page 294) for Friday, classtime.

Paragraphs will be read by classmates and the teacher.
DAY 5

Return assignment 2.

Teacher pairs students. Students exchange papers. Read and discuss briefly. At the end of each paper, the partner writes:
1) what s/he believes the author's purpose to be
2) whether the paragraph is developed by comparisons, contrasts, or both
3) whether the author compared subjects item by item or whether s/he presented one subject then the other.

Return paper, hand it in.

HANDOUT

Using Comparisons or Contrasts pp. 82-85

Comparisons

Writer's purpose

- How were Presidents Lincoln's and Kennedy's deaths similar?
- What does Marshall dislike about the 5-speed bicycle?

Contrasts

- In your own words, describe Henry Chatillon and Tete Rouge.
- How did the peasant's life in America contrast with life in the Old World?

ASSIGNMENT 4

In the time remaining, consider Exercises A and B, pp. 84-85.
Jot down some notes on the topics listed that interest you and that could later be developed into a short essay.

Teacher checks notes.

No formal writing assignment for Monday.
DAY 6

Return assignment 3.

Questions or comments regarding the unit so far

Now that we have seen several examples of comparison-contrast, you should be aware of subjects that are appropriate for that approach to paragraph development. You should be taking note of ideas read since the unit began. Besides choosing a subject to compare or contrast, you must also consider a topic sentence that states the purpose of your writing and the organization of details to support that purpose.

HANDOUT

Here is a list of suggested topics for your composition. By classtime Thursday, you should decide on a topic. In class on Friday, you will write a 200-400 word essay (approximately 3-5 pages) in which you develop a topic using comparisons, contrasts, or both. You may take notes and bring references to class.

Discuss evaluation criteria.

Literature examples may be checked out and previewed through Wednesday. If you decide to write on one of these, you may have your own copy of the poems or stories.

Questions from students

p. 66 The Paragraph—Arranging The Supporting Details  p. 67

Arrangements

1) present all details about one subject then present all details about the other

2) present point by point comparison or contrast
Paragraph 19, discuss
Paragraph 20, discuss

Look at the paragraphs we have previously studied.

- What arrangement has each author used to develop his/her topic?

As you continue to read and write, look for and try both arrangements.
DAY 7

HANDOUT

17.7 Using Comparison and Contrast pp. 345-348

Use details, reasons, and examples to support the comparison or contrast.

Discuss examples.
Keller--comparison in two parts
Drucker--point by point

ASSIGNMENT 5

Complete Exercise A in class. Do individually then discuss.

17.8 Using A Second Paragraph pp. 348-349

Read and discuss.

pp. 351-352 A Second Paragraph to Make a Comparison

Discuss differences between the religious services.
Note the transitional element.

ASSIGNMENT 6

Complete Exercise C or D (page 348) by classtime Wednesday.
Remember to review topics for final composition.
DAY 8

Students exchange assignment 6. Comment on topic, supporting details, and arrangement of details.
Return papers and hand in.

HANDOUT

Unit 9 Sharpen Meaning by Comparison pp. 51-56

As we near the end of this unit, we want to take a closer look at comparison-contrast writing and review some concepts previously discussed.
Read page 51.
- What subjects are compared?
- How does Brooks arrange his details?
- According to Brooks, are wit and humor synonymous? How do they differ?

A. Compare and Contrast Subjects in the Same Class
p. 52 Discuss Practice 1
p. 53 Discuss Practice 2

B. Organize Comparison and Contrast Effectively

Point by point
Do Practice 3a in class.
Element by element
Do Practice 4a in class.
Discuss.

ASSIGNMENT 7

Prepare Practices 3b and 4b, page 54, for class on Thursday.
Remember to have your topic selected tomorrow.
DAY 9

Return assignment 6. Questions from students

Students exchange paragraphs for Practices 3b and 4b.

Partner comments on arrangement of details. Return to owner and hand in.

Quickly complete Unit 9 Part C pages 54-55.

Discuss Practice 5.

Review The Act of Writing.

Note Problems 1 and 2 as possible subjects for final paper.

HANDOUT

Part 2 The Explanatory Composition pp. 150-153

Apply the same concepts used to develop a paragraph to develop a composition.

Review criteria for final paper.

It must explain.

It must use comparison, contrast, or both.

It must have a purpose.

It must have an introduction, body, and a conclusion.

It must be coherent.

Students read Armstrong's article (page 151) and explanation on page 152.

Note paragraphs three and four.

- What contrasts are made?

Questions from students
Reminder: Limit the subject of your composition.

Organize your ideas.

For the remainder of the hour, students will read additional examples of comparison-contrast.

Teacher asks students for topic of final composition.

Remind students to bring handouts, notes, and resources to class Friday.

Paper will be supplied, but students must bring a blue or black ink pen.

Also bring reading material or other classwork in case you finish early.
CONCLUSION
DAY 10

(Return Practices 3b and 4b to Group I)
Teacher responds to questions from class.
Students write final composition.
Use ink.
Double space.
200-400 words (3-5 pages)
Format
   Title
   Name
   Class
   Date
Papers will be returned.
You will have a chance to evaluate this unit.
Mrs. Beers will receive a copy of the results of the study.
Hand in final paper.
Thank you for your cooperation.
GROUP II
PRINT AND FILM
DAY 1
HANDOUT

Teacher lectures. Students refer to examples.

Keep in mind that the three common types of composition often appear in the same piece of writing. They are studied in isolation to gain a better understanding of their content and function. You will read and view examples of comparison and contrast that are obvious. In other examples, similarities and differences between subjects may be less obvious. You are encouraged to combine expository and creative writing as you complete assignments.

p. 212 Teacher contrasts Expository writing and Imaginative writing.

Always keep in mind your general purpose in each assignment: to show similarities and/or differences between two subjects.

You should keep notes of class lectures and discussions and of the examples you read and see. These notes will help you complete written assignments and provide ideas for topics.
DAY 2

Yesterday we discussed types of writing. Remember, too, that comparison and contrast is not the only way to develop a paragraph or composition. There are several ways to develop an explanation. To understand how these methods differ we will look at a few examples.

HANDOUT

examples pp. 97-98

The purpose of expository writing is to explain.

- In what situations and in what types of writing do we explain things?
- Read and briefly discuss the examples.
- Identify why each paragraph is an example of the technique identified.

The first film that we will see is an example of explaining a subject using comparisons. "Into the Jet Age" illustrates how changes in society have resulted in changes in the design of aircraft. As you watch the film, take note of these changes.

FILM

View "Into the Jet Age" (20 min.)

- Discuss film.
- How has warfare affected aircraft design?
- How have demands to travel greater distances in less time affected the industry?
- Contrast old planes with new aircraft.
- Compare the needs of society with the changes in aircraft designed to meet those needs.
Your first reading assignment illustrates a similar concept. Wolfgang Langewiesche explains the revolution of small plane flying, in part, by contrasting the old planes with the new ones:

HANDOUT - ASSIGNMENT 1

"The Revolution in Small Plane Flying" pp. 198-213

For Thursday, be prepared to discuss these questions: (on board)
- What comparisons does Langewiesche make between old and new planes?
- How would you compare or contrast the information presented in the film with that presented by Langewiesche? What similarities and differences are there?
- In your opinion, which explanation is a more effective example of comparison-contrast? Why?

Note the Suggestions for Writing (4 and 5 page 214). Keep them in mind for your final paper.
Today's film is lengthy so we will begin as soon as possible. Yesterday we saw and began reading examples of comparison-contrast used to explain an object. Now, let's look at a film that allows us to compare two people. "Bernice Bobs Her Hair" by F. Scott Fitzgerald is an example of narrative prose. However, by careful observation, we should be able to draw contrasts between Bernice and her cousin Marjorie. We should also see similarities and differences between teenagers of the early twentieth century and those of today. Take note of the characters' personalities as well as their lifestyles. The film is 48 minutes long so bring your notes to class tomorrow for discussion.

Remember we will also discuss "The Revolution in Small Plane Flying."

**FILM**

View "Bernice Bobs Her Hair" (48 min.)
DAY 4

Discuss essay and film. Emphasize the comparison between old and new planes.

Compare the film with the essay.
- Which presents contrasts more effectively?

We might make similar comparisons between Fitzgerald's short story and its filmed version.

- Has anyone read "Bernice Bobs Her Hair"?
- What similarities or differences between the versions did you notice?

Consider the film's presentation of characters.

- How do Bernice's and Marjorie's lives differ?
- How does Bernice's struggle to "fit-in" compare with that of teenagers today?

- Do Bernice and Marjorie change as the story progresses? Does their relationship change? How?

HANDOUT

"A Separate Peace"

Here is a student's analysis of two characters from literature. He explains the theme of A Separate Peace by contrasting Gene's personality with that of Phineas.

Read "A Separate Peace" silently.

- According to this student, what two characteristics does Knowles contrast in the novel?

Contrast Phineas (innocence) with Gene (aggression).
- Besides the two characters, what else in the novel can be contrasted, according to this student?
- If you have read *A Separate Peace*, can you draw other comparisons? Do you agree with this writer's interpretation?

**ASSIGNMENT 2**

Think of two people you know or have read about. Write a short essay (3-5 paragraphs) in which you reveal their similarities and/or differences. Be aware of your topic sentence that identifies your purpose, your choice of details, and your conclusion. We will exchange papers in class on Monday.
DAY 5

You know by now that developing a paragraph or paper by comparison will show similarities between two subjects and that contrast shows differences.

HANDOUT

pp. 145-147

Read passages.

- What similarities have art historians identified between the two paintings that lead them to believe that Quarton is the probable painter of the Coronation?
- What two things are contrasted in the second paragraph?
- In what kinds of situations do people use comparison and contrast? (in daily life and in writing)?

Depending on the topic, a writer may develop a paragraph or composition by comparison, showing similarities, by contrast, showing differences, or by comparison and contrast, explaining similarities and differences.

So far we have compared similar objects and two human beings. Let's think about the similarities and differences between an object and a human being. Analogies are often made between the parts of the human body and various machines. For example, to understand how a camera works, people study how the eye functions. With increased emphasis on health care, sports, and physical fitness, there are more references to the mechanics of the human body. As you watch this film, note how the systems of the body are compared with man-made machines. Contrast the functions of the muscular, skeletal, digestive, and nervous systems.
How does the human machine compare with man-made machinery?

**FILM**

View "The Human Machine" (15 min.)

Discuss.

Remember your assignment due Monday.
DAY 6

Students are paired. Exchange papers.

Partner looks for 1) statement of purpose, 2) use of comparison, contrast, or both, 3) supporting details, and 4) conclusion. Students share positive comments and suggestions for improvement.

Return papers, hand in.

HANDOUT

Here is a list of suggested topics for your final composition. By classtime Thursday, you should decide on a topic. In class on Friday, you will write a 200-400 word essay (approximately 3-5 pages) in which you develop a topic using comparisons, contrasts, or both. You may bring notes and references to class.

Discuss evaluation criteria.

Literature examples may be checked out and previewed through Wednesday. If you decide to write on one of these, you may have your own copy of the poems or stories.

Questions from students

Our next example of comparison-contrast treats a less serious topic but still provides some "food for thought." Note the contrasts presented.

FILM

View "Hold the Ketchup" (20 min.)

Discuss.

- How does the film's introduction serve to heighten the contrast between preparations of food?
Compare the functions of food in our society.
Contrast the status of food in the past with its status today.

ASSIGNMENT 3
For Tuesday, read Philip Wylie's "Science Has Spoiled My Supper."
Again, note the contrasts the author presents.
- What similarities and differences can you cite between the film and Wylie's essay?
- Which medium (film or print) presents a clearer contrast, in your opinion? How?
DAY 7

Return assignment 2.
Discuss essay and film.
- How has the preparation of food changed over the years?
- What comparisons might you make to shed a more favorable light on modern food preparation (as contrasted with that of the past)?
- Can you cite additional examples of processes or products that have changed because of science?

A writer's purpose determines the details and the organization of his/her writing. In this unit, we want to arrange details by comparison or contrast so our purpose becomes to explain similarities or differences.

HANDOUT
Examples of comparison and contrast pp. 365, 293-295, 82-85

Read these paragraphs.

Identify the author's purpose. Notice the details used to support the writer's purpose.

We will view a film that illustrates one of the best known and most interesting comparisons in history. The paragraph we just read about the deaths of Presidents Lincoln and Kennedy may be familiar to you.
- If so, do you remember other similarities between the men?
  Note the comparisons as you watch this film.

FILM
View "Parallels in History: Kennedy and Lincoln" (11 min.)
- What aspects of the men's personal lives are similar?
- What comparisons are made between their political careers?
- What problems did both presidents face?
- How were their deaths alike?
- What comparisons are presented about their wives, their vice presidents, and their secretaries?

Remember to choose a composition topic by Thursday.
DAY 8

When a writer wishes to point out similarities and differences between two things, s/he may arrange details one of two ways:

1) s/he may present all of the details about one subject and then present all the details about the other subject, OR

2) s/he may compare or contrast the two subjects point by point. This is especially effective when the comparison or contrast includes a number of points.

HANDOUT

pp. 345-347

Read the following examples.
- What is the topic idea of each paragraph?
- What two subjects are compared or contrasted?
- How has the writer arranged his/her details?

Note how the authors use details or examples to support their purpose.

A second paragraph (or more) allows a writer to explain something more completely. The first paragraph should contain a topic sentence and serve as an introduction. Subsequent paragraphs develop details, reasons, and examples. The final paragraph should contain an effective clincher sentence to summarize an idea or draw a conclusion. All paragraphs should be linked by a phrase or sentence so the relationship between the paragraphs is clear.

HANDOUT

pp. 351-352

Contrast the two religious services.
- What transitional sentence ties the two paragraphs together?
  As we watch the next film, consider these ideas: (on board)
- How does advertising affect the consumer's life?
- To what extent does advertising make consumers consume more than they need?
  Contrast that response with the necessity of advertising to maintain a free enterprise system.
  Compare Nader's viewpoint with that of Factor.

FILM
View "Advertising" (22 min.)

HANDOUT
"Outdoor Advertising: Two Points of View" pp. 270-285
Read for Thursday.
Prepare the following questions.
(on board)
  Contrast Neuberger's and Markham's viewpoints.
- How does outdoor advertising affect America?
- What comparisons does Markham use to support the right of billboards to exist?
- After comparing the arguments of both authors, with whom do you agree? Why?
- How do the authors use detail (comparison-contrast specifically) to support their arguments?
Discuss film and essays.

Compare authors' viewpoints.

Compare arguments in the essays with those of Nader and Factor.

Which medium is more persuasive because of contrasts presented?

Our last film illustrating comparison-contrast should hit close to home. From the time you were a child reading about the Country Mouse and her cousin in the city, you have been aware of differences between urban and rural life.

What are some differences that come to mind?

Can you think of similarities?

Let's see how your ideas compare with those presented in the film.

FILM

View "Rural and Urban Viewpoints" (18 min.)

What positive aspects of rural life are presented? of city life?

Compare the disadvantages of each lifestyle.

Do the examples support the comparison between rural and urban life?

What conclusion do you draw from the comparison?

For the remainder of the hour, students, read additional examples of comparison-contrast.

Identify your topic for the final composition.

Bring notes to class.

Paper will be provided, but students must bring a blue or black ink pen to class.
Also bring reading material or other class work in case you finish early.
Narration, description, and exposition are names used to classify the most common kinds of writing. These forms rarely occur in isolation. To better understand the structure of writing, we sometimes study one form at a time. We will focus on expository writing and the development of ideas by comparison and contrast.

First, let's listen to an excerpt from Loren Eiseley's *The Immense Journey*. In this passage, Eiseley contemplates the influence of technology and the presence of nature in society. He makes a mental comparison between the two forces. He reflects on a time in his youth when he had captured a hawk.

In this selection, Eiseley presents a series of events in a time sequence (narration), adds physical and emotional details (description), and then explains these incidents (exposition) in a way that subtly persuades the reader to respond to the passage.

Exposition presents an event, object, idea, or process in a logical way.

- What would you identify as the comparison made in the last two paragraphs?
TAPE 2

paragraphs 11-12

Conclude lesson by defining Exposition and explaining the purpose of imaginative writing. (p. 212 Part 1 Expository Writing and Imaginative Writing)
Just as there are different kinds of writing, there are various ways to develop paragraphs in a composition. You might use details, description, narration, explanation, definition, reasoning, persuasion, or comparison and contrast. Your purpose in writing will determine what type of development. For this unit you will see, hear, and write about various subjects, but the general purpose of your writing will be to explain similarities or differences between two subjects.

Part 2 The Explanatory Paragraph

The expository paragraph explains. The writer draws from his/her store of knowledge and offers information. To be meaningful, an explanation must be clear, accurate, and well organized. It can use facts, examples, incidents, or comparisons and contrasts to develop the details of the paragraph or composition.

Listen to the following examples of these methods for developing expository writing.

TAPE 3

pp. 97-98 Part 2 Ways of Developing an Explanatory Paragraph

- What similarities are drawn between Whittier and Franklin?
  Let's look at one of the most well-known comparisons in history?
- Are you aware of the similarities between the lives of Presidents Lincoln and Kennedy?
- What do you know about their lives?
FILM

View "Parallels in History: Kennedy and Lincoln" (11 min.)

- What aspects of the men's personal lives are similar?
- What comparisons are made between their political careers?
- What problems did both presidents face?
- How were their deaths alike?
- What similarities are presented about their wives, their vice presidents, and their secretaries?

ASSIGNMENT 1

Think of two people you know or have read about. Write a paragraph in which you compare their lives, personalities, or physical features. Be ready to share your paragraph in class Wednesday.
DAY 3

Students read paragraphs aloud. Discuss. Hand in.

Let's listen to two more examples of character description developed by comparisons or contrasts.

TAPE 4

p. 82 Lincoln and Kennedy
p. 83 Henry Chatillon and Tete Rouge

Note how the details in each paragraph support the author's purpose. In the first paragraph, the author wants to point out similarities in the deaths of the presidents. In the second paragraph, the two men's personalities are clarified by the contrasts the author points out.

Comparison means showing similarities. Contrast shows differences. Listen to the following paragraphs.

TAPE 5

p. 145 Pieta and Coronation, p. 146 women's status,
pp. 146-147 English People and Americans

- Which paragraph uses comparisons? What details support the comparison?
- Which uses contrast? What is being contrasted?
- Which combines comparison and contrast?

Let's view a film that expands the comparison between American and British lifestyles.

FILM

View "Two Cities: London and New York" (23 min.)

Describe the lifestyle of an American in New York City.
- How does this compare with life in London?
  Contrast the policeman's work in each city.
  Compare the housing development in each city.
  transportation
  the use of land
  entertainment
- According to the film, what signals the difference in the quality of life in the two cities?
Return assignment 1.

Questions from students

Listen to two more examples of comparison and contrast. The first paragraph uses comparison to show how the Pacific Ocean is like a highway. The second uses contrast to convey the author's reasons for preferring small town life.

TAPe 6

pp. 293-294

- How is the ocean like a highway?
- What does the second writer dislike about a big city?
- What are some differences you have observed between city and small town or country life?

The film we will see today continues this idea of contrasts between urban and rural lifestyles.

FILM

View "Urban and Rural Viewpoints" (18 min.)

- What positive aspects of rural life are presented? of city life?
- Compare disadvantages of each lifestyle.
- Do the examples support the comparisons between rural and urban life?
- What conclusion do you draw from the comparison?

ASSIGNMENT 2

For Friday, write a short essay (3-5 paragraphs) in which you compare or contrast two places. You should be familiar with both places so you can
support your comparison with details. Be ready to share your essay in class.
DAY 5

Students share essays. Discuss and hand in.

When a writer shows similarities and differences between two things, s/he might arrange the details in one of two ways:
1) s/he may present all the details supporting one subject and then present the other subject, OR
2) s/he may compare or contrast the two subjects point by point.

As you listen to the following paragraphs, identify
1) the topic idea of each paragraph (What is the author's purpose?)
2) the details that support the purpose, and
3) the arrangement of details.

TAPE 7

pp. 66-67 art sales, philosophies
pp. 345-347, 351-352

In the last example, contrasting the two religious services, note that the second paragraph develops the contrast. Of course, most of our writing is longer than one paragraph when we want to present an idea clearly and completely. When you expand the principles of comparison-contrast from single paragraph development to an entire composition, keep in mind that your first paragraph should contain a topic sentence and serve as an introduction. Subsequent paragraphs should develop the topic by giving details, reasons or examples, and for our purposes, by making comparisons or contrasts. A final paragraph should summarize the idea developed or draw a conclusion. The paragraphs should be linked by a phrase or sentence to show the relationship between them. Listen again to the transitional sentence that ties the last two paragraphs together.
p. 351 excerpt Is Paris Burning?
DAY 6

Return assignment 2.
Questions or comments on unit so far

HANDOUT

Here is a list of suggested topics for your final composition. By classtime Thursday, you should decide on a topic. In class on Friday, you will write a 200-400 word essay (approximately 3-5 pages) in which you develop a topic using comparison, contrasts, or both. You may bring notes and references to class.

Discuss evaluation criteria.

Literature examples may be checked out and previewed through Wednesday. If you decide to write on one of these, you may have your own copy of the poems or stories.

Questions from students

Today we will view a film that contrasts an important aspect of two nations. You may be aware of America's interest in the Japanese workforce. Japanese industry is based on cooperation between labor and management; whereas American productivity is often marred because of differences between blue collar and white collar workers.

Note how the attitude and lifestyle of a worker in Japan differ from those of an American in a similar position.

FILM

View "Two Factories: Japanese and American" (22 min.)

- How does a Japanese view his job? an American?
- What benefits does a Japanese worker receive? an American?
Contrast the relationship between an employee's workday and his personal life in each country.
Today we will look again at two personalities in history. This time, however, the lives are contrasted. Note the details used to support the contrast.

FILM
View "FDR and Hitler: Their Rise to Power" (26 min.)
- Can you identify any similarities in the two men's lives?
- How did each leader use technology to his advantage?
  Compare the economic programs each devised to deal with the Depression.
- How did each leader use propaganda?
  Compare the societies in which each leader came to power.
  Preview suggested topics and writing assignments for final paper.
DAY 8

Listen to the following excerpt from "On the Difference Between Wit and Humor" by Charles Brooks.

TAPE 9

p. 51 Unit 9 Sharpen Meaning by Comparison

- How has Brooks arranged the details of his paragraph?

Teacher reviews points on comparison-contrast. pp. 52-53

Compare or contrast subjects in the same class.

Organize comparison-contrast effectively.

CLASS ACTIVITY

Listen to the following pairs of words and list one point of comparison or contrast for each.

Example: loneliness and solitude

Loneliness is undesirable; solitude is sought after.

1. loneliness and solitude
2. spring and summer
3. youth and age
4. American cars and foreign cars
5. military and civilian life
6. jazz and classical music
7. urban and rural life
8. wealth and poverty
9. comfort and luxury

Discuss student responses.
ASSIGNMENT 3

For Thursday, select one of the topics and write a paragraph of several sentences. Use the point-by-point method or present one item entirely and then the other.
DAY 9

Students share paragraphs. Discuss appropriate arrangements of supporting details. Hand in paragraphs.

Our final film illustrating comparison-contrast deals with a subject less concrete than the previous subjects. As in several of the paragraphs yesterday, we will talk about abstract ideas. Two forms of government are explained, and through these explanations, we become aware of their differences as well as the strengths and weaknesses of each.

FILM

View "Capitalism and Communism" (22 min.)

- What are some differences between the communist and capitalist systems?
- How did each begin?
- What is the theory behind each system?
- How does the theory compare with the actual practice of these systems?

Compare and contrast life in a communist country with life in a capitalist society.

In the time remaining, read the examples of comparison-contrast writing available in class.

Tell the teacher your topic for your final composition.

Remember to bring references, a blue or black ink pen, and reading material in case you finish early.
Film - "Winning is Everything?" (21 min.)

Compare the attitude (philosophy) toward sports participation and its purpose in schools?
- Which approach is more appealing? more realistic?
- What are the advantages/disadvantages of competitive sports? of non-discriminatory sports?
- Would team sports change by adopting open sports participation?

Film - "Two Farms: Hungary and Wisconsin" (22 min.)

Compare the concept of a "farm family" in each location.
- Are family ties the same?
- What geographic differences are obvious?
- What cultural differences can you identify?
- Are the growing cycles similar?
  Consider the decisions that need to be made by the farmers from both places.
- What risks does each face?
- What attitude toward the land does each have?
From The Immense Journey by Loren Eiseley

1. In the morning, with the change that comes on suddenly in that high country, the mist that had hovered below us in the valley was gone. The sky was a deep blue, and one could see for miles over the high outcroppings of stone. I was up early and brought the box in which the little hawk was imprisoned out onto the grass where I was building a cage. A wind as cool as a mountain spring ran over the grass and stirred my hair. It was a fine day to be alive. I looked up and all around and at the hole in the cabin roof out of which the other little hawk had fled. There was no sign of her anywhere that I could see.

2. "Probably in the next county by now," I thought cynically, but before beginning work I decided I'd have a look at my last night's capture.

3. Secretively, I looked again all around the camp and up and down and opened the box. I got him right out in my hand with his wings folded properly and I was careful not to startle him. He lay limp in my grasp and I could feel his heart pound under the feathers but he only looked beyond me and up.

4. I saw him look that last look away beyond me into a sky so full of light that I could not follow his gaze. The little breeze flowed over me again, and nearby a mountain aspen shook all its tiny leaves. I suppose I must have had an idea then of what I was going to do, but I never let it come up into consciousness. I just reached over and laid the hawk on the grass.

5. He lay there a long minute without hope, unmoving, his eyes still fixed on that blue vault above him. It must have been that he was already so far away in heart that he never felt the release from my hand. He never even stood. He just lay with his breast against the grass.

6. In the next second after that long minute he was gone. Like a flicker of light, he had vanished with my eyes full on him, but without actually seeing into that towering emptiness of light and crystal that my eyes could scarcely bear to penetrate. For another long moment there was silence. I could not see him. That light was too intense. Then from far up somewhere a cry came ringing down.

7. I was young then and had seen little of the world, but when I heard that cry my heart turned over. It was not the cry of the hawk I had captured; for, by shifting my position against the sun, I was now seeing further up. Straight out of the sun's eye, where she must have been soaring restlessly above us for untold hours, hurtled his mate. And from far up, rining from peak to peak of the summits over us, came a cry of such unutterable and ecstatic joy that it sounds down across the years and tingles among the cups on my quiet breakfast table.
8. I saw them both now. He was rising fast to meet her. They met in a great soaring gyre that turned to a whirling circle and a dance of wings. Once more, just once, their two voices, joined in a harsh wild medley of question and response, struck and echoed against the pinnacles of the valley. Then they were gone forever somewhere into those upper regions beyond the eyes of men.

9. I am older now, and sleep less, and have seen most of what there is to see and am not very much impressed any more, I suppose, by anything. "What Next in the Attributes of Machines?" my morning headline runs. "It Might Be the Power to Reproduce Themselves."

10. I lay the paper down and across my mind a phrase floats insinuatingly: "It does not seem that there is anything in the construction, constituents, or behavior of the human being which it is essentially impossible for science to duplicate and synthesize. On the other hand..."

11. All over the city the cogs in the hard, bright mechanisms have begun to turn. Figures move through computers, names are spelled out, a thoughtful machine selects the fingerprints of a wanted criminal from an array of thousands. In the laboratory an electronic mouse runs swiftly through a maze toward the cheese it can neither taste nor enjoy. On the second run it does better than a live mouse.

12. "On the other hand..." Ah, my mind takes up, on the other hand the machine does not bleed, ache, hang for hours in the empty sky in a torment of hope to learn the fate of another machine, nor does it cry out with joy nor dance in the air with the fierce passion of a bird. Far off, over a distance greater than space, that remote cry from the heart of heaven makes a faint buzzing among my breakfast dishes and passes on and away.
Ways of Developing an Explanatory Paragraph

You'll find long-distance bus travel efficient as well as economical. Intercity buses are faster than cars or trains and not much slower than planes for distances of 300 miles or fewer, if you count the time you spend getting to and from the airport. The bus lines guarantee you a seat without an advance reservation, and bus schedules tend to be weatherproof. Hence, you won't get "bumped" because a reservation clerk overbooked, and you won't land in Baltimore when you set out for New York.

Faced with rising food costs, several of the nation's self-supporting zoos have hit upon a cagey scheme to enlist community assistance in feeding their hungry boarders. At the Gladys Porter Zoo in Brownsville, Texas, patrons are invited to join the "Take a Lion to Lunch Bunch." As zoo officials are careful to explain, patrons are not required to take one of the big cats to a drive-in for burgers and fries. They are merely asked to pick up the tab for the cost of feeding an animal at the zoo for a day, week or month. Lunch for a lion comes to $4.72, but you can treat a gorilla for $2.01, and it costs only 17 cents a day to play host to a boa constrictor.--Woman's Day

In Chicago, Mary Ann Slovaki was driving home about ten o'clock one night when the radiator hose in her car broke. The mishap occurred on one of the city's most crime-ridden streets, but she didn't even have to roll down her window to ask for help. A request over her CB radio brought three immediate responses--one of them from the police.--T. E. Deiker

Unlike as Whittier and Franklin were in many respects, they were alike in others. Both had sympathy with the lowly which comes of early similar experiences. Both learned a handicraft, for Franklin set type and worked a printing-press, and Whittier made slippers. To both of them literature was a means, rather than an end in itself. Verse to Whittier, and prose to Franklin, was a weapon to be used in the good fight.
The Paragraph of Comparison or Contrast

When one looks closely at the work of Quarton and compares it to details from the Pieta, distinct similarities appear: the drawing of the fingers, the character of the folds in the robes, the shape of a nostril, or a lip, the tracing of an eyebrow. The Pieta Christ and the Coronation Father and Son are similar types, each with a large mass of dark hair falling regularly over the forehead. The flat gold backgrounds of both paintings give to each a sense of timelessness. The mountain behind Mary Magdalene in the Pieta has the same rugged planes as the peaks in the Coronation landscape. The hands of the Pieta figures, so delicate and expressive, resemble the hands of the Coronation Virgin. The city behind the donor's head in the Pieta--modeled after Jerusalem or Constantinople--is realistically drawn, like the cities in the Coronation. Finally, the same vivid Mediterranean light, sharply illuminating and defining forms, floods both paintings. If not an absolute certainty, the attribution to Quarton seems at least, in the words of Michel Laclotte, "very probable."--Priscilla Flood

The position of women, in many countries of Latin America, is quite different from that which they occupy in the United States. Of course, in a number of countries there are feminist movements, and women have changed their conditions considerably from those of their traditional status. This is particularly true of the southeastern part of South America. Yet in many countries women still lead a comparatively secluded life, their chief activities outside the home being religious and charitable. Mothers, even of the wealthy classes, have a greater hand in the bringing up of their own children than is the case in the United States. Mothers occupy a place in the home that is somewhat difficult to understand for those who are not acquainted with Latin American customs.--Philip Leonard Green

To the American who dwells for a season within these stout and well-fortified coasts there are probably no such irritating people under the sun as are the English. Perhaps this fact lies in another, namely that because many of us are sprung from them, we expect them to be more like us than they are. The initial exasperation comes when we discover immediately that this is at once a complete and baffling misconception. Our common language, the physical characteristics common to us both, many other elements of our common inheritance--all would seem to afford points of similarity between us. But these things have not resulted in resemblance or even in affinity. Three hundred years of a totally different environment and development have set us apart from them, and this must be coupled by the knowledge that each decade in their tight little island only serves to make them more uncompromisingly what they are.--Mary Ellen Chase
A SEPARATE PEACE

The theme of innocence versus aggression is very evident throughout the book *A Separate Peace*. John Knowles presents both sides of the conflict many times over.

The main conflict of innocence versus aggression is greatly personified by the two main characters, Phineas and Gene.

Phineas is a shining example of innocence. He typifies this in his total way of life. Finny was always truthful, he would always reveal what he was thinking except for the one great secret no one ever learned until it was futile -- his desperate efforts to enlist in the armed services. Finny once stated a very definite "No" to a headmaster who tried to change his thinking. This had never been done before, yet Finny thought nothing of it. This action left the headmaster quite surprised, while Gene was rather shocked. Finny always treated everyone equally, Finny never held a real hate for any one person. He always believed and faithfully trusted his best friend, Gene.

While Finny was the zenith of innocence, Gene was much different. All of Gene's actions, although subconscious, displayed him as the epitome of aggression. Gene was a very definite aggressive force closing in on and finally destroying the peace and honesty of Finny. Gene typified most of the world in the time of the story. His aggressive actions were normal to nation as well as people. The world was an aggressive force trying to destroy the peace and innocence of the boys at Devon. Gene showed his aggression by his striving to be the best student in the class. He was continually trying to compare himself to Finny and doing anything to come out on top. Gene's aggression was evident when he jounced the limb which caused Finny to fall. This was an act of aggression which would eliminate all competition. He showed aggression when he fought with Quackenbush, and in his thoughts and actions toward Brinker. An often missed fact are Gene's actions toward Leper. He regards Leper as inferior and someone to be played along with and never taken seriously.

Knowles uses many symbols to show the conflict of innocence versus aggression in the book. The summer is used as a symbol of peace. The boys lived a gypsy life unhindered by the war. Winter brings strict enforcement of rules and all the realities of war. Knowles uses the Devon as a peaceful, clean river; refreshing, and a source of much fun as a symbol of innocence. The Naguamsett is a harsh, salty river; it's never a site of enjoyment and symbolizes aggression.

John Knowles is trying to create a basic message in the book. He's trying to tell how innocence is put aside and eventually destroyed by the forces of aggression.
It might be thought innocence would then be destroyed, but innocence remains. This is caused by the rarity of innocence and the great impression it makes on the world. Some forces of aggression may be converted to innocence by the impact of innocence. Thus, the conflict remains.
Develop A Paragraph by Comparison Or Contrast

The oblique band of sunlight which followed her through the door became the young wife well. It illuminated her as her presence illuminated the heath. In her movements, in her gaze, she reminded the beholder of the feathered creatures who lived around her home. All similes and allegories concerning her began and ended with birds. There was as much variety in her motions as in their flight. When she was musing, she was a kestrel, which hangs in the air by an invisible motion of its wings. When she was in a high wind, her light body was blown against trees and banks like a heron's. When she was frightened, she darted noiselessly like a kingfisher. When she was serene, she skimmed like a swallow, and that is how she was moving now.

--From The Return of the Native, by Thomas Hardy

The bumblebee is a more casual pollen gatherer than the honeybee. Her pollen baskets consist of irregular rows of feathery hairs with which she may carry a pollen ball or dust off the pollen from another, while the honey-bee always works hard all day to build up one enormous ball of moist pollen after another to carry back to the hive. The bumblebee appears to be more interested in nectar—she's a comparatively lazy fat mechanic possessed of a wondrous long proboscis with which she is able to set off the mechanisms of flowers with deeply concealed nectar that the honey-bee can't reach.

--From This Green World, by Rutherford Platt

A paragraph may be developed by making comparisons or contrasts.

There is only one sensible way to think of the Pacific Ocean today. It is the highway between Asia and America, and whether we wish it or not, from now on there will be immense traffic along that highway. If we know what we want, if we have patience and determination, if above all we have understanding, we may insure that the traffic will be peaceful, consisting of tractors and students and medical missionaries and bolts of cloth. But if we are not intelligent, or if we cannot cultivate understanding in Asia, then the traffic will be armed planes, battleships, submarines, and death. In either alternative we may be absolutely certain that from now on the Pacific traffic will be a two-way affair. From Return to Paradise, by James Michener
It is not a bad thing now and again to visit the great city and plunge into the sea of its crowds, but in order to emerge again upon terra firma and feel the solid ground under one's feet. For my part, since I am interested in individuals—in John and Peter and Richard, in you who are reading this book—but not in the masses which they form when banded together, I remain in the small town, seeing every day at the same hour the same men, men whose souls have clashed, and sometimes painfully, with my soul; and I flee from the great metropolis where my soul is worshipped with the icy whips of the disdainful glances of those who know me not and who are unknown to me. People whom I cannot name...horrible! From "Large and Small Towns" by Miguel de Unamuno in Essays and Soliloquies.

Using Comparisons or Contrasts

Both President Lincoln and President Kennedy were attacked suddenly by an assassin on a Friday, and each in the presence of his wife. Each man was shot in the head; in each instance, crowds of people watched the shooting. Lincoln's secretary, named Kennedy, had advised him not to go to the theater where the attack occurred. Kennedy's secretary, named Lincoln, had advised him not to go to Dallas where the attack occurred.

Although some may appreciate a five-speed's trappings, most will discover this animal combines the worst of a three- and a ten-speed. The typical five-speed is built on the same heavy frame as the three-speed, often has the same wide saddle and upright handlebars, but has the five-speed gear cluster and changer bolted on back. For two extra gears of dubious value, you pay almost as much as you would for a low-priced ten-speed, but pedal around as much weight as you would on a three-speed.—S. Marshall

Although Henry Chatillon and Tete Rouge were the same age, that is, about thirty, they were very different. Henry was twice as large, and fully six times as strong as Tete Rouge. Henry's face was roughened by winds and storms; Tete Rouge's was bloated by sherry-cobblers and brandy-toddy. Henry had led a life of hardship and privation; Tete Rouge never had a whim which he would not gratify at the first moment he was able. Henry, moreover, was the most disinterested man I ever saw; while Tete Rouge cared for nobody but himself. —Francis Parkman
In America bread never came without complications. The peasant, new to the means of earning his livelihood, added to the difficulties in making ends meet through inability to use efficiently whatever money came to his hands. At home, only the improvident were incapable of nurturing their families out of their own farms and gardens. But in America every crumb was paid for. The unfamiliar process of shopping led to countless losses and often induced the immigrant, whatever the cost, to deal with peddlers, as in the Old World.

--Kirsten E. A. Borg
The Paragraph Arranging the Supporting Details

Some stores are extremely careful about guaranteeing authenticity. Not long ago a Philadelphia housewife bought a Picasso lithograph for $315 from Sears Roebuck. But then the store found that although Picasso had signed the piece, it had been reproduced from a second stone, rather than the original. Sears insisted on taking it back even though the housewife was perfectly delighted to keep it at the purchase price. On the other hand, Harris Steinberg, current chairman of the New York City Bar Association's art committee, criticized one store's collection. Among other things, he said he had seen a statue with plaster inside, bronze outside, labeled as a Degas. He questioned whether it might not be by someone whose name was Irving Degas.

--Milton Esterow,  
"Buyers, Sellers, and Forgers"

You are well aware of the struggle now being waged for the minds of men. One ideology seeks to preserve man's independence of mind, speech, and action; the other seeks not merely to control men's minds but virtually to abolish them as functioning parts of a social order. One philosophy believes in the subordination of intellect to instinct, believes in the excellence of conformity, "correct" attitudes, and habits of nonthinking cooperation and adjustment. This struggle to preserve or to destroy the mind of man goes on in a seemingly innocuous way in education, too.

--William H. Cornog,  
"Bread and Hyacinths"

Using Comparison and Contrast

Have you ever been at sea in a dense fog, when it seemed as if a tangible white darkness shut you in, and the great ship, tense and anxious, groped her way toward the shore with plummet and sounding-line, and you waited with beating heart for something to happen? I was like that ship before my education began, only I was without compass or sounding-line, and had no way of knowing how near the harbor was. "Light! give me a light!" was the wordless cry of my soul, and the light of love shone on me in that very hour.

--Helen Keller,  
"Out of Darkness"
There are two basic differences between the large and the small enterprise. In the small enterprise you operate primarily through personal contacts. In the large enterprise you have established "policies," "channels" of organization, and fairly rigid procedures. In the small enterprise you have, moreover, immediate effectiveness in a very small area. You can see the effect of your work and of your decisions right away, once you are a little bit above the ground floor. In the large enterprise even the man at the top is only a cog in a big machine. To be sure, his actions affect a much greater area than the actions and decisions of the man in the small organization, but his effectiveness is remote, indirect, and elusive. In a small and even in a middle-sized business you are normally exposed to all kinds of experiences, and expected to do a great many things without too much help or guidance. In the large organization you are normally taught one thing thoroughly. In the small one the danger is of becoming a jack-of-all-trades and master of none. In the large one it is of becoming the man who knows more and more about less and less.

--Peter F. Drucker
"How to Be an Employee"

Perhaps in this matter of an old age there is no such thing as the average man. It is common knowledge that some people grow old faster than others, and not till lately has there been official demarcation of the frontier between youth and age. In the fall of 1953, the President said that one reason he appointed Earl Warren as Chief Justice was "his relative youth"--sixty-two. On the same day the Governor of Puerto Rico pardoned a prisoner on account of "his advanced age"--sixty-three. Between those two years, then, must be the Great Divide, though I seem to have been working so hard that I never noticed when I passed over it.

--Elmer Davis,
But We Were Born Free

What really set the Civil War soldier apart was the fact that he came from a less sophisticated society. He was no starry-eyed innocent, to be sure--or, if he was, the army quickly took care of that--but the America of the 1860's was less highly developed than modern America. It lacked the ineffable advantages of radio, television, and moving pictures. It was still essentially a rural nation; it had growing cities; a much greater percentage of the population lived on farms or in country towns and villages than is the case now, and there was more of a backwoods, hayseed-in-the-hair flavor to the people who came from them.

--Bruce Catton,
"Hayfoot, Strawfoot"
A Second Paragraph to Make a Comparison

For many GIs, the most memorable moment of this post-liberation day took place early in the morning at Notre-Dame Cathedral. There, on the side altar of Saint Joseph, in borrowed French vestments, Father Leonard Fries said Mass "for the men of the 12th Regiment we left behind on the road to Paris." Kneeling in the somber sunlight filtering down into the great cathedral, over 300 GIs, their M1s or carbines in one hand, their helmets cupped under the other, were present at the Mass.

Even more moving perhaps was another religious service held in the main synagogue of Paris this same sunny Saturday. There Captain Morris Frank, the Jewish chaplain of the 12th Regiment, a group of Jewish GIs and the sad survivors of four years of oppression and deportation joined together in a memorable Sabbath service. To Rabbi Frank, "the sight of those pale, gaunt faces, the remnants of our decimated people" was an image he would hold forever in his memory. After the service, Frank and the GIs were "hugged, carried aloft, mobbed by crying women...who poured out their hearts with stories of children killed before their eyes, husbands and daughters torn from their arms."

--Larry Collins and Dominique Lapierre
*Is Paris Burning?*

Sharpen Meaning by Comparison

Wit is a lean creature with a sharp inquiring nose, whereas humor has a kindly eye and a comfortable girth. Wit, if it be necessary, uses malice to score a point--like a cat it is quick to jump--but humor keeps the peace in an easy chair. Wit is a better voice in a solo, but humor comes into the chorus best. Wit is as sharp as a stroke of lightning, whereas humor is concerned with homely eternal things. Wit wears silk, but humor in homespun endures the wind. Wit sets a snare, whereas humor goes off whistling without a victim in its mind. Wit is sharper company at table, but humor serves better in mischance and in the rain. When it tumbles wit is sour, but humor goes uncomplaining without its dinner. Humor laughs at another's jest and holds its side, while wit sits wrapped in study for a lively answer.

--Charles Brooks
*"On the Difference Between Wit and Humor"*
...the aim of the Platonic philosophy was to exalt man into a god. The aim of the Baconian philosophy was to provide man with what he requires while he continues to be man. The aim of the Platonic philosophy was to raise us far above vulgar wants. The aim of the Baconian philosophy was to supply our vulgar wants. The former aim was noble; but the latter was attainable.

--Thomas Macaulay
"Francis Bacon"

Democracy rests upon two pillars: one, the principle that all men are entitled to life, liberty and the pursuit of happiness; and the other, the conviction that such equal opportunity will most advance civilization. Aristocracy, on the other hand, denies both these postulates. It rests upon the principle of the superman. It willingly subordinates the many to the few, and seeks to justify sacrificing the individual by insisting that civilization will be advanced by such sacrifices.

--Louis Brandeis
"True Americanism"
COMPARISON-CONTRAST

Choose one of the following topics for your final composition. You may need to research some of the topics so choose one that interests you or one that you know well. In class on Friday, January 27, you will write a short essay (200-400 words, 3-5 pages) using the method of comparison-contrast to develop your ideas.

Your final paper will be evaluated according to the following criteria:
- appropriate choice of topic
- appropriate choice of development--comparison, contrast, or both
- statement of purpose
- use of supporting details
- organization of details--point by point or item by item
- development of composition--introduction, body, conclusion
- other--mechanics, spelling, usage, neatness

TOPICS

People
A brother or sister and yourself
The lifestyles of two people who are friends
Your aunt and your uncle
A boxer and a dancer
Two famous people in history who were different from each other
Family life in the nuclear age and family life at the turn of the century

Places
Two stores you often enter
Elementary school and junior high school or junior high and high school
This community and one you formerly lived in
An American city and a European city
Some aspect of life in the United States and a similar aspect of life in some other country
City or town life and life on a farm
Two schools you have attended
Activities
Road racing and track racing
Football and soccer
Two jobs you have held
Riding a bicycle and riding a motorcycle
Mountain skiing and cross-country skiing

Miscellaneous
Dogs and cats as pets
Two specific television shows (two comedies, two police stories)
Advertising on radio and advertising on television
A novel and a movie based on the same novel
Rock music and jazz
Popular music of the 1940's and the popular music of today
English and mathematics
The subjects studied in school today and those studied a century ago
Modern dress and dress in the 1920's
Airplane travel today and in the 1950's
The goals of the United States' space program and those of Russia

Literature Assignments
Comparing Two Poems
   "The Meadow Mouse" and "The Fawn"
   "Crispus Attucks" and "Concord Hymn"
   "John Anderson My Jo" and "O Mistress Mine"
   "Uphill" and "What Inn Is This"
Comparing Characters
   George in "A Summer's Reading" and Alfred Higgins in "All the Years of Her Life"
Comparing Themes
   "The Gift of the Magi" and "The Necklace"

A topic of your choice (with the teacher's approval)
APPENDIX D. STUDENT EVALUATIONS
Group I Traditional Textbook Instruction

Please respond to the following questions regarding your two-week unit on comparison-contrast writing. Explain why you answer yes or no to a question.

1. Having completed the unit, can you identify comparison-contrast development when it is used in a paragraph?

2. Do you know when it is appropriate to use comparison and contrast?

3. As a result of this unit, do you feel prepared
   a) to write a topic sentence stating the purpose of your paragraph?
   b) to develop a paragraph using comparison or contrast?
   c) to draw an appropriate conclusion to your work?

4. Were the comparisons and contrasts made in the written examples easy to understand?

5. Did class discussion help you understand comparison-contrast writing?

6. Were the topics compared or contrasted in the printed excerpts interesting?

7. Did the teacher give clear directions for developing comparisons and contrasts in writing?

8. Did the teacher provide additional explanations to help you understand the examples of comparison-contrast presented in class?

9. What was the least valuable aspect of this unit?

10. What was the most valuable aspect of this unit?
Group II  Print and Film--Visual Instruction

Please respond to the following questions regarding your two-week unit on comparison-contrast writing. Explain why you answer yes or no to a question.

1. Having completed the unit, can you identify comparison-contrast development when it is used in a paragraph?

2. Do you know when it is appropriate to use comparison and contrast?

3. As a result of this unit, do you feel prepared
   a) to write a topic sentence stating the purpose of your paragraph?
   b) to develop a paragraph using comparison or contrast?
   c) to draw an appropriate conclusion to your work?

4. Were the comparisons and contrasts made in the written and filmed examples easy to understand?

5. Did class discussion help you understand comparison-contrast writing?

6. Were the topics compared or contrasted in the printed excerpts and films interesting?

7. Did the teacher give clear directions for developing comparisons and contrasts in writing?

8. Did the teacher provide additional explanations to help you understand the examples of comparison-contrast presented in class?

9. What was the least valuable aspect of this unit?

10. What was the most valuable aspect of this unit?
Group III  Audio-visual Instruction

Please respond to the following questions regarding your two-week unit on comparison-contrast writing. Explain why you answer yes or no to a question.

1. Having completed the unit, can you identify comparison-contrast development when it is used in a paragraph?

2. Do you know when it is appropriate to use comparison and contrast?

3. As a result of this unit, do you feel prepared
   a) to write a topic sentence stating the purpose of your paragraph?
   b) to develop a paragraph using comparison or contrast?
   c) to draw an appropriate conclusion to your work?

4. Were the comparisons and contrasts made in the filmed and recorded examples easy to understand?

5. Did class discussion help you understand comparison-contrast writing?

6. Were the topics compared or contrasted in the recorded excerpts and films interesting?

7. Did the teacher give clear directions for developing comparisons and contrasts in writing?

8. Did the teacher provide additional explanations to help you understand the examples of comparison-contrast presented in class?

9. What was the least valuable aspect of this unit?

10. What was the most valuable aspect of this unit?
APPENDIX E. HOLISTIC SCORING
HOLISTIC SCORING

Instructions for using the scoring guide:

1. Read the paper quickly to get a general impression.

2. In evaluating, keep in mind the assignment and the characteristics described below.

3. Assign the score which reflects the overall quality of each paper.

POSSIBLE SCORES

6 - Papers scored 6 will address all parts of the assignment and will be well organized. They will show good language control and sentence variety. They will be distinguished by details supporting a strong comparison or contrast. There may be a few mechanical errors, but generally these will be superior papers.

5 - Papers scored 5 will address all parts of the assignment and will be well organized. They may be less developed or detailed than 6 papers with possibly more mechanical problems, but they will have good language control and a clear statement of purpose.

4 - These papers will be competent and cover all parts of the assignment, but they may not be so well organized as 6 or 5 papers. They will show control of the language, though there will probably not be as much development or as many details. Papers may contain minor mechanical errors.

3 - This score is appropriate for papers which ignore one or more parts of the assignment. They may be vague, general, abstract, or undeveloped with few supporting details. There may be problems in syntax or organization. These papers may be too brief, too general, or may have too many mechanical errors to be scored higher.

2 - These papers will be thin in content or have serious problems in mechanics.

1 - This score will be given to papers which show little understanding of the assignment or of the mechanics of writing.
APPENDIX F. STUDENT WRITING SAMPLES
To contrast between town and country

I like both the town and country. I like the town better because when you live in town you're in the center of things. You always know what's going on. If there's a snowstorm and you live in town you don't feel as though you're stranded. You can always run to the store if there's not much food in the house. In the country you can't do that. You usually can't even get out of the driveway. The town always seems to be a lot more exciting. There's usually lots of things going on. The country seems so boring. But there are a lot of good things about the country, too. You can have lots of animals out there; dogs, cats, sheep, cows, pigs, and even horses to ride. That's what I would like about the country. In town you can't have a lot of animals. Maybe a dog or cat. The country is a lot more peaceful than town. In town there's always lots of noise but not in the country. In the country you can drive around a motorcycle or a snowmobile without being 16. But in town if you get caught you're in lots of trouble. The country and town both have disadvantages and advantages. I really like both places. I wouldn't really know which one would be best to live at because I've never lived in the country. I'm so use to living in town. Maybe one day I'll live in the country. I think I would like that very much.
Two Different Sports on Skis

I enjoy both sports of skiing. Waterskiing and snowskiing are both very challenging sports. I think waterskiing is much easier to learn than snowskiing. Snowskiing was very hard for me to learn.

I started waterskiing when I was about 13. I loved it! It was lots of fun! It was very easy to learn, too. Skiing on two was easy but after awhile it got a little boring. So then I was ready to challenge skiing on one. I was really scared at first but my dad and a friend helped me all the way. Once I started skiing on one I never wanted to ski on two again.

Snowskiing didn't come as easy to me as waterskiing did. The first time I went snowskiing I was 15. We went with our church league. Some of our friends were going to take lessons but not Marti and I, we thought we didn't need lessons, boy were we ever wrong. So Marti and I start off on this bunny hill but it wasn't know bunny hill to us! As we were going down the hill I yell to Marti, "Hey Marti, How do you stop?" She says, "I don't know I guess you fall." We never laughed so hard in our whole life! After an hour of learning how to stop better we thought we would challenge a bigger hill. So we find this big hill and we start going down it. Marti is braver then me so she just jetted down it as fast as she could go, but then there's me who went most of the way on my butt. But I got the last laugh because Marti was going so fast that she couldn't stop in time and she skied right into the parking lot and right underneath a car.

As you can tell there's a lot of differences between the two but there are some similarities, too. After I had snowskied I had tons of bruises and sores. The worst thing that has happened to me if I had been waterskiing was a few sore muscles if I has skied a lot that day. Waterskiing I picked up a lot faster then snowskiing. I'm still not that great at snowskiing. Snowskiing, I think, it a lot more difficult. Snowskiing it lot more dangerous of a sport then waterskiing. The funniest thing about snowskiing is watching people wipeout. They take quite a few hard dumps. They hurt like crazy, too. If you fall while waterskiing it doesn't seem to hurt as bad.

I think that both of these sports are lots of fun and very challenging. If anyone were to ask me which one I like best I would tell them waterskiing, but snowskiing it much more challenging. I would also tell them that there is a variety of things you could do for waterskiing. That's way I like that one the best.
To compare and contrast having a dog to having cat for a pet.

Dogs and cats are not only different in appearance but also in personality. Though both are quite playful when young, a cat, as it gets older, tends to be more quiet. They might enjoy being petted more than being played with. A dog might still enjoy chasing a ball long after a cat would.

Another difference is the voice. A cat would be much quieter with its meow that a dog would with its bark.

Eating habits would differ also. On the whole, one thinks of a dog being larger that a cat, therefore; a cat would eat less that a dog. While both would have their individual likes and dislikes, a cat might tend to be a little more fussy of what it eats.

Despite their differences, cats and dogs do have similarities. Both dogs and cats could make life-long friends with their owners. They seem willing to make friends with anyone.

Another similarity is that they both have fur. If one likes furry creatures a cat or dog would be fore them.

I think by looking over the similarities and differences and looking at ones own needs, a person would be able to tell which pet would be better for them.
Seattle and Jewell

Every two cities have numerous differences because each city is unique. Seattle, Washington and Jewell, Iowa is no exception. They are separated by 1,575 miles and like the many miles that separate them, there are many differences.

Besides being in different states, Jewell is a rural area and Seattle is very urban. Seattle's population is 550,831, while Jewell's is less than 2,000. Seattle is also included in a metropolitan area with a population of 1,421,869. Jewell is definitely not metropolitan with only four square miles of town land.

The types of transportation people use is also different. Seattle has many cars and buses. They also have a trackless trolley-bus system used for transportation. Jewell has not buses and people use just cards to get around.

Because Seattle is located on a port and Jewell is located in the mid-west, their industries differ greatly. Seattle's industries include fishing, food processing, shipbuilding, lumbering, paper, flour, metal, and chemicals. Jewell's industry stays centered around agriculture and livestock.

Seattle has approximately 43 parks and playgrounds. Jewell has just one. The total area of Seattle's recreation is 2,910 acres, while Jewell probably has less than one acre.

Seattle's educational system is different from Jewell's, also. Seattle has a number of universities and schools. Jewell has just two.

As one can see there are many differences between Seattle and Jewell. This doesn't mean any city is really better than the other, it just shows the uniqueness of each one.
To Compare and Contrast My Parents

My parents are quite unique in a way that, my dad is a farmer and my mom is a housewife. Sometimes that's all they seemed to be concerned about. Dad doesn't like to go out very often, where as mom, I think, would rather be out on Saturday nights instead of sitting at home. Dad definitely has a short fuse. He can become so upset with the smallest things. He blows everything out of proportion. Now mom, that's a different story. She always seems to be calm and patient. She generally has a solution for any problem. They both are very conscious about things being neat. Dad keeps his tools and machinery in proper order and takes care of them. Mom is always cleaning the house and getting on me to clean up my room. They aren't what I would say, spring chickens. I guess I could say they're getting up there in years. Dad is 52 and mom is 45, but they've got plenty of years ahead of them. I definitely know that they both are conservative. I can understand that the economy isn't in the greatest shape right now, but I don't really like some of things they do about it. For instance, our car is a 1977, and it has 140,000 miles on it. Dad says he'll do something about a new car, while mom agrees and s

Not done
Elementary school--High school

There are many differences among elementary school and high school that someone may never even notice. I think that high school takes much more concentration but it also is much more fun.

In elementary school, kids usually go through thinking that they are hot-shots and really neat. Being in high school, there is a sudden change. The first year is learning how to adjust to life in school not being the center of attention.

High school has so many more activities to offer. There are several different athletic sports that a student can try out for. Also, someone can be involved in drama, math club, home ec club, etc. In grade school students have very few opportunities to be involved with activities.

In elementary school every student had to ride a bus to school and then home at the end of the day, with the exception of those who lived in town. Unlike grade school, most people get their license as a sophomore and can drive to school. The majority of students have their own cars.

It doesn't seem that kids have as many responsibilities in elementary school. Teachers don't assign as much homework and therefore, students goof off more. They have recess which gives them a chance to burn off that energy. In high school, I think sometimes we get caught up with our work too much and we forget that high school is supposed to be fun also.

I know for a fact that now during high school there are many, many more assignments and tests. But I guess that is understandable because we are more mature now and it is the job of the teaches to prepare us for our future, whether that be college or some type of job.

The two have totally different teaching staffs. I know that they couldn't get by with one staff. Also, they each have their own principals. In our system, there is no assistant vice-principal for either one.

These differences that I have talked about are just a few examples of how the two stages of an education differ. After going through elementary, and now in my third year of high school, I really can tell the differences, both in and out of school.